



City of Santa Barbara

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES JANUARY 22, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Fred Sweeney, *Chair*
Brian Miller, *Vice Chair*
Jan Ferrell
Lisa James
Joseph Moticha
Robert Richards
Jonathan H. Ziegler

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

Addison Thompson

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
David Eng, Planning Technician
Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Sweeney (until 6:58 p.m.), Miller, Ferrell (at 3:04 p.m.), James, (at 5:16 p.m.), Moticha (absent 3:30-6:20 p.m.), Richards (until 5:16 p.m.), and Ziegler

Members absent: None

Staff present: Eng and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **January 7, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 6/0/0. (James absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 14, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members James and Sweeney.

Action: Moticha/Miller, 6/0/0. (James absent.) Motion carried.

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 22, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members James, Sweeney, and Moticha.
- Action: Moticha/Ziegler, 4/0/2. (Sweeney and Miller abstained, James absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Eng announced:
 - a. Board Member James will be attending the meeting later at approximately 5:00 p.m.
 - b. An update on the January 15, 2019 City Council appeal hearing regarding 2444 Santa Barbara for which the Board granted a Project Design Approval on October 15, 2018. Board Members Miller and Ziegler attended the appeal hearing. Chair Sweeney requested staff to:
 - 1) Inform appropriate staff (e.g. Andrew Stuffer, Chief Building Official) that the Board requires clarification at a future board meeting regarding the process and purview of the Board when reviewing red-tagged properties;
 - 2) Request the City Attorney's Office give direction to the Board at a future meeting regarding Council's direction/comments on the appealed 2444 Santa Barbara Street project (and other similarly appealed projects), differentiating between direction/comments which may address the Building Code under the Building & Safety Division's purview, and those specifying design issues under the Board's purview; and
 - 3) Request the City Attorney's Office to give direction to the Board at a future meeting if Council or the City has any jurisdiction at a local government and/or State Legislation level regarding the amount of fines levied for work performed without approvals and permits.
2. Board Member Richards announced he would be leaving the meeting early at approximately 5:00 p.m.
3. Board Member Moticha announced he would be leaving the meeting at 3:30 p.m. and returning at approximately 6:00 p.m.
4. Board Member Sweeney announced he would be leaving the meeting at approximately 7:00 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

The Board postponed the Glare & Reflective Issues (metal roof, etc.) Subcommittee report by Board Member Ziegler in order to give Board Member Miller the opportunity to provide input in the discussion. The Board will receive a written report and photographs prior to or at a subsequent meeting.

Board Member Sweeney clarified requirements on non-reflective materials (metal roof, etc.) under the City Ordinance, and those under the SFDB Guidelines and the Board's purview.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. 11 VIA ALICIA****RS-15 Zone**

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-311-003
Application Number: MST2013-00052
Owner: Peter Trent
Architect: Sherry & Associates

(Proposal for site alterations, exterior alterations, and a minor interior remodel to an existing three-story, 3,423 square foot, single-family residence, with an attached two-car garage, located on a 15,681 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Alterations include converting 258 square feet of existing storage area to habitable addition; the demolition and replacement of existing decks with new door and window alterations; and a new 10'x45' swimming pool and site walls. The proposal includes approximately 5 cubic yards of cut and 498 cubic yards of fill for the new pool. The pool has been reduced in size and relocated. The proposal results in a development total of 3,681 square feet and is 84% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Review After Final is requested for a new standing seam metal roof; a glass garage door; relocation of the proposed pool; new landscaping; removal of the previously proposed retaining walls and water tank; revisions to doors and windows; revisions to the decks and patios; revised finishes; and a new wall, fence, and gate at the front deck. Project was last reviewed on February 20, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:29 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion 1: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Applicant to return with alternate approach to the proposed "standing seam" metal roof, and not necessarily excluding other metal roof options.
2. Applicant to return with a different approach to the plate glass garage door.
3. The Board finds the general direction presented for the project's Review After Final, and the change in the style of the architecture, are appropriate and compatible with the neighborhood.
4. Provide more definitive elevations and finished material details for the deck and the around the pool deck, including any appropriate guard rails and/or landscaping.
5. The proposed pervious paving and exterior lighting sconces are acceptable and appear to meet night sky compliance.
6. The general color scheme as presented on the color boards, dated received on December 18, 2018, are acceptable; however, include in an amendment to the color board a revision-by-date of the other main colors of the project on one document.
7. Study the privacy front wall to be lowered (reduced in height) to be more proportionally acceptable.
8. The applicant is encouraged to provide photographs of other similar metal roofs in the surrounding neighborhood.

