



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 17, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 KATIE MAMULSKI, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James, Moticha, and Woolery.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Mamulski and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **October 3, 2016**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **October 3, 2016**, as submitted. Staff addressed the issues on Item 2, 1210 Shoreline Dr., of the Board's request for lawn irrigation maintenance in the parkway and existing lawn in the setback per the Zoning Ordinance requirements.

Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **October 10, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney and Denise Woolery**.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **October 17, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney and Denise Woolery**.

Action: James/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- Ms. Mamulski announced that the last agenda item, 406 N. Ontare Rd., has been postponed indefinitely at the Applicant's request.

E. Subcommittee Reports: Chair Sweeney reported on an email he sent to City staff regarding a previously held workshop on New Zoning Ordinance revisions, process, and schedule and due to non-response from the Planning Commission and City staff, he informed the Board that there might be limited-to-no new input allowed from the SFDB Board's submittal regarding issues such as the allowed increase in size for accessory buildings and garages on the same lot, differing measured definition of "basement" per the California Municipal Building Code versus per the City Zoning Ordinance, etc. Planning Commissioner Addison Thompson made a courtesy visit and reported on the request made by the Board regarding submittal of the Board's input. And he stated that the response he received was that the issues regarding Title 22 of the Zoning Ordinance were not being addressed yet, only those addressing Title 28 of the Municipal Building Code were currently being addressed, but that all input by the various Boards is welcome and would be addressed, and a reply to the Board would soon be forthcoming.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

1. 3435 MARINA DR

A-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-022-005
 Application Number: MST2013-00281
 Owner: Charles Rudd
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a 5,990 square foot, three-level, single-family residence, comprised of two-stories and a basement, and a 440 square foot two-car garage, located on a vacant 1.12 acre lot in the Hillside Design District and within the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes new site walls and gates, new site landscaping and hardscape, a new pool. 3,854 cubic yards of cut and fill grading are proposed, with 10 cubic yards to be exported off site. The proposed total of 6,430 square feet (of which 5,210 is above grade) is 103% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Review After Final is requested for changes in fence material from metal to CMU block with plaster and an alteration of the existing site fence/CMU wall location at the East/South property line.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; and Allison DeBusk, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:19 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Allison reported on the Board's purview regarding the project's view corridor, including trees and fencing which is only within the view corridor as it runs along the property lines, where applicable.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final changes and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) The Board has reviewed the view corridor, which is part of the design plans, and the westerly wall and the current change in design are not inconsistent with the Single Family Design Guidelines.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

2. 1807 LIGHTHOUSE WAY

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-400-005
 Application Number: MST2015-00607
 Owner: Lighthouse Builders LLC
 Applicant: Bruce Blodorn
 Architect: Richard Thorne, Architect

(Lot 5: Proposal for a new 2,281 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with a 525 square foot, attached two-car garage with storage. The project includes new landscaping, site walls, and 30 cubic yards of cut and fill grading, of which 20 cubic yards will be outside of the building footprint. The proposed total of 2,806 square feet on a newly created 11,334 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 73% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project is Lot 5 of a five-lot subdivision approved under MST2006-00476.)

(Final Approval is requested; Project was last reviewed January 5, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:28 p.m.

Present: Bruce Blodorn, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:32 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted with the comment that the Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and that the project follows good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Moticha/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 5 MINUTES AT 3:34 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 3:39 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 45 LAS ALTURAS CIR****A-1 Zone**

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-130-014
Application Number: MST2015-00520
Owner: Pan Hsiao-Li and Dru Finley
Architect: Chris Cottrell

(Proposal to construct a new 468 square foot second-floor addition with 290 square feet of upper level decks to an existing 2,936 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes enclosure of the existing attached 550 square foot carport to become a 507 square foot, two-car garage. A pool with adjacent flatwork and a fire pit were approved separately under MST2015-00190. The proposed total of 3,918 square feet on a 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 77% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested; Project was last reviewed May 16, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect and Jarrett Gorin, Applicant; Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect; Pan Hsiao, Co-Owner.

