



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 19, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Miller, Bernstein, James, Moticha, and Woolery.
Members absent: Sweeney and Pierce.
Staff present: Eng and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of October 5, 2015, as submitted.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained, Sweeney/Pierce absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **October 19, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by James/Moticha.

Action: James/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Pierce absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Eng announced that Chair Sweeney and Board member Pierce will be absent from the meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

FINAL REVIEW**1. 1056 CLIFF DR****E-3 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-212-016

Application Number: MST2015-00177

Owner: Edward St. George

Applicant: Laura Weinstein

Architect: Jerry Wilhelm

(Proposal to construct a 31 square foot first-floor and 584 square foot second-floor addition to an existing 1,047 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached 364 square foot carport. The proposal also includes demolition and replacement of the existing carport with a 483 square foot attached two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,145 square feet on an 8,719 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 64% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00526, including permitting and relocation of an "as-built" trellis.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on September 8, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:06 p.m.

Present: Jerry Wilhelm, Architect; and Shelby Messner, Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.
- 2) Provide details and a cut sheet of the proposed garage door.

Action: James/Bernstein, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Woolery abstained, Sweeney/Pierce absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 3:13 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 3:23 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW: NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 1425 MISSION RIDGE RD****A-2 Zone**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-103-023
 Application Number: MST2015-00474
 Owner: RC Steiner Living Trust
 Architect: Tom Oschner

(Proposal to demolish an existing 3,900 square foot, one-story, single-family residence and garage and construct a new two level single family residence comprising a 4,350 square foot main level, a 3,660 square foot basement, a 590 square foot attached two-car garage, a 710 square foot detached three-car garage, and a 480 square foot detached accessory building. The project includes an uncovered parking space, a new 512 square foot pool, landscaping, a terrace, and 2,400 cubic yards of grading, of which 600 cubic yards will be exported off site. The proposed total of 9,790 square feet (of which 7,960 square feet applies to the floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]) is 145% of the guideline maximum FAR. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for zoning modifications to allow the cumulative garages to exceed 750 square feet and for an accessory structure to be located in the remaining front yard. This project will address a violation in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00057.)

(Comments only; project requires an environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 3:23 p.m.

Present: Tom Oschner, Architect; Jeff Yardi, Landscape Architect; and Russell Steiner, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:39 p.m.

Letters of support from Mitchell D. Gravo, Dennis and Dianne Kimbrough, Alex and Lori Weathers, and Christian Heyer were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:41 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board supports the location of the accessory building (yoga room) in the remaining front yard as a preferred alternative to locating it in a conforming but more visible location downslope.
- 2) The Board supports the requested amount of garage space.
- 3) The Board finds the project compatible with the neighborhood.
- 4) Study an alternative to the skylight.
- 5) Study the details on the front tower element.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed, Sweeney/Pierce absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 1542 CLIFF DR****E-3 Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-170-002
Application Number: MST2015-00409
Owner: Michael Kinderman
Architect: Tom Oschner

(Proposal to construct a new wooden privacy screen with a height of up to 21 feet tall in the rear yard of an existing single-family residence. The proposed screen will be adjacent to an existing 5.5-foot tall retaining wall to remain. The project also includes new landscaping, a new retractable awning on wire cables in a courtyard in the rear yard, and removal of an unpermitted trellis structure. The project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2009-00333.)

(Fourth concept review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on September 21, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:13 p.m.

Present: Tom Oschner, Architect; Jeff Yardi, Landscape Architect; and Marie Kinderman, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:21 p.m.

- 1) Connard Hogan, adjacent neighbor, found the changes to be minimal, mentioning that the step-down of the screen were not significant enough to substantially mitigate impacts. He also stated that the proposed trees would be very intrusive, growing in excess and canopying over the property line, and was concerned that the roots would cause destruction to his foundation.
- 2) Janet Napier, adjacent neighbor referred to the loss of her views in relation to the enormous screen and the proposed plantings. The modifications continued to be incompatible with neighborhood, and would potentially diminish her property value and the enjoyment of her home

A letter of expressed concerns from Janet Napier and Connard Hogan was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:28 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the overall commitment to create an accommodating solution.
- 2) A scheduled site visit will be conducted prior to the next meeting.

Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Pierce absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. 1177 LAS ALTURAS RD****A-1 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-113-004
 Application Number: MST2015-00488
 Owner: Virginia Moede
 Architect: Patrick Tighe

(Proposal for first- and second-floor alterations that will result in a net reduction of 4 square feet to an existing two-story, 1,973 square foot residence. The project includes a 144 square foot addition to an existing 283 square foot accessory space located above a 437 square foot detached two-car garage. The project also includes a new pool in the front yard, new windows and doors, two uncovered parking spaces, removal of roof eaves, site work, and new exterior finishes. The proposed total of 2,606 square feet on an 18,816 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 59% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:52 p.m.

Present: Patrick Tighe, Architect; Albert Chavez, Designer; and Virginia Moede, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:06 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.

Action: Woolery/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Pierce absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 302 E CALLE LAURELES****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-084-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00476
 Owner: James D. Fowkes
 Architect: J. Grant Design

(Proposal to replace an existing 300 square foot attached one-car garage with a new 476 square foot attached two-car garage and construct a 1,506 square foot two-story residential addition on an existing 1,087 square foot single-family dwelling. Also proposed on this 6,414 square foot parcel is a new 32 square foot covered front entry porch, change the exterior finish from plaster to Hardi-shake, and replace all remaining windows with new. The proposed floor-to-lot-area ratio [FAR] will be .38 or 89% of the maximum FAR.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:21 p.m.

Present: Jason Grant, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan.
- 2) Provide a color board.
- 3) Provide design details.
- 4) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.

Action: Moticha/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Pierce absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:38 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 6:07 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 406 N ONTARE RD

E-2/SD-2 Zone

(6:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-151-012
 Application Number: MST2015-00471
 Owner: Carolina N. Pizarro
 Architect: Koffka-Phakos Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,291 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached garage and construct a new 3,601 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 567 square foot three-car garage and 534 square feet of habitable space above it. Also proposed are a swimming pool, patios, site walls, landscaping, and a total of 187 cubic yards of cut grading, of which 179 cubic feet will be under the residence and 8 will be under the pool. The proposed total of 4,702 square feet on a 21,524 square foot lot is 100% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Comments only; project requires an environmental assessment and compliance with base flood elevation requirements.)

Actual time: 6:07 p.m.

Present: Cynthia Phakos and Adrian Koffka, Architects; Claudia Pizarro, General Contractor; and Christina Pizarro, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:25 p.m.

- 1) Carol Hemingway, neighbor at 420 North Ontare Road, referred to the proposal as an office building or condominium in comparison to the historic single story neighborhood.
- 2) Judy Benton, neighbor at 338 North Ontare Road, mentioned that the home would sit along a flood zone. She was concerned about the potential for the home to be converted into rentals. She conducted her own 20 closest homes study to show the relation between the proposal and adjacent homes, and

concluded that a majority of the neighborhood opposed the proposal due to the second story. She found the site map insufficient in representing privacy matters and did not feel Good Neighbor guidelines had been followed. She requested that construction be minimized in consideration for the neighbors.

- 3) Tom Pickett, neighbor at 414 North Ontare Road, stated that the size, bulk, and scale of the proposal exceeded that of surrounding homes. He expressed concern that the design lends the potential for a home-business, negatively impacting the neighborhood.
- 4) Robert Weber, neighbor at 3620 Sunset Drive, did not agree with the comparison of the home to the Canon Drive neighborhood as he felt that the architectural style was significantly different and did not meet compatibility standards. He was concerned about the construction of a pool during the City's drought problem.

Letters of expressed concerns from Chris and Susie Dahlstrom, Sara Jane and Nicholas Woolf, Bob and Patti Weber, Kim Barney, Chris and Judy Benton, Tom and Catherine Pickett, and Don McCarthy were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:48 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the overall design consistent in appearance and supportable.
- 2) Reduce the floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) to 85%.
- 3) The project has quality architecture and materials.
- 4) Follow the Good Neighbor guidelines.
- 5) Provide design details.
- 6) Eliminate the second story above the garage.
- 7) Study the entry area to reduce the massing.

Action: Bernstein/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Pierce absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:17 P.M. ****