



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

**Monday, January 27, 2014**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **3:00 P.M.**

---

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

FRED SWEENEY, *Chair* (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)

BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*

BERNI BERNSTEIN

LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)

JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)

DENISE WOOLERY

JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**      DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**      ADDISON THOMPSON

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE):**      JOHN CAMPANELLA

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician

GABRIELE COOK, Commission Secretary

---

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov)**

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos).

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present:      Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James, Pierce, and Woolery.

Members absent:      Zimmerman.

Staff present:      Bedard, Limón (3:09 until 3:28 p.m.) and Cook.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A.      Public Comment:

No public comment.

B.      Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of January 13, 2014, as submitted.

Action:      James/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained from Item #5, Zimmerman absent.)

C.      Consent Calendars:

Motion:      Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 21, 2014**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by James/Zimmerman.

Action:      Bernstein/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 27, 2014**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by James/Sweeney.  
Action: Pierce/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent.)

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- a. Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:
    - a) The Ordinance amendment to revise the SFDB quorum requirements will be reviewed by City Council on Tuesday, January 28, 2014.
    - b) Board member Zimmerman will be absent from the meeting.
    - c) Board member Miller will be stepping down from item # 6, 711 Circle Drive.
  - b. Chair Sweeney made the following announcements:
    - a) Santa Barbara citizen Paula Westbury passed away.
    - b) Attended and gave an update of the January 23, 2014, Planning Commission Hearing on the Fence, Screen, Walls, and Hedges Ordinance (SBMC §28.87.170).
- E. Subcommittee Reports.  
No Subcommittees.

### **SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### **1. 1535 W VALERIO ST**

**R-1 Zone**

**(3:10)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-071-028  
Application Number: MST2014-00019  
Applicant: Quality Roofing SB Inc.  
Owner: Jeff Barton

(Proposal to remove the existing Presidential Shake, heavy shingle roof, and replace with a new stone-coated steel "Decra Villa Tile" in the "Capri Clay" color roofing system for an existing, one-story, single-family residence, located within the Hillside Design District.)

**(Referred from Consent review on January 21, 2014. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Jeff Barten, Owner;  
Robert Lopez, owner Quality Roofing Company.

Senior Planner, Jaime Limon commented that the City does not have a list of unapproved roofing materials. Consequently, the Board must make the ruling based on appropriateness and compatibility of the materials with the existing architecture on a case-by-case basis.

Public comment opened at 3:19 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion:** **Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:**
- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and consistency and appearance.
  - 2) The Board finds the roofing material is acceptable due to the location of the house and its low visibility from the street.
  - 3) The Board prefers the solid color roofing.
- Action:** Bernstein/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

### **SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### **2. 438CONEJO RD**

**A-1 Zone**

**(3:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-061-013  
 Application Number: MST2013-00336  
 Applicant: Darkmoon B Design & Engineering  
 Owner: Luis Fernandez  
 Engineer: Jonathan Villegas

(Revised project. Proposal to construct a two-story, 2,006 square foot, single-family residence and an attached 440 square foot two-car garage. The previous residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes the removal of six (6) existing trees, new site walls and decks, 264 cubic yards of site grading. The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The proposed total of 2,446 square feet, located on a 6,880 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District, is 84% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The prior design was three-stories and a 79% FAR.)

**(Revised project. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The project was last reviewed on December 2, 2013.)**

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: Jonathan Villegas, Designer;  
 Luis Fernandez, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion:** **Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:**
- 1) Provide photographs of contemporary homes in the neighborhood.
  - 2) Provide a landscape plan.
  - 3) Study reducing the plate heights of the second floor.
  - 4) Study the tower, possibly incorporate corner windows.
  - 5) Simplify the colors and materials palette.
  - 6) Study horizontal wood placement.
  - 7) Study the roof pitch.
  - 8) Provide alternative light fixtures.
  - 9) The Board appreciates the owner's attempt to work with the Board and neighbors and is supportive of the current direction of the design.
  - 10) Provide details for the casement windows.
  - 11) Provide details for the fireplace cap.
- Action:** Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****3. 1323 CLIFF DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-041-007

Application Number: MST2013-00500

Owner: Susan Aumack

Architect: Dylan Chappell Architects

(Proposal for a complete interior and façade remodel, and one- and two-story additions to an existing, 1,383 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, including an attached, two-car garage. The proposal includes 408 square feet of one-story additions, a 579 square foot two-story addition, and partial demolition, to result in a 2,390 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, including the attached, two-car garage. The proposal includes a 300 square foot second level deck. The proposed total of 2,390 square feet, located on a 6,607 square foot lot, is 84% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations identified within Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00260. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

**(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The project was last reviewed on December 16, 2013.)**

Actual time: 4:02 p.m.

Present: Dillon Chappell, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m.

- 1) Todd Davies, neighbor, 1320 Cliff Dr., expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility of a second story.
- 2) Gwen Hildred, neighbor, 1327 San Rafael, expressed concerns regarding the size of the upstairs deck and would like to request south facing topographical plans.
- 3) Ruth Sack, neighbor, 1317 Cliff Dr., expressed concerns regarding privacy and light.

