



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, December 2, 2013

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

DENISE WOOLERY, *Chair*
FRED SWEENEY, *Vice-Chair*
BERNI BERNSTEIN
BRIAN MILLER (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)
LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): JOHN CAMPANELLA

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
GABRIELE COOK, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:06 p.m. by Chair Woolery.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Woolery, Sweeney, Bernstein (3:50 p.m.), James, Pierce (3:09 p.m. left 5:52 p.m.), and Zimmerman.
Members absent: Miller.
Staff present: Bedard and Cook.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **November 18, 2013**, as submitted.

Action: Sweeney/James, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Miller/Pierce absent.)

C. Consent Calendars:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 25, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Zimmerman/Pierce.
- Action: James/Sweeney, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Miller/Pierce absent.)
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **December 2, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Zimmerman/Pierce.
- Action: James/Sweeney, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Miller absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:
- a) Board member Bernstein will be late.
 - b) Planning Commission will review amendments to the Santa Barbara Municipal Code 2887.170 for Fences, Screens and Hedges Ordinance on December 5, and likely to return on December 19, 2013. If Board members would like to attend those hearings they are welcome to or they can submit comments to Renee Brooke, Senior Planner.
 - d) Reminder that the December 30, 2013, meeting is canceled. The December 16, 2013, meeting is the last meeting of the year, Board members please confirm attendance for quorum for the December 16, 2013, meeting as Board member Pierce will be absent.
 - c) Item #3, 311 Via Alicia is moved to Item #4, at the approximate time of 4:10 p.m. and Item #6, 711 Circle Drive will be moved to Item #3, at approximately 3:50 p.m. The remaining items will be reviewed in the remaining subsequent order, item #5 – 438 Conejo Rd., item #6 – 2400 Mount Calvary Rd., and item #7 – 1562 Marquard Terrace.
- b. Board member Sweeney posed a question to the Board if they would like to have another discussion regarding the Hedge Ordinance prior to returning to the Planning Commission. The majority of the Board felt that another discussion was not necessary. Staff advised the Board that they are welcome to attend and present comments/questions at the Planning Commission hearing.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittees.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

1. 1121 WALNUT AVE

R-3 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-202-006
Application Number: MST2011-00409
Owner: Alamar II, LLC
Applicant: Dario Pini
Architect: Murphy and Associates

(Proposal to demolish the existing, 770 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, and construct a 1,885 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, including an attached, 400 square foot, two-car garage. The proposal includes a new 5-foot tall stucco wall in the front yard. The proposed total of 1,885 square feet on a 6,750 square foot lot is 66% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations in ENF 2011-00778.)

(Review after final for alterations to railing materials, window alterations to eliminate the window mullions, and the addition of a water heater closet.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Bryan Murphy, Architect;
Dario Pini, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:21 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of expressed concerns from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: The revised railing materials and the new water heater closet are approved as submitted of the Review After Final. The revised windows are not approved. The project was conditioned for the applicant to return the windows to match the windows as indicated in the original approval (on May 14, 2012).

Action: Pierce/James, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney opposed, Bernstein/Miller absent).

FINAL REVIEW

2. 1576 LA VISTA DEL OCEANO DR

E-1 Zone

(3:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-180-058

Application Number: MST1999-01043

Owner: Alfred Asman

Architect: Chris Manson-Hing

(This is a revised project for major design alterations for a project that received final design approval in 2006. There is an active building permit issued for the approved design, which involves the construction of a new three-story, 3,940 square foot, single-family residence, with an attached two-car garage, and is 99% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The revised application proposes to reduce the project to a new, two-story, 3,565 square foot single-family residence, with an attached two-car garage. The revised project resulting in 81% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) and includes a 50% reduction for a portion of the lower floor area. The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 063-05, approved on October 6, 2005.)

(Final Approval requested. Project Design Approval was granted on June 17, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: Chris Manson-Hing, Architect;
Ed Tebo, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:48 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of expressed concerns from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Zimmerman/Sweeney, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

****THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF AGENDA ORDER******PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****3. 11 VIA ALICIA****E-1 Zone**

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-311-003
Application Number: MST2013-00052
Owner: Peter Trent
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for site alterations, exterior alterations, and a minor interior remodel to an existing three-story, 3,423 square foot, single-family residence, with an attached two-car garage, located on a 15,681 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Alterations include converting 258 square feet of existing storage area to habitable addition, the demolition and replacement of existing decks with new, door and window alterations, and a new swimming pool and site walls. The proposal includes approximately 30 cubic yards of cut for the new pool. The proposal results in a development total of 3,681 square feet and is 84% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval requested. The project was last reviewed on November 18, 2013.)

