



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, February 8, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (present until 6:59 p.m.), Moticha, Bernstein, James (present @ 3:11 p.m.),
 Pierce, and Woolery.

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Eng and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **January 25, 2016.**

- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **January 25, 2016**, as submitted.
- Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **February 1, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney** and **Jaime Pierce** (except Item A).
- Action: Woolery/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **February 8, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney** and **Jaime Pierce**.
- Action: Woolery/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Eng announced the next meeting will take place on Tuesday, February 16th due to Monday's President's Day holiday.

E. Subcommittee Reports: Board member Bernstein updated the Board regarding a City Council report on minor zoning violations that will have quick processing as reported by the Santa Barbara News Hawk, regarding such subjects as parking conversions for required parking, non-conforming garage to habitable space, interior additions (loft or cellars) that exceed FAR limits, and ZIR report requirements. Staff will try to regularly report to the Board on similar topics. Chair Sweeney will also inform Mr. Limon that the Board is interested in taking a tour of the City to review previously approved projects by the Board.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

1. 101 JORGENSEN LN

A-1 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-110-036
 Application Number: MST2015-00151
 Owner: James Love Lee
 Architect: DesignArc
 Landscape Architect: Orange Street Studio
 Engineer: Mike Gones

(Proposal to construct a new 2,994 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with a 500 square foot, detached, two-car carport. The project includes a pool, spa, patios, new driveway and site paving, and landscaping. It also includes 750 cubic yards of cut and fill grading of which 150 cubic yards will occur outside of the building footprint. All grading will be balanced on the site. The proposed total of 3,290 square feet on a 1.37 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 62% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines §15183 Exemption (Projects Consistent with the General Plan). Project must comply with Council Resolution No. 07-086. Project was last reviewed on April 20, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Mark Shields and Natalie Cope, Architects.

Public comment opened at 3:18 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Emails of concerns were acknowledged from Jill Stein requesting a smaller FAR to preserve the rural character, and from David Unger, PhD requesting a reduced FAR and restricted construction hours.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The proposed architecture and project scale are appropriate.
- 2) The proposed redesign of the garage and the roof design are acceptable and supportable.
- 3) The proposed maximum guideline 62% FAR for a two parcel lot in the Hillside Design District is acceptable.
- 4) The following finding was read into the record: "The SFDB finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."
- 5) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines. The Board found any public noise from the site would be mitigated by the lot position and orientation of the building and architecture.
- 6) The landscape plan shall have an irrigation plan with a legend showing plant sizes, species, and quantities.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 1601 CALLE CANON

R-1 Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-072-002
 Application Number: MST2015-00503
 Owner: Laura Cook
 Architect: Ted Meeder

(Proposal to demolish and reconstruct portions of the first floor, add 87 square feet to the first floor, and construct a new 343 square foot second floor at an existing 892 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached 166 square foot one-car garage. The project includes a new 832 square foot covered patio on the ground floor and a 200 square foot second-floor deck. The total of 1,488 square feet of development on a 6,374 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 54% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2012-00249.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 14, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:44 p.m.

Present: Ted Meeder, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:**

- 1) The Board finds the proposed reduced deck size and setbacks are acceptable.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan.

Action: James/Moticha, 6/0/1. (Sweeney abstained). Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD WILL RECESSED AT 3:59 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 4:06 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 3039 HERMOSA RD

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-192-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00607
 Owner: Bryan C. Kenney Living Trust
 Designer: Tony Xiques

(This is a revised proposal for a 130 square foot first-floor and 188 second-floor addition to an existing 1,714 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an attached 436 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,468 square feet, located on an 8,250 square foot lot, is 76% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This revised project is a 477 square foot reduction from the last proposal of 2,945 square feet and 91% FAR.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on February 9, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:07 p.m.

Present: Tony Xiques, Designer; Mallory and Bryan Kenney, Owners.

Public comment opened at 4:16 p.m.

- 1) Matthew Sperling spoke of his support of the proposed project.

Public comment closed at 4:19 p.m.

An email of support from Matthew Sperling and Elizabeth Bauer regarding was acknowledged.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility in terms of size, bulk, and scale; quality of architecture and materials; and good neighbor guidelines have been met.
- 2) The Board appreciates the reduction in the size for neighborhood compatibility.
- 3) The view from the street is pleasant and is compatible with the neighborhood.
- 4) Provide a color board with accurately sized roof tiles and colors, landscape areas, garage doors, and colors of the house.

- 5) Provide a plan drawing of the proposed wall including elevations.
- 6) Provide a detailed landscape plan for review of the patio area by the chimney location due to the position of the front wall.

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

4. 251 LA MARINA DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-161-008
 Application Number: MST2014-00583
 Owner: Navid Eskandari
 Architect: Alan McLeod
 Applicant: Lauren Anderson

(This is a **revised** project description for additions and alterations to an existing 800 square foot, one-story, single-family dwelling with an attached 250 square foot garage. The proposal includes a 648 square foot first-floor addition, a new 661 square foot second-floor addition, demolition of 100 square feet of the existing garage, and construction of a 298 square foot addition to the garage that will result in a 448 square foot two-car garage. The proposal also includes a new driveway and curb cut, new pool and spa, and 20 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. The proposed total of 2,555 square feet of development on a 6,000 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 95% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. No zoning modifications are pursued with the revised project.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on June 15, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:31 p.m.

