



## MEMORANDUM

515 East Ocean  
Suite G  
Lompoc, CA 93436-6926  
(805) 737-4119  
FAX (805) 737-4121

---

Date: August 26, 2010

To: Michael Berman, Frank Cunningham, City of Santa Barbara

From: M. Colleen Hamilton, Applied EarthWorks, Inc.

RE: **Chapala Street Bridge Replacement: Consistency of Historical Resources Evaluation Report (HRER)** with the *City of Santa Barbara Master Environmental Assessment (MEA) Guidelines for Archaeological Resources and Historic Structures and Sites* (January 2002), Historic Structures/Sites Report Requirements

### 1.0 Introduction

Per the attached Historical Resources Evaluation Report (HRER), the City of Santa Barbara, in cooperation with the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) with funding from the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), proposes to demolish the structurally deficient Chapala Street Bridge over Mission Creek (51C0250) and construct a new bridge at the same location. The proposed Chapala Street Bridge Replacement project will remove the existing bridge deck and trusses, leaving one or both of the sandstone abutments in place. The project proposes two alternatives for the new abutments: Alternative 1 would place the new abutments approximately 2 feet behind the existing sandstone abutment, and Alternative 2 would remove and replace the north abutment leaving the south side abutment to be constructed as proposed in Alternative 1. The new bridge width will match the existing bridge dimensions. New combination vehicular/pedestrian railings would be installed on each side of the bridge. The bridge deck will either be replaced to match the existing configuration, or the replacement deck will exclude the northwesternmost, triangular portion of the end span north of Yanonali Street (see HRER Appendix B).

Nine historic resources are within the architectural study area for the proposed project, and the project site is located along the northern boundary of the proposed West Beach Historic District, which is significant for its rich and varied history of the Waterfront Area as a tourist destination (Historic Resources Group 2001). Four properties in the study area (120, 133, and 203 Chapala Street; 135 Kimberly Avenue) are within the proposed district boundaries and are considered contributing resources to the district. Five additional properties are outside the proposed district. The Chapala Street Bridge, the Potter Hotel Footbridge, and the building at 134 Chapala Street appear to be significant historic resources under the MEA criteria. The Mission Creek Diversion and Depot Park are contributing components of the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) listed Southern Pacific Train Depot. Each property within or adjacent to the proposed project site is discussed in detail below.

Because Caltrans is the agency responsible for ensuring compliance with federal regulations applicable to the project, the HRER follows the content and format guidelines specified in California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) *Environmental Handbook, Vol. 2, Cultural Resources* (August 2009). As a result the HRER does not specifically follow the City Master Environmental Assessment (MEA) guidelines for Historic Structures and Sites Reports. However, the HRER was conducted in a manner to ensure adherence to parts of the City's requirements.

The City asked Applied EarthWorks, Inc. (Æ) to prepare a memorandum to ensure that the Caltrans report for the Chapala Street Bridge Replacement project is augmented to be consistent with the

---

requirements of the City MEA. Summaries from the HRER and information augmenting these discussions are provided below. A separate memorandum will be submitted with the Archaeological Survey Report (ASR) for the project, which will describe the inventory of the archaeological resources as required by the City MEA.

## 2.0 Historic Structures and Sites Reports

Per the MEA: *An Historic Structures and Sites Report is an investigation intended to accomplish the following:*

- *Identify historical structures/sites on a proposed project site.*
- *Assess the significance of identified historic structures and/or sites.*
- *If significant historic resources are identified, evaluate potential project impacts to the significant historic resources.*
- *If the proposed project may potentially result in adverse impacts to identified historic resources, propose measures to mitigate the potential adverse impacts.*

Æ assessed potential project impacts to historical structures using criteria specified in the MEA, classifying them as significant unavoidable (Class I), potentially significant unless mitigated (Class II), or less than significant (Class III).

