



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 5, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:07 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James (until 4:51), Moticha, Pierce, and Woolery (3:24 p.m.).
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Limón, Eng, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

 No public comment.
- B. Approval of the minutes:

 Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of September 21, 2015, as submitted.

 Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **October 5, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by James/Miller.

Action: James/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced that Board member Woolery will be arriving late. Item #2, 1802 Hillside Road, and Item #5, 406 North Ontare Road, have been postponed at the request of their respective applicants.

2. Chair Sweeney announced the joint meeting of the Planning Commission and City Council will be Thursday, October 8, 2015. Board members Miller and Moticha will represent the Single Family Design Board at the joint meeting. Chair Sweeney requested additional information on the New Zoning Ordinance workshop.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee Reports.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 1304 CRESTLINE DR****E-1 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-251-001

Application Number: MST2015-00385

Owner: Joseph C. Weber Revocable Trust

Architect: Sherry & Associates Architects, Inc.

(Proposal to demolish 151 square feet of the first floor, to construct a 280 square feet of first-story addition, 227 square foot second-story addition, two new roof decks, and to convert 2 square feet of the master bedroom to deck area at an existing 2,313 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 415 square foot, two-car garage. The proposal includes new solar tubes, a new trellis, roof alterations, and an interior and exterior remodel of the dwelling. The proposed total of 3,082 square feet on a 9,756 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 81% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2008-00067.)

(Project Design Approval is requested.)

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect; and Kathryn Dole, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:33 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1) Provide samples of alternative railing material on the upper deck.

2) The project is consistent in appearance with the scenic character of the City, compatible with the site, and has quality architecture and materials that are consistent with the natural appearance of the neighborhood.

3) The Board recommends having a frosted glass garage door.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/3/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Bernstein/Moticha opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 1802 HILLSIDE RD****R-1 Zone**

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-061-028
Application Number: MST2015-00469
Owner: Wendy Lynne Kanter and Jon Lipman
Applicant: Cesar Cruz

(Proposal to construct 549 square feet of first- and second-floor additions to an existing two-story, 1,582 square foot single-family residence and to construct 83 square feet to the existing 138 square foot, attached, one-car garage. The project includes a new upper-level covered balcony and an expanded deck and new patio cover in the rear yard. The proposed total of 2,352 square feet of development on a 6,600 square foot lot is 83% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project has been postponed at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 626 ALSTON RD****A-2 Zone**

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-171-020
Application Number: MST2015-00463
Owner: Fentisov Living Trust
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to construct a 4,051 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 978 square foot, four-car garage. The project includes a new driveway and six-foot tall gate with columns, decks and patios, landscaping, and walkways. It also proposes 2,484 cubic yards of cut-and-fill grading outside of the building footprint and 982 cubic yards under the building footprint, with 18 cubic yards to be exported off site. The proposed total of 4,936 square feet on a 1.1 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 99% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is required to allow the garage to exceed the maximum allowable size of 750 square feet.)

(Comments only; one-time concept review only.)

Actual time: 3:52 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect; and Mike Shumard, Representative of the Owners.

Public comment opened at 4:05 p.m.

- 1) Bobby Shand, neighbor at 612 Alston Road, requested that the applicant be considerate of the neighbors in keeping with the one-story neighborhood, and maintain the natural topography of the canyon.
- 2) Vicki Klassen, neighbor at 239 Rametto Road, expressed concerns regarding erosion and obstruction of emergency vehicles during construction; she found the size of the second story to be incompatible with the majority of neighborhood.
- 3) Elizabeth Saghi, neighbor at 623 Alston Road, expressed concerns regarding the existing grading, possible erosion, and the proposed size of home on the lot.

- 4) Valerie Froscher, architect representing the Shands, found issues with the neighborhood compatibility, style and size; she mentioned that the view easement restricts development of structures and requested story poles be erected to understand the grading and the height of the home.
- 5) Pat Brodie, landscape designer representing the Shands, observed a large amount of grading and plant removal on the site. She requested there be a new survey showing the existing elevation of the grade. She expressed concerns regarding the size of the second story roof deck, the preservation of the dark sky neighborhood, and the mitigation of landscaping. She also requested story poles be erected to show the impact of the view corridor.
- 6) Bert McCormack, neighbor south of the project, mentioned a previous incident regarding fungus formed around underground water damage and was concerned that the new construction may cause a similar situation. Another major concern was the earthquake fault along the property. He stated that adhering to the deed restrictions after the lot split were intended to regulate elevations and the distance to build along the property line.
- 7) Susan Shand, neighbor at 612 Alston Road, expressed concerns with the size and mass of the property, and the existing grading. She paraphrased a letter from Kathy Marvin, a neighbor of the project, who found the home to be extremely large in comparison to the neighborhood and requested a site visit be conducted to see the magnitude of the project.
- 8) Derek Westen, attorney at law representing a majority of the neighbors, spoke on the concerns of the natural grade being modified and the incompatibility of the home to the neighborhood; requested story poles be erected to understand the many impacts to the neighboring homes. He mentioned the restrictions of the recorded easement and how the neighbors find the proposal to be inappropriate, and needing to be restudied.

