



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, May 2, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 KATIE MAMULSKI, Planning Technician
 LETICIA I. MIGUEL, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (present until 6:30 p.m.), Moticha, Bernstein, Pierce, and Woolery.
Members absent: James.
Staff present: Eng, Mamulski, and Miguel.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **April 18, 2016**.

- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **April 18, 2016**, as submitted.
- Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained from Item 2, James absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **April 25, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Joseph Moticha** and **Denise Woolery**.
- Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **May 02, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Joseph Moticha** and **Denise Woolery**.
- Action: Woolery/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced Board member James will be absent from the meeting.
2. Mr. Eng introduced Katie Mamulski and announced that Ms. Mamulski will staff the Single Family Design Board and Mr. Eng will staff the Historic Landmarks Commission.
3. Mr. Eng requested a re-ratification of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **February 22, 2016 to accept changes to Item 6 (1925 El Camino De La Luz)**. Staff added information clarifying the names of speakers and the content of their public comments.

- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **February 22, 2016**, as submitted.
- Action: Miller/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce abstained, James absent).

4. Mr. Limón announced changes made to the Single Family Design Board Agendas, which now include language regarding public hearing procedures and note a time limit on presentations.
5. Mr. Limón announced Jaime Pierce is will be approaching the end of her term and staff is in the process of recruiting a volunteer licensed landscape architect to serve on Board.
6. Mr. Limón clarified the Single Family Design Board's roles and responsibilities when reviewing projects in relation to the Good Neighbor Guidelines.

E. Subcommittee Reports: There were no reports.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**1. 1210 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-214-015
Application Number: MST2016-00091
Owner: Katherine A. Stuva Living Trust
Architect: Chris Cottrell

(Proposal for exterior alterations on an existing three-story single-family residence that include the following: enlargement of second and third level decks by 308 square feet, new ipe wood siding on select sections of the façade, relocation and replacement of doors and windows, new garage doors, new site walls, and raising a portion of the roof plate on the east elevation. The project includes a reconfiguration and remodel of the interior spaces that will result in a net reduction of 45 square feet. The proposed total of 2,821 square feet on a 5,796 square foot lot in both the Appealable and Non-Appealable Jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone is 107% of the required maximum floor-to-area ratio [FAR]. This project includes coastal review and Staff Hearing Officer review for zoning modifications to allow encroachments into the front and interior setbacks and for a solar access modification. The project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2012-00530.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. Project was last reviewed on April 4, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:24 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect; and Mike Elliason, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:28 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board supports the front setback modification for the first floor additions to the sitting room and finds it is aesthetically appropriate.
- 2) The Board supports the interior and solar setback configuration that has been submitted as indicated on A02 at the Section 9.
- 3) A majority of the Board does not support the second floor expansion and grants an indefinite continuance following the Applicant's appearance at the Staff Hearing Officer.
- 4) Return with different configuration to second floor balcony de-emphasizing the horizontal appearance of the proposed wood siding.
- 5) Restudy the glazing fenestration of the wood being proposed.
- 6) A majority of the Board cannot support a translucent garage door as presented.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 1547 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-041
Application Number: MST2016-00110
Owner: DC Duncan Family Trust
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal for a 108 square foot addition to an existing attached two-car garage of a 4,854 square foot two-story, single-family residence with a 301 square foot partial basement. The project includes a façade remodel, new outdoor deck with a partial trellis cover, site walls, steps, and planters. The proposed total of 5,263 square feet [of which the basement is receiving a 50% FAR credit] on a 22,794 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 106% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project is located within the Appeal Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires a level of Coastal Review to be determined, pending additional information on geological conditions. It also includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow the expansion of the garage into the required front setback.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and may require Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development permit, pending submittal of a geological survey confirming top of bluff and 75-year Seacliff retreat lines.)

Actual time: 4:05 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:18 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission for return to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board can support the overall approach of the project.
- 2) The Board cannot support the four foot extension to the garage, but can support the two foot extension.
- 3) Restudy the exterior colors.
- 4) Consider maintaining the current landscaping as much as possible.
- 5) The Board supports the current configuration of the new deck.
- 6) Study adding landscaping to the south west side.
- 7) Study an alternate garage door.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 1548 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****E-1 Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-183-010
 Application Number: MST2016-00140
 Owner: Charlotte Elaine Keenan Living Trust
 Architect: Dylan Chappell

(Proposal for a total of 570 square feet of additions to an existing 1,876 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached 500 square foot, two-car garage. The additions comprise a 70 square foot addition to the residence and a new 500 square foot detached workshop. The project includes an exterior remodel that includes new windows and doors, roofing, and finish materials. It also includes new site walls, landscaping, paving, and an interior remodel. The proposed total of 2,946 square feet of development on a 15,757 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 68% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:45 p.m.

Present: Dylan Chappell, Architect; and Gary Keenan, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:53 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Return with different material for the roof.
- 2) Study the wall façade for a style other than a modern look.
- 3) Consider a different color for the body of the building.
- 4) Return with a landscape plan.

