



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, September 9, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: DENISE WOOLERY, *Chair*
 FRED SWEENEY, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 BRIAN MILLER (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)
 LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
 JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
 JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): JOHN CAMPANELLA

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDB and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:06 p.m. by Vice-Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Woolery, Sweeney, Bernstein (at 3:28 p.m.), Miller (until 5:55 p.m.), James, Pierce (until 5:55 p.m.), and Zimmerman.
Members absent: Woolery.
Staff present: Bedard, Limón, and Feliciano.
Recorder: Gabriele Cook.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of August 26, 2013, as submitted.

Action: Miller/Zimmerman, 5/0/0. (Bernstein and Woolery absent.)

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 3, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

Action: James/Zimmerman, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein and Woolery absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 9, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

Action: James/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein and Woolery absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:

a) Board member Woolery will be absent from the meeting.

b) Board member Bernstein will be late and will step down from Item 2, 2345 Edgewater Way.

c) Item B, 1291 W. Mountain Dr., of today's Consent agenda has been referred to today's full Board hearing to be reviewed concurrently with the revised project of the same address.

2. Mr. Limón announced that staff is considering making changes to the quorum requirements, as specified in the Santa Barbara Municipal Code (SBMC) Section §22.69.010.C, in order to be consistent with the requirements for the Architectural Review Board (ABR) as outlined in Section §22.68.010.C. The proposed changes will reduce the quorum requirement to one licensed architect, rather than the currently required two licensed architects. A discussion item will be agendized in the near future.

3. Board members Miller and Pierce announced they would be stepping down on Item 5, 3435 Marina Drive.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF ARCHITECTS - URBAN LIVING SANTA BARBARA**

(3:10) Presenter: Christopher Manson-Hing, AIA SB Chapter President Elect

(The 2013 AIA ArchitecTours, entitled "Urban Living Santa Barbara," will take place on October 5, and is a walking tour in the downtown of the City with its Housing and Living Amenities. For more information visit: www.aiasb.com/architecTours2013.cfm.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Christopher Manson-Hing, AIA Representative

A letter of expressed concerns was received from Paula Westbury.

Discussion held.

(Bernstein and Woolery absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 2345 EDGEWATER WAY****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-350-001
Application Number: MST2013-00341
Owner: Michal Smulski
Architect: James Zimmerman

(Proposal to demolish the existing, two-story, 2,171 square foot, single-family residence, and construct a two-story, 2,816 square foot, single-family residence, including an attached, 420 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes the removal of two existing palm trees, new site walls and fencing, a new pool and spa, new hardscape and site landscaping. The proposed total of 2,816 square feet, located on a 25,265 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District and in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 60% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 3:29 p.m.

The Board recessed from 3:33 p.m. to 3:39 p.m.

Vice-Chair Sweeney read a statement regarding sole proprietorships exceptions and Board member presentations.

Present: Jim Zimmerman, Architect
Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:08 p.m.

- 1) Bernie Bernstein, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility, size, bulk and scale. She asked that the Board apply the NPO guidelines to this project, as the proposed Spanish architectural style will set a precedent for the neighborhood.
- 2) Elizabeth Wolfson, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility, in particular the tower height.
- 3) Madeleine Bear, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility. Read comments from Claire Bacher into the record.
- 4) Sally Witnov, support; expressed concerns regarding the home's closeness to the street, the proposed eight foot wall, and the overall boldness of the proposal.
- 5) Ms. Bedard acknowledged a telephone call received from Wanda Staberos, who expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility.

Letters of expressed concerns were received from Claire Bacher, Natalie Selub, Janet Koed, Maureen McFadden, Kymberlee Ruff, Cathie McCammon, David Bacher, Yeoj Aromas, Drew Dyer, Berni Bernstein, Pam Brandon, Irene Stanley, Betsy Cramer, and Paula Westbury.

