



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, August 11, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY
 JIM ZIMMERMAN

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James, Pierce, Woolery, and Zimmerman.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Eng, Limón, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **July 28, 2014**, as submitted.

Action: Bernstein/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **August 11, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by James/Sweeney, except Item A was reviewed by Sweeney.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

No announcements.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

The New Zoning Ordinance subcommittee will meet on September 8, 2014 at 2:00 p.m.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**1. 3435 MARINA DR****A-1/SD-3 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-022-005

Application Number: MST2013-00281

Owner: Charles Rudd

Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a 5,990 square foot, three-level, single-family residence, comprised of two-stories and a basement, and a 440 square foot two-car garage, located on a vacant 1.12 acre lot in the Hillside Design District and within the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes, new site walls and gates, new site landscaping and hardscape, a new pool. 2,150 cubic yards of cut and fill grading are proposed, with 12 cubic yards to be exported off site. The proposed total of 6,430 square feet (of which 5,210 is above grade) is 103% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit. The project was last reviewed on December 16, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Board member Miller stepped down.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect; Allison DeBusk, Project Planner; and Addison Thompson, Planning Commissioner.

Public comment opened at 3:24 p.m.

- 1) Kitch Wilson, neighbor at 415 Calle Las Caleras, expressed his opposition to the second-story addition and requested that restrictions on plant height be placed as a condition of approval.
- 2) Tom Monroe, representing John Kechejian, neighbor, relayed Mr. Kechejian's support of the second design.
- 3) Patti Monroe, representing Sandy Schoolfield, neighbor, relayed Ms. Schoolfield's support of the second design but would like to minimize the impact of the block wall and plantings along Cliff Drive.
- 4) Beth Collins-Burgard, neighbor at 3354 Cliff Drive, expressed support for the design but requested that the Board consider a more open fencing in place of a block wall that is not compatible with the neighborhood. She also asked the Board to consider minimizing the height of plantings to preserve existing vistas.

- 5) Andrew Gottland, neighbor at 501 Calle Las Caleras, is opposed to the second story.
- 6) Ronald Green, a neighbor at 3424 Marina Drive, is opposed to the two story structure and requested that the Board follow the precedent of previous approvals of single-story homes on neighboring lots to maintain the view corridors and follow the intent of the original subdivision plan.
- 7) Don Santee, a neighbor at 421 Calle Las Caleras, would like to protect view corridors by limiting the structure to a single-story.

A letter in support of the second design from Sandy Schoolfield was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:36 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the efforts made in creating the project.
- 2) Study lowering the plate height of the second floor and/or lowering portions of the house to be closer to the existing grade.
- 3) Provide an alternate design for the front block wall, considering an alternate wall for the pool setting.
- 4) Study the corner landscaping, considering height restrictions on plantings that block the view corridor.
- 5) Provide a detailed landscape plan including species and heights of plants.

Action: Bernstein/Pierce, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Woolery opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 1306 DOVER HILL RD

E-1 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-103-014
 Application Number: MST2014-00350
 Owner: Erik Nickel
 Designer: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal to convert an existing 367 square foot detached two-car garage to habitable accessory space, and construct a new 162 square foot detached one-car garage at the bottom of the property, a new 270 square foot attached one-car garage, and a total of 323 square feet of additions to an existing 1,973 square foot multi-story single-family residence. The proposed total of 3,095 square feet, located on an 18,730 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 70% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is required for requested zoning modifications.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 4:06 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Designer; Erik Nickel and Gibbs Smith, Owners; and Joanne LaConte, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m.

Letters of expressed concerns from Robert Timkin, neighbor, opposed to the conversion of the garage to a livable unit and construction of a single car garage, and Barbara Eliassen, adjacent neighbor at 1308 Dover Hill Rd., suggested that a temporary barrier be placed between the properties to protect her vegetation were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board is not supportive of the one-car garage at the street level.
- 2) The Board finds the location and the change of use appropriate for the accessory building.
- 3) Provide an alternate location for a two-car garage, with consideration given to re-grading the driveway to accommodate the alternate garage location.
- 4) Study front elevations and reduce the colonnade arches on the eastern portion of the home.
- 5) Study reducing the size of the arched windows on the north elevation to be consistent with the other windows on the home.

Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:00 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:09 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 1215 E COTA ST

R-2 Zone

(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-022
 Application Number: MST2014-00310
 Owner: Leslie Marie Colasse
 Architect: Leslie Marie Colasse

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-car garage, mud room, and split-level bedroom at an existing 1,398 square foot two-level residence, and construct a new master suite in the same location above a covered driveway. The proposal also includes a new 650 square foot three-car garage with an attached 300 square foot accessory structure, a kitchen remodel, and exterior improvements. The proposed total of 2,768 square feet on an 11,285 square foot lot is 71% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 5:09 p.m.

Present: Leslie Marie Colasse, Architect and Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:13 p.m.

- 1) Roger Goldtrap, adjacent neighbor, expressed his opposition to the project and requested that the three-car garage and master suite be altered to preserve his views.

Letters of expressed concerns from Roger Goldtrap were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:18 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the sensitivity of the proposal in response the constraints of the existing home.
- 2) Study the arch detail of the driveway cover on the east elevation while ensuring adequate vehicular ingress and egress.
- 3) The Board finds the three car garage and the F.A.R. acceptable.
- 4) Provide a streetscape plan of the property and adjacent homes.

Action: James/Zimmerman, 5/2/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Bernstein opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. 210 PALISADES DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-329-007
 Application Number: MST2014-00348
 Owner: Steve Johnson
 Architect: Warner Young

(Proposal for a minor addition and major exterior façade alterations to an existing single-family residence. The project includes a 63 square foot addition at the rear for a stairway to a new converted living space above an existing attached two-car garage. The proposed total of 3,558 square feet is 99% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) located on a 9,635 square foot parcel. This project addresses violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00018.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:51 p.m.

Present: Warner Young, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:59 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide details of the light fixtures, railings, windows, doors and garage doors.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan for the front yard.

Action: Miller/James, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** DINNER BREAK FROM 6:13 P.M. TO 6:34 P.M. ****

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 1565 LA CORONILLA DR****E-1 Zone**

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-302-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00297
 Owner: Mortgage Deeds, LLC
 Owner: Mark Williams
 Designer: Don Swann

(Proposal to construct a new 2,909 square foot two-story residence with an attached 440 square foot two-car garage. The project includes 374 square feet of decks and a total of 818 cubic yards of cut and fill grading. The proposed total of 3,349 square feet on a 17,646 square foot vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 76% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on July 28, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:34 p.m.

Present: Don Swann, Designer; and Mark Williams, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:42 p.m.

- 1) Cathie McCammon, representing La Mesa Neighborhood Association and Hans Misner, neighbor at 1542 La Coronilla Dr., appreciated the reduction in size of the project.
- 2) Joe Danely, neighbor, spoke in favor of the project.
- 3) John Paullin, adjacent neighbor at 1585 La Coronilla Drive, appreciated the change in the separation between the main house and the garage.
- 4) Paul Straede, neighbor at 1558 La Coronilla Drive, expressed support for the project.

A letter of support from Tim Putz, adjacent neighbor, was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:48 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Provide construction details.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 215 LA JOLLA DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(6:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-363-004
 Application Number: MST2013-00528
 Owner: Frank Bucy
 Architect: David Van Hoy

(Proposal for a major façade and interior remodel to an existing, 1,533 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, including an attached, two-car garage, located on a 6,000 square foot lot within the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes 394 square feet of one-story additions, a new 379 square foot second-story addition, and an 86 square foot, second-level deck. The proposal includes demolition and re-construction of the existing garage to be located within the original building footprint. The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The proposed total of 2,291 square feet is 85% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 013-14. Project was last reviewed on July 28, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:55 p.m.

Present: David Van Hoy, Architect; Marilyn and Frank Bucy, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:21 p.m.

- 1) Marc Chytilo, representing Rhonda Seiter, expressed concerns regarding the light pollution of the window fenestration on the second story in relation to the Douglas Family Preserve. Additionally, he is requesting that the 20 closest homes be evaluated regarding neighborhood compatibility. He also stated that the proposed landscaping would not preserve the privacy of the surrounding homes.
- 2) Reverend David Green requested that the precedent for one-story homes be preserved for the neighborhood.
- 3) Rhonda Seiter, neighbor at 225 La Jolla Drive, stated her privacy is threatened by the addition of the second story.
- 4) Edward Tomeo, neighbor 2547 Medcliff Rd., spoke in favor of the project, stating that the project will be an improvement to the neighborhood.
- 5) Susan Shank, neighbor at 221 Selrose Lane, appreciates the story poles. She spoke in opposition of the second story with regard to it limiting views.
- 6) Felicia Kashevaroff, 2545 Medcliff Rd., spoke in support stating that the project is compatible with the neighborhood and modest in size.
- 7) Cathie McCammon, a representative of La Mesa Neighborhood Association, is concerned with neighborhood compatibility as outlined in the Single Family Residential Design Guidelines.
- 8) Joan Tomeo, neighbor 2547 Medcliff Rd., spoke in support of the project.
- 9) Jeff Barens, neighbor at 2321 Edgewater Way, spoke in support stating the project as being compliant with City regulations and rejected the idea of the neighborhood trying to maintain the tradition of only single-story homes in the area.

