



City of Santa Barbara

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD

MINUTES

AUGUST 5, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:
Fred Sweeney, *Chair*
Brian Miller, *Vice Chair*
Jan Ferrell
Lisa James
Joseph Moticha
Robert Richards
Jonathan H. Ziegler

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:
Jason Dominguez
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:
Addison Thompson

STAFF:
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Erica Monson, Planning Technician
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (until 6:09 p.m.), Ferrell, James, Moticha (at 3:07 p.m.), Richards, and Ziegler

Members absent: None

Staff present: Unzueta (3:31 – 4:30 p.m.), Ostrenger (until 4:23 p.m.), Monson, and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **July 22, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: James/Ferrell, 6/0/0. (Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 29, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members Moticha and James.

Action: Miller/Ziegler, 6/0/0. (Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 5, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members Moticha and James.

Action: Ferrell/Ziegler, 6/0/0. (Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Monson announced the following:

- a. Item 1 is a discussion item on Discrimination and Harassment Policy presented by Sarah Gorman, City Clerk Services Manager.
- b. Allison De Busk, Senior Planner and Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney will be present for Item 2, 1631 Shoreline Drive.
- c. Robert Dostalek, Assistant Planner will be present during Item 3, 1553 Shoreline Drive.
- d. Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner will be present during Items 4, 5, 6, and 7 for 1202 Diana Road.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(3:15PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. DISCUSSION ON DISCRIMINATION/HARASSMENT POLICY

Reference Number: PLN2019-00235

Staff: Sarah Gorman, City Clerk Services Manager

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Sarah Gorman, City Clerk Services Manager, City of Santa Barbara

Ms. Gorman discussed and defined discrimination that is prohibited under the City's Discrimination and Harassment policy and Board members signed an acknowledgement of said policy.

(3:45PM) REVIEW AFTER FINAL APPROVAL

2. 1631 SHORELINE DR

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-022

Zone: E-3/SD-3

Application Number: PLN2016-00241

Owner: Chad Yonker

Applicant: Tom Ochsner

Landscape Architect: Charles McClure Landscape Architect & Associates

(Approved project is a proposal to remodel and add 422 square feet of first floor additions and a 1,356 square foot second story addition to an existing one-story single family residence. Project will address

violations in ZIR2016-00169 and ENF2008-00161 related to the remodel, as-built retaining walls and decks along the bluff which were removed without approvals or permits. Other site improvements include landscape changes, a new wood fence, new plaster wall, a new concrete driveway and a flagstone patio. The proposed total of 3,986 square feet on a 20,100 square foot lot located in Hillside Design District is 85% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR.)

Approval of Review After Final is requested for a 9'-0" ceiling height for the first floor rather than the 8'-0" ceiling height approved on July 8, 2019. See Staff memo.

Actual time: 3:30 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Applicant; and Allison DeBusk, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Ostrenger stated that the July 8, 2019 decision made by the Board was appealed to City Council. She explained that Staff is supportive of a second Review After Final review, but during this review the Board should not consider the fact that the prior decision has been appealed.

Ms. DeBusk stated that the project went to the Planning Commission for consideration of the Substantial Conformance Determination and consistency with the Coastal Development Permit, and that she will be available to answer any questions.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m.

Written correspondence from Jon Kauffman, Jesse Wooten, Kip Fulbeck, and Mary Wise were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:51 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

Action: Moticha/Ziegler, 6/1/0. (Sweeney opposed.) Motion carried.

Individual comments:

1. Board Member Sweeney is opposed to the project as he cannot support neighborhood compatibility findings in regards to substantial completion. The substantial completion requirement changed with the removal of the existing 10 foot framing, changing the project substantially.
2. Board Member James stated that she is in support of the project because the 9'-0" ceiling height for the first floor is reasonable for this particular project based on previous review and approval of a 10'-0" ceiling height.
3. Board Member Ferrell is in support of the project because she can understand the Owner's desire for a 9'-0" ceiling height and would want that for her own home.
4. Board Member Ziegler is in support of the project because the net increase in height of the project is acceptable.
5. Board Member Moticha is in support because the proposed project meets SFDB Guidelines.
6. Board Member Miller is in support because the project fits the neighborhood.
7. Board Member Richards is in support of the project because it substantially conforms to what was previously approved.

(4:05PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**3. 1553 SHORELINE DR**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-043
Zone: E-3/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2019-00326
Owner: Rondal Dean Broome
Agent: Trish Allen
Applicant: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to construct a new approximately 2,755 square foot, two-story residence with an attached approximately 584 square foot three-car garage with a 33 square foot attached storage area. The project also includes a new patio, pool, and spa on a 23,333 square foot vacant lot on the coastal bluff. Grading for the project would involve approximately 340 cubic yards of cut and 35 cubic yards of fill. The proposed total of 3,339 square feet of development on a 23,333 square foot lot is 71% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

No final appealable action will be taken at this hearing. Project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit located in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.

