



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

**Monday, September 21, 2015**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **3:00 P.M.**

---

**BOARD MEMBERS:**                      FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*  
  BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*  
  BERNI BERNSTEIN  
  JOSEPH MOTICHA  
  LISA JAMES  
  JAIME PIERCE  
  DENISE WOOLERY

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**      DALE FRANCISCO  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**      ADDISON THOMPSON  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE):**      MIKE JORDAN

**STAFF:**                      JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor  
  DAVID ENG, Planning Technician  
  AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov)**

---

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos).

#### **CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

#### **ATTENDANCE:**

Members present:                      Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein (until 6:48 p.m.), James (until 5 p.m.), Moticha, Pierce (3:04 p.m.), and Woolery.  
Members absent:                      None.  
Staff present:                              Limón, Eng, and Flemmings.

#### **GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A.      Public Comment:

No public comment.

B.      Approval of the minutes:

Motion:                      Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of September 8, 2015, as submitted.

Action:                      Miller/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained, Pierce absent).

## C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **September 14, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Moticha/Woolery.

Action: James/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **September 21, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Moticha/Woolery.

Action: Miller/James, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

No announcements.

## E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

**DISCUSSION ITEM****1. AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF ARCHITECTS (ArchitecTours)**

**(3:10)** Staff: Christopher Mason-Hing (AIA)

(The American Institute of Architects – Santa Barbara Chapter announces the annual ArchitecTours held on October 3, 2015, with the theme ‘Architecture with a Story’ featuring nine projects with intriguing personal stories of the design obstacles encountered during the processing and building phases.)

Actual time: 3:06 p.m.

Present: Christopher Mason-Hing (AIA).

Public comment opened at 3:08 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Presentation held.**

**FINAL REVIEW****2. 324 SHERMAN RD****A-1 Zone**

**(3:15)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 019-050-006  
 Application Number: MST2015-00003  
 Owner: Appelbaum-Shapiro Living Trust  
 Designer: Amy Von Protz  
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC

(Proposal to construct a new 2,301 square foot , two-story, single-family residence with an attached 419 square foot, two-car garage, and a 283 square feet of raised wood decks. The proposal will replace a 1,775 square foot residence and 422 two-car garage that were destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposed total of 2,720 square feet on a 14,395 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 64% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications to allow additions in the front and interior setbacks.)

**(Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Resolution No. 026-15. Project was last reviewed on June 15, 2015.)**

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Designer; and Jarrett Gorin, Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Final Approval with comments:**

- 1) The project is consistent with the character of the neighborhood, and compatible in size, bulk and scale.
- 2) The quality of architecture and materials is acceptable.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Miller opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

**3. 1542 CLIFF DR**

**E-3 Zone**

**(3:35)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-170-002  
Application Number: MST2015-00409  
Owner: Michael Kinderman  
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to construct a new concrete wall and wooden privacy screen with a combined height of 21 feet tall in the rear yard of an existing single-family residence. The proposed wall and screen will be adjacent to an existing 8 foot tall retaining wall to remain. The project also includes a new retractable awning on wire cables in a courtyard in the rear yard.)

**(Third concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was referred from Consent on September 8, 2015.)**

Actual time: 3:28 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; and Marie Kinderman, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m.

- 1) Janet Napier, adjacent neighbor, explained previous impacts to her views from a previously over-height ficus hedge on the subject property and the City's role in having it trimmed. She expressed opposition of the proposed 21 foot tall wooden privacy screen and felt it would be incompatible with the Mesa neighborhood architecture.
- 2) Connard Hogan, adjacent neighbor, expressed concerns that the wooden privacy wall was excessive and not compatible with neighborhood architecture. He felt that the proposal would create a vertical canyon effect on his property and would set a negative precedent for the neighborhood. He also suggested that there were other creative solutions that would be more acceptable.

Letters of expressed concerns from Janet Napier and Connard Hogan were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:55 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the project as presented? 2/5/0 (failed).

**Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board understands the need for a privacy solution between neighbors; however continued development of a design solution that includes architectural and landscaping elements.

Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****4. 1534 LA CORONILLA DR****E-1 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-301-008  
 Application Number: MST2015-00373  
 Owner: ELK Trust  
 Architect: Pacific Architects, Inc.

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,967 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an attached two-car garage and construct a new 3,919 square foot, two-story single-family residence with a 217 square foot, partially enclosed lanai, and a 498 square foot, attached two-car garage. The project includes new landscaping, hardscape, and an in-ground spa. The proposal of 4,417 square feet of development on an 18,282 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 100% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Second concept review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on August 24, 2015.)**

Actual time: 4:36 p.m.

Board member Bernstein stepped down from the project since an associate of the La Mesa Neighborhood Association submitted a letter of concerns.

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; and Layla Khashoggi, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:01 p.m.

