



# City of Santa Barbara

## SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD

### MINUTES

### OCTOBER 2, 2017

3:00 P.M.  
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room  
630 Garden Street  
[SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov)

#### BOARD MEMBERS:

Fred Sweeney, *Chair*  
Brian Miller, *Vice Chair*  
Lisa James  
Joseph Moticha  
Robert Richards

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** Jason Dominguez  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** Addison Thompson

#### STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor  
Katie Mamulski, Planning Technician  
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

---

### CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

### ATTENDANCE

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (at 3:09 p.m.), James (until 6:10 p.m.), Moticha (absent 5:23 – 5:38 p.m.), and Richards  
Members absent: None  
Staff present: Unzueta (until 3:16 p.m.), Mamulski, and Vaughn

### GENERAL BUSINESS

#### A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

#### B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **September 18, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: James/Moticha, 4/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

#### C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 25, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Members James and Sweeney.

Action: Moticha/Richards, 4/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

The Consent Calendar of **October 2, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Members James and Sweeney, was approved by the Board without a formal motion, on a 4/0/0 vote. A formal motion and vote will occur at the October 16, 2017 meeting.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
1. Ms. Mamulski announced the following:
    - a. Due to the length of the agenda, a break has been scheduled between Item 5, 626 Alston Road and Item 6, 945 Arbolado Road.
    - b. On October 5, the Planning Commission will review 1631 Shoreline Drive at approximately 1:30 p.m.
  2. Ms. Unzueta formally introduced herself to the Board as the new Design Review Supervisor.
  3. Chair Sweeney requested a discussion item be placed on an upcoming agenda to discuss the New Zoning Ordinance prior to its adoption.
- E. Subcommittee Reports:
- No subcommittee reports.
- F. Chris Manson-Hing, of the American Institute of Architects, announced that the 9th annual ArchitecTours, "Living with Water," will be held on Saturday, October 7, 2017. ArchitecTours is a celebration of local architecture, its benefits, and cultural identity, and will showcase results of the design review process. The six sites on the tour are a combination of one State Street commercial, MOXI, and five exceptional residential projects showcasing innovative architectural solutions where water is utilized and managed to create exemplary projects.

**CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****1. 509 LA MARINA DR****RS-7.5 Zone**

**(3:10)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-211-015  
Application Number: MST2017-00402  
Owner: Gannon Sutter  
Architect: Ricky Moraga

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,365 square foot one-story single family residence with an attached 515 square foot two-car garage. The proposed project includes a one-story addition of 81 square feet, a second-story addition of 507 square feet, and an interior remodel of 105 square feet. Other site improvements include a new 165 square foot patio cover over an existing patio and a new 53 square foot second-story deck. The proposed total of 2,468 square feet on a 10,700 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 65% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed July 24, 2017.)**

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Ricky Moraga, Architect; and Gannon Sutter, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Gloria Antoniou, neighbor, expressed that the project will block public views of the ocean.
2. Elliott MacDougall, neighbor, expressed that this project will block public views and set a precedent in the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 3:29 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:**

1. The Board explained that the size of the second story is appropriate and the lowering of the plate heights does not hinder the overall ocean views of the neighbors, considering the existing vegetation blocks more views than the second-story addition will.
2. The window in the stairwell will not impact major privacy issues as presented and is over 40 feet away from the property line.
3. The Board made the finding that the following Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
  - a. The style of the secondary addition compliments the existing structure and does not impact the overall integrity and fabric of the neighborhood.
  - b. The consistency and appearance of the building is consistent with the character of the neighborhood and is compatible in size, bulk, and scale.
  - c. The quality of the architecture is appropriate.
  - d. The applicant has followed the good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Miller/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****2. 26 WADE CT****RS-1A Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-091-037  
Application Number: MST2017-00488  
Owner: 26 Wade Trust  
Architect: Pacific Architects  
Designer: Robert Vatter