Actual time: 4:39 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect;
Kate Dole, Landscape Architect;
Lauren Deason, with Sherry and Associates.

Public comment opened at 4:46 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comment:

1) The Board had positive comments regarding consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials and landscape, and good neighbor guidelines.

Action: James/Pierce, 3/1/2. Motion carried. (Sweeney opposed, Bernstein/Woolery abstained, Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**4. 438 CONEJO RD****A-1 Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-061-013
Application Number: MST2013-00336
Owner: Luis Fernandez
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza
Landscape Architect: Bill Mellett

(Proposal to construct a three-story, 1,892 square foot, single-family residence and an attached 400 square foot two-car garage. The previous residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes the removal of six (6) existing trees, new site walls and decks, 299 cubic yards of site grading, including 243 cubic yards of export. The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The proposed total of 2,292 square feet, located on a 6,880 square foot parcel in The Hillside Design District, is 79% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The project was last reviewed on November 18, 2013.)

Actual time: 4:57 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect;
Bill Mellett, Landscape Architect;
Luis Fernandez, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:13 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the third story *may* be supportable, however carries forward the comment from the prior minutes for the applicant to provide an analysis of the 20-closest lots to provide clarification of the existing and approved one, two, and three-story homes in the immediate neighborhood, in order to verify neighborhood compatibility.
- 2) Provide a two-story alternative.
- 3) Study the (east elevation) downspouts on first and second floors.
- 4) Study the connection of the first story roof and how it intersects at the tower element.
- 5) Provide further study of and example photographs of the exterior staircase.
- 6) Study the landscape plan for a revised design approach at the front entry way to designate a pedestrian only entry (no vehicle access/parking).

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 2400 MOUNT CALVARY RD****A-1 Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-040-049
 Application Number: MST2012-00089
 Owner: Charles M. Blizz
 Agent: Brent Daniels

(Concept review to construct a 500 square foot, one-story, modular, single-family residence located on a 4.5 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes approximately 120 cubic yards of site grading to be balanced on site. The proposal will replace the original house which was destroyed in the Tea Fire. Plans to rebuild a new, 2,000 square foot, one-story, single-family residence has been temporarily abandoned.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment. The project was last reviewed at Consent on March 26, 2012.)

Actual time: 5:33 p.m.

Present: Brent Daniels, Architect;
 Hugh Brownly, Construction Manager.

Public comment opened at 5:46 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of expressed concerns from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a site plan to indicate landscaping around the structure.
- 2) The Board finds the approach for a modular is acceptable.
- 3) Provide color palette (to compliment the natural landscape, i.e. gold and yellow hues).
- 4) Provide a design for the proposed car port.
- 5) The Board encourage that the future buildings should be designed in a compatible architectural style.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Pierce absent).

****THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF AGENDA ORDER****

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**6. 711 CIRCLE DR****R-1 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-101-007
 Application Number: MST2013-00468
 Owner: Floppy Trust
 Designer: John Forbyn
 Engineer: Kevin Vandervort

(Proposal to construct a 108 square foot one-story addition to an existing 1,345 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached, 412 square foot, two-car garage. The proposal includes a 14 square foot garage addition, a new roof, remove and replace the driveway and patio, window and door alterations, and 145 cubic yards of grading. The project will address zoning violations identified in ZIR2011-00126 to include the removal of the "as-built" skylights and trellis, and over-height hedges. the proposed total of 1,879 square feet, located on a 13,503 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 45% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Referred from Consent review on November 18, 2013. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 3:55 p.m.

Present: John Forbyn, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide further detailing to demonstrate how water runs off of the flagstone driveway.
- 2) Study a permeable design solution for the driveway.
- 3) The Board supports the general shape of plans and proposed additions.
- 4) Study the garage door design; provide manufacturer specifications of the proposed garage door). Study the garage windows.
- 5) Study all the windows for locations, sizes, and proportions for a more consistent design approach.
- 6) Study the den window.
- 7) Study the bathroom window on the north elevation.
- 8) Study the window proportions and size on the south elevation.
- 9) Study the bay window on the west elevation for size, shape, treatment and relationship to other windows.
- 10) Study the consistency of the window fenestrations on the east and west elevations.
- 11) Study the door entry on the east elevation.
- 12) Study the design of the roof cupola.
- 13) Include cut sheets of landscape and site lighting.