- 1) Hans Meisner, adjacent neighbor, stated that the proposal was too big relative to the size of the lot and that the project's high FAR was in the minority in the neighborhood. He requested an FAR study of the 20 closest homes and that story poles be erected. He questioned if the grading and new landscaping would affect the hillside and expressed concern over possible construction traffic.
- 2) Cathie McCammon, adjacent neighbor, was concerned with size, bulk, and scale of the project and the glare from the many glass windows. She requested there be an FAR study of the 20 closest homes and that story poles be erected to show the impact on adjacent homes.
- 3) Lee Howland stated that the loss of her views due to the project would devalue her home. She was concerned with the "lighthouse effect" of the project's many glass windows, the potential hazard of a brush fires caused by socialization and possibly smoking at the rear patio, and that the 100% FAR exceeded most homes in the area.

Letters of expressed concerns from Hans Meisner, Roxana and Fred Anson, Cathie McCammon, Karen Bridgeman, and Tim Putz were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:09 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, quality of architecture and materials, and adherence to good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) The FAR is acceptable relative to the outline of house being compatible with neighboring homes in context of the footprint.
- 3) Any paving or hardscape over the sewer easement will require review and approval by Public Works.

Action: Moticha/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein stepped down, James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **5. 969 ISLETA AVE**

**E-1 Zone**

**(4:40)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-253-019  
 Application Number: MST2015-00393  
 Owner: Crissman Trust  
 Applicant: Patrick Marr

(Proposal for a 290 square foot first-floor addition, a 576 square foot second-story addition, a 48 square foot second-floor deck, a new entry deck and stairs, removal of an unpermitted shade structure and water heater, and interior remodel of an existing 1,262 square foot single-family residence with an attached 384 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes removal of two interior posts in the garage. The proposed total of 2,512 square feet on an 8,134 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 78% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal addresses violations associated with Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00257. This project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a front setback and two interior setback modifications.)

**(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)**

Actual time: 5:33 p.m.

Present: Patrick Marr, Applicant; and Paul and Pat Crissman, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:45 p.m.

- 1) Michael Ressler, neighbor, expressed concerns regarding possible obstruction of his views by the second story elevations.

Public comment closed at 5:49 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board appreciates the style of architecture and the applicant's efforts in addressing view concerns with the adjacent neighbor.
- 2) Study an alternative to the window on the south elevation on the second story.
- 3) The Board finds that the cable railings and the size of the patio are appropriate to the style of architecture.
- 4) The Board finds the modifications aesthetically appropriate and do not pose consistency issues with the guidelines.
- 5) Provide photos of the neighboring views.
- 6) Provide a landscape plan for the area around the front entry.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Pierce opposed, James absent).

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **6. 941 MEDIO RD**

**E-1 Zone**

**(5:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-321-016  
 Application Number: MST2015-00344  
 Owner: Robert and Grace Gulock Revocable Trust  
 Architect: Anders Troedsson

(Proposal to demolish 16 square feet of an existing 1,215 square foot single-family residence and all of an existing 331 square foot detached garage. The proposal will add 1,278 square feet to the existing residence, including 208 square feet to the existing 77 square foot basement, and includes a new 419 square foot attached two-car garage. Also proposed are a new CMU equipment enclosure, new CMU retaining walls, new fencing, a new trash enclosure, and a new swimming pool with a new pool deck, 244 cubic yards of cut and fill grading outside of the building footprint, and restoration of a historic sandstone cap and pier wall on the property. The project will address violations identified in a Zoning Information Report (ZIR2014-00443). The proposed total of 3,181 square feet of development on a 10,690 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 83% of the required guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). An Administrative Exception is requested to allow a fence and wall to exceed 3-1/2 feet in height within 10 feet of the front lot line. In addition, Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications for additions and alterations to the dwelling, for the garage, swimming pool and pool equipment within required front setbacks.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)**

Actual time: 6:01 p.m.

Present: Anders Troedsson, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:15 p.m.

- 1) Timothy Gozzano, adjacent neighbor, expressed support for the project's single-story design on the small lot and its consistency with the neighborhood. He stated it would be difficult to fit a two car garage on a corner lot.

Letters of expressed concerns from Stephanie Moret and Wendy Edmunds regarding the conservation of the historic wall and the removal of the vegetation from the wall were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:21 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The overall floor plan layout is acceptable.
- 2) The Board supports the modifications for the pool fence, the new location of garage, and the additions in the front yard setbacks.
- 3) Provide a detailed rendering of the elevations to show the stonework, the window placement and fenestration, the roofing material, and the building configuration in context with its surroundings.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **7. 920 MISSION RIDGE RD**

**A-1 Zone**

**(5:50)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-032-012  
 Application Number: MST2015-00398  
 Architect: The Schmandt Group  
 Owner: Gregory Schmandt

(Proposal for a 579 square foot single-story addition to an existing 1,772 square foot, two-level residence with an attached 562 square foot, two-car garage on the lower level. The project includes a new permeable flagstone patio and 45 cubic yards of grading under the building footprint and 15 cubic yards of grading outside of it. The proposed total of 2,931 square feet of development on a 1-acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 59% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)**

Actual time: 6:48 p.m.

Present: Gregory Schmandt, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:52 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to Consent with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the architecture and its compatibility to the neighborhood.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/James absent).

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:54 P.M. \*\***