



City of Santa Barbara California

STAFF HEARING OFFICER STAFF REPORT

REPORT DATE: January 18, 2012
AGENDA DATE: January 25, 2012
PROJECT ADDRESS: 117- 119 W. Mason Street (MST2011-00123)
TO: Susan Reardon, Senior Planner, Staff Hearing Officer
FROM: Planning Division, (805) 564-5470
 Renee Brooke, AICP, Senior Planner *RLB*
 Jo Anne La Conte, Assistant Planner *JAL*

I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The approximately 5,539 square foot project site is currently developed with a 1,115 square foot one-story single family residence and a detached 824 square foot duplex with a three-car garage and 156 square feet of laundry/storage area below. The proposed project involves a 618 square foot second-story addition and a 30 square foot lower level addition to the existing one-story single family residence in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.

The discretionary applications required for this project are Modifications to allow the second-story addition to be located within the required 6' interior setbacks (SBMC §28.21.060 & 28.92.110).

Date Application Accepted: January 11, 2012 Date Action Required: April 11, 2012

II. RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Staff Hearing Officer approve the project, subject to conditions.

III. SITE INFORMATION AND PROJECT STATISTICS

A. SITE INFORMATION

Applicant:	Dawn Sherry	Property Owner:	Arthur W. Toga
Parcel Number:	033-101-003	Lot Area:	5,539 sq. ft.
General Plan:	Hotel & Residential	Zoning:	R-4/SD-3
Existing Uses:	Single Family Dwelling and Duplex	Topography:	Flat

Adjacent Land Uses:

North - Residential	East - Residential
South - Alley/Commercial	West - Residential

B. PROJECT STATISTICS

	Existing	Proposed
Living Area	117 (SFR) = 1,115 sq. ft. 119 (Duplex) = 824 sq. ft.	+648 sq. ft. = 1,763 sq. ft. No change
Garage	666 sq. ft.	No change
Accessory Space	156 sq. ft.	No change

C. PROPOSED LOT AREA COVERAGE

Building: 2,191 sf 40% Hardscape: 1,145 sf 20% Landscape: 2,203 sf 40%

IV. BACKGROUND

The existing development on site consists of a one-story single family residence and a detached duplex with a three-car garage and accessory space below. The number of parking spaces for the existing development is non-conforming with three covered spaces; the Zoning Ordinance requires four covered and two uncovered parking spaces for the existing units on the lot. The property is conforming to density and open yard requirements. The property is non-conforming to both interior setbacks.

A Zoning Information Report (ZIR2010-00145) for the property identified building violations for interior alterations to the storage and laundry rooms on site. A condition has been included to address the building violations identified in the ZIR.

V. ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS

A Historic Structures Report approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) for the proposed project determined that the single-family residence is eligible for listing as a Structure of Merit and that the project impacts would be less than significant. In addition, the proposed project was reviewed by the City's Environmental Analyst and it was determined that the building is located in an archeological resources sensitivity zone. A Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report, an Extended Phase 1 Cultural Resources Investigation and an Addendum to the Extended Phase 1 Cultural Resources Report were accepted by the HLC with recommendations that construction be monitored by a qualified archeologist and a recognized Chumash Native American, and conditions outlined in the Addendum. Those conditions are included in staff's recommendation for project approval. The Environmental Analyst has determined that, the project is exempt from further environmental review pursuant to California Environmental Quality Guidelines Sections 15301 & 15305.

VI. DISCUSSION

The proposed project involves a conforming 30 square foot first floor addition, a 618 square foot second-story addition and exterior alterations to the existing single family residence. No changes are proposed to the existing duplex, three car garage or accessory space.

