



City of Santa Barbara
SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD
MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 18, 2017

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:
Fred Sweeney, *Chair*
Brian Miller, *Vice Chair*
Lisa James
Joseph Moticha
Robert Richards

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Addison Thompson

STAFF:
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, James, Moticha, and Richards
Members absent: None
Staff present: Unzueta (from 5:35 p.m.-6:13 p.m.), Cameron, and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **August 21, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: James/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 28, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Members Sweeney and James.

Action: Miller/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 5, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Members Miller and James.

Action: Miller/James, 4/0/1. (Sweeney abstained.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 11, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Members Miller and James.

Action: James/Moticha, 4/0/1. (Miller abstained.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 18, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Members Miller and James.

Action: Richards/Moticha, 3/0/2. (Miller and Sweeney abstained.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced that Item 3, 206 Northridge Road, is not actionable and can only receive comments.
2. Chair Sweeney presented three photos of a project that recently installed standing seam metal roofs. He asked the Board to take note of the reflectivity of the standing seam and look closely at details if it reviews projects with these roofs in the future.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

F. Chris Manson-Hing, of the American Institute of Architects, announced that the 9th annual ArchitecTours, "Living with Water," will be held on Saturday, October 7, 2017. ArchitecTours is a celebration of local architecture, its benefits, and cultural identity, and will showcase results of the design review process. The six sites on the tour are a combination of one State Street commercial, MOXI, and five exceptional residential projects showcasing innovative architectural solutions where water is utilized and managed to create exemplary projects.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 1527 DOVER RD****E-1 Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-194-001
Application Number: MST2016-00461
Owner: RMX07, LLC
Agent: Jarrett Gorin
Architect: Gordon Brewer

(Proposal to construct a 2,770 square-foot, two-story single-family residence with a 467 square-foot, detached two-car garage and a 374 square-foot detached accessory space on a 13,991 square-foot vacant lot. The project also includes a new 12'5" x 22'5" swimming pool with associated equipment, 1,935 square feet of covered and uncovered decks, landscaping, and other site improvements. There is a total of 815 cubic yards of proposed grading on the site; 329 cubic yards is located within the building footprint, 486 cubic yards is outside the building footprint, and 388 cubic yards of import. Of the total site pavements, impermeable surfaces comprise 4,279 square feet of the lot, and 1,437 square feet of paving is permeable. The proposed total of 3,611 square feet on a 13,991 square-foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 85% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program and requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on October 31, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Agent; Brewer Gordon, Architect; and Robert Adams, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 3:22 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. The Board appreciated that the gate height location and Tier 3 Storm Water Management details were addressed.
2. The Board appreciated the one-story building height being maintained at the street level and recognized that the project follows the contours of the site.
3. The Board made the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility; quality of architecture and materials; landscaping; protection of public health, safety, and welfare; compliance with good neighborhood guidelines; and preservation of public views.
4. The Board made the finding that the Hillside Design District and Sloped Lot requirements have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 B of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's natural topography protection and building scale.
5. The Board made the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on

the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

6. The Board read the Standard Short Term Conditions of Approval memo, dated September 18, 2017, into the record.

Action: James/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

2. 1631 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(3:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	045-173-022
Application Number:	MST2016-00241
Owner:	Chad Yonker
Architect:	Tom Ochsner
Landscape Architect:	Charles McClure Landscape Architects