(Proposal to construct a new 3,842 square foot two-story single-family residence with a detached 474 square foot two-car garage on a currently vacant lot. Other site improvements include retaining walls, pool and spa, 466 square feet of balconies, sauna, and a trellis-covered barbeque patio. A 619 square foot attached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) is also proposed with a 276 square foot one-car garage above a subterranean cellar; per state legislation (AB 2299 and SB 1069), the ADU is exempt from Design Review and the FAR calculation. Approximately 1,201 cubic yards of cut and 507 cubic yards of fill will occur on site with 694 cubic yards of export. The proposed total of 4,316 square feet of development on a 1.23 acre lot is 85% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR).)

**(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment and compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program.)**

Actual time: 3:45 p.m.

Present: Bill Wolfe, Architect, Pacific Architects; and Robert Vatter, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:01 p.m.

Correspondence from Timothy Rodgers with concerns was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:02 p.m.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

1. The Board provided positive comments regarding the size of the project and stated that 85% FAR is acceptable.
2. Study relocating the party deck from the top of the garage to an alternate location.
3. Lower the plate heights, especially at the 12-foot ground-level living area.
4. Provide a landscape plan.
5. Study the amount of grading and try to balance the cut and fill on site.

Action: James/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****3. 2901 PASEO TRANQUILLO****RS-7.5 Zone****(4:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-203-008  
Application Number: MST2017-00568  
Owner: Gooch Retirement Plan Trust  
Applicant: Amy Von Protz  
Designer: Jessie Davis

(Proposal to construct 2,033 square feet of first- and second-floor additions to an existing 877 square foot one-story, single-family residence with a 364 square foot one-car garage. The proposed project also includes demolishing the existing one-car garage and constructing a new 498 square foot attached two-car garage. Other site improvements include an interior remodel and an attached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU); per state legislation (AB 2299 and SB 1069), the ADU is exempt from Design Review and the FAR calculation. The proposed total of 3,408 square feet of development on a 9,672 square foot lot is 95% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is required for Zoning Modification requests to allow encroachments within the required secondary front yard and interior setbacks.)

**(Comments Only. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review, Environmental Assessment, and compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program.)**

Actual time: 4:40 p.m.

Present: Jessie Davis, Designer; and Amy Von Protz, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:50 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Timothy Follett, neighbor, expressed concerns regarding the size of the project, stating that it is too large and not in keeping with the neighborhood.
2. Correspondence from Jennifer Keane and Steve Dee Nagelmann was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:53 p.m.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

1. The Board asked that the applicant reduce the FAR, size, bulk, and scale.
2. Provide a conceptual landscape plan.
3. Bring down the plate heights and be more cognizant of the neighborhood.
4. The existing windows facing Paseo Del Descanso should be more in keeping with the style of the new proposal.
5. Provide photos of boundary fences and any other proposed fences.

Action: Moticha/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****4. 2002 GRAND AVE****R-2 Zone****(5:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-346-008  
Application Number: MST2017-00548  
Owner: Suzanne Duca Ira Rollover F/B/O  
Applicant: Loren Solin

(Proposal to remodel 112 square feet of an existing kitchen, replace windows, relocate the front entry door, and re-roof an existing 695 square foot, single-family residence with an attached 227 square foot one-car garage. Other site improvements include a new 112 square foot patio cover, three new skylights, removal of an existing wood deck, and the installation of a new 494 square foot wrap-around flagstone patio. The existing total of 922 square feet of development on a 3,953 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 46% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is required for Zoning Modification requests to allow encroachments within the primary and secondary front setbacks.)

**(Comments Only. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review.)**

Actual time: 5:23 p.m.

Present: Loren Solin, Designer

Public comment opened at 5:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Continue to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to the Full Board with comments:**

1. The Board provided positive comments and supported the design upgrade.
2. The proposed modifications are architecturally appropriate.
3. The Board asked the applicant to explore if the 4x4 post on the flagstone deck is acceptable in a high-fire zone.
4. The Board expressed that the style of architecture has been maintained.
5. The style and design of the patio cover is appropriate as proposed.
6. The new windows are appropriate as proposed.

