



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, January 25, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (present until 6:15 p.m.), Moticha (present @ 3:13 a.m.), Bernstein, James, Pierce, and Woolery.

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Eng and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board Special Meeting of **Tuesday, January 5, 2016; and January 11, 2016.**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board Special Meeting of **Tuesday, January 5, 2016**, as submitted.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce abstained, Moticha absent).

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **January 11, 2016**, as submitted.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James abstained, Moticha absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **January 19, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Jaime Pierce** and **Fred Sweeney** (Chair noted: a glass handrail was considered for Item A, but deemed not appropriate).

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Moticha absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **January 25, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Jaime Pierce** and **Fred Sweeney** (except for Item A, which was reviewed only by Fred Sweeney).

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Moticha absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced that the American Planning Association's Santa Barbara subsection is holding a Santa Barbara Land Use Planner's Academy for anyone interested in learning more about planning in the Santa Barbara area. He also announced that the Illuminating Engineering Society is holding a lunch hour lecture on "Light Pollution and the Environmental Consequences of Night Lighting" on February 19th.
2. Member Bernstein noted that she would like to review at the next SFDB meeting the City's proposal for types of projects that may be eligible for administrative review.
3. Chair Sweeney presented an example of contemporary architecture shown without the context of the surrounding neighborhood and noted the importance of reviewing projects with their surroundings.
4. Member Bernstein mentioned that she like to revisit the idea of having the Board tour a selection of previously approved projects.
5. Board member Miller announced he would need to leave the meeting at approximately 6:15 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports: There were no subcommittee reports made at this time.

FINAL REVIEW

1. 2941 VALENCIA DR

E-3 Zone

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-362-010

Application Number: MST2015-00529

Owner: Joy Bronson Smith, Revocable Living

Architect: Gregory Jenkins

(Proposal to construct a 27 square foot first-floor addition and a 640 square foot second-floor addition to an existing 1,107 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with a 304 square foot detached two-car garage. The project includes a new covered upper-level balcony and an interior remodel. The proposed total of 2,078 square feet on a 5,000 square foot lot is 85% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2012-00374.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on January 5, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:13 p.m.

Present: Greg Jenkins, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) The architect has responded to the Board's comments.
- 2) The project meets guidelines for neighborhood consistency, compatibility, quality architecture and materials, and Good Neighbor Guidelines.
- 3) The landscape plan is acceptable.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 3:23 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 3:49 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 3039 HERMOSA RD

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(3:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-192-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00607
 Owner: Bryan C. Kenney, Living Trust
 Applicant: Christophe De Rose

(This is a revised proposal for a 130 square foot first-floor and 188 second-floor addition to an existing 1,714 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an attached 436 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,468 square feet, located on an 8,250 square foot lot, is 76% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This revised project is a 477 square foot reduction from the last proposal of 2,945 square feet and 91% FAR.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on February 9, 2015.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board.

Action: Miller/Moticha, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

3. 1533 SAN MIGUEL AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-131-030
 Application Number: MST2015-00580
 Owner: Peter Hirth, Trustee
 Applicant: Windward Engineering

(Proposal for 301 square foot of lower-level additions and for 956 square feet of main/upper-level additions to an existing 1,142 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached 239 square foot, one-car garage. The proposal includes demolition of the existing garage and construction of a new attached 440 square foot, two-car garage at the lower level, along with a new driveway and turnaround. The project includes new three-foot high retaining walls and a new six-foot high wood fence. The proposed total of 2,839 square feet on an 11,771 square foot lot is 72% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The property is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Coastal review. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00382.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on January 11, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:49 p.m.

Present: Misael Contreras, Engineer; Jessica Harlin, Landscape Designer.

Public comment opened at 3:59 p.m.

- 1) Susan Wuertz (neighbor) opposition; had questions regarding the height of the proposed structure, and the proposed slope of the roof at the front of the property, private ocean views, on-street parking impacts, and other impacts to the other properties in proximity to the project.

