



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 20, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

- FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
- BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
- BERNI BERNSTEIN
- LISA JAMES
- JAIME PIERCE
- DENISE WOOLERY
- JIM ZIMMERMAN

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
- DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
- AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James, and Pierce.
Members absent: Woolery and Zimmerman.
Staff present: Eng, Limón, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **October 6, 2014**, as submitted.

Action: James/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery/Zimmerman absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **October 13, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Pierce/Sweeney.
- Action: Miller/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery/Zimmerman absent).
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **October 20, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Pierce/Sweeney.
- Action: Pierce/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery/Zimmerman absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Mr. Eng announced that Board members Zimmerman and Woolery will be absent from the meeting. Additionally, the applicant for Item #3, 30 Camino Alto, had withdrawn their application and the project would not be reviewed.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee Reports.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**1. 511 BROSIAN WAY****A-1/SD-3 Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-030-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00149
 Owner: John Park
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to construct a 5,888 square foot, single-story residence with lofted bedroom space, an attached three-car garage, and two-car uncovered parking on a vacant 2.2 acre lot. The proposal includes an outdoor pool and spa, landscaping, and 510 cubic yards of cut grading and, 3,870 cubic yards of fill grading. The proposed total of 5,888 square feet of development in the Hillside Design District and both the appealable and non-appealable jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone is 104% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio. This project includes Planning Commission Review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit. Project was last reviewed on June 16, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:10 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Jeff Hornbuckle, Architects; John Park, Owner; and Tony Boughman, Case Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:18 p.m.

- 1) Robert Forouzandeh, immediate neighbor to the south, spoke in support of the size, height, and style of the project as being appropriate for the neighborhood.
- 2) Dawn Woods, immediate neighbor to the northwest, spoke in support of the height, and the project.
- 3) David Young, immediate neighbor to the west, spoke in support of the project.
- 4) Tom Evans, immediate neighbor to the west, expressed support for the project and appreciated that the applicant responded to his concerns about the height, the setback, and the lighting issues.

A letter in support of the project from Rosa Choi and Richard Chung was acknowledged. Letters of

expressed concerns from Lori Rafferty, The Foleys, and Bob Bowski were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:34 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) In general, the Board finds the project to be compatible regarding size, bulk and scale as it relates to the site and the neighborhood.
- 2) Study “smart” glazing for the clerestory windows.
- 3) Study an undulating design for the fence along Brosian Way, giving consideration to landscaping in the foreground and background this area.
- 4) Study the roof color, considering its visibility from the neighbors.
- 5) Specify the variety of Ceanothus on the landscape plan.

Action: James/Pierce, 3/2/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Bernstein opposed, Woolery/Zimmerman absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 1117 LAS ALTURAS RD

A-1 Zone

(3:55) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 019-113-022
 Application Number: MST2014-00223
 Agent: Jessica Harlin
 Owner: Doll Family Trust

(Proposal for a 16 x 68 foot lap pool with associated retaining walls, pool equipment, and fencing in the rear yard of single-family residence in the Hillside Design District. The proposal also includes a six foot tall privacy wall, patio, landscaping, and 238.5 cubic yards of grading, of which 175.5 will be exported off-site. This project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Applicant is requesting an exception to the fence and screen height standards per SBMC 28.87.170. Determination required for consistency with neighborhood character. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Resolution No. 024-14. Project was last reviewed on September 22, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:14 p.m.

Present: Jessica Harlin, Designer; Trish Allen, Senior Planner; David Doll, Owner; and Michelle Bedard, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:26 p.m.

- 1) Gil Garcia, speaking for Penny True, expressed concerns regarding the drip line along the retaining wall.
- 2) Edward Gastaldo expressed concerns regarding the possible damage to the oak tree in relation to the retaining wall.
- 3) Everett Woody expressed concerns regarding the drip line along the retaining wall in addition to the root damage along the wall.

A letter of support from Simon Clark was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:32 p.m.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:**

- 1) Provide a section for the structural detail along the westerly native boulder retaining wall on sheet P1.0 of the plans.
- 2) The Board requests an assessment be made if the oak tree were to perish during construction of the retaining wall.
- 3) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 4) The southerly edge condition of the pool presented without the infinity is acceptable.
- 5) The gravel walkway material on the westerly side of the pool is acceptable.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (James opposed, Woolery/Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

3. 30 CAMINO ALTO

A-1 Zone

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-130-028
 Application Number: MST2011-00215
 Owner: David Darren Long
 Architect: ARCHart, Inc.
 Applicant: Manuel Contreras

(Proposal to construct a new three-level 3,699 square foot residence, including a 518 square foot two-car garage, located on a 23,091 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous home was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. The proposed total of 3,699 square feet, located on a 23,091 square foot lot, is 79% of the guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR).)

(Review After Final is requested for replacement of proposed cable railing with glass railing at the rear deck. Project was referred from Consent Calendar on October 13, 2014.)

***** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN. *****

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**4. 1517 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-182-007
 Application Number: MST2013-00219
 Owner: Leatherman Family Trust
 Applicant: Amy Von Protz
 Contractor: David DeLorie

(Proposal to expand an existing 95 square foot second-story deck by 97 square feet and add a new exterior spiral stair case. The proposed new 192 square foot second-story deck is located at the rear of the existing 1,588 square foot, two-story single-family residence, located on a 4,902 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District and within the appealable jurisdiction of the coastal zone. The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(Review After Final is requested to remove a proposed exterior spiral staircase and to replace wooden picket railing with glass railing on the proposed upper-level deck addition at the south elevation. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 034-14. Project was referred from Consent on October 6, 2014)

Actual time: 4:55 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Designer; David DeLorie, Contractor; and Russell Leatherman, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:04 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with comments:

- 1) The Board made the neighborhood compatibility findings based on the limited amount of glazing, and the limited visual impact of glass railings due to their location at the rear of the home and in an area heavily screened by vegetation.
- 2) The Board also finds the glass railings do not adversely impact the architecture of the home.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed, Woolery/Zimmerman absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 1225 MANITOU LN****R-1 Zone**

(5:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-010-036
 Application Number: MST2014-00463
 Owner: Trent Baer
 Applicant: Robert Dawson

(Proposal for a new 629 square foot pool and 38 square foot spa with associated pool equipment, fencing, and patio in the rear yard of a single-family residence in the Hillside Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was referred from Consent Calendar on October 6, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:17 p.m.

Present: Bob Dawson, Contractor.

Public comment opened at 5:24 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:

- 1) Clarify the materials to be used around the pool on sheet A5.
- 2) Provide scales and scalable drawings on plans.
- 3) Specify a pathway to the pool.
- 4) Provide an overhead satellite map of the adjacent homes, showing property lines.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Woolery abstained. Woolery/Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

6. 2405 STATE ST

E-3 Zone

(5:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-071-012
 Application Number: MST2014-00418
 Owner: Dan Underwood
 Architect: Bill Wolf

(Proposal to construct a 2,101 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an attached 505 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes a new driveway, walkways, curb cut, patios, site walls, and fencing, an outdoor fireplace, and the removal of front setback trees. The proposed total of 2,606 square feet on a vacant lot is 85% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on October 6, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:37 p.m.

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect; and Dan Underwood, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:45 p.m.

- 1) Jim Arnesen, adjacent neighbor, spoke in opposition to the project, stating that the garage should be relocated to the rear of the property to be consistent with the existing homes in the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 5:46 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the efforts the architect has taken to reduce the square footage and the overall height of the building.
- 2) The Board appreciates pulling back the elevation on the south side.
- 3) The Board can support the style, size, and location of the property.
- 4) The Board looks forward to seeing the details and further resolution regarding the two bunia-bunia trees.
- 5) The Board prefers that the driveway remain in its current location to conform to neighboring properties.

- 6) The Board suggests that the driveway entry to the south side is a better solution to lower the finished grade of the home to protect the bunia-bunia trees.
- Action: Miller/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery/Zimmerman absent).

***** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:05 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:11 P.M. *****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 456 CONEJO RD

A-1 Zone

(6:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-061-036
 Application Number: MST2014-00491
 Owner: Bradley Vernon
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to construct a new single-family dwelling unit on a vacant lot. The previous dwelling unit was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The project will comprise a two-story, 1,899 square foot dwelling unit with an adjacent 2-car uncovered parking area and exterior covered and uncovered decks and patios. The existing driveway will be re-used and grading will be balanced on site with 25 cubic yards of excavation and 25 cubic yards of fill dirt. The proposed total of 1,899 square feet on an 8,430 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 58% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:11 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect; and Jessica Harlin, Designer.

Public comment opened at 6:24 p.m.

- 1) Brian Milburn expressed concerns regarding the visual impact of the project in relation to his views.

Public comment closed at 6:26 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board asks the applicant to reconsider the style, design, glass, and other materials of the project to be more compatible with the neighboring homes.
- 2) Provide larger photos of the adjacent homes.

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery/Zimmerman absent).

***** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:40 P.M. *****

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by **Jaime Pierce** and **Fred Sweeney**.

FINAL REVIEW**A. 296 SCHULTE LN****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-230-004
Application Number: MST2013-00406
Owner: Stone 2000 Family Trust
Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal to construct a 4,697 square foot, two-story single-family residence, with an attached 506 square foot, two-car garage. The proposal includes an attached, 363 square foot accessory structure, a detached 300 square foot storage building, site walls, two uncovered parking spaces, and 852 cubic yards of grading. The proposed development of 4,652 square feet on a 2.18 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 83% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Planning Commission review to revise the grading/building footprint.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program and requires a 3-star rating with Built Green Santa Barbara. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 009-14.)

Project was continued one week to Consent.

NEW ITEM**B. 830 NORMAN LN****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-110-020
Application Number: MST2014-00501
Owner: David & Caroline Wicht
Contractor: Troy Lobdell

(Proposal to reroof shake tiles on an existing single-family residence in the Hillside Design District with ClayLite S-tile. The reroof will incorporate two-piece mission clay tiles at the eaves and booster tiles throughout the field and ridge.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project was continued indefinitely to Consent with the following comments:

- 1) The proposal meets the design guideline criteria for S-tile roofs and the roof is not in a highly visible location.
- 2) However, the Board does not find the Spanish tile style of roof to be compatible with the architecture of the residence and encouraged the applicant to consider an alternative to the roof material.