



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, January 14, 2013 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

- DENISE WOOLERY, *Chair* - PRESENT
- FRED SWEENEY, *Vice-Chair* - PRESENT
- BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT
- BRIAN MILLER (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative) - PRESENT
- LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative) - ABSENT
- JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative) - PRESENT
- JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative) - PRESENT

- CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT
- PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** ADDISON THOMPSON - ABSENT
- PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE):** JOHN CAMPANELLA - ABSENT

- STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT UNTIL 6:10 P.M.
- MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
- ROSA ROGERS O'REILLY, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/SFDB and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

- Members present: Woolery, Bernstein, Miller (3:08), Pierce, Sweeney, and Zimmerman.
- Members absent: James.
- Staff present: Bedard, Limon, Goo, and Rogers O'Reilly.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **December 17, 2012.**

- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **December 17, 2012**, as submitted.
- Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Miller & Woolery abstained, James absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **January 7, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **January 14, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

Action: Bernstein/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Board member Pierce announced she would be stepping down from Item #3, 32 E. Islay Street and Item #4, 20 Las Alturas Cir.
2. Board member Zimmerman announced he would be stepping down from Item #9, 1533 Shoreline Drive.
3. Staff announced Lisa James would be absent.
4. Jill Zachary, Assistant Director of Parks and Recreation, City of Santa Barbara, announced that the City will host two community meetings to discuss "The Future of the Urban Forest." Meetings will be held on Thursday, January 24, 2013, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. at the Central Library Faulkner Gallery; and on Saturday, January 26, 2013, from 10:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m. at the Louise Lowry Davis Center.

E. Subcommittee Reports: No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**1. 209 MOHAWK RD****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-342-001

Application Number: MST2012-00485

Owner: Ronald F and Carol L Stotts

(Proposal to permit two uncovered parking spaces, per the requested parking exception for a property developed with a floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) of less than an 80%, rather than construct the previously approved two-car garage. The proposal also includes 'as-built' alterations to site retaining walls to be constructed at 5-feet tall, instead of the previously permitted 4-foot height. The 11,625 square foot parcel is currently developed with an existing 2,007 square foot single-family residence with a 428 square foot basement, and is 62% of the floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal will address violations identified in ENF2012-00541.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Carol and Ronald Stotts, Owners.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the following conditions:

- 1) Applicant cover the exposed reinforcing bars with an architectural element to preserve for a future possible garage.
- 2) The Board finds the 5-foot retaining wall to be acceptable.
- 3) The Board finds that the driveway is aesthetically pleasing.

- 4) Provide a section detail of the proposed permeable driveway material design to verify it will qualify as a permeable design, as required.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 2625 SAMARKAND DR

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-303-004
Application Number: MST2012-00488
Owner: Bank of America
Applicant: Mark Morando
Agent: John Fontana

(Proposal to replace a carport with two-uncovered parking spaces, per the uncovered parking exception for properties developed with less than 80% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal also includes the 'as-built' 396 square foot first-floor addition and alterations and reductions to an existing second-story deck, and other site alterations. The proposed development total of 2,321 square feet, located on a 10,299 square foot parcel, is 61% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal will address violations identified in ZIR2012-00448 and ENF2012-00828.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:38 p.m.

Present: Mark Morando, Applicant.

Motion: Continued 2 weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study an alternative design configuration of the proposed parking spaces. The Board would prefer to see two parking spaces side by side.
- 2) Consider removing the current staircase and replacing it with a proper staircase from the garage level to the lower pool area.
- 3) The Board finds the general size and shape of deck is acceptable provided the overall reduction in size.
- 4) Provide a screening solution to the south side of the deck.

Action: Sweeney/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**3. 32 E ISLAY ST****E-1 Zone**

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-102-005
Application Number: MST2012-00440
Owner: Arthur Denk
Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a 275 square foot one-story addition and a new 423 square foot two-story addition to an existing one-story 1,470 square foot single-family residence. The proposal includes the demolition of an existing, detached, 270 square foot one-car garage and construction of a new attached 280 square foot one-car garage. A new 45 square foot second-floor balcony is proposed. The proposed total of 2,448 square feet, located on a 6,080 square foot lot, is 90% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The project was last reviewed at SFDB on December 3, 2012.)

Actual time: 4:06 p.m.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; Arthur Denk, Owner; and Rico Lorelli.

