



# City of Santa Barbara California

## STAFF HEARING OFFICER STAFF REPORT

**REPORT DATE:** March 28, 2012  
**AGENDA DATE:** April 4, 2012  
**PROJECT ADDRESS:** 20 Alisal Road (MST2011-00288)  
**TO:** Susan Reardon, Senior Planner, Staff Hearing Officer  
**FROM:** Planning Division, (805) 564-5470  
 Renee Brooke, AICP, Senior Planner *RB*  
 Jo Anne La Conte, Assistant Planner *JAL*

### I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The 41,382 square foot project site was previously developed with a single-family residence and a detached two-car garage, which were destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposed project consists of construction of a new 2,777 square foot single family residence, an attached 482 square foot two-car garage, and associated retaining wall system. The project will comply with all recommendations outlined in the Geotechnical report dated February 15, 2012, prepared by Workman Engineering and Consulting.

The discretionary applications required for this project are:

1. A Modification to permit new construction within the required 35-foot front setback (SBMC §28.15.060 & 28.92.110) and;
2. A Modification to allow a wall with guardrail to exceed 8' in height within the required 35-foot front setback (SBMC §28.87.170 & 28.92.110).

Date Application Accepted: February 22, 2012      Date Action Required: May 22, 2012

### II. RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Staff Hearing Officer approve the project, subject to conditions.

### III. SITE INFORMATION AND PROJECT STATISTICS

#### A. SITE INFORMATION

Applicant:	James Macari	Property Owner:	Michael & Christina Johnson
Parcel Number:	019-312-009	Lot Area:	41,382 sq. ft.
General Plan:	Major Hillside	Zoning:	A-1
Existing Use:	Vacant	Topography:	57%

Adjacent Land Uses:

North – Residential  
South – Residential

East - Residential  
West - Residential

**B. PROJECT STATISTICS**

	<b>Previous</b>	<b>Proposed</b>
Living Area	2,496 sq. ft.	2,777sq. ft.
Garage	440 sq. ft.	482 sq. ft.

**C. PROPOSED LOT AREA COVERAGE**

Building: 3,337 sf 8%      Hardscape: 623 sf 1.5%      Landscape: 37,422 sf 90.5%

**IV. DISCUSSION**

The proposed project involves constructing a new 2,777 square foot two-story single family residence with an attached 482 square foot two-car garage and associated retaining wall system. The prior single family residence and detached garage were destroyed by the November 2008 Tea Fire.

This project was reviewed by the Single Family Design Board (SFDB) on August 1, 2011 and March 5, 2012 and was forwarded to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments.

**Front Setback**

The previous development on site was not constructed in accordance with the 1977 archive plans. The detached garage was actually constructed in the private road and the residence was located in the required 35-foot front setback. The proposed project consists of rebuilding the single family residence in generally the same footprint as the previous residence, and relocating the garage next to the residence, five feet from the front lot line. A Modification is required to rebuild the residence, decks and garage within the required 35-foot front setback.

The new residence is proposed approximately 22.5 feet from the front line with decks approximately 13 feet from the front lot line, and the garage would be approximately 5 feet from the front lot line. Staff supports the requested Modification, which will allow for an expanded residence within the same general footprint of the previous house, on a slope constrained lot (57% slope) with A-1 Zoning requirements, and provide two covered parking spaces for the residence with a structure completely located on the private property.

Transportation staff has reviewed the new garage and determined that it will function as proposed, as the site is located at the end of the road that provides access to only two other adjacent driveways. Transportation staff recommends that the applicant consider widening the garage door to 18 feet to allow for easier maneuvering in and out of the garage. In addition, Transportation staff has requested that the applicant reverse the swing of the pedestrian doors in the garage, so that they swing out and not into the garage.

### **Over-Height Wall/Railing**

There is an existing retaining wall system, primarily located below the elevation of the road, ranging from 3' to 9.5' in height that is proposed to remain and is located in the required front setback. The proposal includes replacing a stairway/wall structure, which provides access to the front door of the residence below, and connects to the wall system at its existing height. Due to the steep slope of the property and current Building Code requirements, a minimum 42-inch high guardrail will be required on top of the wall. The wall, with a 42 inch guardrail on top, would range in height from approximately 6.5' to 13 feet.

The Zoning Ordinance limits fence heights located within required setbacks to eight feet. The intent of the fence height limitation in this area is to provide vision clearance and an open streetscape. Due to its location at the end of the road, the subject wall does not obstruct vision at the street intersection or driveway and therefore staff does not have safety concerns with the height of the wall. Staff believes the proposed modification for Building Code compliance is appropriate. Therefore, staff has added a condition to allow the guardrail at the minimum height required by Building Code.