Action: Miller/Richards, 5/0/0. (James and Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

Motion 2: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. At a preliminary discussion at the item's next review meeting, the Board shall consider the neighborhood area to be defined as the residences on both sides of Chase Drive, the residences on the westerly side of Nicholas Lane, and the residences on both sides of Via Alicia extending up to the driveway easement at the top of the hill.

Action: Sweeney/Ferrell, 5/0/0. (James and Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**2. 1199 HARBOR HILLS DR****RS-15 Zone****(3:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number:	035-312-007
Application Number:	MST2016-00025
Owner:	Howland Family Trust
Architect:	Richard Thorne

(Proposal to construct 1,184 square feet of additions to an existing 2,591 square foot, one-story single-family residence with a basement and an attached 406 square foot two-car garage. Of the 1,184 square feet of new additions, 1,101 square feet will be in addition to the main residence, and 83 square feet will be added to the garage. Other site improvements include an interior remodel, a new covered porch, new concrete walkway, new retaining wall, new stairs, and the removal of one tree. Approximately 287 cubic yards of cut and 13 cubic yards of fill will occur on site. The proposed project will receive a basement credit of 325 square feet for portions 4 feet or less. The proposed total of 3,856 square feet of development on a 10,918 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 100% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The Staff Hearing Officer has granted a Zoning Modification to allow encroachments within the required front setback.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Neighborhood Preservation, Hillside Design, and Sloped Lot Findings required. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 057-18. Project was last reviewed on November 27, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:03 p.m.

Present: Richard Thorne, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:13 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board supports the design and style of the house, but cannot support the deck on the south elevation.
2. The Board would like to make it clear that substantial decking currently exists on the proposed project.
3. The Board notes the 15-foot guideline is determined by Item 36, Privacy Guidelines of the SFDB Guidelines.
4. The Board defines the neighborhood as residences on the streets of Harbor Hills Drive, intersected by residences on La Coronilla Drive.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 4/1/0. (Sweeney opposed. James and Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: To rescind the previous motion, and to deny the project without prejudice in order to give the applicant to opportunity to appeal the Board's decisions.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 5/0/0. (James and Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 2736 EL PRADO RD

RS-7.5/USS Zone

(4:25)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-282-025
Application Number: MST2018-00249
Owner: Susanna E. Steeneken

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 945 square foot one-story single residential unit with a detached 296 square foot one-car garage. Additions include an 884 square foot first-floor addition, a basement addition of 1,001 square feet, and a 215 square foot accessory workshop located within the basement. The project scope includes demolishing the existing one-car garage, and constructing a new detached 265 square foot one-car garage. Other site improvements include the replacement of the existing composite shingle roof with a new terra cotta tile roof, replacement of all windows, a driveway extension, new 38-inch garden walls, a new 6-foot tall fence along the interior property lines, new hardscape and landscape, a front porch extension and permitting decks on site. Approximately 34 cubic yards of cut, and 40 cubic yards of fill, will occur outside of the main building footprint. The proposed total of 2,702 square feet of development on an 11,325 square foot lot is 70% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The Staff Hearing Officer has granted a Performance Standard Permit for the proposed basement configuration.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Tier 3 SWMP prior to Final Approval. Project was last reviewed on September 24, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:37 p.m.

Present: Susanna E. Steeneken, Architect/Co-Owner; and Ellie Philhandling, Co-Owner

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility with the quality of architecture, materials, and the size, bulk, and scale; acceptable landscaping; and in compliance with good neighborhood guidelines, including privacy considerations with adjacent neighbors.
2. The Board defines the neighborhood area as residences on El Prado Road and Stanley Drive in the Samarkand neighborhood extending to Las Positas Road.

