



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, June 2, 2014

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
BERNI BERNSTEIN
LISA JAMES
JAIME PIERCE
DENISE WOOLERY
JIM ZIMMERMAN

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:08 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James (3:08 p.m. to 6:35 p.m.), Pierce, Woolery, and Zimmerman.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Eng, Limón, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of May 19, 2014, as submitted.

Action: Pierce/James, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **June 2, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Zimmerman/James.

Action: Zimmerman/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Mr. Limon reported that there is a new Community Development Director, George Buell, who will attend the next meeting to introduce himself to the Board.
- b. Chair Sweeney announced his attendance at the annual meeting with the City Attorney, Ariel Calonne. He was informed that there will be new information regarding the speaker slips. Chair Sweeney also revealed if a quorum is lost or a meeting runs too long, the Board has the authority to stop and continue the items at the next full board meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee Reports.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 25 VIA ALICIA****E-1 Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-311-006
 Application Number: MST2014-00111
 Architect: Wade Davis Design
 Owner: Yeoman Trust

(Proposal to construct a 131 square foot addition at the lower level, 215 square feet of additions on the upper level (street grade), a new 126 square foot entry deck, a 260 square foot expansion of the rear deck, and a 390 square foot patio cover over the rear deck on a 16,802 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. The project includes a minor interior remodel. Portions of the additions and the entry deck encroach into the front yard setback. The proposed 3,063 square foot, two-story residence with attached two-car garage is 70% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications.)

(Project Design Approval requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 025-14. Project was last reviewed on April 7, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Jim Davis, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Provide materials for glass railings.
- 3) Provide a mock-up of the guardrails.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 0/7/0. Motion failed. (All opposed).

2nd Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) The Board has agreed that the plans include cable railing on both top and bottom sections.
- 3) Provide a photo featuring the details of the garage.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

2. 502 LAS ALTURAS RD

E-1 Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-273-006
 Application Number: MST2014-00108
 Owner: Moler Patsy Wiser
 Applicant: Leland Walmsley

(Proposal to remove and replace existing un-reinforced site retaining walls of up to three and one-half feet tall, and to construct a new four foot tall wood fence along the western property line. The proposal also includes removal and replacement of the existing concrete driveway and apron with reinforced concrete, removal of the existing flagstone steps and paving, and replacement of the paving with permeable gravel and flagstone at the entry to an existing single-family dwelling on a 6,534 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. Portions of the project are located within the public right of way and will require a minor encroachment permit.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires a minor encroachment permit. Project was referred from Consent Calendar at its last review on March 24, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Leland Walmsley, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m.

- 1) Michael and Ruth Ann Collins, neighbors to the east of the project, submitted a letter with expressed concerns regarding building a re-enforced wall on the Las Alturas setback that could increase danger and accidents as well as the concern of existing and future plantings, and an existing drainage pipe that could be damaged by vehicles without a driveway curb. Mr. Collins also spoke at the meeting reiterating his concerns about safety.
- 2) Klaus Mund, a neighbor to the west of the project, is in opposition of the project. He requested that the wall located on his property be demolished and placed on the property line of the proposed project in addition to be cognizant of his landscape during demolition since plants had been destroyed previously.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:**

- 1) Provide a landscape plan adjacent to the existing driveway located by the drainage system.
- 2) Provide an encroachment approval from Public Works regarding the concrete pavement.

Action: Zimmerman/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 120 E PEDREGOSA ST

E-1 Zone

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-041-017
Application Number: MST2014-00226
Owner: James H. Franzen
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal for 162 square feet of first floor and 162 square feet of second floor additions to an existing 2,044 square foot residence with a detached 420 square foot two-car garage. The proposal also includes a new second floor balcony and interior alterations. The proposed 2,766 square feet of development on a 6,600 square foot lot is 98% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project requires Planning Commission review for a requested FAR modification.)

(Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review for a requested floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) modification.)

Actual time: 4:14 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect; Robert Taylor, Contractor; and James Franzen, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:21 p.m.

- 1) Kellam de Forest expressed concerns regarding the absence of the history of the building along with its compatibility to the streetscape of the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 4:23 p.m.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board appreciates the project design.
- 2) Study rear deck post configuration utilizing a larger post.
- 3) Study corner design with possibly adding another post with consideration of the driveway clearance.
- 4) Remove the roof on the bay window out to the kitchen.
- 5) Provide landscaping or extend the deck on the lower level by the rear door.
- 6) Study the bay window on the second floor for improved proportions on the window opening..

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 1423 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-185-005
Application Number: MST2013-00527
Owner: Chesluk Family Trust
Designer: Bruce Alker
Contractor: Sean Pierce

(Proposal to construct a 440 square foot, second-story, addition to an existing, 2,950 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached, 575 square foot, three-car garage. The proposed total of 3,965 square feet, located on a 12,632 square foot lot within the Hillside Design District, is 98% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 010-14. Project was last reviewed on February 10, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:45 p.m.

