



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, February 23, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
BERNI BERNSTEIN
LISA JAMES
JAIME PIERCE
DENISE WOOLERY
PAUL ZINK, *Interim*

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (3:05 p.m.), Bernstein, James, Pierce, Woolery (3:04 p.m.) and Zink.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Limón, Eng and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of February 9, 2015, as submitted.

Action: Bernstein/Zink, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Miller/Zink abstained).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **Tuesday, February 17, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by James/Miller.

Action: James/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **February 23, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by James/Miller.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Zink abstained).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

a. Mr. Limón reported that the appeal of the project at 1912 Mission Ridge Road will be heard at City Council on Tuesday, March 3, 2105. In addition, it is expected that City Council will appointment a new SFDB member at this meeting.

b. Chair Sweeney and Board member Pierce will step down from Item #1, 3626 San Remo Road. A, Chair Sweeney will step down from Item #3, 2405 State Street, and Board member Zink will step down from Item #7, 640 Aurora Avenue.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Sweeney reported that the Subcommittee met to discuss items of concern regarding the New Zoning Ordinance update. Although staff explained that some items of concern are not part of the NZO scope, modification requirements for setbacks would be explored and further updates will follow.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 3626 SAN REMO DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011

Application Number: MST2013-00506

Owner: Nancy J. Madsen

Designer: Kate Svensson

Applicant: Vincent Amore

(Lot 4: Proposal for construction of a two-story, 2,762 square foot, single-family residence and an attached, 498 square foot, two-car garage, located on a vacant 17,351 square foot parcel (Lot 4). The proposal includes associated flat work, landscaping, and site walls. This proposal is associated with a concurrent application (MST2009-00325) for a four (4) lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 14, 2010 (Resolution No. 015-10). The proposed total of 3,260 square feet is 74% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 022-14. Project was last reviewed on February 17, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:13 p.m.

Present: Vincent Amore, Applicant; Robert Adams, Landscape Architect; Gavin Moores, Principal of Capital Pacific Development Group; Henry Lenny, Architect; Kate Svensson, Designer; and Daniel Gullett, Case Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of

Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City, it is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site, and it is designed with quality architectural details.

Action: Woolery/Zink, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed, Sweeney/Pierce stepped down).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 3:31 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 3:49 P.M. ***

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

2. 415 ALAN RD

A-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-091-024
 Application Number: MST2012-00362
 Architect: Christine Pierron
 Owner: Sean Shahrouzi

(Proposal to construct a new one-story, 2,100 square foot single-family residence with an attached 400 square foot two-car garage, located on a 14,601 square foot vacant lot in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes new site fences, walls, and retaining walls, and a total of 800 cubic yards of grading to be balanced on site. The proposed total of 2,500 square feet is 58% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This is a new parcel created as part of a recent subdivision application (MST2009-00083) approved by City Council (Ord. No. 5580) on February 14, 2012. A separate application (MST2012-00268) was recently approved for alterations to the existing single-family residence.)

(Review After Final is requested to change the architectural style of the proposal from Craftsman to Mediterranean. Changes include revised doors, windows, and window openings, a new garage door, revised roof eaves, a parapet roof at the south end, a revised covered front porch, two-piece mission roof tiles throughout, smooth plaster wall finishes, copper gutters and downspouts, new lighting fixtures, and revised site walls. No changes to the previously approved building footprint and square footage are proposed. Project was last reviewed on March 18, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:49 p.m.

Present: Christine Pierron, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:56 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the change from Craftsman style to Mediterranean style appropriate for the neighborhood.
- 2) Study the architectural detailing on the front façade.
- 3) Study the window proportions and simplify the window details.
- 4) Simplify the roof gable.
- 5) Reduce the number of wall sconces around the perimeter and rear of the project.
- 6) Consider adding ornamentation to the handrails.
- 7) Verify compliance with Tier 2 or Tier 3 Storm Water Management Plan (SWMP) requirements with City staff.

- 8) Work with the client on addressing the number of arches and simplifying the column details at the front porch.

Action: Zink/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 2405 STATE ST

E-3 Zone

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-071-012
 Application Number: MST2014-00418
 Owner: Dan Underwood
 Architect: Bill Wolf

(Proposal to construct a 2,101 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an attached 505 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes a new driveway, walkways, curb cut, patios, site walls, fencing, an outdoor fireplace, and the removal of front setback trees. It also includes 2,825 cubic yard of cut and fill grading, of which 235 cubic yards will be exported. The proposed total of 2,606 square feet on a vacant lot is 85% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project was last reviewed on October 20, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:15 p.m.

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect; and Dan Underwood, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:30 p.m.