Public comment closed at 4:24 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board appreciates the redesign of the house and finds the design is more sympathetic to the adjacent houses.
- 2) Study the material/textures on the north elevation of the garage.
- 3) Study elimination of the stone on the west elevation.
- 4) The Board is supportive of the upstairs deck size; it conforms with the 15-foot setback guideline requirements.
- 5) Provide a landscape plan.
- 6) Provide a color and materials board.
- 7) The Board encourages the applicant to contact the immediate neighbors.
- 8) Study lowering the roof pitch.
- 9) Study the overall roof shapes and consider a flat roof solution on the second floor.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****4. 1826 E LAS TUNAS RD****A-1 Zone**

**(4:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-082-011  
Application Number: MST2014-00002  
Owner: Marilyn Makepeace Revocable Trust  
Architect: Dennis Thompson

(Proposal to construct an 865 square foot, one-story, addition to the existing 2,479 square foot residence, including the conversion of the existing 675 square foot, detached accessory building (garage and workshop) to habitable floor area and 190 square feet of new additions. The proposal also includes the construction of a new, detached, 564 square foot, two-car garage with roof deck, new site retaining walls and stairs, and 270 cubic yards of site grading. The proposed total of 3,908 square feet, located on a 20,036 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 83% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

**(Concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)**

Actual time: 4:44 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:55 p.m.

- 1) John Kelly, representing the MacLean family - owners of the adjacent property at 1832 Las Tunas, (submitted letter) expressed concerns regarding the roof design, garage conversion, location of new garage and proposed roof deck. They are in support of the encroachment of the new garage within the front setback if it will conform to the required interior setback.

Public comment closed at 4:58 p.m.

- Motion:** **Continued to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to the Full Board with comments:**
- 1) Provide a landscape plan; in particular for the area along the westerly property line by (the new driveway/garage area).
  - 2) The Board is supportive of the change in use from the garage to a bedroom, in particular as there are no windows on the wall facing the adjacent neighbor.
  - 3) The Board is supportive of the roof deck above the garage, but suggests stepping back the railing to reduce the size of the useable deck area.
  - 4) The Board supports the roof change.
  - 5) The Board finds the proposed front setback modification is aesthetically appropriate and the proposed modification does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.

Action: Woolery/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM****5. 1315 MISSION RIDGE RD****E-1 Zone****(5:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-210-017  
 Application Number: MST2014-00006  
 Owner: Donald and Adrienne Burlington  
 Architect: Thompson Naylor Architects

(Proposal for alterations to an existing, two-story, 3,104 square foot, single-family residence, including the attached two-car carport, located on a 13,068 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Alterations include replacement of the bridge and front entry deck, add new site steps at grade (adjacent to the bridge), replace all existing wood decks and railings, add a 16 square foot addition to deck two (2), resurface the exterior facade with new stucco, reroof, and replace existing skylights.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Actual time: 5:22 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with the comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and consistency and appearance.
- 2) The Board is supportive of the small deck addition to deck #2 (to accommodate a BBQ).

Action: Bernstein/Peirce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

**\*\*SCHEDULED RECESS FROM 5:35 P.M. TO 5:50 P.M.\*\***

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****6. 711 CIRCLE DR****R-1 Zone****(5:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-101-007  
 Application Number: MST2013-00468  
 Owner: Floppy Trust  
 Designer: Brian Miller  
 Engineer: Kevin Vandervort

(Revised proposal to construct a 201 square foot, one-story, addition to an existing, 1,345 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached, 412 square foot, two-car garage. The proposal includes a new roof, remove and replace the driveway and patio, window and door alterations, and 145 cubic yards of grading. The project will address zoning violations identified in ZIR2011-00126. The proposed total of 1,958 square feet, located on a 13,503 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 47% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Project Design Approval is requested. The project requires compliance with the Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program prior to Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on December 2, 2013.)**

Actual time: 6:02 p.m.

Vice-Chair Sweeney read a statement regarding sole proprietorships exceptions, and Board member presentations.

Present: Brian Miller, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:10 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Project Design Approval for architecture, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and consistency and appearance.
- 2) Study the chimney and the relationship to the column.
- 3) Study simplifying the arch on the garage door.
- 4) Consider a design solution for the existing electrical box.
- 5) Provide a landscape plan and compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Plan (SWMP) requirements.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller stepped down, Zimmerman absent).

### **SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### **7. 19 VISTA DEL MAR DR**

**E-3/SD-3 Zone**

**(6:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-062-006

Application Number: MST2013-00483

Owner: David C. and Elizabeth O. Spaulding

Architect: Steve Harrel

(Proposal to construct a 683 square foot two-story, and 450 square foot one-story addition to an existing, 1,606 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, with an attached, 400 square foot, two-car garage, located on a 26,250 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes an 84 square foot second level balcony and a 450 square foot, ground level, covered porch, and new site hardscape. The proposed total of 3,139 square feet is 66% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

**(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment. The project was last reviewed on December 16, 2013.)**

Actual time: 6:20 p.m.