Action: Pierce/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**4. 288 CANON DR****E-2/SD-2 Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-142-010
 Application Number: MST2015-00549
 Owner: Wayne and Elizabeth Labrie
 Architect: Wayne Labrie

(Proposal for 2,378 square feet of additions to an existing 2,576 square foot two-story single-family residence. The proposal includes new and enlarged decks, minor landscaping changes, and a new permeable driveway and patios. The proposed total of 4,954 square feet (of which 1,594 square feet is in a new basement and will receive a 50% FAR credit) on a 13,769 square foot lot is 99% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications to allow additions and alterations within one interior setback, and for a solar access modification.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. Project was last reviewed on April 18, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:13 p.m.

Present: Wayne Labrie, Architect and Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:30 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board finds acceptable the solar access modification from an anesthetic standpoint as it enhances the current configuration.
- 2) The Board finds acceptable the north elevation window changes that are required for the proposed modification because the wall is located within the setback area. The Board can support the two existing windows to be removed and three windows to be added.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained, James absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

5. 1925 EL CAMINO DE LA LUZ

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-100-024
 Application Number: MST2013-00240
 Owner: Emprise Trust
 Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(This is a revised project. Proposal for a new 2,789 square foot, three-story, single-family residence (30 foot maximum height) with a 571 square foot two-car garage. The project includes water storage tanks, a lap pool, native vegetation restoration and site stabilization. Grading would involve an estimated 1,180 cubic yards of cut and fill to be balanced onsite. The proposed total of 3,360 square feet on a 20,045 square foot flag lot in the Hillside Design District is 72% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project is located within the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review for a requested Coastal Development Permit. Project was last reviewed on April 25, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:45 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, Architect, Thomas Felkay, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:08 p.m.

- 1) Joe Finegold, neighbor, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the location on the lot and the size of the home.
- 2) Nancy Brock, neighbor, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding the staging of the working site for the project.

Public comment closed at 6:13 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission for return to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the Applicant's revision of the proposed plans and appreciates the direction of the architecture.
- 2) The Board appreciates the color choices as it will help the home blend into the hillside.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:30 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 6:55 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 1630 MIRA VISTA AVE****E-1 Zone**

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-013
Application Number: MST2016-00106
Owner: Barbara Thurman
Architect: Tom Smith

(Proposal to demolish the existing 544 square foot two-car garage and 47 square feet of a stairway area, and construct a new 565 square foot master suite in their place at an existing 3,180 square foot single-family residence. The proposal includes a new 447 square foot two-car garage and 122 square foot storage, stair, and elevator area to be located below the new master suite and to be made accessible with newly graded driveway. Also included is a 108 square foot kitchen addition at the rear of the main floor. The proposed total of 3,831 square feet [of which 50% of the partial basement garage is receiving a 50% FAR credit] on a 13,094 square foot lot is 86% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The proposal includes new site work, walls, steps, and an at-grade deck in the front yard. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a zoning modification to allow the new garage and master suite above it to encroach into the interior setback.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested a requested zoning modification.)

Actual time: 6:55 p.m.

Present: Tom Smith Architect; Erin Carroll, Landscape Architect and Trish Allen, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 7:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design of the new master suite and garage.
- 2) Study the bay window in the master bedroom and consider reducing the size.
- 3) The Board finds the relocation of the broad King Palm trees to be appropriate.
- 4) The Board is in support of the modification to allow the new garage, and the master suite above it, to encroach into the interior setback.

Action: Woolery/Pierce, 5//0/0. Motion carried. (James and Miller absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 406 N ONTARE RD****E-2/SD-2 Zone**

(7:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-151-012
Application Number: MST2015-00471
Owner: Carolina N. Pizarro
Architect: Koffka-Phakos Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,291 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached garage and construct a new 3,601 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 567 square foot three-car garage. Also proposed are a swimming pool, patios, site walls, landscaping, and a total of 187 cubic yards of cut grading, of which 179 cubic feet will be under the residence and 8 will be under the pool. The proposed total of 4,169 square feet on a 21,524 square foot lot is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on October 19, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:18 p.m.

Present: Adrian Koffka, Architect, Cynthia Phakos, Architect, Claudia Pizarro, General Contractor, Christina Pizarro, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:30 p.m.

- 1) Julie Benton, submitted letter, opposition; expressed concerns regarding applicant following good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) Tom Pickett, adjacent neighbor, submitted letter, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding third story bedroom.
- 3) Bob Weber, submitted letter, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding second story.
- 4) Lori, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding applicant following good neighbor guidelines

An email in support was acknowledged from: Nancy Madsen.

Public comment closed at 7:49 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Provide a landscape and irrigation plan for the site.
- 2) The Board recommends removing the proposed Juliet balconies on both the north and south elevations.
- 3) Restudy the north elevation for further articulation of the façade and for the possibility of lowering the second floor plate height, especially in the area of the second floor gallery on the south elevation.
- 4) Consider trees along the north and south property lines that will afford some privacy for neighbors and the project itself.
- 5) Verify compliance with pool fencing requirements.
- 6) Consider a different approach to the white stucco wall at the front of the property along North Ontare Road.
- 7) Provide a survey that includes the building footprints of neighboring properties and clearly delineates the driveway dimensions.
- 8) Consider study of the George Washington Smith style homes and other examples of classic Spanish colonial style architecture.
- 9) The Board reiterates following good neighbor guidelines and requests that the applicant meet with neighbors on the project.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (James and Miller absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:35 P.M. ****