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to remodel and add 422 square feet of first-floor additions and a 1,356 square-foot second-story addition to an existing one-story single-family residence. Project will address violations in ZIR2016-00169 and ENF2008-00161 related to the remodel, as-built retaining walls, and decks along the bluff that were removed without approvals or permits. Other site improvements include landscape changes, a new wood fence, new plaster wall, a new concrete driveway, and a flagstone patio. The proposed total of 3,986 square feet on a 20,100 square-foot lot located in Hillside Design District is 85% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments Only. Project requires Planning Commission review and compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program. Project was last reviewed on December 12, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:40 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; Charles McClure, Landscape Architect; and Chad Yonker, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Correspondence from Peter and Linda Snowden, Odile Blanchard, Michael Paskin, Elizabeth Foscue, Don Barthelmess, Carol Kallman, James and Anne-Marie Matthews, Brock Hoffman, Ron and Patt Broome, Nancy Foster, Sam Chesluk, Danny and Susie Duncan, Paul and Kristie Chapman, Teri and Herman Roup, Matt Power, Marissa and Taylor Jobe, Hans P. Miller, Harry and Marlene Wilkinson, Michael Remorenko, Kate Meehan, Kirk Peacock, Graham and Sara Farrar, Lesley Sperling, Jonathan Ford and Tara Haaland-Ford, Brian and Brady Charrette, Dennis and Kristin Zook, John Battel, Gina Picerno, Adam Ziets, Sabrina Gray, Doug Bailey, Pat and Emma Champion, and Chad Yonker was acknowledged.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Jeff Yolles asked general questions and inquired on what community standards exist and how they are used by the Board to analyze a project.
2. Kip Fulbeck stated that he was not notified of this project until it was seen before the Planning

Commission. He further explained that this project is simply too large, too boxy, and inconsistent with the neighborhood.

3. Jessy Wooten, neighbor, explained that when the project is compared to the immediate neighborhood, 35 homes within a 300-foot radius, it is incompatible with two of the five guidelines listed under the neighborhood compatibility guidelines. He further explained that the proposed project is too large and will block public and private views.
4. John Kauffman shared images of two-story elements around the neighborhood and explained that the massing of the second stories are broken up and less boxy. He asked that the Board consider a similar style for the proposed development.
5. Correspondence from Gregg and Cara Leach, Fred Sanford, Silva Aranovich, Susan Sheller, Seymour and Clair Bachmuth, Mary Wise, Patricia J. Janson, Al Harris, and Eric & Bee Saunders was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:07 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Board reemphasized that, in general, it agrees the size of the project is appropriate at 85% of the FAR.
2. The general appearance and architecture of the project is compatible with the neighborhood.
3. The request for a second floor is appropriate.
4. The Board stated that it reserves the right to study the size, bulk, and scale when the project returns for Project Design Approval.
5. The Board recognized that its previous discussion indicated to the applicant that a 10-foot first-floor floor height was acceptable.
6. The Board stated that it reserves the ability to determine the final exterior finish materials when the project returns for Project Design Approval.
7. The Board encouraged the applicant to explore a different roof material other than a standing seam metal roof.
8. The Board expressed that the treatment of the public view of the ocean may be treated differently than what is currently presented; however, in general the public view has not been impeded by the proposed project.
9. The Board recognized that the immediate neighborhood affected by this project is bounded in general along both sides of Shoreline Drive, from Washington Elementary School to Loyola Drive, where Shoreline Drive diminishes in width significantly. It also includes the area bounded by Santa Rosa Avenue, which runs parallel to Shoreline Drive.
10. The Board recognized that this neighborhood is also affected by beach views and can be seen from the beach, below the bluffs, and from the ocean.
11. With respect to the "as-built" retaining walls, the Board recommended the use of Scheme B with the adjustment to not include fill below the lowest wood retaining wall, closest to the beach.
12. The Board also expressed that the section B study, indicating some cut and fill to either side of the higher wall, is a more appropriate aesthetic solution along with the proposed landscaping, which would be planted to camouflage the two existing walls.
13. The Board appreciated the removal of all chimney elements on the roof plan and encouraged the applicant to retain that approach.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 206 NORTHRIDGE RD****A-1 Zone**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-120-014
Application Number: MST2017-00519
Owner: 206 Northridge Rd, LLC
Designer: Kate Svensson

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 2,994 square-foot, two-story single-family residence. The proposed project involves demolishing the existing 289 square foot attached two-car carport and constructing a new 470 square foot attached two-car garage. Other site improvements include demolishing 42 square feet on the first floor, 64 square feet on the second floor, conducting an interior remodel of 2,400 square feet, reconfiguration of the main entry, new patios, new windows, doors, exterior finishes, a new roof, and the addition of a fireplace. The proposed project will address violations in ZIR2017-00219. The proposed total of 3,358 square feet of development on a 29,282 square-foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 70% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:57 p.m.