The existing single family residence on site is non-conforming to both 6' interior yard setbacks, at approximately 5', which appears to be consistent with the two-story buildings on both adjacent properties. In order to construct a uniform addition and to maintain the design integrity of the existing structure, the proposed second-story addition would encroach approximately 1.5' into the 6' interior setback on the West side of the property and approximately 1' into the 6' interior setback on the East side of the property. In addition, five new windows are proposed in the interior setbacks; three on the West elevation and two on the East elevation. The five new windows proposed in the setbacks are relatively small and have been designed to be compatible with the existing architecture. Per the applicant's letter dated August 23, 2011, the fenestrations have been designed to maintain privacy for both the property owners and the adjacent neighbors. Staff supports the Modification requests, which will allow for a reasonable addition to the existing building and result in a cohesive architectural appearance for the existing development on site.

The project was reviewed by the HLC on May 11, 2011 and August 17, 2011 and was continued to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments. The HLC expressed support for the side yard setback encroachments in an attempt to make continuous wall planes appropriate for the style of architecture.

VII. FINDINGS AND CONDITIONS

The Staff Hearing Officer finds that the Modifications are consistent with the purposes and intent of the Zoning Ordinance and are necessary to secure appropriate improvements on the lot. The proposed encroachments into the required interior setbacks allow for a uniform addition to the residence and maintain the design integrity of the existing structure on site.

Said approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. Archaeological and Chumash monitoring shall be conducted as required per the Addendum to the Extended Phase 1 Report Extended dated December 1, 2011, prepared by George Toren of Compass Rose Archaeological, Inc as follows:
 - a. Should removal of the existing patio become necessary, this removal shall be monitored by a qualified archeologist and Native American to assure that no inadvertent damage is done to the site.
 - b. An archeologist and Native American should be present when any work is done that could potentially impact the site deposit (i.e. removing any existing house supports, placing of the moisture barrier, etc.)
 - c. The cultural materials already collected by Compass Rose and any additional items collected during the monitoring program will be curate at the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History at the property owner's expense.
2. The Building violations identified in the Zoning Information Report (ZIR2010-00416) shall be corrected as part of this permit.

STAFF HEARING OFFICER STAFF REPORT
117 W. MASON STREET (MST2011-00123)
JANUARY 18, 2012
PAGE 4

Exhibits:

- A. Site Plan (under separate cover)
- B. Applicant's letter, dated August 23, 2011
- C. HLC Minutes dated May 11, 2011 & August 17, 2011

Contact/Case Planner: Jo Anne La Conte, Assistant Planner
(jlaconte@SantaBarbaraCA.gov)
630 Garden Street, Santa Barbara, CA 93101
Phone: (805) 564-5470 x3320

SHERRY AND ASSOCIATES, ARCHITECTS
513 SANTA BARBARA STREET
SANTA BARBARA, CA 93101
(805) 963-0986

RECEIVED
AUG 23 2011

CITY OF SANTA BARBARA
PLANNING DIVISION

DATE: AUGUST 23, 2011

TO: City of Santa Barbara
Planning Dept
Staff Hearing Officer
PO Box 1990
Santa Barbara, CA 93102

FROM: Dawn Sherry Sherry and Associates, Architects
PO Box 23634 Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 963-0986
dawn@dawnsherry.com

RE: Modification Request for:
117 West Mason Street
Santa Barbara, CA

Dear Staff Hearing Officer,

As Architect and Agent for the Owners I am requesting Modifications to the property located at 117 West Mason Street. Currently existing on the site are two structures. One two story structure in the rear of the property that is a duplex with three one-car garages on the lower level and attached storage for the units. The front structure is a one story single family residence facing West Mason Street.

1. **Modification to allow a portion of the proposed two-story addition to encroach into the required interior yards on both the west and the east elevations.**

We are requesting these two Modifications in order to secure an appropriate addition with regards to maintaining the design integrity of the existing structure. Both the Historic Landmark Commission and the Historic Structures Report for the property have stated that the two story stacked walls of the side elevations are appropriate in order to maintain the existing style of architecture. To offset the upper level walls would be an inappropriate solution to the existing Spanish Colonial Revival style.

