



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, November 16, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:09 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Miller, Moticha, Bernstein, James, Pierce, and Woolery.
Members absent: Sweeney.
Staff present: Eng and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **November 2, 2015**, as submitted.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **November 9, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by **James/Miller**.

Action: Bernstein/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The November 16, 2015 Consent Review was cancelled.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
1. Mr. Eng announced the following announcements:
 - a) There will be two New Zoning Ordinance (called "NZO") Committee meetings on December 7th and December 14th. The Joint Committee is composed of two City Councilmembers and three Planning Commissioners. NZO *Module #2: Development Standards* comprises three components: 1) base zone development standards; 2) overlay zones; and 3) citywide development standards. The Draft Module #2 and NZO Joint Committee staff report are now available for viewing and download on the [NZO Public Meetings webpage](#). Public meetings for this Module will be held over two consecutive Mondays, December 7 and December 14, 2015, from 9:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m. (both days) in the Parks and Recreation Department Conference Room at 620 Laguna Street. Meeting agendas will be released the week of November 16, 2015.
- E. Subcommittee Reports: There were no subcommittee reports.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

1. 100 E CONSTANCE AVE

E-1 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-041-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00625
 Owner: Kenny Van Zant
 Applicant: Diana Kelly

(Proposal for 366 square feet of first-floor additions and 121 square feet of second-floor additions to an existing 3,357 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with a 523 square foot, attached two-car garage. The property includes a designated Indian laurel fig tree to remain unaltered. The proposed total of 4,367 square feet on a 37,779 square foot lot is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00300.)

(Review After Final is requested to raise the second floor roof height by 1', replace existing "Monier Life Tile" with new 2-piece mission clay tiles throughout, revise the second floor exterior door and window to the covered terrace to be one four-panel door, eliminate the previously proposed rear yard trellis, construct a new sunken fire pit terrace, and install a new hot tub spa with pool decking around the existing pool. Project was referred from Consent to the Full Board on October 26, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Darrell Becker and Diana Kelly, Architects; and Kenny Van Zant, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:22 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board found the project acceptable due to the minimal one foot increase in the plate height.
- 2) The Board found the project's consistency of design compatible with the neighborhood.
- 3) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.

Action: James/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 210 MEIGS RD (LOT 1)****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(3:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-110-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00498
 Owner: Lighthouse Builders, LLC
 Applicant: Bruce Blodorn
 Architect: Richard Thorne

(Lot 1: Proposal for a new 2,806 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached two-car garage. The project includes new landscaping, site walls, and 60 cubic yards of grading, of which 40 cubic yards will be outside of the building footprint. The proposed total of 2,806 square feet on an 8,640 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 84% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project is Lot 1 of a five-lot subdivision approved under MST2006-00476.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 007-09. Project was last reviewed on November 2, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:25 p.m.

Present: Bruce Blodorn, Applicant/Agent for Owners.

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board found the project's design and architecture compatible and consistent with the neighborhood.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 210 MEIGS RD (LOT 2)****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-110-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00497
 Owner: Lighthouse Builders, LLC
 Applicant: Bruce Blodorn
 Architect: Richard Thorne

(Lot 2: Proposal for a new 2,244 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with a 460 square foot, attached two-car garage. The project includes new landscaping, site walls, and 30 cubic yards of cut grading, of which 20 cubic yards will be outside of the building footprint. The proposed total of 2,853 square feet on a newly created 7,508 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 88% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project is Lot 2 of a five-lot subdivision approved under MST2006-00476.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 007-09. Project was last reviewed on November 2, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Bruce Blodorn, Applicant/Agent for Owners; and Allison De Busk, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.

