



**City of Santa Barbara**  
**SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD**  
**MINUTES**  
**FEBRUARY 20, 2018**

3:00 P.M.  
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room  
630 Garden Street  
[SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov)

**BOARD MEMBERS:**  
Fred Sweeney, *Chair*  
Brian Miller, *Vice Chair*  
Jan Ferrell  
Lisa James  
Joseph Moticha  
Robert Richards  
Jonathan H. Ziegler

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** Jason Dominguez  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** Addison Thompson

**STAFF:**  
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor  
Katie Mamulski, Planning Technician  
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

---

**CALL TO ORDER**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:16 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

**ATTENDANCE**

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (at 3:25 p.m.), Ferrell, and Richards  
Members absent: James, Moticha, and Ziegler  
Staff present: Mamulski, Vaughn (until 3:30 p.m.), and Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary (at 3:30 p.m.)

**GENERAL BUSINESS**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **February 5, 2018**, as submitted.

Action: Miller/Richards, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, and Ziegler absent.) Motion carried.

**Board comments:**

1. Chair Sweeney commented that in light of the reviews taking place for the projects on La Vista Del Oceano, he spoke with the City of Santa Barbara's Chief Building Official (CBO) and requested that he make a report to the SFDB on actions the City's Building Department is taking, in terms of onsite enforcement, for projects not being built in accordance to their approved plans. The CBO and staff will work together and coordinate a date when the CBO can come before the Board, make his presentation, and give Board Members the opportunity to ask questions about the process and how projects are inspected.

## C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 20, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members Sweeney and Richards.

Action: Richards/Ferrell, 4/0/0. (James Moticha, and Ziegler absent.) Motion carried.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

Ms. Mamulski announced that Item 6, 1306 Dover Hill Road, has been postponed to the March 5, 2018 agenda due to lack of quorum.

## E. Subcommittee Reports:

Chair Sweeney reported that he and Board Member Miller had a brief meeting as part of the Accessory Dwelling Unit subcommittee and prepared a document for the Board to use while discussing Item 1 on today's agenda. The document was distributed to all board members present.

**DISCUSSION ITEM****1. ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT (ADU) ORDINANCE****(3:10)**

Staff:

Marck Aguilar, Project Planner

Rosie Dyste, Project Planner

(ADU discussion of design standards for administrative approval, proposed for inclusion in the ADU Ordinance. The draft ADU Ordinance is scheduled for a City Council Ordinance Committee hearing on February 27, 2018, for review and to make a recommendation to City Council.)

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Marck Aguilar and Rosie Dyste, Project Planners, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:32 p.m.

1. Jarrett Gorin stated that boards should not be reviewing the proposed ordinance without first being able to review the minutes from the Planning Commission discussion. He also expressed that for the most part the proposed design criteria make sense, with the exception of the garage conversion requirements, because forcing people to remove garage doors and replace them with siding and residential doors makes the units more visible and incompatible with neighborhoods, especially since the required replacement parking typically is placed on the existing driveway, which abuts the ADU. Lastly, the screening requirement is supported, but should be more detailed and less subjective.
2. Everett Woody stated that the Planning Commission minutes are not included in the staff report presented to the SFDB, and the SFDB should not move forward with any vote on ADUs until it has seen these minutes. Mr. Woody requested that the Board continue the review until staff can provide the approved Planning Commission minutes as well as a legal opinion regarding the design criteria's compliance with the state law.
3. Alex Pujo stated that in general he is in favor of what is being proposed; however, opening up an ADU application to a discretionary design review is not legal.

Public comment closed at 3:38 p.m.

Chair Sweeney made the following statements prior to the discussion:

- He is a member of the American Institute of Architects (AIA), a past AIA president, the founding president of the Architectural Foundation of Santa Barbara, a standing member of the AIA for 35-plus years, and wants the public to understand that the architects who have commented to the Planning Commission and other boards on this item do not represent all the opinions of the AIA membership.
- With regard to the legality issues brought up earlier, the SFDB does not receive direct legal support during hearings, and the SFDB is not a commission but a review board.
- It is unfortunate that that the SFDB was not approached about this topic early on but late in the game, even though the SFDB has been dealing with ADUs for months now.

