



City of Santa Barbara
SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2018

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:
Fred Sweeney, *Chair*
Brian Miller, *Vice Chair*
Jan Ferrell
Lisa James
Joseph Moticha
Robert Richards
Jonathan H. Ziegler

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Addison Thompson

STAFF:
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Katie Mamulski, Planning Technician
Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Ferrell, James, Moticha, and Ziegler
Members absent: Richards
Staff present: Mamulski and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **August 20, 2018**, as submitted.

Action: Ziegler/Miller, 4/0/2. (Richards absent. Sweeney abstained from Item 4. Miller abstained from Items 7 & 8.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 27, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members James and Moticha.

Action: James/Moticha, 6/0/0. (Richards absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 4, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members James and Moticha.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 6/0/0. (Richards absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Board Member Moticha announced will be leaving the meeting after Item 1, 1686 Las Canoas Road.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

1. 1686 LAS CANOAS RD

RS-1A Zone

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-072-007
Application Number: MST2015-00573
Owner: Linda Kiefer
Architect: Sherry Associates

(Proposal for 419 square feet of first-story additions, conversion of the existing 538 square foot garage and storage area to habitable space, construction of a new 567 square foot two-car garage, a detached 211 square foot gym, a detached 214 square foot storage building, a new 1,040 square foot barn, a new unenclosed horse arena, a new round pen and 3 covered pasture shelters totaling 360 square feet, a new trellis, deck and two new uncovered parking spaces to an existing 2,960 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The proposal includes permitting an "as-built" approximately 6-foot, 8-inch tall electrical entry gate and columns and "as-built" alterations to the driveway. An Administrative Height Exception is requested to allow the over-height gate and columns within 10 feet of the front lot line. The proposal also includes permitting an "as-built" covered entry porch, breakfast room, and bar sink that were approved under expired building permit BLD91-00599 and permitting an "as-built" water heater approved under expired building permit BLD2002-00019. The proposed total of 5,949 square feet of development is 104% of the guideline maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00383. Staff Hearing Officer review was requested and approved for two zoning modifications to allow the total proposed accessory space to exceed 500 square feet, and to allow accessory buildings in the remaining front yard.)

(Review After Final is requested for horse feeding structures, pasture shelters, fencing, two water storage tanks, bio-swale alterations, and revisions to the driveway material. Project was last reviewed August 20, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:10 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Applicant; Christopher Gilliland, Landscape Architect; and Linda Kiefer, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Mamulski clarified that the Board will be reviewing and commenting on only the specific requested horse feeding structures, pasture shelters, fencing, two water storage tanks, bio-swale alterations, and revisions to the driveway material.

Public comment opened at 3:11 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Philip West (westerly adjacent neighbor) expressed opposition and concern regarding the revised site plan, specifically drainage on the site, and requested the owner submit a Letter of Compliance from their civil engineer to be reviewed before the City grants approval of the completed site to ensure minimal negative impacts to adjacent properties, and categorically rejects “after-the-fact” approvals for corrections sought by the owner.
2. Jen Sorensen (adjacent neighbor; provided a recent March 21, 2018 photograph) expressed opposition and concern regarding the on-going water drainage issues of the project site for each yearly rain event of water, mud, and silt flooding, apart from the recent exceptional January rain event. There exists a very real concern after each and every rain event that the existing adjacent creek retention catch basins will overflow and breach causing creek water, mud, and silt flooding onto his property; an approximate loss of 4-inches of soil and silt from the adjacent site’s pastures.

Public comment closed at 3:13 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. From an aesthetics and design perspective, the Board finds the proposed two horse feeding structures, and framed and poured pads are acceptable, and pose no negative visual impacts to the adjacent neighboring properties due to the existing and proposed landscaping on the site.
2. From an aesthetics and design perspective, the Board finds the three proposed pasture shelters, permanent and temporary fencing locations, the two underground water storage tank locations, bio-swale alterations, and water course changes are acceptable.
3. From an aesthetics and design perspective, the Board finds the proposed decomposed granite (DG) material for the revised driveway is acceptable.
4. The Board requests that City Creeks Division staff and Building & Safety Division staff review the site grading and bioswale along the west property line, as it was noted that the proposed grading on the plans did not accurately match the existing site grading and bioswale as reviewed by the Board on their September 4, 2018 site visit prior to the current meeting.
5. From an aesthetics and site placement acceptability, the grading plan shall accurately reflect the proposed bio-swale, excepting the engineering functionality.