Letters of expressed concerns from Susan and Bobby Shand, Bert and Mary McCormack, Helgi Goppelt, Elizabeth Saghi, John and Barbara Ireland, Kathy and John Marvin, Vicki Klassen, and Susan Butcher were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:25 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board recommends an alternate design to be consistent with a stated architectural style.
- 2) The plate heights, specifically on the second floor level, are not to exceed 8' in height.
- 3) The site and floor plan must be consistent with the Planning Commission requirements; the footprint needs to parallel to the contour lines.
- 4) Provide a site survey prior and subsequent to the existing grading, including all existing trees.
- 5) Provide sections through the site at an eighth inch scale to include elevations of adjoining homes bordering the neighborhood.
- 6) Provide a delineated roof plan.
- 7) Study the window fenestrations to be consistent with the architectural style.
- 8) Provide a preliminary landscaping plan.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 210 LA VISTA GRANDE****E-1 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-130-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00452
 Owner: David V. Rossi
 Architect: John Beauchamp

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story, 1,644 square foot single-family residence and a 352 square foot attached two-car garage and construct a new two-level, 3,300 square foot single-family residence with an attached 486 square foot two-car garage. Also proposed are a total of 1,270 square feet of lower and upper level rear and side yard decks. The proposed total of 3,786 square feet of development on a 19,894 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 86% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00242.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 4:50 p.m.

Present: John Beauchamp, Architect; and David Rossi, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:10 p.m.

- 1) Charles Curtis, neighbor at 1515 Knoll Circle, is opposed to a second story as his current views will be obstructed and will set a precedent in a neighborhood of single stories. He mentioned how the overgrown trees added to his concerns over view blockage.
- 2) Kevin White requested that story poles be erected to understand the severity of the project in relation to the neighborhood. He was concerned that the final grading would cause an increase in plate height and expressed how the flat roof would be similar to an airline runway.
- 3) Timothy Wilde stated that the project did not meet the Good Neighbor guidelines since it did not take into consideration the impact of the neighbors' current views. He requested that the plate heights be reduced and the foundation lowered, especially surrounding the views to the ocean, and that story poles be erected.
- 4) David Nordahl mentioned how the size and mass of the building were not compatible with the neighborhood and would impact the surrounding neighbors, specifically concerning their views. He requested that story poles be erected to identify how the impact would affect those walking and driving along the neighborhood.

Letters of support from Diana Buzerak, Helene Segal, Janet and Bob Kates, Melissa Christou, Ray and Virginia Ketzler, Cynthia and Ted Martin, Sue and John Burk, and Patricia Hauptman were acknowledged. Letters of concerns from David and Sandy Nordahl, Robert and Carol Thompson, Timothy Wilde and Caro Creighton, Kevin and Pegeen White, and Sue Butcher.

Public comment closed at 5:25 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant's efforts in working with the neighbors.
- 2) Provide cross sections from various view points.
- 3) The style of architecture is compatible with the neighborhood.
- 4) Provide a roof color and details of the fascia.
- 5) Study softening the look of the house with landscaping and utilizing an appropriate color scheme.

- 6) Reduce the lighthouse effect to north of the project along La Vista Grande.
- 7) Study lowering the finished floor at the highest level of house to 14 1/2'.
- 8) Provide a preliminary landscape plan, showing existing and proposed planting.
- 9) Study the rear deck off the master bedroom to follow the 15' distance guideline.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Miller opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 406 N ONTARE RD

E-2/SD-2 Zone

(5:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-151-012

Application Number: MST2015-00471

Owner: Carolina N. Pizarro

Architect: Koffka - Phakos Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,291 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached garage and construct a new 3,601 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 567 square foot three-car garage and 534 square feet of habitable space above it. Also proposed are a swimming pool, patios, site walls, landscaping, and a total of 187 cubic yards of cut grading, of which 179 cubic feet will be under the residence and 8 will be under the pool. The proposed total of 4,702 square feet on a 21,524 square foot lot is 100% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Review of this project has been postponed at the applicant's request.)

Project has been postponed at the applicant's request.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:07 P.M. ****