Present: Bruce Alker, Designer; Sam Chesluk, Owner; and Tony Boughman, Case Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:52 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) The project supports no significant modifications to the natural topography.
- 3) Considering the building envelope, the size of the building is acceptable.

Action: James/Miller, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 4:56 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:10 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 3626 SAN REMO DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
Application Number: MST2013-00504
Owner: Nancy J. Madsen
Designer: Kate Svensson

(Lot 1: Proposal for construction of a two-story, 2,669 square foot, single-family residence and an attached 467 square foot two-car garage located on a vacant 14,191 square foot parcel (Lot 1). The proposal includes associated flat work, landscaping, and site walls. The proposal is associated with a concurrent application (MST2009-00325) for a four (4) lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 14, 2010 (Resolution No. 015-10). The proposal of 3,136 square feet is 74% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third concept review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on March 24, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:11 p.m.

Board member Pierce has stepped down since her relation to a neighbor of the project conflicts with her status.

Present: Robert Adams, Landscape Architect; Kate Svensson, Designer; Vince Amore, Project Manager; Jarrett Gorin, Land Use Planner; and Daniel Gullett, Case Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:38 p.m.

- 1) Joan Jacobs expressed concerns regarding noncompliance with the conformity of the neighborhood, not showcasing the historical home, not providing additional parking spaces, and not including sufficient space for emergency vehicles.
- 2) Kellam de Forest expressed concerns regarding the purchase of the homes before or after construction, the proposed designs being very ordinary, and lot 4 being too close and needing to be converted into a one-story, reduced in size, or not built at all in order to display the historical home on site.
- 3) Molly Steen, a neighbor north of the proposed project, expressed concerns regarding the lots in relation to compatibility with the neighborhood. Ms. Steen suggested the lots be converted to single-story 1,800 square foot homes that could showcase the existing historic home on site in addition to providing privacy to the neighboring homes.
- 4) Bill Finnigsmier, a neighbor at 3603 Capri Drive, expressed concerns with privacy regarding the excessive height of the project in addition to the massive square footage being an issue with harboring more than one family in each lot causing parking issues.
- 5) Julie Nelson, a neighbor at 3603 Capri Drive, expressed concerns regarding the height of the project in relation to privacy. Ms. Nelson suggested one-story lots to preserve compatibility within the neighborhood as well as to consider following good neighbor guidelines.
- 6) Bob Westwick, a neighbor north of the proposed project, expressed concerns regarding the reduction of square footage, stating that 2% of a reduction wasn't enough in relation to the privacy of neighboring homes. Mr. Westwick suggested the lots conform to the neighborhood since the lots are around 60% bigger than the surrounding homes.
- 7) Mary Esperti, a neighbor at 3610 Capri Drive, expressed concerns regarding the second-story lots in relation to privacy along with the parking space and emergency entrance issues.
- 8) John Steen, co-owner of 3609 Capri Drive, presented a 32-lot plat map and several analyses of the proposed lots in relation to the neighborhood. Mr. Steen pointed out that the lots were 60% bigger

with an F.A.R. three times that of the surrounding homes.

- 9) Peter and Shirley Edwards submitted a letter with expressed concerns regarding the excessive scale of the proposed lots, the parking issues with having single driveways and no guest parking, and the problems with the drought in relation to adding water meters.

Public comment closed at 5:59 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the effort in reducing the square footage.
- 2) Provide further reduction in square footage and height.
- 3) Study the second story in relation to the impact of the adjacent neighbor.
- 4) Study the detailing relative to the existing historical structure on site.
- 5) Study guest parking.

Action: Miller/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce stepped down).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

6. 3626 SAN REMO DR

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(5:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
 Application Number: MST2013-00505
 Owner: Nancy J. Madsen
 Designer: Kate Svensson

(Lot 2: Proposal for construction of a two-story, 2,652 square foot, single-family residence and an attached 479 square foot, two-car garage, located on a vacant 14,094 square foot parcel (Lot 2). The proposal includes associated flatwork, landscaping, and site walls. This proposal is associated with a concurrent application (MST2009-00325) for a four (4) lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 14, 2010 (Resolution No. 015-10). The proposed total of 3,132 square feet is 74% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third concept review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on March 24, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:19 p.m.

Board member Pierce has stepped down since her relation to a neighbor of the project conflicts with her status.

Present: Robert Adams, Landscape Architect; Kate Svensson, Designer; Vince Amore, Project Manager; Jarrett Gorin, Land Use Planner; and Daniel Gullett, Case Planner.

- Jarrett Gorin requested his comments be put on record regarding the inappropriate and unusual manner of one board member's view on how another board may have observed a project, the unnecessary anger asserted over a land-use project, and the misguided comments about the inaccuracy of the story pole set-ups.

Public comment opened at 6:26 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the changes in architecture.
- 2) Reduce plate height and square footage.
- 3) Study locations for guest parking.