Present: Steve Harrel, Architect;  
David Spaulding, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and consistency and appearance.
- 2) The Board appreciates the reduction in square footage and plate heights.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan and compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Plan (SWMP) requirements.
- 4) Provide a color and materials board.

Action: James/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **8. 1423 SHORELINE DR**

**E-3/SD-3 Zone**

**(6:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-185-005  
 Application Number: MST2013-00527  
 Owner: Chesluk Family Trust  
 Designer: Bruce Alker  
 Contractor: Sean Pierce

(Proposal to construct a 450 square foot, second-story, addition to an existing, 2,960 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached, 575 square foot, three-car garage. The proposed total of 3,985 square feet, located on a 12,632 square foot lot within the Hillside Design District, is 98% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

**(Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)**

Actual time: 6:47 p.m.

Present: Bruce Alker, Designer;  
 Sam Chesluk, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:57 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

- 1) It is understood that the project will comply with the maximum 25-foot height restrictions.
- 2) The Board finds the FAR acceptable, however suggests studying possible reductions of the square footage.
- 3) Study a revised roof design of the proposed addition and covered porch.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Woolery opposed, Zimmerman absent).

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****9. 1402 GRAND AVE****A-1/E-1 Zone**

**(7:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-110-047  
Application Number: MST2013-00498  
Owner: Midwest Institution, LLC  
Designer: Richele Mailand

(Proposal to permit "as-built" site alterations to include approximately 454 cubic yards of site grading and vegetation removal for the purposes of a new access road, located on a 5.21 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes the removal of one eucalyptus tree. The project will address violations identified within enforcement case ENF2013-00264. This proposal does not include any alterations to the existing single-family residence.)

**(Project Design and Final Approval requested.)**

Actual time: 7:21 p.m.

Present: Richele Mailand, Designer.

Public comment opened at 7:24 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of support from Eva and Phil Kirkpatrick was acknowledged.

**Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance finding that the grading criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 (C) of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the comment to use a hydro mulch (or other erosion control plant materials) on the uphill cuts of the access road for erosion control.**

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**CONSENT CALENDAR – SEE SEPARATE AGENDA**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)**

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by James and Sweeney.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 2111 STANWOOD DR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-041-026  
 Application Number: MST2009-00173  
 Owner: Taylor Tatman  
 Architect: Christine Pierron  
 Engineer: Kevin Vandervort

(Proposal to rebuild a 2,878 square foot two-story single family residence and attached 525 square foot two-car garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. The project is located in the existing building footprint and includes the replacement of an 857 square foot first floor deck and a 152 square foot second floor deck. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification is requested to allow alterations within the setback. The proposed total of 3,280 square feet on the 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 64% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio.)

**(Review After Final for "as-built" alterations to the style and exterior materials, including a change of the exterior siding from hardiboard to stucco, "as-built" roof material change to S-tiles, an "as-built" master bedroom addition (conversion of covered deck to habitable) and a new Juliette balcony, revised windows, and revised railing materials.)**

**Continued indefinitely to Consent with the following comments:**

- 1) The applicant has been advised to obtain a licensed architect to prepare a complete set of working drawings for the revised project.
- 2) It has been again discussed that the "as-built" S-tile roof is not generally considered to be an appropriate roofing material and is not consistent with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines; the applicant has been provided with a copy of the Clay S-tile installation detail guidelines.
- 3) Carry forward all comments from the prior January 6 and January 21, 2014, Consent reviews.

**PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW****B. 2302 EDGEWATER WAY****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-342-010  
 Application Number: MST2013-00393  
 Owner: Louise Lucena Living Trust  
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal for minor site alterations, a total of 78 square feet of additions, minor exterior alterations and interior remodel to an existing, 1,186 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, located on a 5,873 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes a 34 square foot addition to the residence, a 44 square foot storage addition, replace the existing windows and roof with new, add a new deck, replace the existing asphalt driveway with pavers, and replace an existing fence with a new 5-foot wood fence located along Mohawk Road. The proposal includes review by the Staff Hearing Officer for requested zoning modifications.)

**(Project Design and Final Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 077-13.)**

**Project Design Approval and Final Approval, as noted on Sheets A-1, A-2, and the color board (for fence color and landscaping details), with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.**

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**NEW ITEM**

**C. 1712 ANACAPA ST (ORIGINAL PARCEL) R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-014  
Application Number: MST2014-00030  
Owner: 1712 Anacapa Street, LLC  
Architect: April Palencia

(Proposed alterations to an existing, two-story, single-family residence, located on parcel one fronting Anacapa Street, of a three-lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 8, 2009. The alterations include the replacement of doors and windows, replacement of the garage door, adding new French doors with sidelites at the dining and living rooms, and new French doors at the master bedroom. Other alterations include painting the residence, removal of the trellis, trellis roof and patio wall, and the existing pantry door, and adding a new landing and steps at the living room doors. The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 040-09.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Project Design Approval and Final Approval, as noted on G1.0 (for final colors), with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.**

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:38 P.M. \*\***