



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, June 15, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 LISA JAMES
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Bernstein, Moticha, Pierce, and Woolery.
Members absent: Miller and James.
Staff present: Limón, Eng, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **June 1, 2015**, as submitted.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/James absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **June 8, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Sweeney/Pierce.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/James absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **June 15, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Sweeney/Pierce.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/James absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

No announcements.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee Reports.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**1. 25 CONEJO RD****A-1 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-031-026

Application Number: MST2015-00262

Owner: Vanowen Holdings, LLC

Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to add 186 square feet of main- and lower-floor additions to an existing 6,809 square foot, two-level, single-family residence. The proposal includes reconstructing an existing 961 square foot elevated deck on the main level with an additional 587 square feet. The project includes the replacement of doors and windows of the same size in existing locations, and interior work that includes the demolition of a 370 square foot loft, new internal stairs, and remodel. The proposed total of 6,623 on a 2 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 120% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) and will result in a net reduction of 184 square feet to the residence.)

(Second concept review. Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project was referred from Consent Calendar on June 8, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:10 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:20 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the front entry door and a design solution to provide protection from the elements.
- 2) Reduce square footage of the main level deck.
- 3) Study the support arches under the main level deck.
- 4) Provide a color board.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/James absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 324 SHERMAN RD****A-1 Zone**

(3:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-050-006
 Application Number: MST2015-00003
 Owner: Appelbaum-Shapiro Living Trust
 Designer: Amy Von Protz
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC

(Proposal to construct a new 2,301 square foot , two-story, single-family residence with an attached 419 square foot, two-car garage, and a 283 square feet of raised wood decks. The proposal will replace a 1,775 square foot residence and 422 two-car garage that were destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposed total of 2,720 square feet on a 14,395 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 64% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications to allow additions in the front and interior setbacks.)

(Fourth concept review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 026-15. Project was last reviewed on June 1, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:32 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Designer; and Jarrett Gorin, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:45 p.m.

- 1) Charli Calisti asked for clarification on the type of chimney and fireplace proposed, to which the applicant responded that it would be a gas fireplace. Mr. Calisti thanked the Board and the applicant for responding to his previous concerns. He noted that the west elevation windows have since doubled in size since the last review and asked for continued consideration of his privacy. After the close of public comment, Mr. Calisti asked the applicant whether existing screening landscaping along his property would be preserved, to which the applicant responded that he is willing to preserve it.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the revisions and direction of the revised design.
- 2) Study the structural feasibility of the main floor windows on the north elevation.
- 3) Study increasing the pitch of the narrow span of roofing between the main and upper levels on the north and west elevations to 4:12.
- 4) Study reducing the size of the windows on west elevation at the main floor bedroom (Bedroom #1) and the upstairs bathroom (Bathroom #2).
- 5) So that the relatively thin window frames of the proposed windows show better on the facades, provide a color board with proposing a darker, or at least cream colored, stucco.
- 6) Provide photos of adjacent properties to show how proposed colors relate to those on neighboring homes.
- 7) Provide a landscape plan that includes the area downslope, and shows the existing oleander and pittosporum located along the neighbor's property.

- 8) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and adherence to good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. Miller/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 133 W MOUNTAIN DR

A-1 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-061-024
 Application Number: MST2015-00148
 Designer: Native Son Design Studio
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC
 Owner: Brad Hasse

(Proposal to construct a new 2,347 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 600 square foot, two-car garage and a 524 square foot workshop. The project includes a new driveway and one uncovered guest parking space, a covered patio, and upper level deck. The proposed total of 3,471 square feet on a 3.1 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 58% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second concept review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines §15183 Exemption (Projects Consistent with the General Plan). Project was last reviewed on May 4, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:18 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Applicant; Chris Cottrell, Architect; and Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:28 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.