Action: Ferrell/Miller, 4/0/1. (Sweeney abstained. James and Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 855 MIRAMONTE DR

RS-15 Zone

(4:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-050-038
Application Number: MST2018-00659
Owner: Stephen and Judith Bay Living Trust
Architect: Salt Architecture

(Proposal for a 172 square foot upper-level addition, and a 141 square foot lower-level addition, to an existing 3,031 square foot split level single-family dwelling with an attached 510 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes demolition of a 112 square foot greenhouse, a new 200 square foot upper level balcony, and a remodel of interior spaces. The proposed total of 3,758 square feet of development on a 30,012 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 78% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation, Hillside Design District and Sloped Lot Findings.)

Actual time: 4:49 p.m.

Present: Dillon Henderson, Architect for Salt Architecture

Public comment opened at 4:54 p.m., and closed at 4:59 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Joel O'Hayon-Crosby
2. Virginia Basiago

Public comment closed at 4:59 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Provide a color board and materials list.
2. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met, as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with comments that consistency and appearance of the proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and enhances the appearance of the neighborhood; the project is compatible with the neighborhood in size, bulk, and scale and appropriate to the site and neighborhood; the quality of architecture and materials, and the design quality details are appropriate; and is in compliance with good neighborhood guidelines.
3. The Board defines the neighborhood area as the start of single family residences on Miramonte Drive proceeding east to a point at the top of the hill adjacent to the KEYT building.

4. The Board makes the Hillside Design District and Sloped Lot finding that the natural topography of the development included in the proposed structures and grading is appropriate to the site.
5. The Board makes the finding that the development, including the proposed structures and grading, are appropriate to the site.
6. The Board determined that privacy issues are not part of the Board's purview unless it concerns public right of ways and public views, specifically the east elevation on plan Sheet A3.1, shows a decrease of privacy issues based on the proposed windows on this project.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 5/0/0. (James and Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:11 TO 5:20 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW

5. 365 EL CIELITO RD

RS-1A Zone

(5:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-082-005
 Application Number: MST2018-00432
 Owner: Xorin Balbes

(Proposal to permit as-built, unpermitted site alterations on a property located in the Hillside Design District. The project includes permitting new site steps and patios, site walls and fences, replacing the pool patio and pool coping, adding pool fences and gates, relocating and permitting a chicken coop, relocating and permitting the water tanks, replacement of existing hardscape, and new permeable and impermeable surfaces. A Minor Zoning Exception is requested for a site wall that exceeds 42-inches in height within 10 feet from the front lot line. The proposed project will abate violations in Enforcement Cases ENF2018-00446 and ENF2018-00574. Alterations to the existing single residential unit were reviewed under a separate application.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Minor Zoning Exception, Neighborhood Preservation, Hillside Design, and Sloped Lot Findings required. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program prior to Final Approval. Project was last reviewed on November 26, 2018.)

Actual time: 5:20 p.m.

Present: Paul Ashley, Architect; and Xorin Balbes, Owner

Public comment opened at 5:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To postpone the item two weeks in order for the Board to receive in-meeting session direction and advice from the City Attorney's Office on correct protocol with regard to this red-tag project.

Action: James/Ziegler, 5/0/0. (Richards and Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:34 TO 5:50 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**6. 1409 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(6:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-185-018
Application Number: MST2016-00117
Owner: The Mishpaha Group, LLC
Applicant: SEPPS, Inc.
Landscape Architect: Courtney Jane Miller Landscape Architecture (CJMLA)

(Proposal for site improvements at an existing single-family residence. The project comprises the following: removal of an unpermitted deck at the bluff, replacement of a portion of an impervious concrete driveway with permeable pavers, and construction of a 42-inch tall wood fence, 18-inch tall site wall, new barbecue counter, landscaping alterations, a new rear yard deck, and flagstone and gravel seating areas. Planning Commission has granted a Coastal Development Permit for this project located in the Appeal Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. This project will abate violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00299.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Neighborhood Preservation Findings required. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 015-18. Project was last reviewed by the Full Board on April 18, 2016, and subsequently by Consent for a minor trellis revision on December 31, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:50 p.m.