Action: Miller/James, 4/0/0. (Moticha stepped down.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****5. 626 ALSTON RD****RS-25 Zone****(5:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-171-020  
Application Number: MST2017-00584  
Owner: Wilson Family Trust  
Architect: Dylan Henderson

(Proposal to construct a 3,974 square foot, two-story single-family residence with a 689 square-foot detached two-car garage on a 48,143 square-foot lot. The project also includes a new 15' x 40' pool, a 7' x 7' spa, 1,204 square feet of patio and deck space, a trellis, outdoor grill, site work, and landscaping. Grading is estimated to be 303 cubic yards of cut and fill outside the building footprint with 70 yards of imported fill. The proposed total of 4,663 square feet on a 48,143 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 93% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment and compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program.)**

Actual time: 5:38 p.m.

Present: Dylan Henderson, Architect; and Rob Maday, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 5:42 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Pat Brodie, landscape consultant for the neighbors, asked the Board to consider requesting a solid structure or thicker screening along the driveway to mitigate potential noise and light pollution and requested that the tree species in the view corridor be identified.
2. Bobby Shand expressed that the proposed project is too large for the area, and he has concerns with the landscape lighting. Mr. Shand also submitted written correspondence.
3. Valerie Lewis, architectural consultant for the neighbors, expressed that the pergola will read as a solid structure during the day and will create heavy light pollution at night.

Public comment closed at 5:58 p.m.

**Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:**

1. The Board appreciated the style of the architecture and expressed that the size, bulk, and scale are appropriate for the size of the property.
2. Study the lighting lantern effect on the outside deck area.
3. The Board appreciated the topography and how the grading was handled.
4. Study an alternative to the roof material and consider using a material that is less reflective.
5. The Board agreed that the 92% FAR is appropriate for this particular project because of the size of the property and adjacent properties.
6. Study additional screening or fencing material for the adjacent property line on the northwest side of the property.
7. Include the driveway on the site plan and include the driveway material.

Action: Miller/Richards, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

**\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:10 TO 6:42 P.M. \***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM****6. 945 ARBOLADO RD****RS-15 Zone**

**(6:20)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-241-004  
Application Number: MST2017-00549  
Owner: Brad & R. Merritt  
Architect: Chris Cottrell  
Engineer: Ashley Vance

(Proposal for a remodel and additions to an existing 2,540 square foot single-unit residence located in the Hillside Design District. The project includes a 34 square foot first-floor addition, 204 square foot basement level addition, and converting the existing carport into a two-car garage. The project will provide 837 square feet of rear decks. The proposed total of 3,165 square feet of development on a 15,811 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 73% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)**

Actual time: 6:43 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect

Public comment opened at 6:50 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:**

1. The Board supported the architectural changes and found that they were appropriate.
2. The proposed covered porch and entry additions at the front fit the building well.
3. Consider reconfiguring the steps and size of the deck at the back.

Action: Richards/Moticha, 4/0/0. (James absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****7. 406 N ONTARE RD****RS-10/USS Zone**

**(7:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-151-012  
Application Number: MST2015-00471  
Owner: Christina Pizarro  
Architect: Koffka-Phakos Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,291 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached garage and construct a new 3,601 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 567 square foot three-car garage. Also proposed are a swimming pool, patios, site walls, landscaping, and a total of 187 cubic yards of cut grading, of which 179 cubic yards will be under the residence and 8 cubic yards will be under the pool. The proposed total of 4,169 square feet on a 21,524 square foot lot is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Third Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment and compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program.)**

Actual time: 6:59 p.m.



Present: Christina Pizarro, Applicant; Claudia Pizarro, Contractor; and Jarrett Gorin, Planner

Staff comments: Ms. Mamulski presented a consistency analysis document to the Board from Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, with notes pointing out the most relevant points that should be considered when reviewing this project.