## **V. FINDINGS AND CONDITIONS**

The Staff Hearing Officer finds that the Modifications are consistent with the purposes and intent of the Zoning Ordinance and are necessary to secure appropriate improvements on the lot. The proposed changes within the required setbacks allow for a single family residence to be replaced and for covered parking to be provided on a lot with significant development constraints. The proposed guardrails are appropriate because they are required for safety by the Building Code.

Said approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. The pedestrian doors to the garage shall swing out from, and not into, the garage.
2. The guardrail on top of the wall shall be the minimum height required to meet Building Code requirements, subject to review and approval by the SFDB.

### **Exhibits:**

- A. Site Plan (under separate cover)
- B. Applicant's letter, dated July 12, 2011
- C. SFDB Minutes dated August 1, 2011 & March 5, 2012

Contact/Case Planner: Jo Anne La Conte, Assistant Planner  
(jlaconte@SantaBarbaraCA.gov)  
630 Garden Street, Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
Phone: (805) 564-5470 x3320

Michael Johnson  
7334 Hollister #k  
Goleta, CA 93117

**RECEIVED**  
JUL 13 2011

12 July 2011

**CITY OF SANTA BARBARA  
PLANNING DIVISION**

Staff Hearing Officer  
City of Santa Barbara  
P.O. Box 1990  
Santa Barbara, CA 93102-1990

RE: Modification request for 20 Alisal Lane, Santa Barbara, CA:  
APN: 019-312-009

1. The subject property was involved in the Tea Fire. The residence was destroyed with the foundation system remaining in tact. The foundations were inspected and received passing conditions to replace residence on the same footprint. The previous residence was 2500 s.f. +/- two story with large decks. The previous garage was encroaching in the front yard setback and right of way easement. The previous residence also was encroaching in the front yard setback.
2. The Modification being requested is to allow the reconstruction of the previous residence and garage. The existing footprint will be used and the garage will be relocated to sit entirely within the property. The front yard set back is still encroached upon by the residence, and with new relocated area of the garage will do the same. The existing condition of the site topography dictates the location and foundation structure for the new garage. The new residence will remain in its previous location and conditions.
3. The Modification for the residence encroachment in the front yard setback of the residence is to allow pre-fire condition. The encroachment of the garage in the front yard setback is the result of topography and access from Alisal lane.
4. The reconstruction of a residence on a previously developed lot with the relocation of an encroaching garage is a benefit to the neighborhood and no new impact to the community.

**JAMES  
MAYO  
MACARI**  
ARCHITECT, AIA

Mailing Address: 26185 Bear Valley Rd, Bear Valley Springs, CA 93561  
Office: 220 West Canon Perdido, Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
805-898-0747 Fax 898-0746

**EXHIBIT B**

I respectfully ask the planning commission to allow these modifications.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'm. h.' followed by a long horizontal stroke.

Michael Johnson  
7334 Hollister Ave, Suite K  
Goleta, Ca 93117

**SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD**  
**MINUTES**

**Monday, August 1, 2011**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**3:00 P.M.**

**NEW ITEM**

**G. 20 ALISAL RD**

**A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-312-009  
Application Number: MST2011-00288  
Owner: Embree-Englesberg Community Property Trust  
Architect: James Macari  
Applicant: MBJ Homes

(Proposal to construct a new 2,384 square foot two-story, single-family residence and a new 482 square foot attached two-car garage located on a 41,382 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous residence was destroyed by the Tea Fire. The current proposal will relocate the garage outside of the required public right-of-way. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow the new house and garage to encroach into the required front setback. The proposed total of 2,866 square feet is 58% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)**

**Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:**

- 1) The Board understands the site plan constraints regarding the proposed location of the garage.
- 2) Study the proposed roof height and roof pitch.
- 3) Replace the proposed turret roof design to match the two-piece mission tile (it is acceptable to be its own separate element). Study the height and pitch of the proposed roof.

**SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD**  
**CONSENT CALENDAR**  
**MINUTES**

**Monday, March 5, 2012**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**11:00 A.M.**

**CONTINUED ITEM**

**A. 20 ALISAL RD**

**A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-312-009  
Application Number: MST2011-00288  
Owner: Embree- Englesberg Community Property Trust  
Architect: James Macari  
Applicant: MBJ Homes  
Owner: Michael B. Christina M. Johnson

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to construct a new 2,777 square foot two-story single-family residence and a new 482 square foot attached two-car garage located on a 41,382 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous residence was destroyed by the Tea Fire. The current proposal will relocate the garage outside of the required public right-of-way. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow the new house and garage to encroach into the required front setback. The proposed total of 3,259 square feet is 66% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)**

**Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:**

- 1) The Board understands the site constraints and finds the proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.
- 2) Provide all applicable details; including chimney cap details (Sheet A-7), as called out on elevations.

The ten-day appeal period was announced from the date of approval ratification of these minutes by the Board on Monday, March 12, 2012.