



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, November 14, 2016 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
BERNI BERNSTEIN
LISA JAMES
JOSEPH MOTICHA
DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
KATIE MAMULSKI, Planning Technician
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James, Moticha, and Woolery.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Mamulski and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **October 31, 2016**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **October 31, 2016**, as submitted/amended.

Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **November 7, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney** and **Denise Woolery**.

Action: Woolery/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **November 14, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney** and **Denise Woolery**. Chair Sweeney clarified the maximum requirement for amount of trees on a lot at a 3-to-1 ratio.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Mamulski announced the following changes to the agenda:

- a) Agenda Item 3, 1106 Crestline Dr., was postponed at the Applicant's request.
- b) Agenda Item 7, 406 N. Ontare Rd., was postponed at the Applicant's request.

2. Board member Bernstein announced she would be stepping down from Item #2, 2327 Edgewater Way, due to potential conflict of interest of living within 500 feet of the project.

E. Subcommittee Reports: No subcommittee reports were made at this time.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

1. 453 LAS ALTURAS RD

E-1 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-311-001
 Application Number: MST2016-00416
 Owner: Charles M. Firestone
 Designer: Andrew Hall

(Proposal for a 659 square foot expansion of an existing raised wood deck. The proposal will include a new hot tub with benches and guardrail. The 14,357 square foot lot is located in the Hillside Design District with an average slope of 18% and is developed with a 1,594 square foot single-family residence with a 440 square foot attached two-car garage and a 443 square foot wood deck.)

(Second Concept Review; Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project was last reviewed September 19, 2016 at Consent.)

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: Patty and Charles Firestone, Owners.

Public comment opened at 3:18 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with conditions:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) The Board found the proposed deck design and size is acceptable and appropriate due to the location of the first level deck at the rear of the site, that the proposed deck surrounded by heavy plant vegetation that would be thick and heavy enough to help preserve privacy issues, and that good neighbor guidelines were followed as evidenced by support correspondence provided by the adjacent neighbor.
- 3) Provide clarification of the proposed hot tub framing details in relation to the deck.
- 4) Provide detailed illustrations or plans to clarify the landscaping below the deck.
- 5) Provide more accurate illustrations showing the railing above the deck and trellis element.
- 6) Provide a color board with colors to match existing colors.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

2. 2327 EDGEWATER WAY

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-350-007
 Application Number: MST2016-00191
 Owner: Hack Family Trust
 Architect: Tom Henson

(Proposal to demolish an existing detached 448 square foot two-car garage and 170 square foot one-car carport and construction of a 1,341 square foot first-story addition and 845 square foot second-story addition, new attached 442 square foot two-car garage, and new driveway with motorcourt. Also proposed is to permit an "as-built" deck to this existing 1,602 square foot single-family dwelling. The proposed total of 4,189 square feet on a 22,189 square foot lot is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Planning Commission approval of a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second Concept Review; Comments Only; Project requires Planning Commission Review and Environmental Assessment and was last reviewed September 19, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:37 p.m.

Present: Jacob Niksto, Applicant; Tom Henson, Architect; Derrick Eichelberger, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:48 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Public comment of concern from Berni Bernstein was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the reduced 89% guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) on the project, but would like to see a further reduction in the proposed FAR.
- 2) The Board finds the new design, proposed shingle siding, and articulation are acceptable.
- 3) Restudy the proposed palm trees at the entry along the driveway on the west side.
- 4) All railings on the existing deck are to match the existing house, and not of the proposed plastic or plexi-glass material.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein stepped down).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

3. 1106 CRESTLINE DR

E-1 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-201-005
 Application Number: MST2016-00429
 Owner: Bratton Living Trust
 Owner: Monika Draggoo and David Back
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal for major alterations to an existing 2,516 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached 384 square foot two-car garage. The project involves demolishing 750 square feet of the first floor and 25 square feet of the garage, and constructing 769 square feet on the first floor, resulting in a net reduction of 6 square feet. The project also involves a complete remodel of the exterior including new flat roofs and a lowered total building height. The proposed total of 2,894 square feet on an 18,463 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 71% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow alterations within the front setback.)

(Second Concept Review; Comments Only; Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review and was last reviewed October 3, 2016.)

Postponed indefinitely at the Applicant's request.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

4. 606 SUNRISE VISTA WAY

E-1/PUD 1.2 Zone

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-112-019
 Application Number: MST2016-00490
 Owner: John E. Gerngross Jr. Revocable Trust

(Proposal remove the existing tile burnt red roof and replace two layers 40# underlayment with new Boral Saxony 900 Country Slate Tile in color Sea Pearl Blend.)

(Second Concept Review; Project was referred from Consent Review; Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:19 p.m.

Present: John and Sharon Gerngross, Owners.

Staff read into the record a brief summary on directive received from the City Attorney's office regarding neighborhood private CC&R and PUD requirement practices, and the Board's purview in response to concerns from condominium and townhome associations. It was clarified that the Board cannot regulate on private CC&R requirements which are outside the Board and the City's purview. The Board has no purview to require or compel the Applicant to comply with private CC&R requirements, and can only suggest compliance. In this case, no HOA prior letter of approval is required for design review applications proposing exterior alterations to each residence in the PUD. The Board cannot regulate on CC&R's for PUDs that the City did not impose, with the sole exception of approval conditions that were added at the time the PUD was accepted. The current PUD requirements were read into the record by the Chair. It was also clarified by the Owners that the required specifications on the color of the roof tile was not included in the original PUD requirements for the property at the time it was purchased by the current Owners, but has since been added to the current PUD.

Public comment opened at 4:33 p.m.

