

Present: ~~Minh Pham, Representing Ownership  
Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian  
Henry Lenny, Architect~~

Motion: ~~Final approval of Review After Final as submitted.~~

Action: ~~Boucher/Murray, 5/0/1. Hausz abstained.~~

### IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

8. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone  
(3:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
Application Number: MST2005-00490  
Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
Applicant: Project Solutions LLC  
Architect: Henry Lenny  
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements, and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Continued In-Progress review of Groups E and K.)**

### **(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)**

Present: Minh Pham, Representing Ownership  
Henry Lenny, Architect

#### Group K

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Building 4, acceptable in elevation and the plans need to be revised to reflect the elevations. 2) Building 4 shall have a looser landscape screen. 3) Buildings 25 and 26, acceptable in elevation and the plans need to be revised to reflect the elevations. 4) Building 27, acceptable in elevation and the plans need to be revised to reflect the elevations. 5) Building 27 shall have a looser landscape screen. 6) Building 28, stack the two windows on the right side of the east elevation; otherwise acceptable in elevation and the plans need to be revised to reflect the elevations. 7) Building 29, continue studying the west elevation and stack the windows on the left side of the north elevation. 8) Group E (the pool) will be reviewed in two weeks.

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 5/0/0.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:16 P.M. TO 3:25 P.M. \*\***

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

C. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(2:57)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST99-00305  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Agent: Project Solutions, LLC  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This site is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Review of additional phases will follow.)

**(Review After Final of minor wall bump-out at bathroom on east side of Building 11.)**

**THIS ITEM WAS HEARD OUT OF ORDER.**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect  
 Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian  
 James Jones, Representing Ownership

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board until a determination can be made whether changes are reasonable and necessary or to utilize the wall bump-out or not, and until the Staff Hearing Officer modification comments can be reviewed.

Action: Hausz/Rager.

Substitute Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:  
 1) The Applicant shall explore a design without the bump-out to the building.  
 2) Restore the two proposed windows to their prior repaired condition which would therefore not require a modification.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 9/0/0.

**IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**

8. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(3:27)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Continued In-Progress review of Cottages 28 and 29 of Group K.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY ON COTTAGE 28 WHICH REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL; COTTAGE 29 REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect  
 Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian  
 James Jones, Representing Ownership  
 Trish Allen, Associate Planner, SEPPS

Motion: **COTTAGES 29 OF GROUP K.**

Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following conditions: 1) North and west elevations are approved as submitted Historic Resource Findings. 2) The balcony shall be reduced to 30-inches.

**COTTAGES 28 OF GROUP K.**

Continued indefinitely with positive comments to the Planning Commission.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 9/0/0.

Staff to Track: 1) Buildings 4, 28, 29, and 25, 26, 27 or Group K need an Addendum Letter by the Historian either prior to or concurrent with Final Approval for compatibility with the surrounding historic structures. 2) Historic Structures Findings to be made for Cottage 29.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

9. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(3:32)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Continued review of Main Building.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect  
 Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian  
 James Jones, Representing Ownership  
 Trish Allen, Associate Planner, SEPPS

Motion: **MAIN BUILDING**

Continued two weeks with the Applicant to continue studying the exiting door from the proposed kitchen.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 9/0/0.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

15. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(5:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Continued Concept Review of alternate swimming pool/fitness center design of Group E.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL, AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect  
 Minh Pham, Representing Ownership  
 Alexandra Cole, Historian  
 Trish Allen, SEPPS

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with positive comments and acceptance of the design as proposed. Historic Resource Findings were made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 7/0/0. (Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

16. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(6:09) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Continued review of proposed valet parking structure and tennis court of Group L.)**

**CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED: PUBLIC HEARING**

9. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(5:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2007-00140  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(Multiple buildings are designated as Structures of Merit. Proposal for a revised Master Plan for El Encanto Hotel. The project involves a proposal for the elimination of tennis courts, the construction of valet parking above and operations facility below (Group L); a swimming pool with fitness center below (Group E); reapproval of Cottages 27 and 28 (Group N); and, construction of six new cottages (Mission Village) with partial underground parking on the northeast portion of the property (Group M). Phase 1 of the project (MST99-00305) is complete; portions of Phase 2 of the project (previously reviewed under MST2005-00490) including Groups E, L, and N, require Planning Commission approval and are being reviewed with this Phase 3 of the project with Group M, which requires Planning Commission approval as well. The project component Group M is the only component of the project to be reviewed at this hearing. Other components will be reviewed at future meetings.)

**(Eighth Concept Review focused on Group M, Mission Village. Project requires Environmental Assessment, Planning Commission approval, and Historic Resource Findings.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect  
 James Jones, Owner Representative  
 Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect  
 Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 6:09 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commented that the design was too fancy and should have more of a cottage farmhouse look, and the stairwell should have a Spanish revival look.

