



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD *RE-RATIFIED* MINUTES

Please Note: Item 6, 1925 El Camino De La Luz was re-ratified at the May 2, 2016, Full Board meeting.

Monday, February 22, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Moticha, Bernstein, James, and Woolery.

Members absent: Pierce.

Staff present: Eng, Goo, Miguel, and Kennedy.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of February 8, 2016.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **February 8, 2016**.
Action: Bernstein/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

C. Consent Review.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Review for **February 16, 2016**. The Consent Review was reviewed by **Jaime Pierce** and **Fred Sweeney**.
Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Review for **February 22, 2016**. The Consent Review was reviewed by **Jaime Pierce** and **Fred Sweeney**.
Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced the following changes to the agenda:
Item #2 1405 Mission Ridge Road and Item #3, 2878 Verde Vista Drive will be reviewed out of order. Item #3 will be reviewed as Item #2 and Item #2 as Item #3.
2. Mr. Eng provided the Board with additional information regarding Zoning Information Reports and items eligible for minor zoning exceptions under an ordinance presented to City Council on January 2016.
3. Chair Sweeney announced Board member Pierce will be absent from the meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports: Chair Sweeney updated the Board regarding a spring tour of projects approved by SFDB in the last few years. Board member Bernstein and Chair Sweeney will be part of a subcommittee that will work with Mr. Limón and go through a list of projects that are near or at completion. Board member Bernstein asked board members to make note of good and not so good projects that are under construction or just completed.**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****1. 118 LA VISTA GRANDE****E-1 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-083-011
Application Number: MST2015-00281
Architect: Michael Stroh
Owner: Christopher Lloyd

(Proposal for new masonry retaining walls to replace a failing wall in the rear yard of an existing 1,239 square foot single-family residence in the Hillside Design District. A new detached trellis, fire pit gas feed, landscaping, site steps, and site lighting are proposed. The project includes 30 cubic yards of cut grading to be balanced on site.)

(Review After Final is requested for revisions to the landscape plan in the rear yard. Project was last reviewed at Consent Review on July 6, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:13 p.m.

Present: Michael Stroh, Architect; Pat Brodie, Landscape Designer and Christopher Lloyd and Lisa Lloyd, Owners.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m.

- 1) Dereck Eichelberger, landscape architect with Arcadia Studio, representing adjacent neighbors, Leila and Bob Noel, expressed appreciation for the concessions made in the project by the applicant and homeowners. He requested that a note be added to the plans that the ligustrum is “to be maintained at top of rail”.

Public comment closed at 3:20 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval for revisions with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and with conditions:

- 1) The Board found the project’s design and architecture compatible and consistent with the neighborhood compatibility.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project’s consistency and appearance, quality of architecture and materials, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.
- 3) The language on plans shall be changed to keep the ligustrum plantings maintained at the top of the rail.

Action: James/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF AGENDA ORDER. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 1405 MISSION RIDGE RD

A-2 Zone

(3:30)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 019-210-001
 Application Number: MST2016-00024
 Owner: Maria Brant Living Trust
 Applicant: Ken Mineau

(Proposal for a total of 464 square feet of additions to an existing 4,011 square foot, two-level, single-family dwelling and the attached 432 square foot two-car garage. The additions will take place on the upper level of the split-level dwelling, which appears as single-level at the front elevation and includes a lower level at the rear elevation. The proposal includes alterations to the roof profile, new rafters, new roof shingles, new windows and doors, a new 830 square foot porch and covered terrace in the rear, new outdoor planters and landscaping, and 604 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. It also includes an interior remodel and removal of the following unpermitted items: a storage shed, porch cover in the side yard, and an air conditioning unit. The proposed total of 4,907 square feet on a 42,623 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 99% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area [FAR]. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow additions and alterations to the garage within the required front setback. An administrative exception is requested for an "as-built" retaining wall to exceed 3-1/2 feet tall within 10 feet of the front lot line. This project will also address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00062.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested Zoning Modification. Project was referred from Consent Review on February 16, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Ken Mineau, Architect; and Frank Berzai, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:09 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the style and architecture acceptable.
- 2) Study reduction of the lawn area.
- 3) Study the color palette; several Board members were not comfortable with the use of black and white on this project.
- 4) The Board supports the requested zoning modification to allow additions and alterations to the garage within the required 10-foot front setback.
- 5) The Board supports the administrative exception to allow the "as-built" retaining wall to exceed 3-1/2 feet tall within 10 feet of the front lot line.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Moticha opposed, Pierce absent).