Action: Sweeney/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Pierce absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

7. 1562 MARQUARD TERR

R-1 Zone

(5:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-031-018

Application Number: MST2013-00424

Owner: Joanne Gronquist

Architect: Joe Ewing

(Proposal for a 477 square foot, one-story addition and 144 square foot, two-story addition to an existing 1,352 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, with a 396 square foot, detached, two-car garage, and 238 square foot, detached storage structure. The project includes window and door alterations, replacement of existing siding with stucco, a new standing seam metal roof, and demolition and reconstruction of 49 square feet of the existing garage. The proposed total of 2,607 square feet, located on an 8,411 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District, is 79% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The project was last reviewed on November 4, 2013.)

Actual time: 6:02 p.m.

Present: Joe Ewing, Architect;
Tim Gronquist, Owner;
Joanne Gronquist, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of expressed concerns from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the reconfiguration of the front three windows on the south elevation.
- 2) Study the window proportions of the second floor bathroom in relationship to the pitch of the roof.
- 3) Provide the chimney cap details.
- 4) Study the widow fenestration for consistency on the east/west/north elevations.
- 5) Provide the front staircase railing details.
- 6) Study the odd shaped windows on the west and north elevations.
- 7) Provide the roof venting details.
- 8) The Board is not supportive of the skylights as proposed. Study the skylight placements and integrate into the roof.
- 9) Provide the gutter and downspout locations and details.
- 10) Provide the color and materials board.

Action: Sweeney/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Pierce absent).

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 376 LAS ALTURAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-312-021
Application Number: MST2010-00123
Owner: Kevin G. Cravens
Architect: Sherry and Associates
Contractor: Ken Ruiz

(Proposal to replace a 1,979 square foot house and 488 square foot garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. Proposed is a 4,005 square foot, three-story, single-family residence, attached 523 square foot two-car garage, pool, decks, and 390 total cubic yards of grading. The proposed total of 4,528 square feet, located on a 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District, is 90% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Review After Final for minor site landscaping alterations and the addition of a new secondary pedestrian access bridge from the residence to the driveway.)

Approval of the Review After Final with the following comments:

- 1) Approval of the new pedestrian access bridge (above the driveway).
- 2) The Board understands that there will be a light fixture installed at the step of the bridge, and it will comply with the City Lighting Ordinance.
- 3) Landscaping items to be continued to the December 16, 2013, Consent review.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**B. 1110 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-242-022
Application Number: MST2011-00282
Owner: Traci Marie Kelemen

(Proposal to address violations listed in enforcement case ENF2009-00392 which involves a series of site work and minor alterations to the existing, 1,971 square foot, single-family residence, located on a 9,413 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed project includes permitting the 'as-built' conversion of the carport to a 420 square foot, two-car, garage, provide a new uncovered on-site guest parking space, replace the existing concrete driveway with a new permeable driveway, revise the existing front entry with new porch, steps, and pathway, demolish the existing 'as-built' site retaining walls and construct a series of new engineered site retaining walls, a new driveway gate, and a new wood fence along the north and east property line. The proposed project includes a total of 405 cubic yards of site grading. A Public Works encroachment permit is being pursued for the replacement of an 'as-built' retaining wall located within the public right-of-way.)

(Final Approval requested.)

Final Approval with the condition to revise the SWMP plan to indicate the drains to outlet into the planter above the driveway.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 1650 OVERLOOK LN****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-192-011
 Application Number: MST2013-00472
 Owner: Johnson Family Trust
 Applicant: David Thomas
 Designer: Catherine Dunbar

(Proposal for façade alterations to include a new front entry porch, a new 96 square foot cupola, an 18 square foot bathroom addition, and a 616 square foot rear deck and stairs addition to an existing approximate 450 square foot deck, for an existing, 1,650 square foot, single-family residence, located on a 10,819 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 1,668 square feet is 44% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations identified in ZIR2013-00528.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code as noted for color and railing details.

Note: Cable railing to be installed behind the decorative railing element for compliance with Building and Safety code requirements.

NEW ITEM**D. 1112 MANITOU RD****R-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-270-001
 Application Number: MST2013-00496
 Owner: Buford Family Revocable Trust
 Designer: Eric Knight

(Proposal to remove the existing concrete hardscape and replace with an interlocking decorative paver system, to construct a new 6- to 8-foot high garden wall and new entry gates located in front of the single-family residence. The proposal also includes an 8-inch high curb along the edge of the driveway, 15 cubic yards of grading, and minor exterior changes including site landscaping and lighting. The property is currently developed with a one-story, split level, single-family residence, with an attached two-car garage.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with conditions:

- 1) Provide elevation details of both pedestrian entry gates.
- 2) Specify the materials and colors of the proposed pavers.
- 3) Provide elevation of trellis and indicate height and materials.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Zimmerman and Pierce.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:31 P.M. ****