



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, November 28, 2016 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
BERNI BERNSTEIN
LISA JAMES
JOSEPH MOTICHA
DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
KATIE MAMULSKI, Planning Technician
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (present at 3:04 p.m., until 5:25 p.m.), Bernstein, James, Moticha, and Woolery.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Mamulski and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **November 14, 2016**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **November 14, 2016**, as submitted/amended.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Miller abstained).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **November 21, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney and Denise Woolery**.

Action: Woolery/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **November 28, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney and Denise Woolery**.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Mamulski announced the December 2016 scheduled meetings:

- a) December 5, 2016 – SFDB Consent Review.
- b) December 12, 2016 – SFDB Full Board meeting.
- c) December 19, 2016 – SFDB Consent Review.

2. Board member Bernstein announced she would again be stepping down from Item 6, 2327 Edgewater Way.

E. Subcommittee Reports: No subcommittee reports were made at this time.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

1. 1631 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-022
 Application Number: MST2016-00241
 Owner: Chad Yonker
 Architect: Tom Ochsner
 Landscape Architect: Charles McClure

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to remodel and add 422 square feet of first floor additions and a 1,356 square foot second story addition to an existing one-story single family residence. Project will address violations in ZIR2016-00169 and ENF2008-00161 related to the remodel, as-built retaining walls and decks along the bluff which were removed without approvals or permits. Other site improvements include landscape changes, a new wood fence, new plaster wall, a new concrete driveway and a flagstone patio. The proposed total of 3,986 square feet on a 20,100 square foot lot located in Hillside Design District is 85% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second Concept Review; Comments Only; Project requires Planning Commission Review and was last reviewed August 8, 2016)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; and Charles McClure, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the style of the proposed architectural style, but finds the proposed height of the project is too high.
- 2) The Board finds that the second floor plate height at the middle of the structure is too tall.
- 3) Study the size of the living room as it relates its resolution on the street elevation so that the final architecture solution is more compatible with the general neighborhood given the cottage style architecture being proposed.
- 4) Reduce the percentage of lawn area for neighborhood compatibility and to more accurately reflect existing water shortage requirements.
- 5) The front fence at 5 feet as one large fence is not appropriate for the fabric of the neighborhood landscape, although a combination of a 5-foot fence and landscaping could be acceptable.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

2. 242 LAS ALTURAS RD

E-1 Zone

(3:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-320-025
 Application Number: MST2016-00315
 Owner: Robert McGlashan
 Agent: Robert Irvine
 Landscape Architect: Jon Pride

(Proposal to remodel 1,619 square feet of the existing 3,797 square foot one-story house, demolish 16 square feet of the existing house and add 518 square feet to the residence. Also proposed is a re-roof, a new 420 square foot attached two-car garage to replace the existing non-conforming carport, which would encroach into the front setback and a new pool deck with landscaping. The proposed total of 4,719 square feet on a 43,560 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 98% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested to allow the new garage in the required front setback.)

(A revised project description [split into two separate phases] was submitted by the Applicant at the meeting, as follows: This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish 19 square feet and add 537 square feet to the existing 3,370 square foot one-story single family residence. The proposal also includes an interior remodel of 1,497 square feet, landscape alterations and a re-roof of the central and west wing to match like for like. Other site improvements including a new garage and pool deck will be submitted under a separate phase of the project at a later time and will require Staff Hearing Officer Review. The proposed total of 3,552 square feet on a 43,560 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 72% of the guideline maximum floor to-lot-area ratio (FAR). Project will address violations found in BLD2001-01481 and BLD91-00098.)

(Second Concept Review; Comments Only; Project requires Staff Hearing officer review and was last reviewed on August 22, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:51 p.m.

Present: Domaine Forte and Issac Hendricks, Architects for Studio William Hefner; Robert Irvine, Agent; and Robert McGlashan, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa

Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with the comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) The Board appreciates the changes the Applicant has made on the project.
- 3) Restudy the exterior color and provide a more toned down color to naturally blend with the surrounding environment.
- 4) Consider eliminating the window on the bathroom corner.
- 5) The proposed landscape plan is acceptable that fits the house and meets guidelines.
- 6) Restudy the proposed stone work on the north elevation and provide an alternative option at Consent Review.
- 7) The Board would like verification that the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) will not be any higher than 87% when the garage is added to the plans.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW

3. 2225 MOUNT CALVARY RD

A-1 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-040-037
 Application Number: MST2016-00263
 Owner: Fish and Barbara Salvatore, Trustees
 Applicant: Jon Clark
 Architect: Ray Twyford

(Proposal to construct a 1,150 square foot one-story single family dwelling with an attached 400 square foot garage and related site work including new landscape and hardscape improvements. Access will be provided off the existing private road. Also proposed is approximately 330 cubic yards of cut and fill on site. The proposed total of 1,150 square feet on a 1.5 acre lot is 30% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project was last reviewed on July 25, 2016, and must comply with Tier 3 SWMP requirements.)

Actual time: 4:33 p.m.

Present: Jon Clark, Applicant; Ray Twyford, Architect; Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect; and Fish and Barbara Salvatore, Trustees.