Public comment closed at 6:11 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission greatly appreciates the design staff's efforts and accepts the size, bulk, and scale of project; 2) The parking plinth shall be further modified to be more successfully wedded to the ground and architecture; 3) Applicant to restudy the scale of the too-tall fountain; 4) The curved form of the stairway, and the expression of the plinth in stone is supportable; and 5) The architecture remains generally acceptable with the Commission looking forward to the plan proceeding.

**Action:** Adams/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Hausz/Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

**Building 2:** 11) This is an important building because of its corner location, and it should be enhanced. 12) The building is successful in that the bigger part of the building was organized with a break in the middle. 13) Some Commissioners feel that the one story element appropriately breaks up the mass of the façade, but its importance could be diminished by having it pulled back so that it does not project out as much. 14) The overly differentiation of elements contradicts the intent of breaking up the building. It would be more successful if only certain areas were broken up.

**Building 3:** 15) Consider the lighting in the garages to be integrated into the ceiling, instead of having it hanging. 16) Provide more of a perception of mass at the garage opening supporting the masonry above on the south elevation. 17) Some simplification of the second story above the garage is desired. 18) The bold chamfer at the south elevation was well received. 19) Shorten the length and regularity of the balconies at the East A and East B elevations to lessen the dreaded “motel effect.” 20) The building should not have over-ornamentation because the building itself is quite simple. 21) A finer treatment of the arcade on East A, as suppose to the width of the columns between, will make it seem more open and less massive.

**Building 4:** 22) The exterior stair that is not ornamentation, but manages to ornament the building just the same, is appreciated. 23) Study a solution to the conflict between the desire for simplification and articulation; and plainness versus ornamentation. 24) Although none of the building’s elevations will be seen from the street, some in and out of the mass, without the loss of floor space, was suggested. 25) The top two floors that have exactly the same floor plan should be expressed as such on the outside of the building. 26) The over-differentiation and use of the painted brick is a problem. 27) The mass and punctuation within the mass is more successful with continuing proportions of the Spanish Mediterranean style.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Adams/Sharpe stepped down.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

14. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(6:37)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2007-00140  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(Multiple buildings are designated as Structures of Merit. Proposal for a revised Master Plan for El Encanto Hotel. The project involves a proposal for the elimination of tennis courts, the construction of valet parking above and operations facility below [Group L]; a swimming pool with fitness center below [Group E]; reapproval of Cottages 27 and 28 [Group N]; and, construction of six new cottages [Mission Village] with partial underground parking on the northeast portion of the property [Group M]. Phase 1 of the project [MST99-00305] is complete; portions of Phase 2 of the project [previously reviewed under MST2005-00490] including Groups E, L, and N, require Planning Commission approval and are being reviewed with this Phase 3 of the project with Group M, which requires Planning Commission approval as well.)

**(Ninth Concept Review focused on Group L, Operations Facility/Valet Parking.)**

Present: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers  
 Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
 Henry Lenny, Architect  
 James Jones, Representing Ownership  
 Trish Allen, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 7:02 p.m.

1. Jan von Yurt, neighbor, commented that he and some neighbors were in support of the underground parking, but is disappointed that the proposal has changed. He expressed concern with the setback modifications being requested by the applicant, the impact of construction on the neighborhood, and the traffic impacts that would result from the proposed valet parking.
2. Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that having a wall around the parking lot with hedges would solve problems addressed and that a higher wall may block much of the noise. He commended the owners of the property for retaining the historical aspects of the site. Mr. de Forest requested that historic sandstone be used to replace the modern stone brick pillars.

Public comment closed at 7:16 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:  
 1) Lower the parking at the beginning of the ramp by several feet, continue with a reasonable slope for drainage, and end it with at least a five foot high wall at the lowest end to reduce headlights shining onto Alvarado Street from the parking lot. 2) The Commission would not object to having open parking at this site. 3) A 60 foot long screen wall would be adequate to mitigate the impact of automobiles. 4) The break in the walls with skylights is acceptable. 5) An increase in lighting should not be included. 6) The noise produced by the valet parking should be reduced as much as possible. 7) A plaster wall in lieu of sandstone would be more appropriate and would save money, which could then be redirected to lowering the parking. 8) Keep intact as many pruned eucalyptus trees as possible on the north side of the property. Plant canopy trees around the perimeter of the property, in particular on Alvarado Street.

**Action:** Boucher/Adams, 8/0/0. (Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

**NEW ITEM**

A. 11 W VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone  
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001  
 Application Number: MST2008-00303  
 Owner: 1221 Victoria Court  
 Agent: Lenvik & Minor

(Proposal to enlarge an existing electrical equipment enclosure. There will be no new floor area.)

**Final Approval with the condition that all exposed conduit and piping above the existing enclosure be removed and reinstalled out of sight.**