



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 3, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 KATIE MAMULSKI, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James, Moticha, and Woolery.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Mamulski, and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **September 19, 2016**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **September 19, 2016**, as submitted.

Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 5/0/3. Motion carried. (Sweeney abstained, Bernstein abstained from Item 6, 2327 Edgewater Way, and James abstained from Items 1-5).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **September 26, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Brian Miller** and **Lisa James**.

Action: Miller/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **October 3, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney** and **Denise Woolery**.

Action: Miller/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Mamulski announced that the last item on the agenda, 406 N. Ontare Road had been postponed indefinitely at the Applicant's request and would not be reviewed at this meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports: No subcommittee reports.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

1. 1721 LA CORONILLA DR

E-1 Zone

(3:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-083-002

Application Number: MST2016-00139

Owner: Michael John Malengo

Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal for a 621 square foot second story addition, a new 286 square foot second story deck, and an interior remodel to an existing 1,363 square foot single family dwelling with an attached 426 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,410 square feet is 86 % of the maximum required floor to lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal will address violations outlined in a Zoning Information Report (ZIR2014-00202). Staff Hearing Officer Review is requested for modifications to allow a conforming second-story addition to a property that is non-conforming to required front and two interior setbacks.)

(Project Design and Final Approval are requested; Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 056-16 and was last reviewed on May 31, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:07 p.m.

Present: Tom Oschner, Architect; Michael Malengo, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:12 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:**

- 1) Provide a high quality wood material for the proposed spiral staircase to match the decking material.
- 2) Balustrade railings are to match the spiral staircase railings.
- 3) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance enhances the neighborhood, neighborhood compatibility is appropriate, quality of architecture and materials are appropriate, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 4) The Board found the second story plate height acceptable.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 6 MINUTES AT 3:25 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 3:31 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 1210 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-214-015
 Application Number: MST2016-00091
 Owner: Katherine A. Stuva, Living Trust
 Architect: Chris Cottrell

(Proposal for exterior alterations on an existing three-story single-family residence that include the following: enlargement of second and third level decks by 308 square feet, new Ipe wood siding on select sections of the façade, relocation and replacement of doors and windows, new garage doors, new site walls, and raising a portion of the roof plate on the east elevation. The project includes a reconfiguration and remodel of the interior spaces that will result in a net reduction of 45 square feet. The proposed total of 2,821 square feet on a 5,796 square foot lot in both the Appealable and Non-Appealable Jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone is 107% of the required maximum floor-to-area ratio (FAR). This project includes Coastal Review and Staff Hearing Officer Review for zoning modifications to allow encroachments into the front and interior setbacks and for a solar access modification. The project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2012-00530.)

(Project Design Approval is requested; Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 047-16, and was last reviewed on May 2, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:32 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:41 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion 1: Project Design Approval with comments:

- 1) The Board finds acceptable the two-foot expansion of the encroaching porch into the front yard setback.
- 2) The greening roof label should be changed to say "planter".
- 3) The Board finds acceptable the standing seam metal roof standing with the comment that the seam should be maximum of 12-inches on center.

- 4) The Board finds acceptable the proposed setback modifications, the modifications to the first floor sitting room, and the proposed color board.
- 5) The Board requests staff to confirm the existing and continued maintenance of the lawn irrigation in the parkway, and of existing lawn in the setback near the house.

Action: James/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Motion 2: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance as the footprint has not been enlarged, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines.

Action: James/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

3. 2517 SELROSE LN

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-361-035
 Application Number: MST2016-00337
 Owner: Abigail Ziv
 Architect: Thomas Oschner, AIA Architect
 Landscape Architect: Brian Brodersen

(Proposal to demolish 32 square feet of the existing garage, to construct a 657 square foot one-story addition, a 567 square foot second floor addition, a new 500 square foot detached accessory structure, a new pool with pool equipment and associated grading, and an interior remodel to an existing 1,187 square foot single-family dwelling with an attached 480 square foot garage. The proposed total of 4,093 square feet is 97% of the maximum allowable floor to-lot-area ratio. The property is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Coastal Review. Staff Hearing Officer Review is requested to allow conforming additions to the dwelling in the required front and interior setbacks.)

(Second Concept Review, Comments only; Project requires Staff Hearing Officer and Coastal Review; Project was last reviewed August 22, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Thomas Oschner, Architect; Brian Brodersen, Landscape Architect; Nathan and Abigail Ziv, Owners.

Public comment opened at 4:10 p.m.