Present: Cameron Hunt, and Katie Klein, Landscape Architects, CJMLA

Staff comments: Mr. Eng read a statement from the case planner Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, which stated that the applicant is requesting that the stone steps remain temporarily for one growth season for access to the landscaped area on the bluff. Even though the Conditions of Approval on the project require that the stone steps be removed, planning staff finds the delay in removal of the stone steps acceptable for one year's time, and will follow-up to confirm the removal of the stone steps at that time.

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m., and closed at 5:28 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. The treatment of the City Map bluff edge and native plantings are acceptable.
2. The Board finds acceptable the request for the stone steps to temporarily remain for one year in order to establish plantings and for landscape access to the bluff.
3. Staff to follow-up and confirm the following season the removal of the stone steps and that the irrigation is turned off.
4. The planting plan with a majority of native plants provides adequate screening for adjacent neighbors and the park.
5. Reduce the number of grazing lights to be reduced by half in number with some of the grazing provided for the pathway.
6. Switching the play area with the driveway turnaround location is acceptable.
7. The irrigation plan is appropriate.
8. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's

consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility; quality of architecture and materials; landscaping; and compliance with good neighborhood guidelines.

9. The Board defined the neighborhood as the area along Shoreline Drive and two blocks to the east of the property including Shoreline Park, and two blocks to the west of the property along Shoreline Drive.
10. The Board reviewed the easterly property line wood fence and the proposed trellis areas that remain in compliance with positive reviews.

Action: James/Miller, 5/0/0. (Richards and Moticha absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

7. 1049 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA

RS-15 Zone

(6:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-283-005
 Application Number: MST2018-00632
 Owner: Steve Dahl
 Architect: Banyan Architecture

(Proposal for 1,733 square feet of additions to an existing one-story 1,728 square foot single-residential unit with a 525 square foot detached two-car garage. The project includes new decks and patio areas, new landscaping, a lap pool, and site retaining walls. The proposed total of 3,986 square feet of development on a 22,962 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 85% of the guideline maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Neighborhood Compatibility, Hillside Design, and Sloped Lot Findings required. Project was last reviewed on December 10, 2018.)

Actual time: 6:16 p.m.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect, Banyan Architects; and Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 6:47 p.m., and closed at 6:49 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's acceptable architecture and quality use of materials; consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility; and the proposed trees and landscaping provide beauty, shelter, and privacy for adjacent neighbors.
2. The Board defines the neighborhood as the Riviera, including the area along Alameda Padre Serra and Ferrelo Road.
3. The Board makes the Hillside Design and Sloped Lot finding that the natural topography of the hillside, including the large oak grove above the development, does not negatively impact the natural appearance of the area in any significant way.

4. The Board understands that a soils report on the project is still pending which should help clarify public concerns regarding the foundation of the proposed lap pool.

Action: Ferrell/Moticha, 5/0/0. (Sweeney and Richards absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 1211 DEL MAR AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(7:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-213-003
 Application Number: MST2018-00679
 Owner: Timothy Gorham
 Architect: Kas Seefeld

(Proposal for an addition and remodel of an existing 1,433 square foot, one-story, single-residential unit with an attached 285 square foot one-car garage. The project involves a 137 square foot addition to the ground floor, a new 555 square foot second story, and a new 379 square foot attached garage that is 116 square feet larger to accommodate two-cars. The project also includes a new driveway and new wider curb cut, all new doors and windows, a new rear yard patio, and new landscaping. The proposed total of 2,504 square feet of development on a 6,534 square foot lot in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 89% of the maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 7:13 p.m.

Present: Kas Seefeld, Architect

Public comment opened at 7:24 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Gwen Hildred
2. Richard Wolf (Elizabeth Brooks ceded her time to Mr. Wolf.)

Public comment closed at 7:38 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Study reducing the floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).
2. Study reducing the upstairs area in order to help minimize the overall mass, bulk, and scale of the project.
3. Pull the decks back to 15-feet away the property lines;
4. Reduce the size of the covered deck.
5. Provide a site plan showing the window locations to reveal any negative privacy impacts to adjacent neighboring.
6. Provide a site section showing the property lines.
7. Provide landscape plan and a color board.

Action: Moticha/Ziegler, 5/0/0. (Sweeney and Richards absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:01 P.M. ***