Public comment opened at 7:23 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Tom Pickett, neighbor, explained that there is an architectural design issue with the proposed location of the driveway as it crosses his property and asked the Board to postpone or deny the project until this issue is resolved via legal direction. Catherine Pickett ceded her time to Mr. Pickett.
2. Chris Dahlstrom, neighbor, expressed that the mass, size, bulk, and scale are incompatible with the neighborhood. Mr. Dahlstrom also submitted written correspondence.
3. Judy Benton, neighbor, expressed that the applicant has not followed the good neighbor guidelines and that the project poses privacy issues, is incompatible with the neighborhood, and is too large and bulky for the area. She provided design suggestions to help mitigate some of her concerns. Mary Lynn Rohrbach and Chris Benton ceded their time to Ms. Benton.
4. John Bury, neighbor, voiced that the size, bulk, and scale are too large for the neighborhood.
5. Carol Hemingway advised that the proposed design is out of scale with the neighborhood. Ms. Hemingway also submitted written correspondence to the Board.

Public comment closed at 7:35 p.m.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:**

1. In general, the landscape plan appears to be palatable; however, the Board would like to understand where certain tree and hedge species have been placed to mitigate privacy concerns on the north and south.
2. The Board would like to see a reduction of plate height at the one-story garage, which would then dictate a reduction at the arcade that connects to the main house.
3. The general approach to the required fencing for the pool is acceptable.
4. Consider restudying the height and decorative elements of the two entry gates at the north and south.
5. Provide a full elevation of the proposed new entry gate.
6. Provide a clear representation of the fencing, showing where it will be and what will be changed or modified, and discuss its design with the neighbors at the north and south.
7. Restudy the general sizes of the floorplan, specifically the spaces that are between main functions, such as the stairwell and entryway, in order to make an effort to further reduce the overall size of the home.
8. Although the FAR is currently at 85%, the Board encouraged the applicant to reduce the size further, based on an analysis of current room sizes.
9. In regard to the east elevation, the proportions of the tall window element at the entry staircase need to be restudied.

10. The floor-to-floor plate heights need to be reduced eight feet on the first floor and some floor-to-floor plate heights on the second floor should be reduced to seven feet six inches.
11. Study the relating proportions of the window openings and the language of the window openings so that the style is compatible throughout the entire piece of architecture. Currently, there is a large variety of fenestration vocabulary that needs further study.
12. Consider an alternative to articulate the arched openings at the balcony.
13. The Board appreciated the reduction of the balconies and the introduction of an overhanging Juliet balcony; the proportions and articulation of the railing or guardrail tile element on the Juliet balcony need to be restudied.
14. The fence height should be reduced to six feet from seven feet.
15. Eliminate any light fixtures on the proposed fence, and if they are needed for safety reasons, they should be surface-mounted or articulated into the wall itself to avoid light pollution.
16. On the west elevation, consider the upper stair balcony proportions.
17. Reduce the floor-to-floor heights on the west elevation; it was suggested that it may be a reduction of some areas and retaining some of the others.
18. Consider the reduction of overstated and over-articulated design elements and simplify to an Andalusian style of architecture with simple stucco finishes and other simplified details.
19. If windows are desired at the south elevation garage, restudy them so that they meet the vocabulary of the main house (i.e., Andalusian-style punctured openings versus surface openings).
20. Reducing the height of the garage should dictate the reduction of the house galleria.
21. Study the proportion of the garage door openings at the three-car garage.
22. The Board encouraged the applicant to continue, as demonstrated tonight, to provide documentation in writing, including dates and times, of what items have been discussed, agreed on, and disagreed on with the neighbors, so that the Board clearly understands the interaction between the applicant and the adjacent neighbors.

Action: Sweeney/Moticha, 4/0/0. (James absent.) Motion carried.

**\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:48 P.M. \***