Action: James/Moticha, 6/0/0. (Richards absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:35 TO 3:48 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW**2. 1035 COYOTE RD****RS-1A Zone****(3:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-061-005
Application Number: MST2017-00529
Owner: Berrett 2009 Family Trust
Applicant/Architect: Rick Starnes

(Proposal for a change of use of the existing non-conforming, 428 square foot, single-story building from accessory to single-family use located within the required 35 foot front setback. A portion of the building was permitted as a workshop and storage building at 402 square feet but is actually 428 square feet. The proposed project also includes 1,046 square feet of additions, 869 square feet of new development, and construction of a new 400 square foot two-car carport. Zoning Modifications were approved to allow the conversion of the workshop/storage to a single-story residential unit and for the construction of a new two-car garage located within the required front setback. Other site improvements include the demolition of existing structures within the required setbacks. The proposal will address violations listed in ENF2015-00314 and ZIR2015-00535. The proposed total of 2,643 square feet of development on a 25,177 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 56% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 005-18, and was last reviewed March 19, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:48 p.m.

Present: Rick Starnes, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:55 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Provide a revised full set of plans.
2. Provide condition details keyed to the elevations and plan drawings.
3. Provide conforming architectural details per Title 24 regarding wall thicknesses, window and door schedule and details, sill and header details, etc., for energy compliance.
4. The Board finds the proposed color board is acceptable.

Action: Miller/Ziegler, 5/0/0. (Moticha and Richards absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:59:35 TO 4:15 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 365 EL CIELITO RD****RS-1A Zone****(4:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-082-005
Application Number: MST2018-00432
Owner: Xorin Balbes, Wailea Inn, LLC

(Proposal to permit as-built, unpermitted site alterations on a property located in the Hillside Design District. The project includes permitting new site steps and patios, site walls and fences, replacing the pool patio and pool coping, adding pool fences and gates, relocating and permitting a chicken coop, relocating and permitting the water tanks, and replacement of existing hardscape and new permeable and impermeable surfaces. A Minor Zoning Exception is requested for a site wall that exceeds 42 inches in height within 10 feet from the front lot line. The proposed project will abate violations in Enforcement Cases ENF2018-00446 and ENF2018-00574. Alterations to the existing single residential unit were reviewed under a separate application.)

(Comments Only. One-time Concept Review.)

Actual time: 4:15 p.m.

Present: Paul Ashley, Architect; and Xorin Balbes, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:30 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Kenneth Rosenberg expressed concern regarding the instability of the unpermitted wall that abuts the driveway which poses serious safety issues.
2. Chris Daves expressed concern regarding the height, weight, and instability of the unpermitted wall that abuts the driveway which poses serious safety issues without inbuilt re-bar materials, and emergency ingress and egress of the site for emergency vehicles and public, and safe wall construction concerns.
3. Michael Freeman expressed concern regarding daily site construction traffic issues, and emergency ingress and egress access for emergency vehicles and public.
4. Norah McMeeking expressed concern regarding emergency ingress and egress access for emergency vehicles and public, and instability of the unpermitted wall that abuts the driveway which poses serious safety issues.
5. Robert Maxwell McMeeking (a structural engineer) expressed concern regarding instability of the unpermitted wall that abuts the driveway which poses serious safety issues regarding the unsupported footings, and lacks acceptable aesthetics.
6. Bruna Tripicchio expressed concern regarding the unpermitted driveway and gate that abuts her driveway for safe access, and the proposed water tank concerns for water drainage and runoff from the site.
7. Dale Fathe-Aazam expressed concern regarding the proposed water tank concerns for water drainage and runoff from the site, the unpermitted driveway and gate that abuts her driveway for safe access, and height, weight, and instability of the unpermitted wall that abuts the driveway which poses serious safety issues.
8. Correspondence from Dale Fathe-Aazam & Bruna Tripicchio and Lynn Kirk were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:46 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Provide sufficient information of the construction of the existing wall to remain in place on the southerly property line adjacent to El Cielito Lane.
2. Provide a site section of the wall.
3. Provide a site section of at minimum 80 feet from the center line of the El Cielito property line, to indicate:
 - a. The new location of the proposed future water tank to scale;
 - b. The height of the proposed future water tank;
 - c. The dimensions and diameter of the proposed future water tank; and
 - d. Specify the proposed materials, color, potential anchoring, and the configurations of any overflow area around the water tank.
4. Provide a drawing and photograph of the traffic gate to be retained located off El Cielito Lane.
5. Provide a section with the existing and proposed top of grade and top of wall for the wall to be retained running parallel to El Cielito Lane on the westerly side of the property.
6. Applicant shall have a surveyor indicate on the plans the top of wall and bottom of wall at key junctures on the westerly CMU stucco wall to be retained.
7. Provide final resolution of any landscaping and irrigation around the identified oak tree at the northeast corner of the property.
8. Indicate bottom of wall grade on the existing wall to be retained at front property line on El Cielito Road, including photographs keyed to the sections to be retained, and the top of wall elevations, including a photograph of the existing drive gate to the retained on El Cielito Road.
9. Indicate on the plans the existing or proposed new gazebo to be located outside of the front setback and side setback yards.
10. Indicate on the plans finished floor elevations of the gazebo, and provide a sectioned and/or elevations of the gazebo showing complete heights, materials, colors, and other finishes.
11. Relocate the filter and pump equipment located immediately behind the south wall off El Cielito Lane, and show on the plans the new location outside the 35-foot setback.
12. Provide a clear graphic on the plans of the new permeable paving for the driveway at the bottom entrance gate off El Cielito Lane.
13. Graphically indicate on the plans the location of the new patio paving surfaces immediately west of the existing pool; and indicate on the plans the retaining walls, top of wall elevations, bottom of wall elevations, seat locations, and provide a catalog cut of any pre-manufactured fire place element.
14. Show coping details at the pool edge and the general pattern of the proposed paving around the pool.
15. The Board does not support a portable pool enclosure fence. Provide a permanent pool enclosure element that meets all City Building Code requirements for locked gates of such pool fencing, including heights, colors, materials, etc.
16. Indicate on the plans locations and pattern type for replacement of existing flagstones on existing stair cases, and indicate the pattern, shape, and size of the flagstone pattern for the new terraced area, identified as "A" on plan Sheet A1-0.1.

