



City of Santa Barbara
SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD
MINUTES
JULY 9, 2018

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:
Fred Sweeney, *Chair*
Brian Miller, *Vice Chair*
Jan Ferrell
Lisa James
Joseph Moticha
Robert Richards
Jonathan H. Ziegler

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Addison Thompson

STAFF:
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Katie Mamulski, Planning Technician
Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Ferrell, James, Moticha, Richards (absent from 4:18 – 4:51 p.m.), and Ziegler
Members absent: None
Staff present: Mamulski and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **June 25, 2018**, as submitted.

Action: James/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 2, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members James and Moticha. Motion carried.

The Consent Calendar of **July 9, 2018** was cancelled.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

No announcements.

- E. Subcommittee Reports:

Chair Sweeney reported on a meeting with Irma Unzueta, Senior Planner, regarding pending Board member training.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 104 JORGENSEN LN

RS-1A Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-110-038
Application Number: MST2017-00713
Owner: Jason L. Rick
Applicant: Mark Lloyd
Architect: Brian Cearnal

(Proposal for a two-lot subdivision of an existing 4.43 acre parcel resulting in Lot 1 at 2.32 acres and Lot 2 at 2.11 acres, and construction of a new two-story single residential unit and attached garage on Lot 2. The proposed house and garage total approximately 5,163 square feet and is 92% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Planning Commission review is requested for a Tentative Subdivision Map, Zoning Modifications for lot frontage, and Public Street Waivers for the two proposed lots.)

(First Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Planning Commission Review.)

Actual time: 3:05 p.m.

Present: Mark Lloyd, Applicant; Jason L. Rick, Owner; and Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:10 p.m.

The following people expressed concerns or comments:

1. James Love Lee, neighbor at 101 Jorgensen, spoke of concerns regarding the height and siting of the house related to mountain views.
2. Cody Cammbell, neighbor at 559 Mountain Drive, and also on behalf of an absent neighbor, spoke of concerns about further development of the site after a previous subdivision approved by City Council was limited to three lots, emergency fire access, increased traffic, and private view impacts.
3. Randall Wade, neighbor at 2626 Foothill Lane, also spoke of concerns about further development after the previous subdivision was limited to three lots approved by City Council.
4. Richard Goodstein, neighbor at 107 Jorgensen Lane, spoke in favor of the lot split, but expressed concerns about parking currently occurring on the private road limiting access.
5. Correspondence from David Unger expressing concerns about privacy and the size of the proposed house was acknowledged.

Chair Sweeney clarified that some public comments should be directed to the Planning Commission, as the purview of the Single Family Design Board is to determine the appropriateness of the proposed size, bulk, and scale; and the compatibility of the style of architecture, materials, color, size, and location on the lot. The Board does not have purview regarding private views unless it's related to privacy issues.

Staff comments: Mr. Boughman explained the project has undergone development review by staff from the Planning, Building, Fire, Creeks, and Transportation divisions. The question of splitting this lot is under the Planning Commission's purview. Staff will be forwarding the Single Family Design Board's comments to the Planning Commission regarding neighborhood compatibility of the project. The previous subdivision was approved by the Planning Commission for four lots. This approval was reduced to three lots by City Council on appeal. The new two-lot subdivision application conforms to requirements, and will be presented to the Planning Commission for approval. Mr. Boughman also clarified that an addition to the project description is the proposed grading of 625 cubic yards of cut, and 300 cubic yards of fill.

Public comment closed at 3:26 p.m.

Motion: **Continue indefinitely to the Planning Commission for return to the Full Board with the following comments:**

1. The Board is comfortable with the bulk and size of the structure.
2. Study to lower the plate heights to a more proportional level.
3. The Board appreciates the style of the architecture and finds it appropriate to the already established neighborhood.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Individual comment: Chair Sweeney requested the applicant to study balancing more of the cut and fill grading on the site.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 1533 SAN MIGUEL AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(3:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-131-030
 Application Number: MST2017-00648
 Architect: Thompson Naylor Architects
 Owner: Rodoni Family Trust

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,142 square foot, single residential unit with an attached 239 square foot, one-car garage and construct a new 2,278 square foot, two-story single residential unit with an attached 400 square foot, two-car garage and 106 square feet of accessory space. Also proposed are 830 square feet of patios and decks. Approximately 290 cubic yards of grading will occur on site. The proposed total of 2,784 square feet of development on an 11,665 square foot lot is 71% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project site is located within the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. Coastal Review will include review of a Coastal Exclusion application. A separate concurrent application is proposed to construct a new 422 square foot detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) and one uncovered parking space. Per state legislation (AB 2299 and SB 1069), the ADU is exempt from Design Review and the FAR calculation.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed January 22, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:55 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect; Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect ASLA; and Rhiannon Rodoni, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:05 p.m.

Craig Wuertz requested clarification of the proposed roof line height.