### **Discussion held.**

#### Board comments:

Board Member Miller stated that Chair Sweeney should head the ADU discussion since they had a subcommittee meeting earlier in the week and the Chair has a good understanding of the Board's questions and concerns.

1. Chair Sweeney made the following comments during the discussion:

- Sought clarification regarding:
  - Whether the Board can address decks attached to ADUs because according to the state law, a deck is not defined as a livable area and therefore should be under the purview of the Board.
  - Whether the Board is able to analyze the FAR of a new project and include the square footage of the ADU structure in the FAR calculation, to determine if the scope of a proposed project is acceptable or too large for the location.
  - The Design Criteria proposing that for ADUs, unenclosed decks and balconies within 15 feet of interior property lines will require screening, though this will not apply to non-ADU projects.
  - The SFDB cannot request or suggest alternate locations for ADUs on parcels, even if they might present public view or noise issues.
  - Replacement parking for a single-unit residence with an ADU garage conversion can be accommodated in front yard driveways within the front yard setback.
- Explained that since the SFDB is asked to assure neighborhood compatibility, it is up to the members of the Board to decide what the neighborhood is defined as on a project by project basis. With that said, in reference to the issues of style, color, and details, it may become very subjective between the administrative person reviewing an ADU application and the applicant. He suggested that the City hire a qualified design architect, full time or part time, to conduct the reviews.
- Stated that issues still remain with the proposed ADU ordinance, and it may not be ready to move on to the Council Ordinance Committee.
- Addressed the public, stating that one of the SFDB's challenges is that for many projects, the SFDB review is the only public hearing, and though it is the only venue for public comment, the SFDB has limited purview over some of the public's concerns since it does not review zoning issues, only aesthetics, size, scale, bulk, and neighborhood compatibility. Consequently, the SFDB does not have all the tools that it would like to have to address the public concerns, which can be frustrating for both the Board and the public.

**FINAL REVIEW****2. 459 EL CIELITO RD****RS-1A Zone**

**(3:55)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-082-026  
Application Number: MST2016-00562  
Owner: Dave Brown  
Architect: Kent Mixon

(Proposal to construct a new 3,179 square foot, one-story single-family residence with a 235 square foot attached art studio and 571 square foot attached garage on a currently vacant lot, where the previous single-family residence was destroyed in the Jesusita Fire. The proposal also includes a new 200 square foot swimming pool, 686 square feet of covered patio and 1,059 square feet of uncovered patio. Approximately 421 cubic yards of cut and 233 cubic yards of fill will occur on-site with 198 cubic yards of grading to be exported off-site. The proposed total of 3,985 square feet on a 1.03 acre lot is 80% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed January 9, 2017.)**

Actual time: 4:15 p.m.

Present: Lovita Wibisono and Kent Mixon, Andrulaitis+Mixon Architects; and Scott Menzel, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:26 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Final Approval as submitted.**

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, and Ziegler absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**FINAL REVIEW****3. 11 VIA ALICIA****RS-15 Zone**

**(4:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-311-003  
Application Number: MST2013-00052  
Owner: Peter Trent  
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for site alterations, exterior alterations, and a minor interior remodel to an existing three-story, 3,423 square foot single-family residence, with an attached two-car garage, located on a 15,681 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Alterations include converting 258 square feet of existing storage area to habitable addition, the demolition and replacement of existing decks with new, door and window alterations, and a new 10'x45' swimming pool and site walls. The proposal includes approximately 5 cubic yards of cut and 498 cubic yards of fill for the new pool. The pool has been reduced in size and relocated. The proposal results in a development total of 3,681 square feet and is 84% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed December 11, 2017.)**

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Hyun Bae Cho, Project Manager and Architect, Sherry & Associates Architects, Inc.