- 1) Alan Aleksander, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding how the project appears larger and more massive than proposed from the surrounding adjacent homes below the site elevation, and requested a reduced scale of the project.
- 2) Lauren Hawksworth, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the proposed lot split, and conformation to zoning requirements.
- 3) Steve Hanson, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the proposed swimming pool and equipment location and requested a re-evaluation due to proximity to his adjacent bedroom location, and noise abatement measures taken.

- 4) William Hawksworth, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the southern elevation of the roof line.

An email in opposition from Lauren Hawksworth regarding the proposed swimming pools and future water use was read into the public record and acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study to provide sound absorbing material on the interior of the concrete six-foot wall surrounding the proposed swimming pool equipment area to reduce noise levels as much as possible.
- 2) The Board finds the proposed easterly side yard, the existing house crossing over into the east and north front and interior setback modifications, and the overhangs are aesthetically appropriate, and do not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.
- 3) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance regarding the acceptable reduced square footage; the reduced size, height and general configuration of the pool pavilion; the acceptable location of the pool as depicted on plan Sheet #AS-10; and the location of the pool equipment.
- 4) Provide a reduced FAR, if applicable.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 2 MINUTES AT 4:53 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 4:55 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

4. 1120 LUNETTA PZ

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(4:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-222-007

Application Number: MST2016-00098

Owner: Jay P. Roston Trust

Architect: Becker Henson Niksto Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 402 square foot garage and 180 square foot shed and construct a new 499 square foot two-car garage with 499 square feet of accessory space above, with a new 140 square foot second-story deck and a 106 square foot roof deck. The existing development on site consists of a 1,286 square foot one-story single-family dwelling with a detached 402 square foot two-car garage. The property is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposed total of 2,281 square feet on an 11,760 square foot lot is 58% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second Concept Review; Project requires Coastal Review and was last reviewed August 8, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:55 p.m.

Present: Thomas Oschner, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:59 p.m.

- 1) William Stark, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding privacy impacts due to the imposing appearance of the proposed second story and negative impact to the space between homes and openness of his view and property. He requested that the proposed project adhere to increasing the space between homes be proportionate to the increase in height of the structure.

Public comment closed at 5:02 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the progress made so far on the project by the Applicant.
- 2) Reduce the plate heights to 7/6th measurements at the lowest point, with a reduced roof pitch of 3 and 12, including lowering the tower element and the window header height due to the proximity of the adjacent building, and a lowering the driveway respectively for an overall reduction in height.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 1106 CRESTLINE DR

E-1 Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-201-005
 Application Number: MST2016-00429
 Owner: Bratton Living Trust
 Owner: Monika Draggoo and David Back
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal for major alterations to an existing 2,516 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached 384 square foot two-car garage. The project involves demolishing 750 square feet of the first floor and 25 square feet of the garage, and constructing 769 square feet on the first floor, resulting in a net reduction of 6 square feet. The project also involves a complete remodel of the exterior including new flat roofs and a lowered total building height. The proposed total of 2,894 square feet on an 18,463 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 66% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer Review is requested for a zoning modification to allow alterations within the front setback.)

(Comments Only; Project requires Staff Hearing Officer Review.)

Actual time: 5:18 p.m.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; and Monika Draggoo and David Back, Owners.

Public comment opened at 5:27 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board could not support the proposed design and style of the architecture that was inappropriate in consistency and appearance, lacking neighborhood compatibility as not a single home in the area possesses such an apparent un-inviting flat roof, has inappropriate window treatments, lack of quality of architecture and materials, and does not follow good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) The Board would like see a different roof configuration to be more sensitive to the context of the surrounding neighborhood.
- 3) If a contemporary style of architecture is chosen, it should be extremely sensitive to the surrounding neighborhood.

Action: Miller/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS POSTPONED INDEFINITELY AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 406 N ONTARE RD

E-2/SD-2 Zone

(5:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-151-012
Application Number: MST2015-00471
Owner: Christina Pizarro
Architect: Koffka- Phakos Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,291 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached garage and construct a new 3,601 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 567 square foot three-car garage. Also proposed are a swimming pool, patios, site walls, landscaping, and a total of 187 cubic yards of cut grading, of which 179 cubic yards will be under the residence and 8 cubic yards will be under the pool. The proposed total of 4,169 square feet on a 21,524 square foot lot is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested; Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2016.)

Postponed indefinitely at the Applicant's request.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:40 P.M. ****