



City of Santa Barbara

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD

MINUTES

JUNE 10, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:
Fred Sweeney, *Chair*
Brian Miller, *Vice Chair*
Jan Ferrell
Lisa James
Joseph Moticha
Robert Richards
Jonathan H. Ziegler

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:
Jason Dominguez
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:
Addison Thompson

STAFF:
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Erica Monson, Planning Technician
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Sweeney, Ferrell, Moticha, Richards, and Ziegler
Members absent: Miller and James
Staff present: Monson and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **May 28, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: Moticha/Ferrell, 5/0/0. (Miller and James absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **June 3, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members Sweeney, Richards, and Miller.

Action: Ferrell/Moticha, 5/0/0. (Miller and James absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **June 10, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members Sweeney and Richards.

Action: Richards/Moticha, 5/0/0. (Miller and James absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

No announcements.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(3:20PM) REVIEW AFTER FINAL APPROVAL

1. 762 WESTMONT RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-103-001

Zone: RS-6

Application Number: PLN2014-00110

Owner: Timothy R. Sulger

Applicant: Broderson Associates

(Approved project is a 355 square foot swimming pool, 68 square foot spa, 61 square foot barbeque, and 1,091 square feet of new paved patio area to be added to the existing 491 square foot patio. No grading is proposed.)

Approval of Review After Final is requested to substitute glass sound railing for the previously approved cable railing system. Project was last reviewed on June 3, 2019.

Actual time: 3:05 p.m.

Present: Timothy R. Sulger, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

Action: Moticha/Richards, 4/1/0. (Sweeney opposed. Miller and James absent.) Motion carried.

(3:40PM) NEW ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL**2. 1527 DOVER RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-194-001
Zone: RS-15
Application Number: PLN2019-00186
Owner: RMCX07, LLC
Applicant: Jarrett Gorin

(Proposal for a new 3,626 square foot two-story residence with an attached 424 square foot two-car garage. Project also includes a 408 square foot shell above garage for a future accessory dwelling unit under a separate permit. The project includes an 11'x25' swimming pool, 1,658 square feet of uncovered and covered decks, landscaping and other associated site improvements. A total of 470 cubic yards of cut, 990 cubic yards of fill, with a net import of 520 cubic yards is proposed. The proposed total of 3,589 square feet of development, of which 50% of the lower floor area is excluded from the calculation, on a 13,779 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 85% of the maximum allowable floor-to-area ratio (FAR).)

Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project was previously reviewed under PLN2016-00461. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation, Hillside Design, Sloped Lot, and Grading Findings.

Actual time: 3:21 p.m.

Present: Robert Adams, Landscape Architect; Jarrett Gorin, Applicant; and Gordon Brewer, RRM Design Group

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Mary B. Collier
2. Joan Rutkowski, opposed.

Public comment closed at 3:43 p.m.

- Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:**
1. Study providing additional vertical planting and landscaping in the back of the project in order to hide the walls and soften the height of the project.
 2. Study height of existing walls and adding seat walls with landscaping to soften the view of the building.
 3. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the following comments:
 - a. The project is compatible with the character of the City.
 - b. The project is compatible with the character of the neighborhood. The project is within the guidelines FAR and the size, bulk, and scale of the project are appropriate despite the tall plate heights.
 - c. The project uses quality architecture and details.

- d. The project complies with Good Neighbor Guidelines.
4. The neighborhood is defined as the Riviera, specifically the area including Dover Road, Alameda Padre Serra, Lasuen Road, and Paterna Road.
5. The Board makes the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
6. The Hillside Design and Sloped Lot criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the following comments:
 - a. The decreased amount of cut and fill required on site is a positive change and helps preserve the natural topography of site.
 - b. The proposed grading is acceptable.
7. The Board read the Standard Short Term Conditions of Approval memo, dated June 10, 2019, into the record.

Action: Ferrell/Ziegler, 3/2/0. (Moticha and Sweeney opposed. Miller and James absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments:

Board Member Moticha stated that he is opposed to the project because the height of the back wall between the bottom deck and upper deck is too tall, therefore bulk and scale of the house is not acceptable.

Board Member Sweeney stated that he is opposed to project due to the tall plate heights.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(4:10PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**3. 512 E ISLAY ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-064-005
Zone: R-2
Application Number: PLN2019-00236
Owner: Suzanne Marie Errico Living Trust
Applicant: Patricio Nava

(Proposal for a 98 square foot addition to the first floor and a new 664 square foot second floor to an existing 856 square foot single-unit residence with a detached 162 square foot one-car garage. Project includes a new deck, new balcony, interior remodel, and relocation of the main entry. The proposed total of 1,833 square feet on a 3,250 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 84% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio.)