- 1) Cathie McCammon (adjacent neighbor/HOA), opposition, spoke of concerns regarding the proposed matching aesthetics in the neighborhood, specifically the proposed roof tiles and color.
- 2) Gerard Cardillo (neighbor/HOA), opposition, spoke of concerns regarding the history and evolution of the current neighborhood practices.

Public comment of concern from Gerard Cardillo, Catherine McCammon, were acknowledged.

Two letters in support submitted by the Applicant from Dan Lord and Sylvain & Karen Debarqa, adjacent neighbors, were read into the record and acknowledged.

A letter of concern from Barbara Dixon, and a petition in opposition from Catherine McCammon, Gerard Cardillo, Ethyl Yeung, Barbara Dixon, and Albert Yimm were also submitted.

Public comment closed at 4:36 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the proposed roof tile style and color are not in keeping with the existing color scheme of the neighborhood and PUD or in keeping with SFDB Guidelines for neighborhood consistency, and needs to match existing rounded-edge roof tile configuration and a similar color scheme of the surrounding neighborhood.

Action: James/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Substitute Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the proposed roof tile style and color are not in keeping with the existing color scheme of the neighborhood and PUD or in keeping with SFDB Guidelines for neighborhood consistency, and needs to match existing rounded-edge roof tile configuration and a similar color scheme of the surrounding neighborhood.
- 2) Return with a new color style and color.

Action: James/Woolery 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 1135 HARBOR HILLS DR****E-1 Zone****(5:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-314-005
 Application Number: MST2016-00484
 Owner: John Mithun
 Architect: Thomas Ochsner, AIA Architect

(Proposal for an addition and remodel of an existing one-story single-family residence to include a 162 square foot garage addition, 519 square foot residence addition, new covered patio, entry pergola, and landscaping. Other site improvements include a re-roof, change of exterior finishes and new doors and windows. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for front and interior setback modifications. The proposed total of 2,999 square feet on a 10,454 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 79% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments Only; Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review, and must comply with Tier 3 SWMP requirements.)

Actual time: 5:05 p.m.

Present: Thomas Ochsner, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:13 p.m.

- 1) James Scafide (Attorney for Nancy Engstrom) opposition, spoke of concerns regarding setback issues and preserving his client's private harbor views with regard to the scale and location of the new proposed master bath addition with a request to scale the size back or relocating it. His client has also offered to pay for redesigned plans.
- 2) Nancy Engstrom (neighbor), opposition, spoke of concerns regarding preserving her private harbor views with regard to the negative impacts of the proposed scale and location of the new proposed master bath addition, new landscaping, palm tree back patio location, and story poles. She confirmed her offer to pay for redesigned plans.
- 3) Hudson Holnick (neighbor), opposition, concurred and ceded his time to the previous speakers.

Public comment of concern from Ira & Lesley Levy and Nancy Engstrom were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:16 p.m.

The Chair stated for the public record that the Board is mainly an architectural design and aesthetics Board for mass, bulk, and scale, and neighborhood compatibility; therefore, *private* view concerns of the public are not within the Board's purview, and although it was determined that private views were not negatively impacted for this particular project site, he encouraged both the Applicant and neighbors to work together with the good neighbor guidelines to achieve neighborhood compatibility.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The proposed front and interior modifications on the north east (fireplace) and north west (garage) are aesthetically appropriate, and do not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Design Guidelines and findings.
- 2) Reduce the master bedroom/bathroom wing.
- 3) Rework the new roof over the existing part of the house.
- 4) Remove the palm tree, and provide current landscape plans with details for only the areas affected by the remodel and additions.

- 5) Practice Good Neighbor Guidelines by meeting with neighborhood for neighborhood compatibility after design modifications to the plans have been made.
- 6) The Board does not support a standing seam roof.

Action: Moticha/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 237 SAN CLEMENTE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(6:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-151-006
 Application Number: MST2016-00476
 Owner: David Wadors
 Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to demolish the existing 1,544 square foot one-story single-family residence and construct a new 1,967 square foot two-story single-family residence. The proposal also includes a new two-story detached 550 square foot garage with a 280 square foot accessory structure above to be used as an exercise room. Other site improvements include a new driveway, retaining wall and decks on both the residence and accessory structure. The proposed total of 2,730 square feet on an 8,049 square foot lot located in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 85% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments Only; Project requires Tier 3 SWMP compliance and Coastal Review.)

Actual time: 5:45 p.m.

Present: Thomas Ochsner, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:51 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the style of architecture acceptable, and is willing to consider the accessory structure over the garage acceptable provided there is a reduction in height for neighborhood compatibility, with possibly some landscaping.
- 2) Study the front patio and reduce.
- 3) Provide an accurate FAR.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan.
- 5) Study the height of the overall house for a reduction to an 85% FAR and reduced height.
- 6) Restudy the deck off the second floor master bedroom for a possible reduction in size or removal.
- 7) Remove the proposed spiral staircase for neighborhood compatibility.

Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 406 N ONTARE RD****E-2/SD-2 Zone****(6:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-151-012
Application Number: MST2015-00471
Owner: Christina Pizarro
Architect: Koffka- Phakos Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,291 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached garage and construct a new 3,601 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 567 square foot three-car garage. Also proposed are a swimming pool, patios, site walls, landscaping, and a total of 187 cubic yards of cut grading, of which 179 cubic yards will be under the residence and 8 cubic yards will be under the pool. The proposed total of 4,169 square feet on a 21,524 square foot lot is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested; Project was last reviewed May 2, 2016.)

Postponed indefinitely at the Applicant's request.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:16 P.M. ****