Public comment opened at 4:18 p.m.

- 1) Phil Morreale (easterly neighbor) submitted a letter of opposition; expressed concerns regarding privacy and neighborhood compatibility.

Public comment closed at 4:22 p.m.

Motion: Continued 2 weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study reducing the FAR to 85%; however a larger FAR may be supported if the proposed addition is an exemplary design.
- 2) Study the configuration of the proposed addition in order to make it more integrated and compatible with the original building and architectural style; including the roof configuration and window sizes, styles, and locations.
- 3) Study design alternatives which include the project retaining a detached garage design; consider a design which incorporates a breezeway rather than the addition being connected to the residence.
- 4) Study alternative designs in terms of the stair location.
- 5) The Board does not have a preference to the use of clear or obscure glass for the bathroom windows; however the applicant is encouraged to study alternatives to the bathroom windows in design and location in order to help maximize the neighbor privacy.
- 6) The proposed new trees are to be, at the very minimum, 24-inch box trees.
- 7) The Board finds the 12-foot hedge height acceptable.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce stepped down; James absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 20 LAS ALTURAS CIR****A-1 Zone****(4:35)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-122-001

Application Number: MST2012-00270

Owner: Charles Rudd & Inken Gerlach

Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a new 3,430 square foot two-story, single-family residence with an attached 515 square foot garage located on a 19,718 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous 3,475 square foot single-family residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes new site walls, an existing pool to remain, new pool decking, removal and replacement of an existing 32 inch diameter trunk, redwood tree with three oak trees, and proposed grading of 100 cubic yards of cut, 70 cubic yards of fill and 30 cubic yards of export. The proposed total of 3,945 square feet of development is 89% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer approval for requested zoning modifications. The project requires a Public Works encroachment permit.)

(Project Design Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing officer Resolution No. 054-12. Compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program is required prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on October 22, 2012.)

Actual time: 4:37 p.m.

Chair Woolery read a statement regarding sole proprietorships exceptions, and Board member presentations.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; Charles Rudd and Inken Gerlach, Owners.

Public comment opened at 4:49 p.m.

- 1) Don Vogt addressed the Board. He has no issue with this project at the moment.

Public comment closed at 4:51 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Consider adding stone to the columns on the south elevation, rather than the plaster as shown.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce stepped down, James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**5. 22 NICHOLAS LN****E-1 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-033-002
Application Number: MST2011-00063
Owner: Brian & Robin Kopeikin
Architect: Kimberly True

(Proposal for a new 6-foot tall plaster site wall with sandstone cap on the Barker Pass Road side of the property and along the north interior property line, multiple stacked walls varying in height from 6-inches to 3 feet, new landscaping; new 1,555 square foot flagstone patio to replace existing 640 square foot concrete patio, remove and replace garden stairs, and removal of one existing 16 to 18-foot tall cypress tree. The project will involve approximately 32 cubic yards of fill grading.)

(Review After Final for minor design alterations to the previously approved 6-foot stucco wall and landscaping for the wall along the northerly interior property line. Alterations to the site wall and landscaping along Barker Pass Road was approved on June 4, 2012.)

Actual time: 4:59 p.m.

Present: Kimberly True, Architect; Skye McGinnes, Contractor; and Robin Kopeikin, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:21 p.m.

- 1) Frank Heath, opposition; expressed concerns regarding hedge height being higher than the wall, preservation of private views and the potential destruction of the neighbor's driveway. Requested that all vegetation be trimmed at all times at all walls at the height of the wall as it stands.
- 2) Robert Sailors, opposition; expressed concerns regarding preservation of private views.
- 3) Pamela Hazard, opposition; expressed concerns regarding hedge height maintenance and requested that applicants choose landscaping that doesn't naturally grow high.
- 4) Mindy Wolfe for Lauren Moore, opposition; expressed concerns regarding groundwater runoff, hedge height maintenance, and neighborhood compatibility.
- 5) Keith Strauss (by telephone), opposition; expressed concerns regarding preservation of private views and choice of vegetation.
- 6) Mindy Wolfe, Attorney for Patricia Rumpza, opposition; expressed concerns regarding preservation of private ocean and harbor views, true wall height, drainage, hedge height, the potential destruction of the neighbor's driveway and the potential fire risk imposed by hedges. Requested that applicant reduce wall height to six feet above the original grade.
- 7) Robin Kopeikin, support; responded to public comment. Noted that the original grade has been restored, that they will solve the drainage issue and that everything on this project has been approved by fire.