Public comment opened at 4:39 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Final Approval with the substitution of the revised plan Sheet A-3.3.**

Action: Richards/Ferrell, 3/1/0. (Sweeney opposed. James, Moticha, and Ziegler absent.)  
Motion carried.

Individual comments: Chair Sweeney stated that in his opinion, the project does not represent neighborhood compatibility or the view corridor that one would like to have on steep hillsides.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

## **FINAL REVIEW**

### **4. 626 ALSTON RD**

**RS-25 Zone**

**(4:35)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-171-020  
Application Number: MST2017-00584  
Owner: Wilson Family Trust  
Architect: Dylan Henderson

(Proposal to construct a 3,974 square foot, two-story single-family residence with a 689 square foot detached two-car garage on a 48,143 square foot lot. The project also includes a new 15' x 40' pool, a 7' x 7' spa, 1,204 square feet of patio and deck space, a trellis, outdoor grill, site work, and landscaping. Grading is estimated to be 303 cubic yards of cut and fill outside the building footprint with 70 yards of imported fill. The proposed total of 4,663 square feet on a 48,143 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 93% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Final Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program. Project was last reviewed November 27, 2017.)**

Actual time: 4:43 p.m.

Present: Dylan Henderson, Architect, Salt Architecture; and Kier Smith & Rob Maday, Landscape Architects

Staff comments: Ms. Mamulski stated that the project still requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements, and that the Board can continue the project until staff receives the SWMP before granting approval of the project.

Public comment opened at 4:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Continue to Consent for Final Approval with comments:**

1. The Board appreciates the architectural design and landscaping details.
2. Study the A/C unit equipment adjacent to the stone wall and mitigate any soundproofing issues.

3. In this specific case, the Board will consider glass railings acceptable only in the location adjacent to the barbeque area.

Action: Miller/Richards, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, and Ziegler absent.) Motion carried.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### **5. 1420 MANITOU RD**

**RS-15 Zone**

**(4:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-222-004  
 Application Number: MST2017-00602  
 Owner: Smith Living Trust  
 Designer: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,597 square foot, one-story single residential unit with an attached 450 square foot, two-car garage. The proposed project includes an interior remodel of 747 square feet, a 382 square foot addition to master bedroom, and addition of a new 117 square foot covered entry. Other site improvements include new roofing, minor door and window changes, and removal of an existing parking space. The proposed total of 2,429 square feet of development on a 14,242 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 57% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposed project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2017-00088.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed October 16, 2017.)**

Actual time: 5:18 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Designer; Jaime Pierce, Landscape Architect; and Deborah Shaw, Landscape Contractor

Public comment opened at 5:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Continued to Consent for Final Approval with comments:**

1. Adopt the s-tile ordinance requirements for an s-tile, including the following:
  - a. The addition of a double starter row of two-piece barrel tile deployed at the eave and inns.
  - b. The roof has 15-20 percent of the field tiles laid and mortared with randomly placed boosters/kickers.
  - c. Natural cement mortared hips and ridges should also be present.
2. The Board approves the use of s-tile based on the letter from the applicant's structural engineer stating that the roof cannot accept a clay tile roof.
3. Provide exterior lighting on the elevations.
4. Show exterior gate details of the garden gates.
5. Provide clarification on the landscape plan on the low-impact lawn.
6. Properly label the gravel walkways on the plans.
7. Study a better camouflage approach for the backflow valves.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, and Ziegler absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****6. 1306 DOVER HILL RD****RS-15 Zone**

**(5:25)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-103-014  
Application Number: MST2017-00764  
Owner: Erik T. Nickel  
Designer: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal to install a new "hill hiker" accessibility ramp along the west side of the existing multi-story single residential unit. There are no proposed alterations to the existing residential unit or the one-story accessory building located in the Hillside Design District. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a Zoning Modification request to allow the "hill hiker" to encroach within the required interior setback.)

