

PROJECT NAME: Charles Meyer Desalination Plant Reactivation
PROJECT NO.: #3752
DATE: 1-Apr-15
SUBJECT: DBO Proposal Evaluation Panel Summary

RFP Category	Max. Points ⁽¹⁾	Evaluator A		Evaluator B		Evaluator C		Evaluator D		Evaluator E		Evaluator F		SUMMARY	
		ACCIONA / FILANC	IDE / KIEWIT	ACCIONA / FILANC	IDE / KIEWIT	ACCIONA / FILANC	IDE / KIEWIT	ACCIONA / FILANC	IDE / KIEWIT	ACCIONA / FILANC	IDE / KIEWIT	ACCIONA / FILANC	IDE / KIEWIT	ACCIONA / FILANC	IDE / KIEWIT
PART 1 - Project Plan	100	85	95	85	85	71	84	80	90	90	90	90	80	84	87
PART 2 - Technical Design Approach	300	225	275	275	250	223	218	200	280	285	225	260	240	245	248
PART 3 - Construction Sched., Planning & Sequencing	100	70	95	85	80	75	95	95	90	75	95	75	90	79	91
PART 4 - Operations and Maintenance	100	75	95	90	80	91	87	95	100	95	65	90	70	89	83
PART 5 - PRICE PROPOSAL	400													394	400
TOTAL:														891	909

Technical Proposal (Subtotal): 497 509

Net Present Value	ACCIONA / FILANC	IDE / KIEWIT
NPV Bid Schedule 1 ⁽²⁾	\$ 61,569,005	\$ 62,176,051
NPV Bid Schedule 2 ⁽³⁾	\$ 99,557,739	\$ 96,533,418
NPV_A	\$ 80,563,372	\$ 79,354,735

Difference in NPV_A = 2%
 Is Difference in NPVA > 10%? No
 Is Price Technical Trade-off Analysis Required? No (Note 4)

Notes:

1. Base upon criteria set forth in Section 6.3 of the RFP.
2. Taken from Bid Form 21 (RFP Attachment B).
3. Taken from Bid Form 22 (RFP Attachment B).
4. If the difference in NPV_A is > 10% and the highest ranked firm is not the lowest cost, a price technical trade-off analysis is required, refer to Section 6.6 of the RFP.