The Chapala Street Bridge and properties in the surrounding neighborhood were inventoried during an architectural survey and detailed in an HRER prepared for this project (Morlet 2010). Within the architectural study area are a total of five buildings, three structures, and one landscape feature. Two of the buildings and one structure were formally evaluated for historic significance during the current investigation. Of these, 133 Chapala Street had previously been determined to be a contributor to the potential West Beach Historic District, and 203 Chapala Street had been previously determined eligible as a City Landmark. One structure, the Chapala Street Bridge, appears to be a significant historic resource under the MEA criteria. Each resource is itemized in the HRER and further described on the appropriate California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) inventory forms: Primary Record (DPR 523A) and Building, Structure, and Object Record (DPR 523B). In addition to the formally evaluated properties, six other previously identified historic resources are present either within or adjacent to the proposed project site.

<b>Resource Identified</b>	<b>Relationship to Project Site</b>	<b>Level of Significance</b>	<b>Potential Impact</b>	<b>Mitigation Proposed</b>
Chapala Street Bridge (51C0250)	Within	Structure of Merit	Class II	Yes
Southern Pacific Train Depot: Mission Creek Diversion	Within	Listed on NRHP	Class II	Yes
Southern Pacific Train Depot: Park	Adjacent	Listed on NRHP	Class III	Yes
Potter Hotel Footbridge	Adjacent	Structure of Merit	Class III	Yes
134 Chapala Street	Adjacent	Structure of Merit	None	No
Proposed West Beach Historic District	Adjacent	Proposed NRHP	Class II	Yes
120 Chapala Street	Adjacent	District Contributor and NRHP eligible	None	No
133 Chapala Street	Adjacent	District Contributor	None	No
203 Chapala Street	Adjacent	District Contributor and City Landmark	None	No
135 Kimberly Avenue	Adjacent	District Contributor	None	No

Below each historic resources is identified, assessed for significance, and evaluated for impacts; mitigation is proposed, as necessary.

### **Chapala Street Bridge (51C0250)**

The Chapala Street Bridge (51C0250) is the subject of the project and appears eligible to be listed as a City Structure of Merit under City Criterion 3e. While the bridge is not a good example of the Warren truss style due to the alterations that have taken place over the years, it is the only remaining example of a steel truss bridge within the city of Santa Barbara. The character-defining features of the bridge are the steel double-intersection Warren pony trusses and the sandstone abutments.

Due to the structure's deteriorated and unsafe condition, project plans propose to completely demolish the Chapala Street Bridge and construct a new bridge within the same roadway alignment. The demolition will destroy the character-defining features of the bridge that qualify the structure as a City Structure of Merit. While this bridge is the last remaining example of the steel truss style in the city of Santa Barbara, the bridge style itself is very common in California and abundant information on Warren style structures is publicly available. This bridge has undergone modifications that have altered its original appearance significantly, especially to the upper cord. In consideration of these factors, the destruction of the Chapala Street Bridge would constitute a Class II impact, potentially significant unless mitigated.

The bridge consists of the sandstone abutments, which also serve as retaining walls along Mission Creek (distinguishable from the Mission Creek Diversion revetment), steel double-intersection Warren pony trusses, and an asphalt-concrete covered deck. The proposed project will remove the steel double-intersection Warren pony trusses, deck, and possibly the sandstone abutment along the north creek wall. Two alternatives are currently proposed for the new bridge abutments. Alternative 1, the sandstone abutments will remain in place and new concrete abutments will be placed approximately 2 feet behind the existing abutments. Alternative 2, the north abutment would be removed and replaced with a new concrete abutment. The south abutment would not be effected by Alternative 2. The existing deck does not contribute to the eligibility of the bridge as it has been replaced and its removal will not constitute an impact. The following mitigation measures are required by the MEA for either alternative:

- Recordation according to the Community Development Department's "Required Documentation Prior to Demolition" standards, including documentation of the sandstone abutments and steel trusses. Predemolition recordation in part would reduce adverse impacts to the bridge.
- Commemoration of the demolished structure with a display of text and photographs designed by a City-approved historical consultant for placement on the perimeter of the property near the intersection of Chapala and Yanonali streets.
- If feasible, to further mitigate adverse impacts resulting from the removal of the existing bridge, the bridge railing should be designed to be reminiscent of the original Warren truss style, constructed of metal, not concrete.