Present: Kate Svensson, Designer; and Robert Adams, Earthknower Studio, Landscape Architect

Staff comments: Mr. Cameron announced that this item is not actionable since the Zoning plan check is still pending.

Public comment opened at 5:12 p.m.

Don Swann spoke with concerns, expressing that it would be desirable if the garage could be kept in the front yard, that two front doors means the home could be used as a multi-family instead of single-family unit, and that the elm tree is undesirable and kills the landscaping in his front yard. Mr. Swann also submitted two letters to the Board, one for himself and one on behalf of Mr. McKinster, the neighbor across the street.

Public comment closed at 5:16 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the size and bulk of the structure.
2. Restudy the color scheme and consider using earth tones for the plaster.
3. Study the stone work on the chimneys and the compatibility of the chimney caps.
4. The Board does not support the use of a standing seam metal roof and asked the applicant to explore other options.
5. The Board does not support the use of an all-glass garage door system and asked the applicant to study alternatives.
6. The Board looks forward to a fully developed landscape plan.
7. Explore the trellis element on the south elevation.

8. Study the proportions and relationship of the upstairs suite windows on the south elevation; it was recommended that the two side windows be slightly smaller.

Action: Miller/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:32 TO 5:35 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 1638 PAYERAS ST

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(4:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-022-005
 Application Number: MST2017-00506
 Owner: Steven Camarillo
 Applicant: Jacob Niksto

(Proposal to construct 930 square feet of first- and second-story additions to an existing 1,588 square foot, one-story single-family residence with a 406 square foot attached garage. A 162 square foot attached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) is also proposed; per state legislation (AB 2299 and SB 1069), the ADU is exempt from Design Review and the FAR calculation. Other site improvements include door and window replacements, an interior remodel, and demolishing the existing covered patio in the backyard. The proposed project is located in the Non Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Coastal Review. The proposed total of 2,356 square feet of development (excluding the ADU) on an 8,045 square-foot lot is 74% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:35 p.m.

Present: Jacob Niksto, Architect; and Steven Camarillo, Owner

Staff comments: Mr. Cameron explained the purview of the Board specific to ADU projects.

Public comment opened at 5:46 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. Return with a color board that includes the color of the plaster, the proposed roofing material, and a spec sheet of the proposed light fixtures; also include them on the plans and elevations.
2. Develop a landscape plan around the first-floor addition and front porch.
3. The Board expressed that the plate heights and second-story addition are appropriate for the overall size of the house.
4. The Board stated that the windows are appropriate as proposed.
5. The Board made the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility; quality of architecture and materials; and compliance with good neighborhood guidelines.

Action: Miller/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 1035 COYOTE RD

A-1 Zone

(5:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-061-005
Application Number: MST2017-00529
Owner: Berrett 2009 Family Trust
Architect: Rick Starnes

(Proposal for a change of use of the existing non-conforming 428 square foot single-story building from accessory to single-family use located within the required 35 foot front setback. A portion of the building was permitted as a workshop and storage building at 402 square feet but is actually 428 square feet. The proposed project also includes 1,046 square feet of additions, 869 square feet of new development, and construction of a new 400 square-foot two-car garage. Zoning Modifications are requested to allow the conversion of the workshop/storage to be converted to a single-story residential unit and for the construction of a new two-car garage located within the required front setback. Other site improvements include the demolition of existing structures within the required setbacks. The proposal will address violations listed in ENF2015-00314 and ZIR2015-00535. The proposed total of 2,643 square feet of development on a 25,177 square-foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 56% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments Only. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for Zoning Modification requests.)