Public comment closed at 4:24 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design; however, suggests the following items of study:
- 2) Study lowering the height of the wall along the interior property adjacent to the public beach access.
- 3) Study the tower element with the suggestion to either eliminate it or revise the design and reduce the height.
- 4) Study manipulating plate heights, possibly a 7-foot plate height going into a higher plate height. Moody Sisters was suggested as a design reference.
- 5) Study methods to reduce the overall size and mass as viewed from the public street. Suggestions included:
 - a. Providing an increased setback from the street;
 - b. Recessing the second floor;
- 6) Revising entry design to the court yard to be neighborhood friendly, and recessing the court yard entry wall from the proposed residence.
- 7) Provide two renderings of the front elevation; one of the elevation itself and the other to include plants at mature growth.
- 8) Include more evergreen trees to increase neighborhood compatibility.

Action: Miller/James, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein and Zimmerman stepped down, Woolery absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 1816 CLEVELAND AVE****R-2 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-061-010

Application Number: MST2013-00344

Owner: Gordon Family Survivors Trust

Architect: Peter Walk Hunt

(Proposal to permit the 'as-built' 64 square foot entry porch addition, an 'as-built' 95 square foot under-floor utility room addition, a remodel and addition to the existing two-car carport, and permit the 'as-built' approximately 342 square foot, uncovered, deck, located above the carport. The proposed total of 1,283 square feet, located on a 5,050 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 53% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. The project will address violations identified in ENF2013-00555.)

(Concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 4:59 p.m.

Present: Peter Hunt, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:19 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and to return to the Consent Calendar with comments:

- 1) The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Design Guidelines.
- 2) The alteration to the roof form is acceptable.
- 3) Replace the bamboo railing with standard wood construction railing to match existing.

Action: Bernstein/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**4. 1291 W MOUNTAIN DR****A-1 Zone****(4:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-050-037
 Application Number: MST2012-00030
 Owner: Allison Armour Revocable Living Trust
 Architect: Blackbird Architects

(Proposal to construct a new 2,499 square foot, one-story, single-family residence and an attached 635 square foot two-car garage located on a 3-acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes 642 cubic yards of cut and 633 cubic yards of fill. Construction of a detached 500 square foot accessory workshop structure and a 390 square foot open barn is also proposed. The proposed total of 4,024 square feet is 66% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline.)

(Review After Final to add 242 square feet to east side of residence, and add one sliding door.)

Actual time: 5:30 p.m.

Present: Allison Armour and Jonathan Bryce, Owners

Public comment opened at 5:38 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

Action: Pierce/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

NEW ITEM – REFERRED FROM CONSENT**1291 W MOUNTAIN DR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-050-037
 Application Number: MST2013-00357
 Owner: Allison Armour Revocable Living Trust
 Applicant: Myles Steimle
 Engineer: Pool Engineering, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new in ground pool and spa to total 585 square feet in area located on a 3.04 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a new, 5-foot tall, black, vinyl-coated, chain-link security perimeter fence and gate, new pool equipment, and approximately 50 cubic yards of grading. There is an active building permit (BLD2012-00857) to construct a new single-family residence, detached garage, detached accessory structure, and barn.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

This item was reviewed in conjunction with Item 4 on the Full Board agenda.

Actual time: 5:30 p.m.

Present: Allison Armour and Jonathan Bryce, Owners

Public comment opened at 5:38 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely back to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:**
- 1) Provide details for pool equipment and retaining wall (equipment screening).
 - 2) Include a site section through the pool with all appropriate labeling.
 - 3) Clearly denote on the plans the locations of hardscape (i.e., walkways and decking) and landscaping around the pool and the relationship between the residence and the pool.
 - 4) Clearly denote the species, size, critical root zone, and location of the existing tree, and the distance between the tree and the proposed pool.
 - 5) Show the fencing and security gate location; provide details and description.
- Action:** Pierce/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

**** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:50 P.M. TO 5:53 P.M. ****

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

5. 3435 MARINA DR

A-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-022-005
 Application Number: MST2013-00281
 Owner: Charles Rudd
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a new, two-story, 4,760 square foot, single-family residence, and a 600 square foot three-car garage, located on a vacant 1.12 acre lot in the Hillside Design District and within the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes, new site walls and gates, new site landscaping and hardscape, a new pool, and 400 cubic yards of site grading to be balanced on site. The proposed 5,360 square feet residence is 106% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 5:50 p.m.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect
 Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 6:05 p.m.