Present: Alan McLeod, Architect; and Lauren Anderson, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 4:42 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board found the style and architecture acceptable and supportable.
- 2) Restudy providing alternate exterior lighting (exp. craftsman).
- 3) The Board recommends reducing the proposed 95% FAR to an 85% FAR; however, the Board would support the proposed 95% FAR, if:
 - a) The plate height was reduced to 6.5 or 6 inches in height to mitigate the bulk of the building in how it relates to the adjacent neighbors;
 - b) Reduced the size of the exterior deck off the den; and
 - c) Reduced the size of the windows on the south elevation.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 2878 VERDE VISTA DR****E-3 Zone**

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-362-023
 Application Number: MST2015-00628
 Owner: Perkins Family Trust
 Applicant: Bildsten Architecture & Planning

(Proposal to add a 743 square foot second story to the existing 965 square foot, one-story single-family residence with a 380 square foot, detached, two-car garage. The project includes the "as-built" alteration of the rear service porch and "as-built" enclosure of the front porch. The proposed total of 1,708 square feet on a 4,193 square foot lot is 71% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for alterations in the front setback and conforming additions that change the basic characteristics of the existing residence, which is non-conforming to two-front yard setbacks.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 5:16 p.m.

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Principal Architect; and Erica Obertelli, Project Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the changes made to the roof design.
- 2) Study reducing the eave overhangs and plate heights to accommodate a lower roof profile between 8 feet and 8 feet, 6 inches to better match the first floor and the relationship with the roof and eave pitch, and to improve neighborhood compatibility.

Action: Pierce/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD WILL RECESSED AT 5:55 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 6:25 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**6. 1533 SAN MIGUEL AVE****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(6:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-131-030
 Application Number: MST2015-00580
 Owner: Peter Hirth, Trustee
 Applicant: Windward Engineering
 Designer: Barefoot Designs

(Proposal for 301 square foot of lower-level additions and for 956 square feet of main/upper-level additions to an existing 1,142 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached 239 square foot, one-car garage. The proposal includes demolition of the existing garage and construction of a new attached 440 square foot, two-car garage at the lower level, along with a new driveway and turnaround. The project includes new three-foot high retaining walls and a new six-foot high wood fence. The proposed total of 2,839 square feet on an 11,771 square foot lot is 72% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The property is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Coastal review. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00382.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on January 25, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:25 p.m.

Present: Misael Contreras, Engineer; Jessica Harlin, Landscape Designer.

Public comment opened at 6:35 p.m.

- 1) Dana Halverson (submitted email), opposition; spoke of concerns regarding preservation of their left side private view corridor.

An email of concern from Dana Halverson and Jay Winner regarding preservation of their private view corridor was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:40 p.m.

The Chair stated for the public record that the Board is mainly an architectural design and aesthetics Board for mass, bulk, and scale, and neighborhood compatibility; therefore, *private* view concerns of the public are not within the Board's purview, and encouraged both the Applicant and neighbors to work together with the good neighbor guidelines to achieve neighborhood compatibility.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with positive comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design changes made to the proposed project.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and good neighbor guidelines.
- 3) Study a design change of the garden fencing, stone, and middle fence area.
- 4) The Board finds the proposed 72% FAR is supportable and acceptable.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

7. 306 SHERMAN RD

A-1 Zone

(6:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-050-003
 Application Number: MST2009-00414
 Owner: Antar Dayal
 Architect: Hector Magnus
 Agent: Janet Caminite

(Proposal to rebuild a house and garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. The project includes a new 2,427 square foot, three-story single family residence plus a 555 square foot basement that is not included in the floor to lot area ratio [FAR], and a 471 square foot attached two-car garage. The project includes a reflection pool, retaining walls, and approximately 450 cubic yards of cut grading to be exported from the site. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification is requested for the proposed garage to encroach into the front setback. The proposed total 2,898 square feet, excluding the basement, on the 10,500 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 77% of the FAR. The project received Final Approval by SFDB on April 12, 2010. The project is returning to the Staff Hearing officer for additional setback encroachments involving a fountain wall element that exceeds 8 feet in height and exterior stairs within the required front setback. The design elements were part of the original approval granted by SFDB and have not changed; however, the project is returning to SFDB for comments only to the Staff Hearing Officer.)

(Review After Final is requested to omit window louvers, omit a fence along the westerly property line, and for revisions to the landscape plan. Project was last reviewed on January 25, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:59 p.m.

Present: Hector Magnus, Architect; Janet Caminite, Agent; and Antar Dayal, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:02 p.m.

1) Dusty Baker spoke in support of the proposed project.

Public comment closed at 7:04 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of the Review After Final with conditions:

- 1) The Board appreciates the Applicant's compliance with Fire Department regulations and landscaping requirements.
- 2) A metal fence, window louvers, a westside wall, and landscaping shall not be required of the Applicant.
- 3) The adjacent property of owner on Sherman Way shall leave the existing oleander plant hedge in-place between the two properties.

Action: Woolery/James, 3/3/0. Motion failed. (Bernstein/Sweeney/Pierce opposed, Miller absent).

Substitute Motion:

Final Approval of the Review After Final with conditions:

- 1) The Board appreciates the Applicant's compliance with Fire Department regulations and landscaping requirements.
- 2) A metal fence, window louvers, a westside wall, and landscaping shall not be required of the Applicant.
- 3) The adjacent property of owner on Sherman Way shall leave the existing oleander plant hedge in-place between the two properties.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Pierce/Sweeney opposed, Miller absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:23 P.M. ****