



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, April 4, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 LETICIA I. MIGUEL, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Moticha, James, Pierce, and Woolery.
Members absent: Bernstein.
Staff present: Limón, GOO (present until 3:30 p.m.), LaConte, Bedard, Kaufman, and Miguel.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **March 21, 2016**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **March 21, 2016**, as

amended.
Action: Woolery/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

C. Consent Review.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Review for **March 28, 2016**. The Consent Review was reviewed by **Jaime Pierce** and **Fred Sweeney**.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Review for **April 4, 2016**. The Consent Review was reviewed by **Joseph Moticha** and **Denise Woolery**.

Action: Woolery/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced Board member Bernstein would be absent from the meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports: Chair Sweeney updated the Board on the planned spring tour of SFDB approved projects. Chair Sweeney will be providing a copy of his list for potential projects to visit to Board member Bernstein and Mr. Limón.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

1. 210 MEIGS RD (LOT 4)

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-110-011
Application Number: MST2015-00606
Owner: Lighthouse Builders LLC
Applicant: Bruce Blodorn
Architect: Richard Thorne

(Lot 4: Proposal for a new 2,388 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with a 400 square foot, attached two-car garage. The project includes new landscaping, site walls, and 30 cubic yards of cut and fill grading, of which 20 cubic yards will be outside of the building footprint. The proposed total of 2,788 square feet on a newly created 7,787 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 89% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project is **Lot 4** of a five-lot subdivision approved under MST2006-00476.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 007-09. Project was last reviewed on March 21, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Bruce Blodorn, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:14 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.
- 2) Return with proposed lemon bottlebrush tree details and location.

Action: Miller/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

2. 1512 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-181-012
 Application Number: MST2012-00328
 Owner: William Russ
 Designer: Robert Paul Design
 Designer: Acanthus Design

(Proposal to demolish the existing 1,360 square foot, two-story single-family residence, the 220 square foot garage, and accessory buildings; and construct a new 2,208 square foot two-story single-family residence, and a new 430 square foot two-car detached garage. The proposal includes 781 square feet of second-story decks, a 90 square foot roof deck, and an 8-foot tall site wall. One palm tree is proposed to be relocated; all other existing trees are proposed to remain. The proposed total of 2,638 square feet, located on a 7,864 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 84% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The proposal will address violations identified in ZIR2011-00414.)

(Review After Final is requested for revisions to the landscape plan. Project was last reviewed on June 2, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Chair Sweeney read a statement regarding sole proprietorships exceptions, and Board member presentations.

Present: Denise Woolery, Architect; and William Russ, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval of the Review After Final for the following changes 1) proposed eight foot fence on the property line except for where it must be 42 inches, 2) frosted glass in the place of the stained glass as a temporary measure, 3) reduction of plantings on site especially on the eastern yard, 4) hardscaping changes.

Action: James/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery stepped down, Bernstein absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 1425 MISSION RIDGE RD****A-2 Zone**

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-103-023
 Application Number: MST2015-00474
 Owner: RC Steiner Living Trust
 Architect: Tom Oschner

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 3,900 square foot, one-story, single-family residence and garage and construct a new two level single family residence comprising a 4,390 square foot main level, a 3,660 square foot basement, a 550 square foot attached two-car garage, a 704 square foot detached three-car garage, and a 480 square foot detached accessory building. The project includes a new pool, landscaping, a terrace, and 2,400 cubic yards of grading, of which 600 cubic yards will be exported off site. The proposed total of 9,784 square feet (of which 7,960 square feet applies to the floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR] is 145% of the guideline maximum floor to lot area ratio [FAR]. The proposal requires a determination of Substantial Conformance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution #082-008 approved on October 22, 2008. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for zoning modifications to allow the cumulative garage space to exceed 750 square feet and for an accessory structure to be located in the remaining front yard. This project will address a violation in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-0057.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 004-16. Project was last reviewed on October 19, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:40 p.m.

Present: Tom Oschner, Architect; Jeff Yardi, Landscape Architect; and Russell Steiner, Owner; and JoAnne LaConte, Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 3:58 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued 2 weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy proportions of the plate heights of the home.
- 2) Restudy the proportions between the yoga studio, the house, and the garage.
- 3) Restudy the detailing in terms of the column size and the way it is attached to the plaster.
- 4) Study windows details for consistent appearance.
- 5) Return with skylight details.
- 6) Explore options for corbels. It is suggested to study the corbels at the Biltmore Hotel.
- 7) The Board appreciates the chimney caps and suggest using ceramic tile or decorative feature on the top of the chimney caps.
- 8) Study how the window mullions separations are used on first story floor and living room.
- 9) Explore an alternate trellis for the cover of porch.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 1210 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(4:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-214-015
Application Number: MST2016-00091
Owner: Katherine A. Stuva Living Trust
Architect: Chris Cottrell

(Proposal for exterior alterations on an existing three-story single-family residence that include the following: enlargement of second and third level decks by 308 square feet, new ipe wood siding on select sections of the façade, relocation and replacement of doors and windows, new garage doors, new site walls, and raising a portion of the roof plate on the east elevation. The project includes a reconfiguration and remodel of the interior spaces that will result in a net reduction of 45 square feet. The proposed total of 2,821 square feet on a 5,796 square foot lot in both the appealable and non-appealable Jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone is 107% of the required maximum floor-to-area ratio [FAR]. This project includes coastal review and Staff Hearing Officer review for zoning modifications to allow encroachments into the front and interior setbacks and for a solar access modification. The project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2012-00530.)