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued one week to Consent Review with comment that the Board appreciates the project's consistency and appearance, landscaping, the quality of architecture and materials, and the attention to the site details.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 288 CANON DR****E-2/SD-2 Zone**

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-142-010
 Application Number: MST2015-00549
 Owner: Wayne L. and Elizabeth B. Labrie
 Architect: Wayne Labrie, Architect

(Proposal for 2,378 square feet of additions to an existing 2,576 square foot two-story single-family residence. The proposal includes new and enlarged decks, minor landscaping changes, and a new permeable driveway and patios. The proposed total of 4,954 square feet (of which 1,594 square feet is in a new basement and will receive a 50% FAR credit) on a 13,769 square foot lot is ~~99%~~ 62% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications to allow additions and alterations within one interior setback, and for a solar access modification.)

(Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 054-16 and was last reviewed on May 2, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:43 p.m.

Present: Wayne Labrie Architect and Owner; and Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:54 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion 1: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the conditions:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.

Action: Moticha/_____. Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Motion 2: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the architecture and style, but would like the Applicant to study to reduce the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio closer to an 85% maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).
- 2) Study simplifying the overall exterior roof elevations, especially in terms of the second story roof configurations on the east and west elevations for a more cohesive singular roof structure.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Moticha/Sweeney opposed).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 1531 W VALERIO ST****A-2 Zone****(4:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-071-041
 Application Number: MST2016-00450
 Owner: Jeffrey Alan Sears, Living Trust
 Architect: W David Winitzky

(Proposal to construct a new three-story 2,590 square foot single-family residence with an attached 474 square foot two-car garage and a detached 244 square foot one-car garage on a previously vacant lot. The proposal includes a total of 250 cubic yards of grading, 162 cubic yards cut and 27.8 cubic yards fill under the building and 167 cubic yards of cut and 52.8 cubic yards of fill on site. Also proposed is 1,148 square feet of roof decks, 619 square feet of decks at grade, site walls, new driveway and two uncovered parking spaces. The proposed total of 3,310 square feet located on a 74,790 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District, is 61% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 007-07, and was last reviewed October 31, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:25 p.m.

Present: W David Winitzky, Architect; and Jeffrey Alan Sears, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:36 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter in support from Pamela Haldemna was acknowledged by the Board that was provided from the Applicant.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with the conditions:

- 1) The Board read the following finding into the record: "The SFDB finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility in size, bulk, and scale; quality architecture and materials, preservation of public views, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 3) The Board finds acceptable the 61% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).
- 4) Provide exterior lighting details.
- 5) Provide a color board.

Action: James/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 5 MINUTES AT 5:48 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 5:52 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**6. 2327 EDGEWATER WAY****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(5:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-350-007
 Application Number: MST2016-00191
 Owner: Hack Family Trust
 Architect: Tom Henson

(Proposal to demolish an existing detached 448 square foot two-car garage and 170 square foot one-car carport and construction of a 1,341 square foot first story addition and 845 square foot second-story addition, new attached 442 square foot two-car garage, and new driveway with motorcourt. Also proposed is to permit an "as-built" deck to this existing 1,602 square foot single family dwelling. The proposed total of 4,189 square feet on a 22,189 square foot lot is ~~89%~~ 86% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Planning Commission approval of a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Third Concept Review; Project requires Planning Commission Review and Environmental Assessment and was last reviewed November 14, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:52 p.m.

Present: Jacob Niksto, Applicant; Tom Henson, Architect; Derrick Eichelberger, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:01 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An emailed letter of concern from Michel, Marie, and Timothy Boudreaux was acknowledged regarding appreciation of the Board's requests to reduce the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR), and had further concerns regarding construction, noise, and parking issues, which staff verified for the Board that some issues can be addressed by conditions of approval imposed by the Planning Commission upon approval.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission for return to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) The Board appreciates the further reduction in maximum floor-to-lot area ratio from 89% to an 86% FAR for a requested further reduction in size, bulk, and scale; especially regarding the south elevation deck railings, including reductions to the length of the project on the east and west elevations, and a further reduction toward the south.
- 3) The Board finds the landscape plan is acceptable in the removal of the tall palm trees and courtesy preservation of adjacent neighborly views for neighborhood compatibility and good neighbor guidelines. For the record, the Board finds the dated "11/21/2016" plan set is acceptable.

Action: Moticha/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein stepped down).

Board comments: The Board requested clarification from staff if the Planning Commission can request story poles, and if so required, when the project returns to SFDB can the Board request a second set of story poles even if the Owner had already previously posted them for the Planning Commission.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 626 SUNRISE VISTA WAY****E-1/PUD 1.2 Zone**

(5:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-112-026
 Application Number: MST2016-00396
 Owner: James C. Henry III
 Architect: Jose Contreras
 Architect: Windward Engineering

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,320 square foot one-story residence and 663 square foot attached garage and construct a new 3,614 square foot one-story residence with an attached 471 square foot two-car garage and 1,911 square feet of covered decks in the Planned Unit Development. The proposed total of 4,028 square feet on a 16,204 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 92% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project was last reviewed on October 31, 2016 and must comply with Tier 3 SWMP requirements.)

Actual time: 6:13 p.m.

Present: Jose Contreras, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:20 p.m.

- 1) Gerard Cardillo (adjacent neighbor of La Vista Estates Owners Association), spoke in support of the project, and to specifically to thank the Board on requiring the further reduction of FAR, and for requesting the design style of the project to match the design style of the neighborhood for compatibility.

Public comment closed at 6:22 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) The Board finds the 92% maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) acceptable considering the size of the lot and the similar structures in the Planned Unit Development (PUD).
- 3) Provide a double starter row of two-part Mission tile which is a more acceptable material.
- 4) Show landscape lighting details on the plans.
- 5) Provide Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:29 P.M. ****