### **Southern Pacific Train Depot: Mission Creek Diversion (1905)**

The Mission Creek Diversion is within the bridge replacement project site and has been identified as a contributing component of the Southern Pacific Train Depot property, which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The diversion revetment is made of large, distinguishable sandstone blocks that line each side of Mission Creek from Montecito Street to the west truss of the

---

Chapala Street Bridge. Isolated segments of revetment exist to the east between the Chapala Street Bridge and the Mason Street Bridge.

Although the project plans do not propose to remove any portions of the sandstone revetment under either of the proposed alternatives, the possibility exists that the sandstone revetment within the Mission Creek Diversion may be inadvertently impacted during construction activities.

Two optional deck configurations are proposed for the new bridge. The new deck would either be replaced to match the existing configuration, or the replacement deck will exclude the northwestern most, triangular portion of the end span north of Yanonali Street (see HRER Appendix B). The optional deck configuration which excludes the northwestern triangular portion would distance construction activities from the Mission Creek Diversion revetment, further reducing the risk of impact to this NRHP contributing component.

The location of the resource does not allow for the creation of an Environmentally Sensitive Area; therefore, removal of or damage to the sandstone blocks would constitute a Class II impact (potentially significant unless mitigated) to this National Register property.

The following mitigation measure would reduce impacts to the Mission Creek Diversion revetment to less than significant levels:

- All sandstone revetment blocks will be preserved either in situ or, if necessary, removed and reinstalled when the new abutments are completed. If removed, photo documentation may be required to ensure proper replacement. Concrete replacements that mimic the historic appearance of the revetment and create a false sense of history will not be an acceptable mitigation strategy.

### **Southern Pacific Train Depot: Park (1905)**

The Southern Pacific Train Depot, which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places, is adjacent to the Chapala Bridge Replacement project site. A small triangular park associated with the depot lies within the architectural study area but will not be impacted by the project. Depot Park will be protected during all construction activities and will not be utilized as a construction lay down area. With this precaution in place, impacts to the park will be Class III, less than significant.

To ensure that the Depot Park, a contributing component of the NRHP-listed Southern Pacific Train Depot, will not be adversely impacted, the following protection measure should be taken:

- The Chapala and Yanonali Street sides of the park shall have a barrier fence made of metal posts and construction safety netting to protect the landscaping within this environmentally sensitive area.

### **Potter Hotel Footbridge (circa 1905)**

The Potter Hotel Footbridge is immediately adjacent to the proposed project site. It sits at the northwestern corner of the Chapala Street Bridge. *Phase III Architectural Resources Report for the Mission Creek Flood Control Project*, prepared by Post and Hazeltine (1999), evaluated this structure as ineligible for state and federal listing, but concluded it qualified as a City Structure of Merit under City Criteria a, h, and i.

Given that the Potter Hotel Footbridge is situated immediately adjacent to the northwest corner of the Chapala Bridge deck, an environmentally sensitive area will be designated for its protection. With this precaution in place, impacts to the bridge will be Class III, less than significant.

---

To ensure that the Potter Hotel Footbridge will not be adversely impacted, the following protection measure should be taken:

- The pedestrian bridge shall have construction safety netting on all sides to prevent access within this environmentally sensitive area and heighten visibility of the bridge during construction activities, especially during demolition.

### **National Cash Register at 134 Chapala Street (1954)**

The building at 134 Chapala Street is immediately adjacent to the proposed project site. It sits at the southeastern corner of the Chapala Street Bridge. *Phase I/II Architectural Resources Report for the Mission Creek Flood Control Project* prepared by Post and Hazeltine (1999) evaluated this structure as ineligible for state and federal listing, but concluded it qualified as a City Structure of Merit under City Criterion e.

Project activities adjacent to this property are limited to the application of new roadway, and it will not be impacted by the project.

### **Proposed West Beach Historic District (2001)**

The proposed West Beach Historic District boundary defined by Historic Resources Group in 2001 encompasses four of the properties within the Chapala Street Bridge study area. The district, as currently proposed, includes a range of architectural styles including Spanish Colonial Revival, Craftsman, Italianate, Courtyard Apartments, and vernacular style bungalows. Some of the houses were constructed as multiple-family properties and others included small rental houses situated behind the main residence. The sandstone curbs lining the street, stone retaining walls, and stone hitching posts are small-scale landscape elements that contribute to the historic character of the neighborhood and contribute to the district as unifying components.