The Applicant stated that he scheduled a five-day advance notice after-hours neighborhood meeting last Wednesday, October 12, 2016, at 7:00 p.m., showed the Board a sample of the hand-delivered invitations and address list, and reported that he no neighborhood attendees at that meeting.

The Owner stated that she is very sensitive and open to neighborhood concerns.

For the record, staff clarified the error made on the Agenda that Mr. Thomas Moore was never an owner of the property, and his name has been removed from the project in the City system.

Public comment opened at 3:54 p.m.

- 1) Donald Vogt, neighbor, opposition; spoke of concerns that he did not received prior notification of the Applicant's neighborhood meeting until October 7, 2016, and was not given sufficient time to attend, discuss, or consult with the Applicant's most recent public meeting with neighbors.
- 2) Michael Jaffe, neighbor, opposition; spoke of privacy concerns and would like the opportunity to discuss his concerns, but that he was also not given sufficient time to attend, discuss, or consult with the Applicant's most recent public meeting with neighbors.
- 3) Thomas Munroe, neighbor, opposition; stated that he understands the Applicant's desire to build, but he believes that there is sufficient space to build without impacts to neighbors, and spoke of concerns that he was also not given sufficient time to attend, discuss, or consult with the Applicant's most recent public meeting with neighbors.

Two email of expressed concerns from Donald and Carolyn Vogt, and Michael and Jann Jaffe were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:01 p.m.

The Chair stated for the public record that the Board is mainly an architectural design and aesthetics Board for size, mass, bulk, and scale, and neighborhood compatibility; therefore, as directed by the City Attorney's Office of the City of Santa Barbara, *private* view concerns are not within the Board's purview, and he encouraged both the Applicant and neighbors to work together with the good neighbor guidelines to achieve neighborhood compatibility.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Restudy to provide alternative materials for the proposed gate and glass garage door.
- 2) Restudy to provide an additional gate with due consideration of the proposed landscape plan.
- 3) Provide all details on the plans, including further deck and railing details, down spouts, and roof overhangs.
- 4) The Board included the statement for the record that neighborhood impacts and neighborhood compatibility were duly considered by the Board for this project. The Board acknowledged that the Applicant did make sufficient effort to meet and promote a dialogue with adjacent neighbors of the project to discuss neighborhood compatibility impacts.
- 5) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Woolery/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Board comment: The Board suggested that the Applicant add an additional Olive tree to the landscape plan.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 704 SAN ROQUE RD

E-1/SD-2 Zone

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-062-017
 Application Number: MST2016-00432
 Owner: Myrna L. Smith
 Architect: Keven Strasburg

(Proposal for a second story addition of 798 square feet to an existing 1,759 square foot one-story single family residence. The proposal will also include a new front deck with steps down to the driveway. The proposed total of 2,570 square feet on a 14,778 square foot lot is 60% of the maximum allowable floor to-lot-area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:39 p.m.

Present: Myrna L. Smith, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Study to show the accessibility to the upper floors from the interior of the building.
- 2) Provide accurate and detailed building sections on the plans.
- 3) Show adjacent homes in relation to the project and window locations on the plans. Provide sufficient photographs for the Board to review windows details.

- 4) Study to reduce the proposed deck size, and review the placement of the second story addition, and review the SFDB Guidelines for acceptable methods and less stacking to reduce the massing and bulk of the structure.
- 5) Provide a landscape plan with further details such as retaining walls and areas of new landscaping.
- 6) Show dimensioned furniture in new addition areas and on exterior areas on the plans.

