



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, August 27, 2012 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

DENISE WOOLERY, *Chair* – PRESENT
FRED SWEENEY, *Vice-Chair* - PRESENT
BERNI BERNSTEIN - ABSENT
BRIAN MILLER (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative) - PRESENT
LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative) – PRESENT
JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative) – PRESENT UNTIL 4:25 P.M.
JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative) - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON – PRESENT UNTIL 6:28 P.M.

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): JOHN CAMPANELLA - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – ABSENT
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Woolery, James, Miller, Pierce (present until 4:25 p.m.), and Sweeney, and Zimmerman.

Members absent: Bernstein.

Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of Tuesday, August 21, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **Tuesday, August 21, 2012**, as submitted.

Action: Sweeney/Pierce, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Miller abstained, Bernstein absent).

C. Consent Calendar. (Last Monday's August 20, 2012 Consent was ratified at Tuesday's August 21st meeting).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **August 27, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Brian Miller** and **Lisa James**.

Action: Sweeney/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Bedard announced Board member Bernstein would be absent at today's meeting.

2. Board member Pierce previously announced she would be stepping down from Item #4, 1131 Las Alturas Rd., and Item #5, 20 Las Alturas Circle.

E. Subcommittee Reports: No subcommittee reports.**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****1. 909 CALLE CORTITA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-176-015

Application Number: MST2011-00353

Owner: George and Deanna Gregg Living Trust

(Revised proposal for 999 square feet of one- and two-story additions to an existing 2,080 square foot two-story single-family residence, with an attached 418 square foot two-car garage, located on a 9,727 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The 999 square foot addition involves a new 519 square foot addition to the existing second-level, and a new 480 square foot grade level addition. A total of 290 cubic yards of grading will be balanced on site. This project will result in a three-story, 3,497 square foot single-family residence, and is 99% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project received Planning Commission approval for a floor area modification on August 9, 2012 (Resolution No. 012-12).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-12. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on February 27, 2012.)

(3:06)

Present: George Gregg, Property Owner.

Chair Woolery read out to the Board the Conditions of Approval for the Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-12.

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, the Hillside Design District Findings, and Grading Findings have been met as stated in subsection 22.69.050.B and C, of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments and finds the proposed project to be consistent with the Neighborhood Preservation Findings, in that the project is consistent in appearance, neighborhood compatible, is of quality architecture and materials, and has an appropriate site landscape plan.
- 2) The proposed project is consistent with the Hillside Design District and Sloped Lot Findings in that the proposed addition is designed to be sensitive to the existing site topography, and the building maintains a scale that blends with the hillside by minimizing the visual appearance of the structures and the overall height of structures.
- 3) The proposed project is consistent with the Grading Findings as the proposed grading will not significantly increase siltation or decrease the water quality of streams, drainages, or water storage facilities to which the property drains, and the proposed grading will not cause a substantial loss of southern oak woodland habitat.
- 4) The proposed project is in compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-12.
- 5) Provide all typical construction details on the plans for final Consent review.
- 6) Provide an acceptable solution for the existing lawn under the oak tree in the landscape plan.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 415 ALAN RD

A-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-091-024

Application Number: MST2012-00268

Owner: Seybold 1997 Trust

Architect: Christine Pierron

(Proposal for a 39 square foot addition and conversion of an existing 221 square foot accessory building into a new 260 square foot one-car garage, and construction of a new attached 496 square foot accessory building, located on a proposed 45,056 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District and in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal also includes a new patio and a new 42-inch in height retaining wall. There is an existing 3,372 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached two-car garage to remain. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. A two-lot subdivision, resulting in a 45,056 square foot lot and a 14,601 square foot lot, has been approved for this site and is awaiting approval from the California Coastal Commission. The proposed total development of 4,128 square feet is 82% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(3:36)

Present: Christine Pierron, Architect; and Mr. Seybold, Property Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:42 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the general direction of the design as appropriate for the proposed project.
- 2) The Board finds the proposed zoning modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.
- 3) Study and clearly document all existing and proposed new fence and wall heights, locations, and material details on the plans.

Action: Sweeney/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 123 E PEDREGOSA ST

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-381-013
Application Number: MST2012-00081
Owner: Braulio Jimenez
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal for a total of 660 square feet of one- and two-story additions to an existing one-story, 958 square foot, single-family residence, with an existing detached 183 square foot one-car garage. The proposed total of 660 square feet of additions includes a 367 square foot new two-story addition, and 293 square feet of one-story additions. The proposal will result in a 1,801 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached 183 square foot one-car garage. The proposed total of 1,801 square feet, located on an 8,326 square foot lot, is 55% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of a requested zoning modification.)

(3:51)

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:58 p.m.

- 1) James Karlin, opposition; staff read a written note of expressed concerns and additional questions regarding the proposed changes and modification.
- 2) Dianne Porinsh, Agent for the adjacent owner Ryan Spilsborghs (read Mr. Spilsborghs' letter); spoke of privacy concerns, and design above the garage.
- 3) Valeria Froscher, opposition; spoke of proximity concerns of the proposed project.

Public comment closed at 4:06 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study an alternative second-story design centered above the existing house.
- 2) Provide site sections through the residence, the property, and adjacent properties for an understanding of the site views.
- 3) Provide all architectural elements and details of both the existing house and the proposed addition.
- 4) Provide a site landscape plan to identify all existing and proposed landscaping on the property; clarify the location of an existing, possibly overheight, bamboo hedge.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**4. 1131 LAS ALTURAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-113-030

Application Number: MST2012-00164

Owner: Charles Rudd Jr.

Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a new 4,030 square foot three story, single-family residence, including a basement, and an attached 470 square foot garage, located on a 20,024 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous approximately 3,000 square foot single-family residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes new entry gates, new retaining walls, new patios and decks, a new spa, an existing swimming pool to remain, and a total of 50 cubic yards of grading. Also proposed is the removal of three existing trees and planting of four new replacement trees. The proposed total of 4,500 square feet, which includes a 50% reduction of the basement square footage area, is 95% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project received a Project Design Approval on June 4, 2012. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval.)

(4:25)

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; Jaime Pierce, Landscape Architect; Charles Rudd Jr., Property Owner; and Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:39 p.m.

- 1) Penny True, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility.

Public comment closed at 4:45 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board found the architectural style generally acceptable.
- 2) Provide a complete set of structural drawings.
- 3) Provide a smoother proposed eyebrow (window) detail.
- 4) Provide a simpler column support alternative at the trellises.
- 5) Provide a simpler alternative for the proposed chimney cap.
- 6) Provide additional information to resolve retention of surface storm water at the southwest corner of the property.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce stepped down, Bernstein absent).

Board comments: The Board commented on the distinction between this property, and the other proposed neighborhood project at 20 Las Alturas Circle, regarding “neighborhood compatibility” of second-floor proposals in the area.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 20 MINUTES AT 5:11 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:16 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 20 LAS ALTURAS CIR

A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-122-001
Application Number: MST2012-00270
Owner: Charles Rudd and Inken Gerlach
Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a new 3,710 square foot three-level, single-family residence with an attached 475 square foot garage located on a 19,718 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous 3,475 square foot single-family residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes new site walls, an existing pool to remain, new pool decking, removal and replacement of an existing 32 inch diameter trunk, Redwood tree with three Oak trees, and proposed grading of 100 cubic yards of cut, 70 cubic yards of fill and 30 cubic yards of export. The proposed total of 4,185 square feet of development is 94% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications and a Public Works encroachment permit.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment, Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications, and a Public Works encroachment permit for work in the public right-of-way.)

(5:16)

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; Charles Rudd Jr., Property Owner; and Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:42 p.m.

- 1) Carolyn Vogt opposition; (provided some additional documentation and photographs; and also spoke for Manny Espig); expressed concerns regarding the second-story addition for neighborhood compatibility among the nine homes in that cul-de-sac.
- 2) Don Vogt, opposition (submitted letters; provided some additional documentation and photographs; and also spoke for George Northrop, Pat Mitchell, and Doug Crawford); expressed concerns regarding the effect of a second-story addition in the neighborhood (post Tea Fire); visibility from the street; site lines and privacy concerns; and noise abatement.
- 3) Art Ayres, opposition; expressed concerns regarding size and bulk of the proposed project and second-story addition.

Letters of concern from Janet Vlasach; Jesse Benenati; Tracy Wells; Jon A. Hepper; and Don Vogt (including a petition with multiple signatures) were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:02 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy the site wall, and consider a separate smaller pool enclosure fence or wall.
- 2) Study an alternative to the existing retaining wall on Las Alturas Circle, and on Las Alturas Road.
- 3) The Board cannot support the size, scale, and bulk of the proposed house at 94% FAR; applicant to reduce the FAR closer to the 85% guideline and consider an architectural solution to appear more as a one-story residential design, or an alternative split-level design; and to study other designs of homes in the Las Alturas Circle area.
- 4) Careful consideration is to be given to the location of any exterior decks.
- 5) Consideration of the new design to take into consideration tree relocations or tree removals.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce stepped down, Bernstein absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:28 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 414 E ALAMAR AVE****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-201-015
Application Number: MST2011-00183
Owner: Patricia Ann Fiedler Trustee
Designer: Joaquin Ornelas
Agent: June Pujo

(Review After Final proposal for revisions to a previously approved front yard wall, varying in height to a maximum of 5'-8" with six-foot, four-inch pillars, located on a 9,148 square foot lot currently developed with a one-story, 1,569 square foot single-family residence with a detached 460 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification (Resolution No. 031-12).)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 031-12.)

Approval of Review After Final with compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 031-12.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 1207 MIRAMONTE DR****E-1/PUD Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-021-025
Application Number: MST2012-00261
Owner: Albert and Lillian Pizano
Contractor: Richard Visueta

(Proposal to replace the existing shake roof and replace with a new S-tile roof for an existing two-story single-family residence located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Project Design and Final Approval is requested.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with conditions that the applicant follow the clay S-tile roof installation details, per by the SFDB Guidelines, to make the roof more authentic in appearance, with details to include:

- 1) A double starter row of two-pierce barrel tile is employed at the eave ends;
- 2) The roof has 15% to 20% of the field tiles laid with mortared randomly placed boosters (kickers); and
- 3) Natural cement mortared hips and ridges are present.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 903 ALSTON RD****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-174-018
Application Number: MST2012-00190
Owner: JW Realty, LLC
Architect: Al Winsor

(Proposal for site alterations for an existing parcel currently developed with a single-family residence located on a 26,570 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The alterations include the demolition of existing retaining walls, construction of new site retaining walls, a new entry gate with columns, alterations and expansion to an existing carport, and resurface of the existing driveway and replacement of a portion of existing gravel driveway with permeable pavers. Other site improvements include new patios and decks, new trellis, new site landscaping and drainage, approximately 100 cubic yards of grading, and exterior lighting. A portion of the new retaining walls, located along the street frontage, is also proposed to occur on the adjacent neighbor parcel at 901 Alston.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project received Project Design Approval on June 4, 2012.)

Final Approval as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Brian Miller** and **Lisa James**.