- 1) Kitch Wilson, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed project and resulting obstructions of the public view corridor (horse path); opposed to the second story and the 5-foot concrete wall around the property.
- 2) Susan Zalon, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility, preservation of public views, landscaping, size, bulk and scale. Opposed to height of the gate in front of the house.
- 3) Ronald Green, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the preservation of public views, the roof height, neighborhood compatibility, FAR, and size, bulk and scale.
- 4) Michael Moore, opposition; agrees with previous three speakers. Expressed concerns regarding the finished floor height being too high, and is against the residence being a two-story home. Believes the ridge height of the roof should be 16-18 feet. Expressed further concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility and the FAR being too high.
- 5) Donald Santee, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility, preservation

of public views, the FAR, and the western line vegetation. Property walls and fences and trees should be low enough not to block views and corridors.

- 6) Ms. Bedard acknowledged receipt of a letter from Sandy Schoolfield expressing appreciation that the wood fence has been changed to a metal one, the outside staircase to the second story has been removed, and the size of the second story has been reduced.
- 7) Ms. Bedard acknowledged receipt of an email from Pam and Russ Strobel, property owners of the adjacent parcel at 3455 Marina Dr., expressing support for the project.

A letter of expressed concerns was received from Paula Westbury.

Public comment closed at 6:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the changes presented, including the removal of the exterior staircase and the reduction in size of the second floor deck.
- 2) The current proposal at 103% FAR is too large. Provide a reduction in the total square footage. The FAR does not necessarily need to be at 85%, but should move closer to that direction.
- 3) Study the shape of the house to address its size, bulk, and scale.
- 4) Study the placement of the building on the lot, the placement, size, and mass of a proposed second story, and the proposed residence in relation to the proposed site landscaping.
- 5) Study a different approach to the motor court; study materials and designs to be compatible with the neighborhood; discussion included a reduction in height.
- 6) Provide elevations of the entry gate and walls; study proportions in relationship to the proposed building and from the street.

Action: Bernstein/James, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Pierce stepped down. Woolery absent).

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)**NEW ITEM****A. 939 ALEEDA LN A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-070-012
Application Number: MST2013-00366
Owner: Lee Stevens Separate Property Trust
Architect: Stephanie Poole

(Proposal for an "as-built" 116 square foot one story addition, to replace 5 aluminum windows with 5 vinyl windows, replace the garage door, replace entry doors, replace two windows with French doors and to replace an aluminum sliding door with French doors to an existing single family dwelling with an attached two-car garage.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

NEW ITEM**B. 1291 W MOUNTAIN DR A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-050-037
Application Number: MST2013-00357
Owner: Allison Armour Revocable Living Trust
Applicant: Myles Steimle
Engineer: Pool Engineering, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new in ground pool and spa to total 585 square feet in area located on a 3.04 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a new, 5-foot tall, black, vinyl-coated, chain-link security perimeter fence and gate, new pool equipment, and approximately 50 cubic yards of grading. There is an active building permit (BLD2012-00857) to construct a new single-family residence, detached garage, detached accessory structure, and barn.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Referred to the Full Board to be reviewed in conjunction with Item 4 with comments:

- 1) Provide a revised site plan to coordinate the proposed footprint addition, the revised pool location, and clarify location and the "critical root zone" of the existing tree within close proximity to the proposed pool.
- 2) Clarify the proposed total excavation in cubic yards for the new pool.
- 3) Show the proposed location of the pool fencing; provide material and construction details.