Public comment closed at 4:06 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with comments:

1. The Board appreciates the requested site sections, full landscape plan, and the reduction of the proposed roof height to 14 feet.
2. Provide landscape lighting details.
3. Provide a roof color.
4. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; enhances the scenic character of the neighborhood and compatibility; compatible with the surrounding architecture, uses quality materials; and is in compliance with good neighborhood guidelines.

Action: James/Moticha, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 1117 HARBOR HILLS DR

RS-15 Zone

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-314-019
Application Number: MST2017-00431
Owner: Akila Krish
Architect: James Lecron

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,075 square foot one-story, single-family dwelling with an attached 460 square foot two-car garage, and construct a new 2,939 square foot, one-story, single-family dwelling with an attached 500 square foot two-car garage. Other site improvements include 1,577 square feet of terraced decks and a new spa. The proposed total of 3,439 square feet of development on a 17,639 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 78% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer approval was granted for new construction within the required 30-foot front setback.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 066-17. Project was last reviewed March 19, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:18 p.m.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Richards recused himself as the landscape architect from hearing this item.

Chair Sweeney read the following State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory:
The City Attorney's office has determined that sole proprietors are allowed to prepare professional documents and make project presentations before a board they served on based on an exception to the Political Reform Act and Fair Political Practices Commission rulings. The limitation is that they are not to unduly influence their fellow board members on a decision by advocating for their clients. The exception allows board members to continue practicing their profession in the City while volunteering on a board.

Present: James LeCron; Architect; and Robert Richards, Landscape Architect; and Akila Krish, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:33 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The Board supports the proposed standing metal seam roof, since these types of roof already exist in the neighborhood, and the added element of a hip roof mitigates reflection concerns.
2. Clarify the location of the single condenser unit on the property (and noise decibel levels).
3. Clarify the seam pattern of the plaster at the rear west elevation, and grading at the rear lower terracing of the house.
4. Study the dimensional proportions of the fenestrations on the doorways and windows on the elevations.
5. Study adding a window in the front entryway above the door.
6. Provide a color board.
7. Provide exterior lighting details.

Action: Miller/Ziegler, 6/0/0. (Richards absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 945 ARBOLADO RD

RS-15 Zone

(4:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	019-241-004
Application Number:	MST2018-00144
Owner:	Edward Glassgold
Applicant:	Chris Cottrell

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 2,540 square foot two-level single residential unit with an existing 387 square foot two-car carport. The proposed project includes 250 square feet of additions to the upper level and 564 square feet of additions to the lower level. Other site improvements include a new covered entry porch, an interior remodel, approximately 1,118 square feet of new decks and converting the existing two-car carport to a two-car garage. The proposed total of 3,745 square feet of development on a 15,811 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 86% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third Concept Review. Comments Only. Project was last reviewed May 29, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:51 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Applicant; and Jarrett Gorin, Land-use Planner

Staff comments: Ms. Mamulski requested comments only from the Board as outstanding zoning issues have to be resolved on the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 5:07 p.m.

Thomas Fogel spoke of concerns regarding upper and lower floor privacy impacts, landscape foliage and privacy screening issues, parking impacts, and retaining wall issues in the neighborhood.

Correspondence from Thomas and Ellen Fogel received prior to the previous April 30, 2018 meeting of concerns was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:12 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The Board finds the proposed standing metal seam roof acceptable.
2. Restudy the proposed plate heights.
3. Study the landscaping and screening between properties to address adjacent neighboring privacy concerns.
4. Study and clarify the type and location of the existing fence.

Action: Moticha/Ziegler, 6/1/0. (Sweeney opposed.) Motion carried.

Individual comment: Chair Sweeney opposed the approval due to the standing seam metal roof.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 20 WOODALE LN

RS-1A Zone

(5:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	021-161-005
Application Number:	MST2018-00078
Owner:	Margaret B. Voegele Sharpe, Trustee
Designer:	Mark Armstrong
Contractor:	James Hughes

(Proposal for alterations to an existing 3,108 square foot single residential unit with a 641 square foot garage. The proposal includes permitting an unpermitted 621 square foot three-car garage and permitting the conversion of the original garage to habitable space. Other site improvements include the removal of a 6' curved wall in front of the original garage, the removal of a trellis located in the interior setback on south property line, and removal of a shed. The proposal also includes replacement of the existing deck, a new roof, new windows, and changes to the front entry. The proposed total of 4,436 square feet of development on a 25,264 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 94% of the guideline maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Project was last reviewed March 19, 2018.)

Actual time: 5:51 p.m.

Present: Mark Armstrong, Designer; and James Hughes, Contractor

Public comment opened at 6:04 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The Board appreciates the addressed garage roof changes, some window details, and details of the standing seam metal roof and the front portico.
2. Provide more detail drawings showing stucco and wood locations.
3. Provide total square footage of the house and the proposed square footage for each room.
4. Provide downspouts and gutter details.
5. Provide a sample deck railing material.
6. Provide exterior lighting details and locations.
7. Provide roof venting details.
8. Provide south stair color and material details and sample.
9. Provide landscape lighting details.
10. Provide both existing and new deck details.