Actual time: 4:22 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; Tom Ochsner, Applicant; and Robert Dostalek, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Mr. Dostalek clarified that as a component of the project, the Applicant will be required to conduct a Visual Evaluation of the project in order to minimize impacts on scenic public views and explore design alternatives. He requests that the Board provide comments that will assist the Applicant with preparing the Visual Evaluation.

Public comment opened at 4:47 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The Board has reviewed the scheme outlined on the drawings labeled July 15, 2019, and appreciates the Applicant's desire to pursue contemporary architecture.
2. Review alternative contemporary approaches, using elements of pitched roofs that mimic the nature of the neighborhood.
3. The Board defines the neighborhood as Shoreline Drive, between the edge of Washington School and the edge of Shoreline Park, and along the bluff and up to Santa Rosa Avenue for the purposes of this study. Consider any view corridors from Loyola Drive as it returns to Payeras Street.
4. In order to meet the Scenic Resources and Visual Quality policy, consider studying at least the following building configurations:
 - a. A site study that would place building footprint and geometry (size, bulk, and scale) on one-half side of the site, running east to west.
 - b. An additional study could be made of a series of pavilions that alternate from the north-south boundaries of the site as defined on Sheet A-S1.0 that would still allow for a direct view corridor for pedestrians using either side of Shoreline Drive.

- c. Additional studies to address the issue are acceptable.
- 5. The Board recognizes that the site is unique, in that the site is located on the end of an incline street, specifically Loyola Avenue.
- 7. Provide section studies or other visual elements in order to evaluate how the view corridor is depicted from at least two to three positions along Loyola Avenue down to Shoreline Drive.
- 8. Applicant shall return, in all scenarios, with an overview of how each scenario would be applied with landscaping in order to ensure privacy for both the Owner and how it affects the public scenic views from the corridor.

Action: Sweeney/Moticha, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

(4:35PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

4. 1202 DIANA RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-008
 Zone: RS-6
 Application Number: PLN2017-00217
 Owner: BLH Properties LLC
 Applicant: Shaun Lynch
 Contractor: Vernon Construction

(The project consists of a proposal to subdivide an existing 1.06 acre parcel into four (4) lots in the RS-6, Single Residential Zone and Low Density Residential (Max 5 Dwelling Units/Acre) General Plan designation. The proposed lots vary in size from 9,004 to 15,505 square feet and comply with General Plan and Zoning density. Proposed lot 3 includes alterations to the existing Structure of Merit to include the demolition of all "as-built" non-permitted additions to return to the configuration of the original 1921 adobe residence. Also proposed is the addition of an attached two-car garage at the rear of the residence. The proposal will result in a 975 square foot residence, and a 400 square foot garage. Other site alterations include the demolition of the existing detached garage and detached accessory buildings. Site improvements for the subdivision include site grading (1,000 cubic yards of cut and 540 cubic yards of fill), removal of five (5) existing Oak trees, proposal for 22 replacement Oak trees, and approximately 8,500 square feet of paving to create a new shared driveway easement connecting the proposed four lots to Cota Street, including alterations to the existing driveway/access for the existing condominiums on the adjacent lot, located at 1133 E Cota Street. The existing driveway to Diana Road will remain as a secondary access. The proposal includes development of one new primary dwelling unit on three of the four proposed lots, ranging in size from 2,161 to 2,694 square feet, including an attached two-car garage. The application will address violations identified in ENF2017-00868.)

Project Design Approval is requested. The project obtained Planning Commission approval for a Tentative Subdivision Map (TSM), Public Street Waiver, and Street Frontage Modifications. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 006-19. Neighborhood Preservation and Grading findings are required. Project was last reviewed on May 29, 2018.

Actual time: 5:31 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning; Shaun Lynch, Evoke Design; and Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Bedard requested that the Board make the Neighborhood Preservation findings, Subdivision Grading findings, and was available to answer any questions.

Public comment opened at 5:45 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Grandcolas

Written correspondence from Dino Dal Bon was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:48 p.m.

- Motion:** **Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:**
1. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the following comments:
 - a. The consistency and appearance is consistent with the scenic character of the City and enhances the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. The project is compatible with the character of the neighborhood in its size, bulk, and scale.
 - c. The paving materials presented are acceptable in terms of the driveway and fencing material on Sheet A-105. The 5 foot tall wood slats are acceptable.
 - d. The project complies with Good Neighbor Guidelines.
 2. The Grading findings have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050.C of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the following comments:
 - a. The proposed grading will not significantly increase siltation in or decrease the water quality of streams, drainages or water storage facilities to which the property drains; and
 - b. The proposed grading will not cause substantial loss of southern oak woodland habitat.
 3. The neighborhood is defined as the area surrounded by mid-block Cota Street, between Chiquita Road down to Voluntario Street, and down to Diana Road and La Quila Lane.