(Comments only; project requires an environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 4:31 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect; and Katherine A. Stuva, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:44 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy the design.
- 2) Study the balcony configuration on the second and third level in relationship to the side yard property line.
- 3) The Board is not in favor of the garage doors being glass.
- 4) The landscaping and garden wall are acceptable.

Action: Pierce/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 1211 SERRA VISTA LN****E-1 Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-510-004
 Application Number: MST2015-00211
 Owner: Cynthia Halpin Mccoy Residence Trust
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning LLC
 Architect: Peikert RRM Design Group

(Proposal to add a second story and an attached garage to the existing 1,202 square foot one-story single-family residence. The project is located in a Planned Residence Development on a 3,071 square foot lot which serves as the building envelope. The project would add 227 square feet of floor area and 200 square feet of unenclosed terrace area to the first floor, a 552 square foot second floor, and an attached 494 square foot attached two-car garage at the upper floor level accessed from a new driveway on the uphill side of the lot. This project includes Planning Commission review for an amendment to the conditions of approval to increase the maximum square footage allowed on the lot from 1,800 to 2,000 square feet exclusive of garages and open porches, and for a modification to encroach into the required setback from the exterior boundary of the Planned Residence Development.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination for increased building height, consistent with Planning Commission Resolution No. 004-16. Project was last reviewed on June 1, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:01 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Applicant.

Motion: Postponed indefinitely to Full Board

Action: Miller/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 246 SAN CLEMENTE****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-152-025
 Application Number: MST2015-00598
 Owner: Jewell Family Trust
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning LLC
 Designer: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal for a 288 square foot first-floor addition and a 169 square foot second-floor addition to an existing 1,820 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached 256 square foot one-car garage. The proposal includes removal of a tool shed and construction of a 112 square foot accessory building. The proposed total of 2,407 square feet on a 5,998 square foot lot is 90% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio. The property is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires coastal review. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested to allow for one covered parking space on site, instead of the two that are required.)

(Comments only; project requires an environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

Actual time: 5:03 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Architect; and Carolyn Jewell, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.
- 2) The Board understands the site constraints and finds the proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.
- 3) The Board supports the general style of the addition.
- 4) Study the detached rear structure and lowering the plate height.
- 5) Study dropping the window sizes on the proposed north elevations of the upstairs bathroom.
- 6) The Board supports the single car garage as adding a secondary covered parking space would be infeasible.
- 7) Study surfaces of driveway to be permeable.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 288 CANON DR

E-2/SD-2 Zone

(5:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-142-010
 Application Number: MST2015-00549
 Owner: Wayne and Elizabeth Labrie
 Architect: Wayne Labrie

(Proposal for 2,378 square feet of additions to an existing 2,576 square foot two-story single-family residence. The proposal includes new and enlarged decks, tree removals and minor landscaping changes, and a new permeable driveway and patios. The proposed total of 4,954 square feet [of which 1,594 square feet is in a new basement and will receive a 50% FAR credit] on a 13,769 square foot lot is 99% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications to allow additions and alterations within the front and two interior setbacks, and for a solar access modification.)

(Comments only; project requires an environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 5:30 p.m.

Present: Wayne Labrie, Architect; and Matthew Labrie.

Public comment opened at 5:58 p.m.

- 1) Sue Wood, adjacent neighbor, submitted letter in support. Expressed support to the proposed project.

An email in opposition was acknowledged and received from; Shawn Graft regarding size, bulk and scale, parking, and neighborhood compatibility.

Letters and emails in support were acknowledged and received from 24 gathered signatures and residents.

Public comment closed at 6:01 p.m.

Motion: Continued 2 weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) As proposed the residence's size, bulk and scale are not appropriate in relation to the neighborhood context.
- 2) Return with simplified plans.
- 3) The Board does not find the style of architecture acceptable. The design should be more streamlined so the residence reads as a single-unit.
- 4) Return with a clear description of existing home compared to what is being proposed.

Action: Miller/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**8. 11 VIA ALICIA****E-1 Zone****(6:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-311-003
 Application Number: MST2013-00052
 Owner: Peter Trent
 Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for site alterations, exterior alterations, and a minor interior remodel to an existing three-story, 3,423 square foot, single-family residence, with an attached two-car garage, located on a 15,681 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Alterations include converting 258 square feet of existing storage area to habitable addition, the demolition and replacement of existing decks with new, door and window alterations, and a new swimming pool and site walls. The proposal includes approximately 30 cubic yards of cut for the new pool. The proposal results in a development total of 3,681 square feet and is 84% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Comments are requested for a revised pool location and design. No changes have been made to the proposed residence since Project Design Approval. Project was last reviewed on December 2, 2013.)

Actual time: 6:36 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's revised pool location and design.
- 2) The Board recommends to widen planters at the end of infinity pool and the stair stepping grade to be 5 feet instead of 3 feet.
- 3) Return with landscape plans.

Action: Pierce/James, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney opposed, Bernstein absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:52 P.M. ****