Action: James/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 210 MEIGS RD (LOT 3)****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(3:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-110-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00499
 Owner: Lighthouse Builders, LLC
 Applicant: Bruce Blodorn
 Architect: Richard Thorne

(Lot 3: Proposal for a new 2,281 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with a 443 square foot, attached two-car garage. The project includes new landscaping, site walls, and 60 cubic yards of cut and fill grading, of which 20 cubic yards will be outside of the building footprint. The proposed total of 2,853 square feet on a newly created 8,157 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 89% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project is Lot 3 of a five-lot subdivision approved under MST2006-00476.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 007-09. Project was last reviewed on November 2, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:45 p.m.

Present: Bruce Blodorn, Applicant/Agent for Owners.

Public comment opened at 3:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Addison Thompson, Planning Commission Liaison, clarified the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and cohesiveness with the public views of the neighborhood.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 3:49 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 3:55 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**5. 113 LA PLATA****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-201-014
Application Number: MST2015-00351
Owner: Bruce G. McAbery III
Architect: Tom Jacobs

(This is a revised project description to change the garage configuration of the previous proposal. Proposal to demolish the existing 1,295 square foot, one-story residence and attached one-car garage and construct a new 2,333 square foot, two-story residence with an attached two-car garage. The project includes an 86 square foot upper-level deck, new driveway and relocated curb cut, landscaping, and fencing. The proposed total of 2,333 square feet on a 5,553 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 91% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on November 2, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:55 p.m.

Present: Tom Jacobs, Architect; and Bruce G. McAbery III, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, quality of architecture and materials, and found the project's size, bulk, and scale are compatible with the neighborhood. The Board found the project generally acceptable.

Action: Woolery/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 4:03 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:21 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 435 E VALERIO ST****R-2 Zone**

(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-123-008
 Application Number: MST2015-00021
 Owner: Dow, Oretsky, & Parenteau
 Architect: Dan Weber
 Owner: Thomas Oretsky

(Proposal to demolish 307 square feet of existing non-conforming garages (attached to a garage on a neighboring property), to demolish 231 square feet of the second floor of the dwelling and to construct a new detached 421 square foot two-car garage on a lot developed with an existing 2,772 square foot, two-story single family residence. The proposal also includes a new curb cut, driveway, exterior deck, a new 42 inch high motorized gate, site alterations and an interior remodel to the dwelling. This project will address violations identified in an enforcement case ENF2007-00477 and a Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00596. The proposed total of 2,951 square feet on a 5,924 square foot lot is 111% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested modifications to allow alterations in the front setback and to reduce minimum open yard dimensions.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 053-15. Project was last reviewed on March 9, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:21 p.m.

Present: Dan Weber, Architect; and Alelia Parenteau, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:35 p.m.

- 1) Teddy Gasser (adjacent neighbor sharing the project garage), supports; only expressed concern regarding any new changes to the garage, and the easement agreement between the two adjacent properties.

Public comment closed at 4:38 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency in appearance, size, bulk, and scale, neighborhood compatibility, and the quality of architecture and materials.

Action: Woolery/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 4:50 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:03 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 1601 CALLE CANON****R-1 Zone**

(5:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-072-002
Application Number: MST2015-00503
Owner: Laura Cook
Architect: Ted Meeder

(Proposal to demolish and reconstruct portions of the first floor, add 87 square feet to the first floor, and construct a new 343 square foot second floor at an existing 892 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached 166 square foot one-car garage. The project includes a new 832 square foot covered patio on the ground floor and a 200 square foot second-floor deck. The total of 1,488 square feet of development on a 6,374 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 54% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2012-00249.)

(Comments Only.)

Actual time: 5:03 p.m.

Present: Ted Meeder, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:12 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board found the project acceptable, and complies with the SFDB Guidelines and in size, bulk, and scale.
- 2) Keep and maintain the 8-foot hedge height to help mitigate heavy traffic, noise, and privacy considerations.
- 3) The upstairs deck is appropriate in size, and considers the neighborhood to the northeast.
- 4) Provide photographs to clearly clarify from the street and driveways in consideration of any impact issues the proposed deck may have on adjacent privacy issues of the neighborhood.