Action: Woolery/Pierce, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 1302 SAN MIGUEL AVE****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-042-007
Application Number: MST2015-00221
Owner: Ethan Franklin
Architect: Chris Manson-Hing

(Proposal for 377 square feet of additions to an existing 1,473 single-single family residence with an attached two-car garage on a lower level. The project includes demolition of an existing front entry cover and concrete patio, a new wood deck at the front entry, new terraced planters, a remodeled deck and new railings above the garage, new doors and windows, and a new metal standing seam roof. The proposed total of 1,850 square feet on a 6,418 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 66% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for alterations in the front setback.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

Actual time: 4:37 p.m.

Present: Chris Manson-Hing, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:52 p.m.

- 1) Ron Nichols, adjacent neighbor, expressed support for the project and the garage windows proposed for the existing blank garage wall.

Public comment closed at 4:53 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board can support the additions and changes, including the proposed garage windows in the front setback.
- 2) The majority of the Board members are hesitant to approve the glass garage doors due to potential light pollution impacts.
- 3) Provide alternative solutions and give additional information on the proposed bronze glass.
- 4) The landscape plan is appropriate.
- 5) Provide a lighting plan for the exterior.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/James absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 240 EUCALYPTUS HILL DR****A-2 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-050-025
 Application Number: MST2014-00548
 Owner: Clay Tedeschi Trust
 Architect: Dennis Thompson
 Engineer: Mitch Perkins
 Contractor: J. Fenske Construction, Inc.

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for 1,423 square feet of first- and second-floor additions and an interior remodel to an existing two-story, 4,845 square foot single-family residence with a detached 403 square foot two-car garage with 468 square feet of accessory space above. The proposed total of 7,139 square feet on a 2.9 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 118% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project has been revised to omit a new 449 square foot two-car garage and will no longer require a front setback modification.)

(Second concept review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on December 1, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:11 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson and Jeff King, Architects; and Clay Tedeschi, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with comments:

- 1) Provide color board and details.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and adherence to good neighbor guidelines.
- 3) The Board recognizes the large lot size of the property.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:22 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 5:40 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW**6. 1912 MISSION RIDGE RD****A-1 Zone**

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-083-021
 Application Number: MST2014-00585
 Owner: Craig Morrison
 Applicant: Jeff Shelton

(Proposal for a 22 square foot first-floor addition and a 530 square foot second-floor addition to an existing 2,120 square foot one-story, single-family residence with an attached 579 square foot garage. The proposal includes one new uncovered parking space, a 194 square foot covered patio at the entry, a 158 square foot second-story deck, a raised pool and surrounding deck, and interior remodel work. It also includes permitting an "as-built" air conditioning condenser unit, relocation of the pool equipment enclosure, and new pedestrian and driveway gates. The proposed total of 3,251 square feet on a 25,091 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 69% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00157.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on January 26, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:40 p.m.

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect; and Craig Morrison, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:55 p.m.

- 1) Rinaldo Brutoco, adjacent neighbor, appreciated the architect's changes to the balcony above the garage. Mr. Brutoco also expressed concerns on behalf of himself and the Bedfords who live south of the project regarding potential drainage impacts and the lack of information on plans to inform a discussion about this. He stated that he echoes the concerns presented by Trevor Martinson, is concerned about the Board's lack of consideration to privacy issues, and noted the short notice on review of the project.
- 2) Trevor Martinson, neighbor in close proximity, raised concerns about the noticing for the review and requested a two week postponement to respond to the concerns in his letter.
- 3) Stephanie Bacon, adjacent neighbor, expressed concerns regarding privacy from windows proposed in the project.

A letter of expressed concerns submitted by Trevor Martinson, neighbor in close proximity, was not submitted until the start of the meeting and the Board allowed twenty minutes for overview by the Board members.