Action: Ferrell/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:30 TO 6:54 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 2840 SERENA RD

RS-7.5/USS Zone

(6:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	051-212-013
Application Number:	MST2018-00294
Owner:	Rochelle Family Trust
Architect:	Don Swann
Engineer:	Gary Frolenko

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,243 square foot one-story single residential unit with a detached 360 square foot two-car garage. The proposed project includes 458 square feet of additions to the residence, demolition of the existing two-car garage and construction of a new 459 square foot detached two-car garage with a 436 square foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) constructed above. Other site improvements include a new 20 square foot deck as well as minor landscape and hardscape alterations. Approximately 24 cubic yards of cut will occur under the building footprint and 24 cubic yards of fill will occur outside of the building footprint. The proposed total of 2,596 square feet of development on a 7,500 square foot lot is 85% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(First Concept Review. Comments Only.)

Actual time: 6:54 p.m.

Present: Don Swann, Architect; and Mark Rochelle, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Mamulski requested comments only from the Board as environmental review is still pending on the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 6:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

- Motion:** **Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:**
1. Provide color board and materials board.
 2. Provide lighting fixture details and locations.
 3. Provide fence details proposed between the new unit and the house.
 4. Consult with Staff regarding the proposed hedge.
- Action: James/Moticha, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

7. 917 PASEO FERRELO

RS-15 Zone

(7:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-261-006
 Application Number: MST2018-00305
 Owner: Mark Brinkman
 Applicant: Jose Sanchez

(Proposal to permit unpermitted alterations to an existing 2,346 square foot two-story single residential unit with an attached 650 square foot two-car garage. The proposed project includes permitting glass railing on the existing deck, glass garage doors, an A.C. unit, a retaining wall, and a shoring wall. Other site improvements include the demolition of a deck within the rear yard. There is no new square footage proposed to the existing residence as part of this application. The existing total of 2,996 square feet of development on a 10,500 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 79% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposed project will address violations in Enforcement Case ENF2015-00801.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 7:11 p.m.

Present: Dan Weber, Architect; and Mark Brinkman, Owner

Public comment opened at 7:21 p.m.

Correspondence provided by the Owners in support of the proposed retaining wall from Margaret A. Casey, and Dean Guaneli & Cristine Crooks were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:22 p.m.

- Motion:** **Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following conditions:**
1. The Board denies the installed glass railing to remain on the property, and finds that it should be removed from the site. Applicant to re-install the original cable railing approved in 2011.
 2. The Board accepts the demolition of the existing deck, and finds the replacement landscaping is appropriate.
 3. Even though it is under clear protest, the Board concedes that the glass garage doors are to remain, even though they were not included in the original application and set of drawings approved in 2011.
 4. The Board finds the proposed AC unit is appropriate as long as the noise decibel levels to property line requirements are met and acceptable as identified by City staff.

5. The retaining wall and shoring wall located on the south west portion of the property should be allowed to remain, and that appropriate landscaping be used to diminish the impact of the walls as depicted by photographs provided by the applicant on plan Sheet G.008.
6. The Board finds the other landscape details on the proposed landscape drawings are appropriate.
7. The Board finds that remaining portions of the project for Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City and neighborhood.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project, as originally approved in 2011.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project, and neighborhood compatibility are appropriate for its location, and are in compliance with good neighborhood guidelines, as originally approved in 2011.
 - d. The proposed materials are consistent with the original approval in 2011.
 - e. The proposed landscaping and tree locations as presented are acceptable and compatible with the neighborhood.

Action: Sweeney/Ferrell, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 1666 LAS CANOAS RD

RS-1A Zone

(7:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-072-011
 Application Number: MST2018-00330
 Owner: John Mosby
 Applicant: Dylan Henderson

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 2,822 square foot two-story single residential unit with a 340 square foot detached two-car carport. The proposed project includes a first-floor addition of 196 square feet and a second-story addition of 196 square feet. Other site improvements include the re-orientation of an exterior staircase and an interior remodel. The proposed project will abate violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00106. The proposed total of 3,554 square feet of development on a 1 acre lot located in the Hillside Design District is 72% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(First Concept Review. Comments Only.)

Actual time: 7:50 p.m.

Present: Dylan Henderson, Applicant; Kevin Capon, Architect; and John Mosby, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Mamulski requested comments only from the Board as an environmental review and project design approval assessment are still pending on the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 7:56 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: **Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

1. The Board finds the proposed size, bulk, and scale of the addition are appropriate to the existing home.
2. Restudy for lighter first level trellis canopy materials.

Action: Miller/Richards, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:03 P.M. ***