Action: Moticha/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 5:26 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:35 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**8. 1568 LAS CANOAS RD****A-1 Zone**

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-082-032
Application Number: MST2015-00517
Owner: Matthew J. Boeddeker
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to permit the "as-built" conversion of the 361 square foot garage to habitable floor area and construct a new two-story, detached accessory building, including a 500 square foot, two-car garage, and 494 square feet of accessory space. The proposal also includes a 165 square foot family room addition, a new covered patio, a new guest parking space, and alterations to site paving. The proposed development total of 3,514 square feet, located on a 1.46 acre lot in the Hillside Design District, is 67% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Comments Only.)

Actual time: 5:35 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; and Matthew J. Boeddeker, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:40 p.m.

- 1) Dr. Julie R. Coburn, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed height of the project, property values, good neighbor policy, and private views in the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 5:43 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds acceptable the proposed project design.
- 2) The Board finds no public views are impacted.
- 3) The Chair stated for the public record that the Board is mainly an architectural design and aesthetics Board for mass, bulk, and scale, and neighborhood compatibility; therefore, *private* view concerns of the public are not within the Board's purview.
- 4) The Board encouraged both the Applicant and neighbors to work together with the good neighbor guidelines to achieve neighborhood compatibility.

Action: Woolery/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:50 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 6:35 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**9. 45 LAS ALTURAS CIR****A-1 Zone**

(6:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-130-014
 Application Number: MST2015-00520
 Owner: Pan Hsiao-Li and Dru Finley
 Architect: Chris Cottrell

(Proposal to construct a new 468 square foot second-floor addition with 290 square feet of upper level decks to an existing 2,936 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes enclosure of the existing attached 550 square foot carport to become a 507 square foot, two-car garage. A pool with adjacent flatwork and a fire pit were approved separately under MST2015-00190. The proposed total of 3,918 square feet on a 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 77% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:35 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:41 p.m.

- 1) Carolyn Vogt (also speaking on behalf of Carol Fechtman and Tranquilla Grey - submitted letter), opposition to second story addition; expressed concern regarding the new second-story addition in an exclusively single-story neighborhood from street view, significant difference from original CCRs now expired, privacy issues, and the expansive and open feel of the neighborhood.
- 2) Don Vogt, (submitted photographs) opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility, design compatibility, and privacy issues.
- 3) Michael Jaffe, (submitted photographs) opposition; expressed concern regarding the intent of the original architecture, and proposed deck and privacy issues.

Public comment closed at 6:59 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the new second-story addition? 1/5 (failed).

The Chair stated for the public record that the Board is mainly an architectural design and aesthetics Board for mass, bulk, and scale, and neighborhood compatibility; therefore, *private* view concerns of the public are not within the Board's purview, but the Board encouraged the applicant to reconsider the design and for both the applicant and neighbors to work together to achieve neighborhood compatibility.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the comment that the Board could not support the proposed second-story design as presented as the project does not meet the neighborhood compatibility criteria. The Board encouraged the applicant to study to redesign the project to be more compatible with the neighborhood, and for both the Applicant and neighbors to work together with the good neighbor guidelines to achieve neighborhood compatibility.

Action: James/Pierce, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Miller abstained, Sweeney absent).

FINAL REVIEW**10. 133 W MOUNTAIN DR****A-1 Zone**

(7:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-061-024
Application Number: MST2015-00148
Owner: Brad Hasse
Architect: Chris Cottrell
Applicant: Jarrett Gorin

(Proposal to construct a new 2,347 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 600 square foot, two-car garage and a 524 square foot workshop. The project includes a new driveway and one uncovered guest parking space, a covered patio, and upper level deck. The proposed total of 3,471 square feet on a 3.1 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 58% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Final Review is requested. Project must comply with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program. Project was last reviewed on June 15, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:18 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect; Jarrett Gorin, Applicant; Brian and Brad Hasse, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:21 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with the Board's positive comments regarding the project's size bulk and scale, consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and scenic character.

Action: Pierce/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:26 P.M. ****