- 1) Jim Arnesen expressed concerns regarding the amount of cut and fill grading, the overwhelming height of the structure in the view corridor, the location of the garage fronting State Street, and the removal of the *araucaria araucana* (monkey puzzle tree).

Public comment closed at 4:35 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant efforts.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 3) Include in the landscape plan a grouping of three *hymenosporum flavum*, comprising two 15 gallon and one 24 inch boxes.
- 4) The chimney should be clad with stucco or stone.

Action: Bernstein/Pierce, 3/0/2. Motion carried. (Zink/Woolery abstained, Sweeney stepped down).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. 2233 FOOTHILL LN****A-1 Zone**

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-101-007
 Application Number: MST2014-00521
 Owner: Sarah F. Hammett
 Architect: Mark English

(Proposal for 74 square feet of first-floor and 88 square-feet of second-floor additions to an existing two-story, 3,226 square foot, single-family residence with an attached 772 square foot three-car garage and two uncovered parking spaces. The project includes the alteration of roof forms, and new windows and doors. The proposed total of 4,161 square feet of development on a 38,251 square foot lot is 85% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested.)

Actual time: 4:53 p.m.

Present: Mark English, Architect; and Sarah Hammett, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:00 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:

- 1) Study the scale of the hay loft detail in relationship to the roof line and the soffit below, on the north elevation.
- 2) Study the prospect of a protected front door.
- 3) Provide cut sheets for dark sky light fixtures and confirm proposed landscape lighting.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan detailing the gravel zone adjacent to the private driveway and along the front elevation facing Foothill.
- 5) Provide details of the window trim, roof overhang, and fascia.

Action: Zink/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 350 MOUNTAIN DR****A-1 Zone**

(5:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-012-023
 Application Number: MST2015-00043
 Owner: Ruth Engle
 Applicant: Steve Willson

(Proposal for 702 gross square feet of one- and second-story additions to an existing 2,821 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an attached two-car garage. The proposed total of 3,523 gross square feet on a 1-acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 71% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:20 p.m.

Present: Steve Willson, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide additional information for the proposed exterior siding. The Board is concerned about the use of metal panels and urges the applicant to consider alternatives.
- 2) Provide cut sheets of the lighting fixtures and show the location of the fixtures on the elevations. The fixtures shall be dark sky compliant.
- 3) Show the location of the gutters and downspouts on the elevations and include the material for the gutters.
- 4) Provide a color board; the applicant is encouraged to bring colored elevations to show the colors on various planes.
- 5) Provide details of the overhang, and the deck and railing.
- 6) Provide cut sheets for the garage doors, showing alternatives for models with varying amounts of glass and translucency.

Action: Zink/Miler, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:48 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 6:28 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 435 E VALERIO ST

R-2 Zone

(6:25)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-123-008
Application Number: MST2015-00021
Owner: Dow, Oretsky, and Parenteau
Architect: Dan Weber

(Proposal for exterior and site alterations to an existing 2,772 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with a detached 307 square foot, one-car garage. The proposal includes the demolition of the existing non-conforming garage (attached to a building on a neighboring property) and construction of a new standalone two-story building comprising a 332 square foot accessory unit above a 432 square foot two-car garage. It also includes a new curb cut, driveway, exterior deck, and reconfiguration and remodel of interior spaces. The proposed total of 3,079 square feet on a 5,924 square foot lot is 115% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested modifications to allow alterations in the front setback and to reduce minimum open yard dimensions. This project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2007-00477 and Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00596.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 6:28 p.m.

Present: Dan Weber, Architect; and Alelia Parenteau, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:45 p.m.

- 1) Teddy Gasser expressed concerns regarding the location of the windows in relation to her privacy as well as the issues in separating the shared garage space. She spoke in support of the curb cut that will improve the driveway and the design of proposed project.

Letters in opposition from Daphne Page, Bill Beach and R. Warder Bayly were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:54 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the project's design direction of the project but prefers the use of the three window set configurations presented in the renderings as opposed to what is on the plans.
- 2) The Board can support the built-up deck at the rear but would like a study of an alternate design for terracing the deck.
- 3) Provide details of the porch columns, illustrating how they should look proportionally.
- 4) Study the front elevation of the detached garage, giving special attention to the treatment of the additional three foot width on the ground floor.
- 5) Provide clarification from the City staff regarding the curb cut and street tree preservation.
- 6) Working together with the neighbor, study the impact of the garage alteration to the neighbor's garage and work together to provide a mutually agreeable solution.
- 7) Provide a landscape plan concerning the westerly side of the property line along Valerio and Cota streets.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 640 AURORA AVE

E-1 Zone

(7:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-122-014
 Application Number: MST2015-00038
 Owner: Nicolas A. and Rosalyn Cole D'icelli
 Designer: Jason Grant Design Studio

(Proposal for a 1,234 square foot, one- and two-story addition to an existing 1,590 square foot one-story residence with attached 441 square foot two-car garage. The project includes a new covered front entry porch and upper level balcony. The proposal total of 3,255 square feet on a 13,500 square foot lot is 78% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested modifications for additions in the front setback and for changes to the basic exterior characteristics of a non-conforming residence.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 7:27 p.m.