We feel the Modifications are justified in order to secure a very appropriate solution to the integrity of the existing design. The structure will still be much smaller than the adjacent two structures to both the east and west of subject property. In addition, the fenestrations proposed have been designed to maintain privacy for both the Property Owners and the two adjacent neighbors.

Thank you for your consideration of these Modifications and please feel free to call if you have any questions.

Sincerely,
Dawn Sherry



EXHIBIT B

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES

Wednesday, May 11, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 117 W MASON ST

R-4/SD-3 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-003
Application Number: MST2011-00123
Owner: Floyd R. Fleming Trust
Owner: Arthur Toga
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "**Contributing property to the Potential West Beach Historic District.**" Proposal for alterations and a 720 square foot, second-story addition to an existing 1,115 square foot, one-story single-family residence. No changes are proposed in the legal detached two-story garage with 666 square feet of garage space, a 156 square foot laundry room, and an 824 square-foot, second-story dwelling unit. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a zoning modification for the addition to encroach into the required interior setbacks. Project requires Coastal Review on this 5,539 square foot parcel located in the appealable and non-appealable jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone. The project will result in total development on site of 3,481 square feet and will address violations called out in Zoning Information Report ZIR2010-00416.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Staff Hearing Officer review of a Zoning Modification, and Coastal Review.)

Present: Dawn Sherry and Gregg Pellegrini, Architects

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on expansion of one-story structure towards the 119 duplex rather than a second-story addition.

Public comment closed at 2:18 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Support was expressed for the restoration of the window screen, the matching of the simplicity of building style, and the side yard setback encroachment modifications in an attempt to make continuous wall planes as appropriate in the style of architecture.
2. Restudy the integration of the addition into the existing structure.
3. Of concern is the size of the second story addition as currently proposed and its impact on both the neighborhood and the existing structure.
4. It was recommended that the architect and owner see the property originally designed by Mary Osborne Craig and altered by Mark Shields located at 2100 Laguna Street for inspiration on second story additions.
5. Provide profiles/sections of adjoining structures, including those to the rear.
6. Retain the design of the existing chimney in the new chimneys. The exterior expression of the existing chimney should remain.

Action: La Voie/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES

Wednesday, August 17, 2011 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. **117 W MASON ST** R-4/SD-3 Zone

(4:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-003
 Application Number: MST2011-00123
 Owner: Floyd R Fleming Trust
 Owner: Arthur Toga
 Architect: Dawn Sherry

(This parcel is identified as a "Contributing property to the Potential West Beach Historic District." Proposal for alterations and a 720 square foot, second-story addition to an existing 1,115 square foot, one-story single-family residence. No changes are proposed in the legal detached two-story garage with 666 square feet of garage space, a 156 square foot laundry room, and an 824 square-foot, second-story dwelling unit. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a zoning modification for the addition to encroach into the required interior setbacks. Project requires Coastal Review on this 5,539 square foot parcel located in the appealable and non-appealable jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone. The project will result in total development on site of 3,481 square feet and will address violations called out in Zoning Information Report ZIR2010-00416.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Staff Hearing Officer review of a Zoning Modification, and Coastal Review.)

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect, Sherry & Associates

Public comment opened at 4:19 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the importance of the project's street presence.

Public comment closed at 4:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. Support was expressed in a previous review for the restoration of the window screen, matching the simplicity of building style, and the side yard setback encroachment modifications in an attempt to make continuous wall planes as appropriate in the style of architecture.
2. In subsequent submittals, both the existing and proposed elevations should be shown on the plans.
3. The Commission prefers the gabled roof.
4. There was no preference with respect to having the fireplace engaged or unengaged with the wall.
5. The Commission prefers the inset on the two side elevations located on the second floor as depicted with a gash line on Sheet A1.2 Proposed Upper Floor Level Plan.

Action: Orías/Murray, 6/0/1. (Drury abstained. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

Note: The Consent Calendar reviewer shall refer to the 11 x 17 preferred elevations dated August 17, 2011.