Action: James/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 940 ALSTON RD

A-2 Zone

(4:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-173-028
 Application Number: MST2016-00444
 Owner: Inken H. Gerlach and Charles R. Rudd
 Agent: Kas Seefeld

(Proposal to construct a new 5,455 square foot two-story single family residence with 1,913 square foot basement and 440 square foot detached garage on a previously undeveloped site. Proposed site improvements include 891 square feet of decks, a 22'x12' swimming pool, spa and new site landscaping to include the removal of one palm tree. The proposed total of 5,455 square feet on a 75,000 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 101% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments Only; Project must address plan check corrections and comply with Tier 3 SWMP requirements.)

Actual time: 5:06 p.m.

Present: Kas Seefeld, Agent/Architect; and Charles R. Rudd, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:19 p.m.

- 1) Marsha Byers (neighbor) introduced herself to the Board and, on behalf of her neighbors, she expressed her appreciation for the Board's review.
- 2) Kerry Moriarty (adjacent neighbor), opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the proposed height and location and proximity of the building site and resulting privacy impacts, and he requested restudy of structure orientation and window locations on the project site, and requested the placement of story poles.

Staff received a prior emailed request from Judy Mouderrres to be placed on the interested party list regarding this project.

Public comment closed at 5:25 p.m.

Received at the meeting a request from Marsha Byers to be added to the interested party list for this project.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the style of architecture.
- 2) Study to reduce the total square footage, including reducing the proposed 101% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) to a recommended 85% FAR.

- 3) Restudy the deck arrangements, specifically privacy impacts to adjacent neighbors, and study adding decking to the basement area to mitigate the large massing of the walls on the topography.
- 4) The Board finds acceptable and can support the single level first floor understanding the Owner's desire not to have a lot of stairs in the interior space.
- 5) Study lowering the plate heights to help mitigate the bulk and height of the structure.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 1531 W VALERIO ST

A-2 Zone

(5:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-071-041
 Application Number: MST2016-00450
 Owner: Jeffrey Alan Sears, Living Trust 11
 Architect: W. David Winitzky

(Proposal to construct a new three-story 2,590 square foot single-family residence with an attached 474 square foot two-car garage and a detached 244 square foot one-car garage on a previously vacant lot. The proposal includes a total of 250 cubic yards of grading, 162 cubic yards cut and 27.8 cubic yards fill under the building and 167 cubic yards of cut and 52.8 cubic yards of fill on site. Also proposed is 1,148 square feet of roof decks, 619 square feet of decks at grade, site walls, new driveway and two uncovered parking spaces. The proposed total of 3,310 square feet located on a 74,790 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District, is 61% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 007-07 and Tier 3 SWMP requirements; Project was last reviewed at Planning Commission on February 8, 2007.)

Actual time: 5:50 p.m.

Present: W. David Winitzky, Architect; Meg West, Landscape Architect; and Jeffrey Alan Sears and Marilyn O'Malley, Co-Owners.

Public comment opened at 6:01 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An email in support from Pamela Haldemna was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the style of architecture.
- 2) Study alternative materials for exterior surface treatment.
- 3) Provide clarification of the roof materials.
- 4) Study the fenestration on the upper level regarding a lantern effect.
- 5) Provide an alternative material other than gravel for the driveway access.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed).

Board Comment: Applicant to study to utilize downspouts instead of using a flat roof as a method to collect rainwater as a Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) measure.

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS POSTPONED INDEFINITELY AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

7. 406 N ONTARE RD

E-2/SD-2 Zone

(5:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-151-012
Application Number: MST2015-00471
Owner: Christina Pizarro
Architect: Koffka- Phakos Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,291 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached garage and construct a new 3,601 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 567 square foot three-car garage. Also proposed are a swimming pool, patios, site walls, landscaping, and a total of 187 cubic yards of cut grading, of which 179 cubic yards will be under the residence and 8 cubic yards will be under the pool. The proposed total of 4,169 square feet on a 21,524 square foot lot is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested; Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2016.)

Postponed indefinitely at the Applicant's request.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:48 P.M. ****