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF AGENDA ORDER. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

3. 2878 VERDE VISTA DR

E-3 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-362-023
 Application Number: MST2015-00628
 Owner: Perkins Family Trust
 Applicant: Bildsten Architecture & Planning

(Proposal to add a 743 square foot second story to the existing 965 square foot, one-story single-family residence with a 380 square foot, detached, two-car garage. The project "as-built" enclosure of the front porch. The proposed total of 1,708 square feet on a 4,193 square foot lot is 71% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project includes Staff Hearing officer review for alterations in the front setback and conforming additions that change the basic characteristics of the existing residence, which is non-conforming to two front yard setbacks.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. Project was last reviewed on February 8, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Architect; and Erica Obertelli, Designer.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) Consider the importance to the placement of gutters and downspouts and the effects it will have to the composition of the house.
- 3) The Board appreciates the work that has gone into refining the project, it now meets the compatibility guidelines.
- 4) The Board finds the additions to the residence acceptable, as they relate to existing encroachments into the front yard setbacks.
- 5) The "as-built" enclosed front porch is acceptable and compatible with the architecture.

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 251 LA MARINA DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-161-008
Application Number: MST2014-00583
Owner: Navid Eskandari
Architect: Alan McLeod

(This is a revised project description for additions and alterations to an existing 800 square foot, one-story, single-family dwelling with an attached 250 square foot garage. The proposal includes a 648 square foot first-floor addition, a new 661 square foot second-floor addition, demolition of 100 square feet of the existing garage, and construction of a 298 square foot addition to the garage that will result in a 448 square foot two-car garage. The proposal also includes a new driveway and curb cut, new pool and spa, and 20 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. The proposed total of 2,555 square feet of development on a 6,000 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 95% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. No zoning modifications are pursued with the revised project.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on February 8, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:33 p.m.

Present: Alan McLeod, Architect; Lauren Anderson, Applicant; and Navid Eskandari, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with positive comments:

- 1) The Board finds the style of the home fits the character of the neighborhood and it is compatible.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, safety, and good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 1045 CIMA LINDA LN****A-2 Zone**

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-045
Application Number: MST2016-00033
Owner: Greg Anzalone
Architect: Alan McLeod

(Proposal for 1,247 square feet of one-story additions to an existing 3,462 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached two-car garage. The proposal includes the conversion of the existing garage into new habitable space, roof alterations, and an interior remodel. It also includes elimination of one of two existing driveways and curb cuts, modification of the remaining curb cut, a new driveway gate, and new landscaping. This project will address a violation identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00596. The proposed total of 4,709 square feet of development on a 1.38 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 90% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:45 p.m.

Present: Alan Mcleod, Architect; and Drew Scherer, Alan Mcleod Architect, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 4:50 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Recognizing that staff needs to complete an Environmental Assessment for the project, the Board supports Project Design Approval on Consent with Final Approval to follow, also on Consent.

Action: Moticha/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 1925 EL CAMINO DE LA LUZ

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(5:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-100-024
Application Number: MST2013-00240
Owner: Emprise Trust
Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(Proposal for a new 3,101 square foot, three-story, single-family residence (30 foot maximum height) with a 444 square foot two-car garage. The project includes water storage tanks, a lap pool, native vegetation restoration and site stabilization. Grading would involve an estimated 1,175 cubic yards of cut and fill to be balanced onsite. The proposed total of 3,545 square feet on a 20,045 square foot flag lot in the Hillside Design District is 76% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project is located within the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review for a requested Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 5:21 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, Architect, Anthon Ellis, Project Manager, Thomas Felkay and Tracy Walters, Applicants.

The Chair stated for the public record that the Board is mainly an architectural design and aesthetics Board for mass, bulk, and scale, and neighborhood compatibility; therefore, *private* view concerns of the public are not within the Board's purview.

Public comment opened at 5:56 p.m.

- 1) Nancy Brock, submitted letter, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the cement that still remains.
- 2) Thomas J. Morrison, a neighbor, submitted letter, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed project being a 3-story home and would like to see project return as a 2-story home.
- 3) Stan Krome, neighbor, submitted letter, opposition; asked architect to clarify the location of the project on a 1978 photograph.
- 4) Joanna Morgan, submitted letter, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding the stabilization of the existing homes that are adjacent and above and the immense design may threaten the neighbors.

- 5) Ken Liatas, submitted letter, support; spoke on behalf of himself and neighbor Tanda Jennings, adjacent to the proposed project. Expressed that everyone is not against project and the next door neighbor is very receptive to the hillside being stabilized.
- 6) Carol Eichler, submitted letter, support; voiced project would have minimal impact on ocean/island views of the public and neighbors. Expressed that rebuilding and occupying this site may minimize the environmental risk caused by vagrants.
- 7) Julie Dorn, neighbor, submitted letter, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding the project being 3-stories and the safety of the bank if drilling caissons into fractured bedrock occurs. Consider building 20 feet or more closer to the street, lessening project by one story, placing a hedge and higher the rooftop.
- 8) Robert Stenson, neighbor, submitted letter, opposition; stated little has changed in proposed project; inappropriate for the location; concerned with impacts of heavy equipment of trenching, grading, traffic, and paving; may impact earth movement.
- 9) Chris Dorn, neighbor, opposition; loss of private Eastern view and project being 3-story. Requesting project be minimized by 1-story and moved up to in the bluff top.
- 10) Janice Taylor, neighbor across the street, submitted letter, opposition; expressed concern with setting precedent to building on the broken second elevation of a cliff.

