



# City of Santa Barbara California

## STAFF HEARING OFFICER STAFF REPORT

**REPORT DATE:** July 12, 2006  
**AGENDA DATE:** July 19, 2006  
**PROJECT ADDRESS:** 2100 Laguna Street (MST2005-00539)  
**TO:** Staff Hearing Officer  
**FROM:** Planning Division, (805) 564-5470  
 Danny Kato, Zoning & Enforcement Supervisor *DK*  
 Roxanne Milazzo, Associate Planner

### I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The project site is located on the corner of Laguna & Padre Streets. The 5,800 square foot site is currently developed with a 1,313 square foot single family residence and 266 square foot detached garage. The proposed project involves 459 square feet of first and second floor additions to the residence, site walls, and legalization of an "as-built" fountain.

### II. REQUIRED APPLICATIONS

The discretionary application required for this project is a Modification to permit the first floor portion of the addition to be located within the required open yard and five-foot (5') separation distance for accessory structures, and for the fountain and site walls to be located within required front and interior yard setbacks (SBMC §28.15.060 & 28.04.020).

Date Application Accepted: June 19, 2006      Date Action Required: September 19, 2005

### III. SITE INFORMATION AND PROJECT STATISTICS

#### A. SITE INFORMATION

Applicant:	Mark Shields	Property Owner:	Same
Parcel Number:	025-265-016	Lot Area:	5,858 sf
General Plan:	3 Units Per Acre	Zoning:	E-1
Existing Use:	Residential	Topography:	12% Slope
Adjacent Land Uses:			
	North - Residential		East - Residential
	South - Residential		West - Residential

**B. PROJECT STATISTICS**

	<b>Existing</b>	<b>Proposed</b>
Living Area	1,313 sf	1,773 sf
Garage	266 sf	No Change
Accessory Space	None	No Change

**IV. LOT AREA COVERAGE**

Lot Area:	5,858 sf
Building:	1,952 sf; 33%
Landscape:	2,703 sf; 46%
Hardscape	1,203 sf; 20%

**V. DISCUSSION**

A Historic Structures Report was approved on September 28, 2005. Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated his preference that the house not be altered at all, but found the additions to this "Structure of Merit-worthy" residence meeting the intent of the Secretary of the Interior Standards. This project was reviewed by the Historic Landmark Commission and given favorable comments on May 3, 2006.

Staff recognizes the site constraints associated with a 5,800 square foot lot being zoned E-1 which requires thirty-foot front yard setbacks. Being located on a corner results in thirty foot front yards off of both frontages. The proposed first floor addition observes the front and interior yard setbacks but requires relief of the open yard area. As shown on the site plan, this property will still maintain adequate outdoor living space, as intended by the ordinance, for outdoor enjoyment in the private area located off the kitchen. All second story portions of the proposed improvement have been designed to comply with all current zoning regulations. The distance between the residential addition and the existing garage on site is a definition regulation and does not impact either structure. The three foot separation being maintained provides adequate area for accessing the rear yard and actually creates an improved privacy benefit. Lastly, the "as-built" fountain provides a landscape element, located in an appropriate area, and does not violate the purpose and intent of the ordinance which is to limit floor area/building within the front yard setback.

**VI. RECOMMENDATION/FINDING**

Staff recommends that the staff hearing officer approve the project, making the findings that the Modifications being requested are necessary to secure appropriate improvements on site while meeting the purpose and intent of the ordinance with the condition that a Zoning compliance Declaration be recorded against the property's title and that the floor plan configuration be adjusted as required by the Zoning Plans Examiner. Also, the front entry wall be removed from the plans until approved by the Historic Landmark Commission.

Exhibits:

- A. Site Plan
- B. Applicant's letter dated 6/19/06
- C. HLC Minutes
- D. Neighborhood Support

Contact/Case Planner: Roxanne Milazzo, Associate Planner  
([rmilazzo@SantaBarbaraCA.gov](mailto:rmilazzo@SantaBarbaraCA.gov))  
630 Garden Street, Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
Phone: (805)564-5470



Mark and Jody Shields  
2100 Laguna Street  
Santa Barbara CA 93101  
563.1415

6/19/06

Modification Hearing Officer  
City of Santa Barbara  
P.O. Box 1990  
SB CA 93102-1990

Re: Modification Request for;

2100 Laguna Street  
SB CA 93101

APN # 025-263-016

E-1

~~DEAR~~ STAFF HEARING OFFICER,

On our property there is an existing house of 1313 Net SF and a detached single car garage of 266 Net SF. The garage encroaches 8' into the northerly 10' side yard setback and 9' into the easterly 10' side yard setback. The house encroaches 16' into the 30' westerly front yard setback and 10' into the southerly 30' front yard setback. The home is located on a corner and is encumbered by two 30' front yard setbacks.

The first modification requested is to allow the northern ground level bedroom addition to be placed in a portion of the required open yard area. This addition will allow the reconfiguration of the existing plan to best accommodate an interior stair to the second level master bedroom addition. Thus creating a much needed study and extra bedroom for our growing family. "The Parents" need a more private bedroom and the "Kids" need separate bedrooms as we have a son and a daughter. The existing home now has only two small bedrooms and minimal 1920's closets.

The second modification requested is to allow our northerly ground level addition to encroach 18" into the required 5' space between the garage and our ground floor bedroom addition. This small encroachment helps create a more useable bedroom and further

increases the privacy of the "North Court". We see no need to have a 5' passage between our garage and bedroom, this space is better utilized as living space within our bedroom addition.