Sandstone curbs are present within the project area on Chapala Street, but the current Chapala Street Bridge does not possess sandstone curbing. As the sandstone curbing may need to be removed on Chapala Street during construction, this activity would constitute a Class II impact (potentially significant unless mitigated) to the proposed West Beach Historic District.

The following mitigation measure would reduce impacts to the proposed district to less than significant levels:

- all existing sandstone curbing will be preserved either in situ or, if necessary, removed and reinstalled when the new roadway is put down. All curbing should be photographed in place prior to removal to guide reinstallation.

### **Properties Contributing to the Proposed West Beach Historic District (2001)**

Four properties, not discussed above, that contribute to the eligibility of the proposed West Beach Historic District are located within the architectural study area and listed below:

1. NRHP eligible and West Beach District contributor property at 120 Chapala Street (1914);
2. West Beach District contributor property at 133 Chapala Street (1941);
3. City Landmark and West Beach District contributor property at 203 Chapala Street (1924);
4. West Beach District contributor property at 135 Kimberly Avenue (1923).

Project activities adjacent to the above properties are limited to the application of new roadway. These resources will not be impacted by the project.

---

The architectural survey and research were conducted by Aubrie Morlet of Applied EarthWorks, Inc. under the supervision of M. Colleen Hamilton, who is listed on the most current City Qualified Historian List. The Caltrans documentation and this memorandum were written by Aubrie Morlet and M. Colleen Hamilton. The documents will be submitted to the City Planning Division, the Gledhill Library, and the Central Coast Information Center following review and approval by Caltrans and City regulatory personnel and approval by the Historic Landmarks Commission.

### 3.0 Content and Format

The HRER cover page lists the name and address of the applicant and the consultant preparing the report, along with the date the report was prepared. Michael Berman is the point of contact for the City Community Development Department. His telephone number is 805-564-5470; his e-mail address is [MBerman@SantaBarbaraCA.gov](mailto:MBerman@SantaBarbaraCA.gov). Telephone and email contact information for Aubrie Morlet is 559-229-1856, [AMorlet@appliedearthworks.com](mailto:AMorlet@appliedearthworks.com). M. Colleen Hamilton can be contacted at 951-766-2000 or [MChamilton@appliedearthworks.com](mailto:MChamilton@appliedearthworks.com). The addresses for the project study area are listed in Section 5 of the attached HRER and their locations are illustrated on HRER Map 3.

In compliance with City Historic Structures and Site Report requirements, the Caltrans HRER contains the following.

- Table of contents, project description, documents review and identification of previously recorded resources; identification and description of resources in the vicinity.
- Review of all the required information sources listed in MEA Section 2.4 – within the MEA-designated sensitivity zones: Spanish Colonial and Mexican Period; Hispanic-American Transition Period; American Period; and Early Twentieth Century.
- A site history, including neighborhood context, lot, historic events, associated persons, etc., along with architectural and social history of each structure detailed on the respective DPR record form.
- Field inventory, identifying previously and newly recorded resources, including DPR record forms (as detailed above).
- Photographs of buildings, structures, and objects, including surrounding streetscapes.
- Assessment of historic structures/sites, based on results of documents review and field inventory. Additional assessments for local eligibility criteria are detailed above.
- Evaluation of potential project impacts are detailed above.
- Recommended action/mitigation measures are not included in the HRER as required by Caltrans, but have been provided in detail above.
- No residual impacts are expected.
- A list of research resources utilized in report preparation is included in the HRER and includes all resources required in the MEA.
- Appendices including maps, preliminary plans, and Caltrans Bridge Inventory Sheet.

Three copies of the HRER are provided for internal review prior to submission to the Historic Landmarks Commission. Please consider the above additional information and contact me of you

---

have any questions or concerns. I can be reached by telephone at (951) 766-2000 or by email at [mchamilton@appliedearthworks.com](mailto:mchamilton@appliedearthworks.com).

Respectfully,

M. Colleen Hamilton, M.A., RPA  
Senior Architectural Historian/Historical Archaeologist  
Applied EarthWorks, Inc.

cc: Aubrie Morlet  
Ann Munns