Action: Woolery/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce stepped down).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

7. 3626 SAN REMO DR

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(6:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
 Application Number: MST2013-00506
 Owner: Nancy J. Madsen
 Designer: Kate Svensson

(Lot 4: Proposal for construction of a two-story, 2,795 square foot, single-family residence and an attached, 498 square foot, two-car garage, located on a vacant 17,351 square foot parcel (Lot 4). The proposal includes associated flat work, landscaping, and site walls. This proposal is associated with a concurrent application (MST2009-00325) for a four (4) lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 14, 2010 (Resolution No. 015-10). The proposed total of 3,292 square feet is 75% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third concept review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on March 24, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:35 p.m.

Board member Pierce has stepped down since her relation to a neighbor of the project conflicts with her status.

Present: Robert Adams, Landscape Architect; Kate Svensson, Designer; Vince Amore, Project Manager; Jarrett Gorin, Land Use Planner; and Daniel Gullett, Case Planner.

Public comment opened at 6:44 p.m.

- 1) Kellam de Forest expressed concerns regarding the fenestration of the lot in relation to the variety of windows as well as concerns with parking. He suggested the lot become a one-story property.

Public comment closed at 6:47 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Reduce plate heights on first and second floors.
- 2) Reduce square footage on the second floor.
- 3) Provide detailing relative to the adjacent historical structure on site.

Action: Zimmerman/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce stepped down, James absent).

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by Jim Zimmerman and Lisa James.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**A. 502 E MICHELTORENA ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-031-001
Application Number: MST2011-00186
Applicant: Paul Zink
Owner: Douglas Foster

(Proposal to construct a 430 square foot one-story addition to the existing 900 square foot one-story single-family residence located on a 5,194 square foot lot. The proposal includes demolition of the 182 square foot detached one-car garage and construction of a 185 square foot attached one-car garage, and removal of two trees. The project includes Planning Commission Approval of zoning modifications (Resolution No. 017-11). The parcel is located in the Lower Riviera Special Design District.)

(Review After Final to include removal of windows from the east elevation, a rotated chimney cap, replacement of the outdoor fireplace with a gas fire pit, a revised study window, revised site walls, replacement of a suspended wood trellis with wrought iron, replacement of double doors with a single window, and revised landscaping and irrigation.)

Final Approval as submitted of Review After Final.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 1512 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-181-012
Application Number: MST2012-00328
Owner: William Russ
Designer: Robert Paul Design
Designer: Acanthus Design

(Proposal to demolish the existing 1,360 square foot, two-story single-family residence, the 220 square foot garage, and accessory buildings; and construct a new 2,208 square foot two-story single-family residence, and a new 430 square foot two-car detached garage. The proposal includes 781 square feet of second-story decks, a 90 square foot roof deck, and an 8-foot tall site wall. One palm tree is proposed to be relocated; all other existing trees are proposed to remain. The proposed total of 2,638 square feet, located on a 7,864 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 84% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal will address violations identified in ZIR2011-00414.)

(Review After Final for minor alterations to include an expansion of the bridge to eight feet in width, elimination of the landscaped green-roof element on the top roof only (per Building and Safety requirements), and elimination of a few "eyebrow" elements above east elevation windows.)

Final Approval as submitted of Review After Final.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 165 CEDAR LN****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-083-003
 Application Number: MST2013-00012
 Owner: Paul H. Tucker
 Architect: David Mendro
 Contractor: Alan Cooper

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing one-story 2,088 square foot single-family residence, located on a 13,796 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes the conversion of the existing 459 square foot attached garage to a habitable addition and 125 square feet of new additions. The application is requesting a parking exception to provide one-covered and one-uncovered parking space and involves the construction of a new one-car carport and new permeable paving. Additional site alterations include new site walls and patios, deck additions, alterations to an existing deck, the demolition of an existing concrete patio, and demolition of an 'as-built' storage structure. The proposed total of 2,967 square feet is 70% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Review After Final to include new a new 42 square foot spa and associated equipment, a new fire-pit, additional site work, and 31 yards of grading, all in the rear yard.)

Final Approval as submitted of Review After Final.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**D. 2618 MESA SCHOOL LN****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-283-026
 Application Number: MST2013-00516
 Owner: Ole & Monique Mikkelsen
 Architect: Jeremy Roberts
 Agent: Arne / Kar Mikkelsen

(Proposal for repairs and replacement of an "as-built" six-foot high wood fence, a proposed six foot high wood fence by the driveway and for a proposed eight foot high wood rear fence. The project also includes replacement of a garage door on the storage shed with a man door. The property is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications for over-height fences. The existing 7,949 square foot lot is developed with a one-story, single-family residence. The proposal will address violations identified within ZIR2013-00068.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 022-14.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

NEW ITEM

E. 1217 BEL AIR DR

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-280-003
Application Number: MST2014-00247
Owner: Daniel Knight & Suzette Ann Carter
Agent: Scott Branch

(Proposal to replace an existing 102 square foot mitered glass greenhouse-style bay window with standard constructed walls, windows, and a roof at the rear of an existing 3,176 square foot single-family dwelling in the Hillside Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:05 P.M. ****