Public comment closed at 5:41 p.m.

Mr. Limon clarified for the Board the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance (NPO) requirements regarding the Good Neighbor Guidelines and the Board's purview over protection of private views.

Motion: Approval of the Review After Final with the following conditions:

- 1) The Board finds that the wall height is acceptable as shown on Sheet L-2.1 and L-S.1.
- 2) Applicant is denied the proposed 8-foot tall hedge along the northerly interior property line. Provide replacement landscaping screening that will not exceed the height of the wall.
- 3) The Board finds that the proposed drainage shown on Sheet L2.1 is acceptable as

long as the work will be confined to the applicant's property and that no work will occur on the neighboring property.

- 4) The Board is open to the contractor and the applicant working to achieve an alternative drainage solution that may possibly eliminate the need to remove 9 inches of the existing neighbor's driveway, which is located on the applicant's property.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed; James absent)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 25 MINUTES AT 6:10 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:35 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW

6. 20 CAMINO VERDE

A-1 Zone

(6:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-282-027

Application Number: MST2012-00283

Owner: Rory Rye & Jim Doub

Applicant: Jim Doub

Architect: Edwards Pitman Architects AIA

(Proposal to construct a new single-family residence to replace the residence destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes the construction of a new 5,413 square foot, two-story residence, including an attached two-car garage. The project includes 346 square feet of decks and refurbishment of an existing swimming pool and spa. No grading is proposed. The proposed total of 5,413 square feet, located on a 1.3 acre parcel in the Hillside Design District, is 105% of the guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval requested. Project Design Approval was granted on November 5, 2012.)

Actual time: 6:37 p.m.

Present: Jack Kiesel, Architect; Rory Rye and Jim Doub, Owners.

Public comment opened at 6:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

1) Relocate the A/C unit out of the front yard setback.

2) Provide noise specifications for the A/C units to show compliance with the Noise Ordinance per Santa Barbara Municipal Code §9.16).

Action: Zimmerman/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 220 SALIDA DEL SOL****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(6:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-123-001
Application Number: MST2012-00359
Owner: Kirk & Tanase Peacock
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to construct a new 300 square foot one-story addition and 556 square foot two-story addition to an existing 1,599 square foot single-family residence, and an attached 441 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,896 square feet, located on an 8,524 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 87% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval requested. The project was last reviewed on October 22, 2012.)

Actual time: 6:55 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued to consent with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the consistency and appearance, compatibility and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Provide drainage details, including locations of downspouts.
- 3) Eliminate the radius on the corbel under the balcony and use 90 degree right angles.
- 4) Provide a color and materials board for the file.

Action: Zimmerman/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**8. 1676 FRANCESCHI RD****A-1 Zone**

(7:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-102-004
Application Number: MST2012-00493
Owner: B & B SB Trust
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to demolish the existing 5,124 square foot single-family residence and construct a new 6,496 square foot three-story single-family residence located on a 2-acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes an attached 750 square foot three-car garage, two-uncovered parking spaces, a 200 square foot detached accessory building, new site walls and gates, new site landscaping, and a new pool. A total of 351 cubic yards of site grading is proposed, including 201 cubic yards of grading within the proposed building footprint and 150 cubic yards of grading elsewhere on site. The project is 113% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) and includes a 50% reduction of basement level square footage.)

(Concept Review. Comments only; project requires compliance with the Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program.)

Actual time: 7:11 p.m.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:35 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Robert P. Miles was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design, proposed material, color pallet and architectural style.
- 2) Provide complete story poles, including the ridges, eave lines, and the horizontal mass, for consideration of the overall massing and scale, not just the height. Review the story poles requirements.
- 3) Provide a conceptual site landscape plan.
- 4) The Board would like to see further definition on the proposed railing details for the decks.
- 5) Study reducing the FAR to closer to 100%.
- 6) Further definition of view considerations from the lower private road and the proposed cabana.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Woolery and Miller opposed/ James absent).