17. For terrace area B, indicate by elevation or by section, the height of the surface of the two terrace areas from the existing grade.
18. Indicate on the plans any exterior garden lighting or safety lighting as it pertains to the front entry off El Cielito Road, and to the south entry off El Cielito Lane.
19. Indicate on the plans the official civil survey of the location and depth of the natural gas pipe line located off the El Cielito Lane right-of-way or off the right-of-way.

Action: James/Ferrell, 5/0/0. (Moticha and Richards absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 2018 FOOTHILL RD

RS-1A Zone

(4:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-103-027
Application Number: MST2018-00430
Owner: Anderson Family Trust
Architect: Patricio Nava

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,631 square foot single residential unit with a detached 400 square foot two-car carport. The proposed project includes an addition of 617 square feet to the residence, a new 593 square foot attached two-car garage and an interior remodel. The proposed total of 3,241 square feet of development on a 1.03 acre lot located in the Hillside Design District is 65% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:16 p.m.

Present: Patricio Nava, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:28 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The Board finds the proposed additions are in keeping with the size of the lot.
2. The Board finds the tile roof over the new additions supportable.
3. Provide window and door details similar to the original doors, if possible.
4. Provide a color board and lighting details for the house.

Action: Ferrell/James, 5/0/0. (Moticha and Richards absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 113 SANTA ROSA PL****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(5:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-202-006
Application Number: MST2018-00431
Owner: Mark Miller
Architect: Thompson Naylor Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 806 square foot one-story single residential unit with an attached 266 square foot one-car garage, and 505 square feet of accessory structures. In their place will be a new 2,620 square foot two-story single residential unit with an attached 410 square foot two-car garage. Other site improvements include new fencing, 901 square feet of impervious paving, a permeable driveway, front and rear patios, a new 240 square foot patio cover, a 380 square foot second story deck and new landscaping. Approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and 50 cubic yards of fill will occur on site. The proposed total of 3,030 square feet of development on a 7,405 square foot lot is 100% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposed project is located the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and will require Coastal Review.)

(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:36 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson and Suzette Naylor, Architects; Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect; and Mark and Miranda Miller, Owners

Public comment opened at 6:01 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Restudy the size and scale; study reducing the first floor plate height to 9 feet, and reducing the second floor plate height to 8 feet in height.
2. The Board finds the proposed architecture acceptable.
3. Study reducing the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) closer to the design guideline of 85% FAR.
4. Restudy the size of the proposed deck.
5. Applicant to work with staff to confirm whether the front retaining wall and the picket fence will require a minor zoning exception. The Board finds the front retaining wall and the picket fence would be supportable at 5 feet, 6-inches in total height.
6. The proposed landscape plan is supportable.
7. The Board appreciates the owners' efforts to keep his neighbors informed on the proposed project.

Action: James/Miller, 5/0/0. (Moticha and Richards absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:25 P.M. ***