Action: Miller/James, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(5:00PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**5. 1202 DIANA RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-008
Zone: RS-6
Application Number: PLN2019-00258
Owner: BLH Properties LLC
Applicant: Shaun Lynch
Contractor: Vernon Construction

(Proposal for construction of a new 1,997 square foot two-story single-unit residence, with an attached 403 square foot two-car garage. The project includes site landscaping and alterations. The proposed total of 2,400 square feet of development located on a proposed 15,505 square foot lot is 55% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This is proposed Lot 1 of a 4-lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission (PLN2017-00217).)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires an exception by the Single Family Design Board (SFDB) for the location of the backflow device (SBMC 30.140.130.D). Neighborhood Preservation and Grading findings are required. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 006-19. Project was last reviewed on May 29, 2018 under PLN2017-00217.

Actual time: 6:10 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning; Shaun Lynch, Evoke Design; and Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Bedard stated that after the Planning Commission review, the new lot application numbers were created.

Public comment opened at 6:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the following comments:
 - a. The consistency and appearance is consistent with the scenic character of the City and the surrounding neighborhood.
 - b. The project uses quality architecture and materials.
 - c. The two trees on the property previously scheduled to be removed are being kept and other mitigation measures for replanting are acceptable.
 - d. The project does not disrupt public views.
 - e. The project follows Good Neighbor Guidelines.
2. The Single Family Design Board exception for the encroachment of the backflow device is acceptable.
3. The reduction of the stair tower is appreciated and improves the aesthetic of the overall building.
4. Show the locations of the exterior light fixtures.
5. Provide a color board.

Action: James/Ferrell, 6/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(5:25PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

6. 1202 DIANA RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-008
Zone: RS-6
Application Number: PLN2019-00259
Owner: BLH Properties LLC
Applicant: Shaun Lynch
Contractor: Vernon Construction

(Proposal to construct a new 2,703 square foot single residence, including an attached 400 square foot two-car garage. Project includes site landscaping and alterations. The proposed total of 2,703 square feet of development located on a proposed 9,125 square foot lot is 78% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio. This is proposed Lot 2 of a 4-lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission (PLN2017-00217).)

Project Design Approval is requested. Neighborhood Preservation and Grading findings are required. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 006-19. Project was last reviewed on May 29, 2019 under PLN2017-00217.

Actual time: 6:33 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning; Shaun Lynch, Evoke Design; and Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:36 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Laura Grandcolas
2. Rick Grandcolas

Public comment closed at 6:48 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Show locations of outdoor lights, downspouts and gutters.
2. Provide color board and show patio tile materials.
3. The design of the home is appreciated.
4. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the following comments:
 - a. The project is consistent with the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. The project is compatible with the neighborhood in size, bulk, and scale.
 - c. The project uses quality architecture and materials.
 - d. The preservation of the Olive trees and other trees is appreciated.
 - e. The project follows Good Neighbor Guidelines and will be an acceptable addition to the neighborhood.

5. At the previous review of the project, privacy issues between Lot 2 and properties to the east were reviewed. At this meeting, privacy issues posed by windows on the second floor between the westerly property (across Lot 3) to properties located off Diana Road were reviewed.

Action: Ferrell/James, 6/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(5:50PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

7. 1202 DIANA RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-008
Zone: RS-6
Application Number: PLN2019-00276
Owner: BLH Properties LLC
Applicant: Shaun Lynch
Contractor: Vernon Construction

(Proposal to construct a new 2,146 square foot single residence, including an attached 400 square foot two-car garage. The project includes site landscaping and alterations. The proposed total of 2,146 square feet of development located on a proposed 9,004 square foot lot is 63% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio. This is proposed Lot 4 of a 4-lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission (PLN2017-00217).)

Project Design Approval is requested. Neighborhood Preservation and Grading findings are required. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 006-19. Project was last reviewed on May 29, 2019 under PLN2017-00217.

Actual time: 6:56 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning; Shaun Lynch, Evoke Design; and Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Consider raising the height of the three windows on the north elevation, reducing them to 18 inches in size, and possibly adding four windows.
2. Window and door reveals shall be punched in.
3. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the following comments:
 - a. The project is consistent with the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. The project is compatible with the neighborhood in size, bulk, and scale.
 - c. The project uses quality architecture and materials.
 - d. The project follows Good Neighbor Guidelines and will be an acceptable addition to the neighborhood.
 - e. The project does not encroach on public views.

Action: James/Moticha, 6/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(6:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

8. 281 CANON DR

Assessor's Parcel Number:	053-143-005
Zone:	RS-10/SRP/USS
Application Number:	PLN2019-00333
Owner:	Evan R. Jeffrey
Applicant:	Jim Davis

(Proposal for a 475 square foot addition to an existing two-story 1,602 square foot single-unit residence with a detached 371 square foot two-car garage. Project includes an interior remodel. The proposed total of 2,448 square feet of development on a 7,070 square foot lot is 84% of maximum allowable floor to lot area ratio.)

No final appealable action will be taken at this hearing. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation, Hillside Design, and Sloped Lot findings.

Actual time: 7:07 p.m.

Present: Jim Davis, Applicant

Public comment opened at 7:12 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Consider adding gutters and exterior lighting.
2. Show vents in the roofing and their locations.
3. Show gutters and downspouts.
4. Consider adding shutters in various locations and a planter box.

Action: Moticha/Ziegler, 6/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:21 P.M. ***