FINAL REVIEW**9. 1533 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(7:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-182-014
Application Number: MST2012-00046
Owner: Anina Davenport Revocable Trust
Architect: James Zimmerman

(This project has been revised to reduce the overall second-story addition by 283 square feet, reducing the FAR from 85% to 79%, and elimination of the 700 square foot "as-built" bluff-side, circular tiled patio. The revised proposal involves the construction of a 946 square foot, second-story addition to an existing 2,419 square foot residence with an attached two-car garage. The project also includes a major façade remodel, a 92 square foot one-story addition and interior remodel. The proposed total of 3,457 square feet, located on a 19,166 square foot lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and in the Hillside Design District, is 79% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project received Planning Commission approval for a Coastal Development Permit and zoning modifications (Resolution No. 018-12). The proposal will address the violations in ZIR2011-00381.)

(Final Approval requested. Project Design Approval was granted on December 17, 2012.)

Actual time: 8:07 p.m.

Vice-Chair Sweeney read a statement regarding sole proprietorships exceptions, and Board member presentations.

Present: James Zimmerman, Architect.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Approval of proposed changes in roof and entry doors and lights as shown on Sheet A5, dated January 3, 2013.
- 2) Provide final details on lighting fixtures.

Action: Pierce/Sweeney, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman stepped down, James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:21 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):**FINAL REVIEW****A. 331 CONEJO RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-050-031
Application Number: MST2012-00454
Owner: Daniel Heckman
Architect: Craig Shallenberger

(Proposal to rebuild a single-family residence and garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal will rebuild the original 2,328 square foot, two-story, single-family residence and attached 412 square foot two-car garage, located within the footprint of the original residence. The proposed total of 2,740 square feet, located on an 11,674 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 72% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).

(Final Approval of architecture and landscaping requested.)

Final approval with conditions:

- 1) Architecture approved as submitted.
- 2) Remove shrubs at deck because they may not meet High Fire Area requirements.
- 3) Submit irrigation plan with point of connection, identify backflow device location, number and location of valves, and irrigation notes.
- 4) Complete and reproduce the landscape compliance statement on the landscape plans.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 1101 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-221-016
Application Number: MST2012-00463
Owner: Ryan Mcfadden
Architect: Dylan Chappell

(Proposal to permit the 'as-built' demolition of the original covered parking and provide two new uncovered parking spaces, per the requested parking exception for a property developed with a floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) of less than an 80%. The proposal includes a new 105 square foot storage shed and the addition of one new window on the north elevation. The 6,572 square foot lot is currently developed with an existing one-story, 1,520 square foot, single-family residence and is 54% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. The proposal will address violations identified in ZIR2012-00507.

(Final approval of architecture and landscaping requested.)

Final approval with conditions:

- 1) Replace Agave species with Agave Attennata.
- 2) Recommend replacing proposed Eugenia hedge with smaller foundation hedge such as Myrsine or Escallonia Fradesii for less trimming maintenance.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**C. 1150 BEL AIR DR E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-280-018
 Application Number: MST2012-00483
 Owner: Alta Community Invest, LLC
 Architect: Steve Harrel

(Proposal for an interior and exterior remodel to an existing two-story 2,350 square foot single-family residence and a detached 320 square foot two-car garage, located on a 14,810 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District. Alterations include a new trellis/deck addition, replacement of all windows and doors, the addition of one new window and one new door, adding shutters to the windows, and the replacement of the garage door.)

(Project Design and Final Approval requested.)

Project Design and Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 14 MORADA LN A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-151-009
 Application Number: MST2013-00010
 Owner: Arthur N & Amy D Tracewell
 Architect: Ted Meeder
 Contractor: Walker Pools, Inc

(Proposal to permit the 'as-built' 146 square foot addition to the existing 258 square foot accessory structure, to permit the 'as-built' 221 square foot covered patio, with outdoor kitchen, and a new flagstone patio, fireplace and attached stucco seat wall. The proposal also includes the demolition of the 'as-built' carport. The one-acre parcel is currently developed with an existing one-story 1,603 square foot single-family residence. A separate application for a new pool and spa was previously approved (MST2012-00404).

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**E. 3208 CAMPANIL DR A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-110-007
 Application Number: MST2013-00003
 Owner: Bollag Family Trust
 Designer: Carlos Grano

(Proposal for a new one-story 183 square foot laundry room addition to an existing two-story, 8,372 square foot single family residence with an attached 3-car garage, located on a 7-acre parcel in the Hillside Design District. The proposal is 87% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) Shed roof as proposed is not consistent with the existing architecture.
- 2) Study alternative flat roof with parapet, or hip roof, or a gable roof.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Brian Miller** and **Lisa James**.