The benefit of our modest bedroom addition is twofold. It provides much needed space for our growing family, and the ground level bedroom addition helps make our outdoor open yard more functional and private. By adding to the north we create a private "North Court" . This concept makes use of the narrow space between our garage and house, space which is currently very open to busy Laguna Street, is not functional or private, slopes, and functions only for circulation. By creating an additional private courtyard we add to our aggregate useable outdoor open space! Currently none of our outdoor open spaces have the required 20' minimal width, yet they are comfortable and compliment the traditional Santa Barbara Spanish Colonial style. If you add up the square footage of our existing and proposed courtyards we exceed the 1250 sf open yard area! Our ground level addition helps balance the "mass bulk and scale" of our second story addition, and prevents the need for a more aggressive second story addition. This concept won favor with the Historic Landmarks Commission.

Thank you for this consideration,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'mjs', with a small flourish underneath.

Mark and Jo Shields

Addenda to Modification Request

June 30, 2006

Mark and Jo Shields  
2100 Laguna Street  
SB CA 93101

Dear Modification Hearing Officer,

We understand that we need an additional modification for our existing fountain and a modification to allow our easterly site walls to be connected to the house with an arched opening. The reason for this request is as follows:

1. The existing fountain is an attractive amenity to our home, poses no congregation issues and will further enhance our future entry courtyard when enclosed by our proposed 4' site wall. Having a fountain at the entry is also typical of Spanish Colonial Architecture.
2. Connecting the easterly site walls with an arched opening to the house poses no congregation issues and further enhances the courtyard feel of the home. It is also typical of Spanish Colonial Architecture and appropriate for site walls to be connected with an arch to the house.

Thank you for this consideration,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'M & J Shields', written in a cursive style.

The Shields





## **HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION COMMENTS – MAY 3, 2006**

Kellam De Forest expressed concern over the impact of a second story addition in the neighborhood.

The following letter was read into the record by Chair Suding:

Robin Jones, neighbor at 402 Plaza Rubio, stated that the applicant discussed the addition with their neighbors and she expressed support for the project. In addition, around a dozen other neighbors signed a petition showing support for the project.

Straw vote: How many of the Commissioners are in favor of the modification of the side yard setback for the first story? 7/0/0.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comment that the Commission supports the proposed design and finds that a four foot high wall at the front entrance is appropriate.

Action: Hausz/Pujo. Murray stepped down. 7/0/0.

## **HLC REVIEW OF HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT – SEPTEMBER 28, 2005**

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated the house is a good example of Spanish Colonial Revival architecture. The report finds the house is Structure of Merit-worthy and concludes that the proposal does not meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards to the letter, but with the exception of the six foot high entry wall, the proposal does meet the intent of the Standards. Mr. Jacobus stated his preference that the house not be altered, but if it is to be altered, the proposed architecture appears to meet the intent of the Standards.

Kellem De Forest, resident, reiterated the importance of the structure as part of an overall plan that Mary Craig was attempting to create as an entry way to the Santa Barbara Mission. Mr. De Forest related the importance of maintaining the vision of the original urban planning.

HLC Comments: At the applicant's request, the HLC commented on the proposed six foot-high wall at the entrance to the house. The HLC supports the Historic Structures Report's conclusion that a six foot-high wall is inappropriate at that location. The HLC would consider a wall of less than six feet if one is proposed as part of the overall design, but made it clear that their willingness to consider a wall does not assure that they will ultimately approve a wall at the front entrance.

Fermina Murray, Historian and Preparer of the report, stated she cannot support adding into the report the addition of the wall, at any height, as it would constitute an adverse impact on the resource.

Motion: The Commission approved the report as submitted.

Action: Pujo/La Voie, 4/3/1/1. Hsu, Naylor, and Spann opposed. Murray stepped down. Hausz abstained.



April 16, 2006

Historic Landmarks Commission

\*  
(22 NEIGHBORS)

Dear Commissioners,

We have reviewed the Shield's plans for their home at 2100 Laguna Street. We find the addition and site walls compatible with our neighborhood.

Stan Buehler, 2121 Garden St.

Clyde Slantz 411 E Padre St.

June Slantz 411 E Padre St.

June Foytner 430 Plaza Rubio

Robert Foytner 430 Plaza Rubio

Mark Klaus 420 Plaza Rubio

Shannon Crane 420 Plaza Rubio S.B.

Jack Slantz

Respectfully,

Livella Slantz 2111 LAGUNA ST.

SD

The adjacent neighbors.

Heanne Vapnek 414 Plaza Rubio

April 16, 2006

Historic Landmarks Commission

Dear Commissioners,

We have reviewed the Shield's plans for their home at 2100 Laguna Street. We find the addition and site walls compatible with our neighborhood.

Rodney Brown 407 E. PADRE

Gail M. McLaren 404 E. Padre

Richard McLaren 409 E Padre St.

Mr. & Mrs. Ernest H. Jones 402 Plaza Rubio

Deborah Dvonle 340 E. Los Olivos St.

STEPH T. Hoke 339 E. PADRE ST.

Ciruelo Bencos 2105 Laguna St.

J. Barth 342 E PADRE ST

Margie Sims Klinger 4116 E Padre St

Respectfully,

Domeni Brannen 330 JUNIPERO TRAIL

The adjacent neighbors.

April 30.

ROBIN JONES

Historic Landmarks Commission:

Our neighbors Jody and Mark Shields wish to add a small addition to their existing home at 2100 Laguna St.

They brought a lovely model of their prospective Plans and we discussed the addition as we are their near neighbors.

We felt it was perfectly fine with us and really appreciated their careful explanation, sometimes neighbors are not so thoughtful.

Please give it your  
(over)

Careful consideration and  
hopefully let them build.

Robin Jones

Mrs. Ernest H. Jones  
402 Plaza Radio