NEW ITEM**C. 2510 MESA SCHOOL LN****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-292-035
Application Number: MST2013-00350
Owner: Alan Glink
Designer: Steve Willson
Landscape Architect: Yardy Design

(Proposal to seek a new approval of a previously approved and subsequently expired project (MST2009-00506). Proposal to demolish the existing single-family residence and garage and construct a 2,861 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, and an attached, 408 square foot, two-car garage, located on a 15,000 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes a 330 square foot, detached accessory building, and a 237 square foot workshop, attached to the garage, new site walls, fences, and landscaping. The proposed total of 3,836 square feet is 88% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

The following people spoke in support of the project:

1. John Lengsfelder, 2516 Mesa School Ln.; and
2. Nancy Ferguson, 2502 Mesa School Ln.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the condition to replace the cypress tree that was removed with a 36' box Arbutus Marina, as noted on Sheet L-1.

NEW ITEM**D. 265 CONEJO RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-041-008
Application Number: MST2013-00351
Owner: Wendy M Edmunds
Designer: Kris Kirkelie

(Proposal to construct a 1,986 square foot, one-story, single-family residence and an attached, 415 square foot, two-car garage, located on a 2.35 acre parcel in the Hillside Design District. The prior residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. A prior project (MST2009-00183) was previously approved and has subsequently expired. The proposal includes a 165 square foot, detached, accessory building, a 696 square foot exterior deck, a new spa, and the removal of one, 30-inch diameter, oak tree. The proposed total of 2,566 square feet is 45% of the guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of requested zoning modifications.)

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate, and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Design Guidelines.
- 2) Provide details for eaves, rain gutters, windows, doors, colors, and materials, etc.
- 3) Provide a revised site landscape plan with an updated building footprint and provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.
- 4) Provide elevations and floor plans of the detached accessory structure.
- 5) Proposed removal of the fire damaged Oak is acceptable.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**E. 1218 E DE LA GUERRA ST****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-132-003
Application Number: MST2013-00008
Owner: Ray S. Goodner Revocable Trust
Architect: Gary Jensen

(Proposal to construct a new 405 square foot second story addition and a new 174 square foot ground level accessory building to an existing 1,491 square foot single-family residence and an attached 390 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes the removal of an existing palm tree and a new four-foot tall wrought iron gate across the driveway. The proposed total of 2,460 square feet, located on a 10,000 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 66% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design and Final Approval are requested.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 1702 LA VISTA DEL OCEANO DR****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-480-061
Application Number: MST2005-00020
Owner: Vista Oceano La Mesa Venture, LLC
Agent: Brent Daniels
Architect: Zehren and Associates
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for revisions to the previously approved project to include enclosing a 400 square foot covered porch into a new family room, adding a new fire place and chimney, adding four new high windows and a new skylight. The original project, which is currently under construction, is a new 4,281 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, with an attached 443 square foot two-car garage and a detached 251 square foot one-car garage, located on a 45,143 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The revised proposals results in a total of 5,375 square feet and is 108% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Review After Final for alterations to pool and spa location, revised associated pool hardscape and site landscaping.)

Approval as submitted of Review After Final.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**G. 3232 CAMPANIL DR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-102-028
 Application Number: MST2012-00469
 Owner: Compton Family Trust
 Architect: Jeffrey Berkus
 Contractor: Young Construction
 Landscape Architect: S.A. Fausset-Landscape Architect, Inc.

(Proposal for the construction of a new vehicular entry gate, pillars and site walls, located on a 38,049 square foot property to be developed with a new, two-story, single-family residence. The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow the new site improvements to exceed the maximum 42-inch height requirement, located within 20-feet of the front property line. An application was approved by the Single Family Design Board on February 25, 2013, to demolish the existing residence and site improvements, and construct a new, 6,864 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, including an attached three-car garage.)

(Project Design and Final Approvals are requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 051-13.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

NEW ITEM**H. 1207 PORTESUELLO AVE****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-192-006
 Application Number: MST2013-00361
 Owner: Steven T. Kiehn
 Applicant: Ventura Pools

(Proposal to construct an in-ground swimming pool, automatic pool cover, spa, pool equipment and 80 cubic yards of cut grading to a property with an existing single family dwelling with an attached garage in the Hillside Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided).

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as Submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Brian Miller and Jaime Pierce.
 Meeting attended by Addison Thompson, Planning Commission Liaison.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:40 P.M. ****