Letters of support from Patrick Fearbend, Christina Shades, Pat and Tony Kraydock, Jeff Barens, Karen and Joe Bucannon, Roger Dixon, Noah and Brent Christenson, Mary Richardson, Felicia Kashevaroff, Edward Tomeo, Joan Tomeo, Erica Climperia were acknowledged. A neutral letter from Mark and Victoria Paul was acknowledged. Letters of opposition from Derek Westin, Reverend David Green and Barbara Thornburg Green were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:49 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal.

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 4/3/0. Motion carried. (Pierce/Bernstein/Woolery opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:31 P.M. ****

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by Lisa James and Fred Sweeney, except Item A was reviewed by Fred Sweeney.

FINAL REVIEW**A. 1826 E LAS TUNAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-082-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00002
 Owner: Marilyn Makepeace Revocable Trust
 Architect: Dennis Thompson

(Proposal to construct 791 square foot of one-story additions to an existing 3,272 square foot residence. The project includes the conversion of the existing 657 square foot, detached accessory building (garage and workshop) and 141 square foot breezeway to habitable floor area. The proposal also includes the construction of a new, detached, 564 square foot, two-car garage with roof deck and terrace, new site retaining walls and stairs, and 425 cubic yards of site grading. The proposed total of 3,863 square feet, located on a 20,036 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 83% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Final Approval requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 018-14.)

Final Approval as submitted with comments:

- 1) The Board considered the neighbor's view to the west and found that the proposed garage will not be visible from the neighbor's deck.

NEW ITEM**B. 952 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-242-014
 Application Number: MST2014-00346
 Owner: Gail Fisher Revocable Trust
 Contractor: Scarlett's Landscape

(Proposal to permit an "as-built" counter, barbeque, and hot tub on a 13,403 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The lot, which spans two parcels (APNs 019-252-013 & 019-242-014) is currently developed with an existing 1,347 square foot one-story house with attached two-car garage. Also proposed is the replacement of dryrot-damaged deck and fencing, resurfacing existing CMU walls, new CMU seat walls, and repaving the existing driveway. The proposal will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00220. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Continued to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The Board finds the requested zoning modification aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistent issues with the design guidelines.
- 2) The proposed glass railing is unacceptable and an alternative railing system shall be considered.

NEW ITEM**C. 1111 LAS CANOAS LN A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-090-006
 Application Number: MST2014-00367
 Owner: Christine Morgan
 Contractor: Pintado Pools

(Proposal to construct a new 350 square foot in-ground pool and associated pool equipment in the rear yard of an existing two-story single-family residence in the Hillside Design District. No pool decks and other site work are proposed as part of this application.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

NEW ITEM**D. 835 CENTINELA LN A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-102-026
 Application Number: MST2014-00379
 Owner: Michael E. & Cynthia Murphy
 Architect: Dylan Chappell

(Proposal to remodel an existing 4,114 square foot, one-story single-family residence. The proposal includes exterior alterations to the front entry, roof, rear deck and stair, and a net square footage reduction of 121 square feet. The proposed total of 3,993 of development on a 38,457 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 81% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Study the clerestory windows on the south elevation.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan.

NEW ITEM**E. 709 W CANON PERDIDO ST R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-060-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00377
 Owner: Steve Andre

(Proposal to permit "as-built" wooden fences of up to seven feet tall along the Loma Alta Street, Canon Perdido Street, and Marilla Avenue frontages. The fence requires Administrative Review of Minor Exceptions for fences that exceed three and one half feet tall and are located within 10 feet of a front lot line.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Applicant is requesting an exception to the fence and screen height standards per SBMC 28.87.170. Determination required for consistency with neighborhood character.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and with the following conditions:

- 1) Fill in the gap in the parkway strip adjacent to fences on Loma Alta Drive and Carrillo Street.
- 2) Provide landscaping on the parkway strip in front of the fence on Marilla Avenue.
- 3) Paint the fence to match the existing light forest green color of the fence on Marilla Avenue.
- 4) Applicant to coordinate with staff on disposition of shed in the setback as part of a future proposal.