Public comment closed at 6:02 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with comments:

- 1) The Board has reviewed the redesign of the eaves and finds it acceptable.
- 2) The new design of the windows on the north elevation, at the master bedroom, meets the Board's guidelines for privacy. The Board acknowledges the architect's efforts to raise the sill of the windows to five feet to ensure the privacy of the neighbors.
- 3) The Board has reevaluated the design of the balcony on the west elevation, and seeing that its design with fixed planters will prevent occupants from stepping out onto it, the Board finds that the design will ensure privacy for the neighborhood.

Action: Woolery/Pierce, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed, Miller/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 251 LA MARINA DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(6:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-161-008
Application Number: MST2014-00583
Owner: Navid Eskandari
Architect: Alan McLeod
Applicant: Lauren Anderson

(This is a revised project description to reconfigure and reduce the square footage of the proposal. Proposal for a 500 square foot first-floor addition and new 650 square foot second story on an existing 800 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with a 250 square foot, attached one-car garage. The project includes demolition of 93 square feet and conversion of 157 square feet of the existing garage into first-floor habitable space. A new 448 square foot, attached, two-car garage will be constructed. The project also includes a new driveway, curb cut, and 20 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. The proposed total of 2,555 square feet of development on a 6,000 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 95% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested modification to allow an addition in the required side yard setback.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

Actual time: 6:20 p.m.

Present: Alan McLeod, Architect; Lauren Anderson, Applicant; and Navid Eskandari, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:26 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board supports the two-foot encroachment in the side yard setback.
- 2) The design of the second story and addition are compatible with the neighborhood.
- 3) The 95% FAR is acceptable considering the quality design of the remodel.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/James absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:37 P.M. ****

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by **Fred Sweeney** and **Jaime Pierce**.

CONTINUED ITEM**A. 1314 HILLCREST RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-111-005
 Application Number: MST2015-00254
 Owner: Kimbrough Living Trust
 Applicant: Russ Banko
 Engineer: Perkins Engineering

(Proposal to convert an existing 471 square foot, attached two-car garage into habitable space and construct a 108 square foot addition and new 400 square foot , attached two-car garage at an existing 2,435 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes replacement of some concrete paving. The proposed total of 2,943 square feet on a 23,087 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 63% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Tier 3 SWMP prior to Final Approval.)

Final Approval with condition:

- 1) Demonstrate compliance with Storm Water Management Program on plans.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 947 CARRILLO RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-262-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00091
 Owner: Mary Ellen Broeffle
 Applicant: Brandon Broeffle
 Designer: Erick Molinar

(Proposal to construct a 400 gross square foot, one-story accessory building in the rear yard of an existing 1,517 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 208 square foot one-car garage. The proposed total of 2,125 square feet of development on a, 8,256 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 66% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Continued indefinitely to Consent.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 1417 SAN MIGUEL AVE****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-132-006
 Application Number: MST2015-00263
 Owner: Gott Family Trust
 Designer: Don Swann

(Proposal to construct a new 262 square foot, upper level, covered wood deck at the rear of an existing 1,513 square foot single family residence.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued two weeks to Full Board.

NEW ITEM**D. 1510 LA VISTA DEL OCEANO DR****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-170-016
 Application Number: MST2015-00278
 Owner: Paul D. and Julie Edgar
 Architect: Nick Braybrooke

(Proposal to remove three windows and a door on an existing single-family residence in the Hillside Design District and replace these with two new Milgard fiberglass windows and one aluminum clad window. The surrounding stucco will be patched to match the existing finish on the residence.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) Provide a color and materials board.
- 2) Provide construction details for the proposed windows.
- 3) Provide a materials sample of the fiberglass window.

NEW ITEM**E. 118 LA VISTA GRANDE****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-083-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00281
 Owner: Christopher Lloyd
 Architect: Michael Stroh

(Proposal for new masonry retaining walls to replace a failing wall in the rear yard of an existing 1,239 square foot single-family residence in the Hillside Design District. A new detached trellis, fire pit gas feed, landscaping, site steps, and site lighting are proposed. The project includes 30 cubic yards of cut grading to be balanced on site.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.