Actual time: 5:58 p.m.

Present: Rick Starnes, Architect

Staff comments: Mr. Cameron advised that the Board is being asked to review the aesthetics of the project and explained that it is not the purview of the Board to comment or alter the determinations made by the Creeks Division. The Board should provide comments on the portions of the project that require modifications and advise if the proposed modifications are aesthetically appropriate. Lastly, the applicant has already been informed that staff is unable to support the front setback modification request.

Public comment opened at 6:09 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: The Board determined that no comments on the architectural aesthetics of the project will be provided until the applicant and staff come to an understanding on what will be allowed to be built on the property.

Action: Moticha/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 130 CAMINO ALTO****A-1 Zone**

(5:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-150-018
Application Number: MST2017-00487
Owner: Demir Hamami
Architect: Pacific Architects

(Proposal to construct a new 3,845 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 443 square foot garage on a vacant parcel that was previously destroyed by fire. Other site improvements include a 221 square foot workshop, 1,798 square feet of decks and balconies, and a 31 square foot covered porch. An attached 650 square foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) is also proposed; per state legislation (AB 2299 and SB 1069), the ADU is exempt from Design Review and the FAR calculation. The proposed total of 4,509 square feet of development (excluding the ADU) on a 32,839 square-foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 93% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments Only. Project requires further Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 6:13 p.m.

Present: William Wolf, Pacific Architects

Public comment opened at 6:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Return with a project that does not exceed 85% FAR, excluding the ADU portion of the project.
2. Study the redo of the front wall and gates so that they are more in keeping with the architectural vocabulary of the current building.
3. Study the floor to floor heights and have the first-floor clearance be no more than nine feet and the second-floor clearance at eight feet.
4. Reconfigure and break up the decks so that they are more compatible and avoid the straight line across the front, at both levels.
5. Return with a schematic-level landscape plan.
6. The Board recognized that it could not make comments on the three ADU exterior elevations on the second floor, the bridge, or the ADU decks.
7. Return with a color study for the exterior and materials board, preferably avoiding the use of the color white and reflective materials.
8. The Board appreciated the cable rail approach to enclose and protect the deck area and staircases.
9. Provide details on the proposed exterior lighting fixtures for the Board's review and consideration.
10. Provide clarification on types of skylights and finishes that may be used on the flat roof.
11. Provide the flat roof color and material.
12. Study ways to break up the flatness of the roof.

Action: Miller/James, 5/0/0 Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 30 ALSTON PL****A-2 Zone**

(6:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-161-009
Application Number: MST2017-00518
Owner: Douglas J. Kaplan Revocable Trust
Applicant: Jonathan Villegas

(Proposal to construct a 200 square foot second-story addition on an existing 2,704 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an existing 496 square foot attached two-car garage. The proposed project also includes new windows and doors, new deck finish and railing, a new trellis, and an outdoor fireplace. The proposed total of 3,400 square feet of development on a 1.01 acre lot located in the Hillside Design District is 68% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:36 p.m.

Present: Jonathan Villegas, Applicant

Public comment opened at 6:40 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Susan Case, neighbor, stated that she has tried to communicate with the neighbor to understand the scope of the project to no avail, and that she would like to meet with the neighbor before construction takes place. Ms. Case also submitted written correspondence.
2. Claude Case, neighbor, explained that there has been no communication with the neighbors and he feels left out and ignored. He expressed that he would like to discuss the project with the owner, including structure and vegetation.

Public comment closed at 6:45 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The owner is to communicate with the neighbors.
2. The project is compatible with the size, bulk, and scale of the neighborhood.
3. The Board made the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility; quality of architecture and materials; landscaping; protection of public health, safety, and welfare; and compliance with good neighborhood guidelines, with the caveat that the owner communicate with the neighbors.
4. The Board recognized that the proposed trellis element is not exceeding the existing roofline and can only be seen from the southerly portion of the lot.

Action: Miller/Sweeney, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:55 P.M. ***