No final appealable action will be taken at this hearing. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation, Hillside Design, and Sloped Lot Findings.

Actual time: 4:28 p.m.

Present: Patricio Nava, Applicant

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Catherine Bos, opposed.
2. Bill Beach, opposed.
3. Jeff Shuman, opposed.
4. Theresa Gray
5. Alex Grzywacki, opposed.
6. Patty West, opposed.

Written correspondence from Patty West and Kikka Bayly were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:50 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Restudy the whole design of the project, as the project is too large for the high-density neighborhood.
2. Consider the Single Family Design Board Guidelines for the placement of the deck in relation to the property line.
3. Provide a surveyor's drawing of the Oak tree height, drip line, and its exact location on the site, making considerations to preserve the Oak tree.
4. Provide site sections from the north, east, south, and west and street elevations. Building sections shall be through the three plate-floors and the staircase element running east-west. Further, show where the neighbors' windows are located in relation to the proposed design, and how the windows on the proposed project will relate to the neighbors' windows, so that privacy concerns can be addressed.

5. The neighborhood is defined as the Upper East neighborhood, specifically the area of East Islay Street, Olive Street, East Pedregosa Street, and Prospect Avenue.

Action: Ferrell/Moticha, 5/0/0. (Miller and James absent.) Motion carried.

(4:50PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

4. 401 ORILLA DEL MAR DR

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-321-016

Zone: R-4/SD-3

Application Number: PLN2019-00199

Owner: Ray Fazendin

Applicant: Michelle McToldridge

(Proposal is to convert an existing 1,094 square foot duplex into a 2,200 single-unit residence. The project includes a 34 square foot first floor addition, a new 1,022 square foot second story, and a new 440 square foot two-car attached carport. A proposed 450 square foot roof deck, new roofing, and site improvements are also included. The proposed total of 2,640 square feet on a 5,000 square foot lot in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 108% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

No final appealable action will be taken at this hearing. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation findings.

Actual time: 5:21 p.m.

Present: Michelle McToldridge, Applicant; and Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning

Public comment opened at 5:33 p.m.

Written correspondence from Caroline and Nick Howell was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:34 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Scale down the size of the project.
2. The preservation of the original building footprint is appreciated.
3. Provide rendered drawings that emulate the approved landscape plan in order to show the relationship of the landscaping elements.

Action: Moticha/Ferrell, 5/0/0. (Miller and James absent.) Motion carried.

(5:20PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**5. 574 RICARDO AVE**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-131-007
Zone: RS-15
Application Number: PLN2019-00215
Owner: Reward Ventures LLC
Applicant: Penn Hsu, Architect

(Proposal to demolish 1,324 square feet of an existing single-unit residence. The project will construct a new two-story 2,433 square foot residence with 499 square feet of additions on the first floor, and 610 square feet of additions on the second floor. The attached 499 square foot two-car garage is to remain. The project also includes a new 280 square foot deck. The proposed total 2,433 square feet of development on a 7,400 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 94% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio.)

No final appealable action will be taken at this hearing. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation, Hillside Design, and Sloped Lot findings.

Actual time: 5:53 p.m.

Present: Penn Hsu, Applicant, SPH Design and Architecture, Inc.

Public comment opened at 5:58 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Brian Moulton, opposed.
2. Michael Mete, opposed.
3. Mark K. Endo, opposed.

Written correspondence from Berni Bernstein was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:03 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Restudy the design of the project and its compatibility with the neighborhood.
2. Provide a full landscape plan.
3. Provide building site plans.
4. Provide site sections that show the location of neighbors' homes, proposed windows, and neighbors' windows in relation to the project so that privacy concerns can be addressed. The site sections should extend across Ricardo Avenue and down to the lower property on Dolores Avenue.
5. Provide a materials board.
6. Find out if the power lines can be varied.
7. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have not been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the following comments:
 - a. The project as proposed is not compatible with the neighborhood.

- b. The project does not meet Good Neighbor Guidelines.
- c. The size, bulk, and scale is not acceptable.
- d. The quality of architectural materials is not acceptable.
- 8. A FAR closer to 85% guideline is preferred.
- 9. Provide an accurate streetscape of the project in relationship to the house to the south, and the two houses to the north. The streetscape should be associated with a proper survey.
- 10. Provide a complete roof plan, showing the location of skylights.
- 11. Include pitched roofs that are reminiscent of the rest of the neighborhood as part of the roof configuration, in order for the project to be compatible with the neighborhood.

Action: Ferrell/Moticha, 5/0/0. (Miller and James absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:22 P.M. ***