Public comment closed at 4:02 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the project is moving in the right direction; however, the second floor (street level) plate height should be reduced.
- 2) The proposed standing seam metal roof is not appropriate for the project in this particular neighborhood context.
- 3) Provide a front elevation that includes the arbor and stone wall superimposed on it.
- 4) The Board suggests that the applicant provide drawings showing the adjacent homes that convey their size, bulk, and scale in relation to the subject property.
- 5) The proposed colors are too dark and a lighter palette is suggested.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 2878 VERDE VISTA DR

E-3 Zone

(4:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-362-023
 Application Number: MST2015-00628
 Owner: Perkins Family Trust
 Architect: Bildsten Architecture & Planning

(Proposal to add a 743 square foot second story to the existing 965 square foot, one-story single-family residence with a 380 square foot, detached, two-car garage. The project includes the "as-built" alteration of the rear service porch and "as-built" enclosure of the front porch. The proposed total of 1,708 square feet on a 4,193 square foot lot is 71% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes **Staff Hearing Officer** review for alterations in the front setback and conforming additions that change the basic characteristics of the existing residence, which is non-conforming to two-front yard setbacks.)

(Comments Only; Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 4:28 p.m.

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Architect; and Erica Obertelli, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:33 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the design of the second floor addition, roof, and size and location of proposed windows (to achieve proportions that are more compatible with the existing first-story).

2) The Board suggested the applicant provide photographs of two-story dwellings in the neighborhood to assist in attaining neighborhood compatibility.

3) Provide plate height dimensions on plans.

Action: Moticha/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 456 CONEJO RD

A-1 Zone

(5:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-061-036
Application Number: MST2014-00491
Owner: Bradley Vernon
Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to construct a new single-family residence on a vacant lot. The previous dwelling on the parcel was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The project will comprise a 1,669 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 562 square foot two-car garage. It also includes 331 cubic yards of cut and 8 cubic yards of fill grading. The proposed total of 2,231 square feet on an 8,431 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 67% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on October 14, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:56 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect; Jessica Harlin, Landscape Designer; Sean Lynch, Agent; and Bradley Vernon, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:12 p.m.

Brian Milburn (neighbor) opposition; appreciated the Applicant's reduction of the proposed massing, but did not like the proposed modern architectural design.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, and good neighbor guidelines.

2) The Board finds the proposed 67% FAR acceptable.

Action: James/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**6. 511 BROSIAN WAY****A-1/SD-3 Zone**

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-030-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00569
 Owner: John Park
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal for a new 7,200 square foot tennis court at a single-family residence on 2.22 acre lot in the Hillside Design District and located within both the appealable and non-appealable jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone. The tennis court will be developed within the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and will require Coastal Review. The project includes 1,366 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on the site and includes revisions to a previously approved landscape plan under MST2014-00149.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on December 14, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:29 p.m.

Present: Lovita Wibisono, Architect; and Grace Park, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:35 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Moticha/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:36 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:44 P.M. ***

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**7. 306 SHERMAN RD****A-1 Zone**

(5:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-050-003
 Application Number: MST2009-00414
 Owner: Antar Dayal
 Architect: Hector Magnus
 Agent: Janet Caminite

(Proposal to rebuild a house and garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. The project includes a new 2,427 square foot, three-story single family residence plus a 555 square foot basement that is not included in the floor to lot area ratio (FAR), and a 471 square foot attached two-car garage. The project includes a reflection pool, retaining walls, and approximately 450 cubic yards of cut grading to be exported from the site. **Staff Hearing Officer** approval of a modification is requested for the proposed garage to encroach into the front setback. The proposed total 2,898 square feet, excluding the basement, on the 10,500 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 77% of the FAR. The project received Final Approval by SFDB on April 12, 2010. The project returned to the Staff Hearing Officer for additional setback encroachments involving a fountain wall element that exceeds 8 feet in height and exterior stairs within the required front setback. The design elements were part of the original approval granted by SFDB and have not changed.)

(Review After Final is requested to omit window louvers, omit a fence along the westerly property line, and for revisions to the landscape plan. Project was last reviewed on January 5, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:44 p.m.

Present: Antar Dayal, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:57 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board directed the Applicant to revisit the landscape plan and provide hedging consisting of *prunus ilicifolia* (Hollyleaf Cherry) or a species of similar drought tolerance and height, to be drip irrigated until fully established, to be minimum 15 gallon size, and planted six feet on center along the westerly property line for the depth of the house. The proposal is subject to Fire Department approval for compliance with High Fire Hazard Area landscaping requirements. If additional hedges are not approved by Fire Department, the Board reserves the right to revisit exterior louvers on the westerly elevation as a screening solution.
- 2) (Acknowledging zoning requirements for hedge height limits within an interior setback), the Board prefers a hedge solution and supports a hedge of up to 12 feet tall within the westerly interior setback.
- 3) The landscape plan as presented for the remaining areas is acceptable with the condition that it be drip irrigated.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:00 P.M. ****