Letters and emails in opposition were acknowledged and received from: Nancy Brock and Tom Morrison; Joanna Morgan and Stan Krome; Bruce Peterson; Julie Dorn; Janice Taylor; David and Marcene Smith; Greg and Judith Smith; Joe and Kim Finegold; and Robert Stenson. The majority of the comments were in regard to geologic stability, top of bluff location, and the size of the proposed residence.

Letters and emails in support were acknowledged and received from: Mary and Carter Walters, Fred Carr, Scott Williams, Angelique Clark, Linda Kavanagh, Michelle Amendola, Mrs. John B.F. Bacon, John Broberg, Sharon Broberg, Nora Duncan, George Feiwel, William and Cynthia Prado, Dave Stuhlbarg, Laura Vondracek, John Steel, Tracey Walters, Robert Eichler, Carol Eichler, Roynane Lisk, Brenda Scarborough, Ken Liatas, Michael Amendola, Mary Pat Moloney, Kimberley Gerace, Jennifer Cox, Gabriel Lockwood, Lenna Anna Lockwood, Liz Kay, Bryant Gover, Harry Weisbart, Charlie Grant, Geoffrey Jewel, David Gala, Denise Nelson, Robert Ooley, Tanda Jennings, and Harriet Eckstein.

Public comment closed at 6:29 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide the square footages and FARs of the 20 closest homes.
- 2) As an exercise, provide the FAR for the buildable portion of the lot northward of the top of bluff.
- 3) Clarify with Creeks Division whether the cisterns address Storm Water Management Program requirements for the site, and given the unique circumstances of the site whether any storm water is allowed to leave the site, not necessarily towards the ocean, but perhaps landward.
- 4) Reduce the shape of the house to include areas within the vertical elevations that will allow for some additional landscaping to diminish the elevation impacts, particularly to the west and east.
- 5) Reduce the floor-to-floor heights to bring the proposal more into human scale and to meet the 25 foot height guideline.
- 6) Return with a different approach to the railing system, eliminating glass railings.
- 7) Share the potential design for any rooftop mounted solar system.
- 8) Provide preliminary color board.
- 9) Provide a preliminary landscaping plan and irrigation plan.

- 10) Provide exterior lighting on elevations where they will occur.
- 11) Show drainage locations either internal or external to the elevations.
- 12) Consider reducing the amount of glazing at the staircase element on the west elevation.
- 13) Provide interior square footage for each room on the drawings.
- 14) Provide details for paving material on driveways, decks, patios around the pool, and exterior staircases.
- 15) Clarify parts of adjacent property used for temporary construction storage and include grading information. Provide a contour plan or sections with planting material that will go on the back side.
- 16) Staff to confirm the Board's purview over the staging site.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

***THE BOARD RECESSED AT APPROXIMATELY 7:15 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT APPROXIMATELY 7:46 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 612 SURF VIEW DR

E-1 Zone

(6:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-112-009
 Application Number: MST2016-00042
 Owner: Bodhi Oser
 Designer: Sarai Grenell

(Proposal to construct a new 546 square foot, one-story addition to the existing 1,821 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with 421 square foot attached two-car garage. The proposal includes a change to the roof form at the rear of the residence, a reroof of the whole house with a new metal roofing material, a new 335 square foot covered patio at the rear of the house, replacement of the garage door, new wood siding near the front entry, replacement of exterior light fixtures, and an interior remodel. The project includes new site walls, fences, and gates at the front yard, and new site landscaping. The proposed total of 2,367 square feet located on a 16,850 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 54% of the guideline floor-to-lot ratio [FAR]. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00099.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 7:46 p.m.

Present: Sarai Grenell, Designer.

Public comment opened at 7:57 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant's efforts on this project.
- 2) Study the front elevation and the treatment of the area above the garage door; a trellis was suggested.
- 3) On the north elevation, explore alternative options on window pop out.
- 4) The Board cannot support a metal standing seam roof on this house in this particular neighborhood.
- 5) The Board appreciates the approach to the rear elevation. Study improving the project by tying together the two different architectural styles.
- 6) Return with landscape plan and color board.
- 7) Provide cut sheet for the light fixtures.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**8. 1401 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(7:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-185-016
Application Number: MST2016-00028
Owner: David Ellenberger
Architect: Pacific Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for 49 square feet of first-story and 318 square feet of second-story additions to an existing 1,812 square foot, two-story single family residence with an attached 400 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes a new covered entry porch, new 711 square foot rear deck with outdoor barbecue, a total of 180 square feet of balconies, replacement of all windows and doors, new exterior finishes, and a remodel of interior spaces. No grading is proposed. The proposed total of 2,579 square feet on a 7,339 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 85% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project is located within the Appeal Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires an Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 8:19 p.m.

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect.

Public comment opened at 8:28 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the project meets neighborhood compatibility guidelines, it has quality architecture and materials, its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate.
- 2) The applicant has taken into consideration the street presence of the property.

Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce and Miller absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:38 P.M. ****