Present: Jason Grant, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:33 p.m.

- 1) Joan (Lucky) Coil expressed concerns regarding the obstruction of her views from the second story addition. She suggested that the addition may be done on the ground level.

Public comment closed at 7:40 p.m.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Speak with neighbors upon delivery of the plans to receive feedback.
- 2) Study the shape and location of the second story. Consider shifting it back along the north side of the structure closer to the slope of the hillside.
- 3) Story poles are not requested at this time, but may be beneficial (at a later date).
- 4) Provide a landscape plan of the front area.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink stepped down).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:53 P.M. ****

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by **Lisa James** and **Brian Miller**.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**A. 20 LAS ALTURAS CIR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-122-001
 Application Number: MST2012-00270
 Owner: Charles Rudd and Inken Gerlach
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a new 3,430 square foot two-story, single-family residence with an attached 515 square foot garage located on a 19,718 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous 3,475 square foot single-family residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes new site walls, an existing pool to remain, new pool decking, removal and replacement of an existing 32 inch diameter trunk, redwood tree with three oak trees, and proposed grading of 100 cubic yards of cut, 70 cubic yards of fill and 30 cubic yards of export. The proposed total of 3,945 square feet of development is 89% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer approval for requested zoning modifications. The project requires a Public Works encroachment permit.)

(Review After Final is requested for "as-built" site wall alterations, an "as-built" window change at the living room, new landscape design, and revised exterior light fixtures.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**B. 434 CONEJO RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-061-012
 Application Number: MST2014-00066
 Owner: Maria Lourdes C. Smith
 Architect: Alex Pujo

(Proposal to construct a new 1,724 square foot two-story single-family residence and attached 519 square foot two-car garage. Also proposed is a 133 square foot second floor deck and 290 linear feet of retaining walls. A total of 444 cubic yards of grading, of which 238 cubic yards is outside of the building footprint, is proposed. The proposed development total 2,243 square feet, located on a 7,925 square foot vacant lot within the Hillside Design District, is 71% of maximum floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for front and interior setback modifications.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 048-14.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with conditions:

- 1) Provide a cut sheet of the garage door.
- 2) Clarify the correct square footage statistics and include an updated FAR calculator on plans.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**C. 1575 ORAMAS RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-051-005
 Application Number: MST2014-00587
 Designer: Mark Morando
 Owner: George Pecoulas and Patricia Luscombe

(Proposal to replace the exterior windows and doors with Kolbe and Kolbe Vista Deluxe metal clad flush-mounts, a new smooth-coat Mission style stucco, a new roof, alterations to the roof above the garage and dwelling, and a new garage door. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for alterations to the dwelling within the interior & front setbacks. A previous application (MST2014-00294) was reviewed and approved by the Single Family Design Board on July 14, 2014, for a 25 square foot addition, a new balcony and exterior alterations to the dwelling at the property.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 007-15.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

NEW ITEM – PUBLIC HEARING**D. 1531 LIVE OAK LN****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-261-029
 Application Number: MST2015-00063
 Owner: Robert and Tammara Stockero
 Architect: Don Swann

(Proposal to replace the mansard roof of an existing 2,099 square foot, two-story, single-family residence in the Hillside Design District with a shingled hipped roof. The proposal includes the replacement of five windows, new stucco on the entire exterior, and a new central heating system. No changes to the square footage are proposed. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested modification to allow alterations within the front setback.)

(Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the requested modifications aesthetically appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines. The proposed alterations are a significant improvement over the existing residence.

NEW ITEM**E. 1311 W VALERIO ST****R-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-081-014
Application Number: MST2015-00067
Owner: Benjamin Seeley
Applicant: Noah Greer

(Proposal for exterior alterations to an existing one-story 1,040 square-foot single-family home. The proposal includes including relocation of windows and the front entry door, new front yard steps and pathways. This proposal will permit a 42" to 64" tall "as-built" retaining wall in the rear yard and a 42" tall retaining wall in the public right of way, the latter of which will require an encroachment permit. There are no changes to the building footprint, roof height, exterior colors or materials or square footage, which will remain at 37% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations listed in Zoning Information Report (ZIR2011-00330).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code to return indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 2) The height of the as-built retaining wall located in the public right of way is aesthetically appropriate for the site and the neighborhood, and does not pose consistency issues with the Design Guidelines.