**(Comments Only. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review and was last reviewed January 8, 2018).**

**Item postponed due to lack of quorum.**

**\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:44 TO 6:35 P.M. \***

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****7. 218 LAS ONDAS****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

**(6:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-162-027  
Application Number: MST2017-00734  
Owner: Dave & Sar Paschke

(Proposal to construct a first- and second-story addition on an existing 1,116 square foot, one-story single residential unit with a 393 square foot attached two-car garage. The proposed project consists of an addition of 521 square feet to the first story and a new 230 square foot second story. Other site improvements include a new 250 square foot covered patio and an interior remodel. The proposed total of 2,260 square feet of development on a 5,836 square foot lot is 85% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project is located in the Non Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Coastal Review.)

**(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed December 11, 2017.)**

**Item postponed indefinitely due to the applicant's absence.**

**CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****8. 1402 GRAND AVE****RS-1A/RS-15 Zone****(7:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-110-047  
 Application Number: MST2017-00826  
 Owner: Joseph Kearns  
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for additions to an existing two-story single residential unit. The proposed project includes an 808 square foot addition to the upper level and a new 539 square foot, attached two-car garage. The project will address violations in Enforcement Case ENF2016-00296 and Zoning Information Report ZIR2016-00113. The proposed total of 4,081 square feet of development on a 5.22 acre lot located in the Hillside Design District is 56% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed January 22, 2018.)**

**\* The item was heard out of agenda order. \***

Actual time: 6:35 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Mamulski stated for the record that the applicant for Item 7, 218 Las Ondas, is not present and since Item 8, 1402 Grand Avenue, is not a noticed item, it will be heard out of order and in place of Item 7.

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect, DMHA

Public comment opened at 6:52 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Ann Camble expressed that though the project may be defined as a three-story structure, from her view, it is a four-story structure. She explained that the previous owner built an unpermitted driveway, dumping debris into the creek, and also built a fence without an opening or wildlife corridor, and she hopes restoration of the creek can be included in the scope of this new project. She also stated that the location of the garage diminishes her property value. John Camble ceded his time to Ms. Camble.

Public comment closed at 6:57 p.m.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

1. The Board appreciates the style and quality of the architecture, and that the addition blends well with the existing style of the home.
2. The Board's assessment after individual site visits is that the existing public view corridors are not impacted by the proposed project.
3. The proposed landscape design softens the size, bulk, and scale of the proposed structure.
4. The Board encourages the continued conversation between the current owner and the adjacent property owner, with mitigation measures to hopefully restore some portions of the creek and tree area at the bottom of the canyon.

Action: Miller/Richards, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, and Ziegler absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****9. 1751 GRAND AVE****R-2 Zone****(7:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-141-009  
Application Number: MST2017-00854  
Owner: Jax J. Carroll II  
Architect: Tom Meaney

(Proposal for a partial demolition and alterations to an existing 1,454 square foot, two-level, single residential unit that will result in a 22 square foot addition on the main level and a 397 square foot addition on the lower level. Other site improvements include a new roof deck. The proposed total of 1,873 square feet of development on a 5,148 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 76% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address a violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2016-00088.)

**(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed January 22, 2018.)**

Actual time: 7:15 p.m.

Present: Tom Meaney, Architect

Public comment opened at 7:23 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Project Design Approval and continue to Consent for Final Approval with comments:**

1. The front roof sash is a huge improvement, adds a finishing touch to the front elevation, and is acceptable since it is under an existing eave.
2. The rear deck is acceptable as it has no apparent privacy issues and does not present itself as a party platform or area of concern with regard to privacy for existing neighbors.
3. The Board made the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility; quality of architecture and materials; landscaping; hillside compliance; and compliance with good neighborhood guidelines.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, and Ziegler absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:26 P.M. \***