



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, April 9, 2012

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT
DENISE WOOLERY, VICE-CHAIR - PRESENT
BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT
BRIAN MILLER - PRESENT
FRED SWEENEY - PRESENT
JIM ZIMMERMAN - ABSENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): JOHN CAMPANELLA – ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Deisler, Woolery, Bernstein, Miller, and Sweeney.

Members absent: Zimmerman.

Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **March 26, 2012**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **March 26, 2012**, as amended.
 Action: Woolery/Sweeney, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained from Item 3, 1790 Sycamore Canyon Drive, Zimmerman absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **April 2, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney**.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **April 9, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman** and **Denise Woolery** (for Item E only).

Action: Bernstein/Sweeney, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Bedard announced that Jim Zimmerman would be absent from today's meeting.
2. Staff clarified issues regarding the Board's purview of project review and potential zoning concerns.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 940 ALSTON RD****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-173-028
 Application Number: MST2012-00007
 Owner: American Riviera Bank
 Designer: Nils Holroyd

(Proposal to construct a new 3,750 square foot two-story single-family residence, and an attached 750 square foot three-car garage located on a vacant 1.72 net acre lot in the Hillside Design District. A total of 1,220 cubic yards of onsite cut and fill grading is proposed, which involves 800 cubic yards beneath the main building footprint and 420 cubic yards elsewhere on site. Other site improvements include a new swimming pool, a new detached pool equipment/accessory structure, new site landscaping, including the removal of six existing oak trees and one palm tree, approximately 600 linear feet of a new, 6-foot tall, chain-link perimeter fencing, new site retaining walls, driveway entry gates, and a new driveway. The proposed total of 4,500 square feet is 84% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-85.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. The project received a Substantial Conformance Determination for compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-85. The project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program prior to obtaining Final Approval. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on January 30, 2012.)

A Board site visit was conducted at 2:00 p.m. to 940 Alston Road.

(3:11)

Present: Nils Holroyd, Designer; and Robert Egenolf, Attorney for Applicant ^(corrected 5/3/12) ~~Neal Solomon~~ **Neal**

Staff summarized to the Board the conditions in the Substantial Conformance Determination (SCD) letter for the record:

- 1) The oak removal shall be minimized;
- 2) The oak tree replacement will be at a 2:1 ratio, and all 23 undersized oak trees shall remain; and
- 3) The driveway length shall be minimized, as appropriate.

Public comment opened at 3:33 p.m.

- 1) Kerry Moriarty (adjacent neighbor/previous owner of subject property), opposition; expressed privacy concerns regarding the proposed shared access driveway and a request to relocate garage or common area driveway.
- 2) Peggy Cochran (adjacent neighbor), spoke in support of the project.
- 3) Marsha Byers, opposition; expressed concerns regarding potential privacy impacts.
- 4) Geonine Moriarty, (adjacent neighbor/previous owner of subject property), opposition; expressed concerns regarding proximity of the new shared garage driveway, with a request to relocate the driveway further north.

Letters from Judith Mouderrres and Paula Westbury were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:44 p.m.

Straw vote: Given the topography and site constraints, how many Board members could support the current proposed building footprint? 1/3/1 (failed: 1 support/3 opposed/1 abstained).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant's efforts and for participating with the recent Board site visit. The Board finds the proposed architectural style to be a nice representative of that style; however, finds that the style, mass, bulk and scale of the proposed design is not appropriate for this particular site.
- 2) The Board understands the site constraints and finds the general proposed building site area to be potentially acceptable; however, the applicant is directed to propose a new design style with a reduced height, mass, bulk, and scale, and to be more considerate of the existing contours of the site, reduce the amount of proposed grading, and study to reduce the length of the driveway and reducing the amount of existing oaks to be removed.
- 3) Study possible relocation of the driveway entry gates.
- 4) Reduce the size, bulk, scale, and height of the proposed two-story garage.
- 5) Provide a more efficient floor plan, particularly around the master bedroom suite, master bath and closet area.
- 6) Replace the gravel around pool with more acceptable hardscape or lawn.
- 7) Provide a landscape plan that utilizes sustainable and native plants in the landscape design.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

2. 1202 SHORELINE DR**E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-214-011
Application Number: MST2011-00114
Owner: Donna B. Sheppel, Trustee
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal for a complete façade remodel and the construction of a 340 square foot first-floor addition, and a 560 square foot second-story addition to an existing one-story, 990 square foot, single-family residence with an attached 530 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes the demolition of the existing 530 square foot garage and construction of a new attached 400 square foot two-car garage. The proposal will result in a 2,290 square foot, two-story, single family residence, located on a 6,098 square foot lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, and is 85% of the maximum required floor-to-lot-area ratio. The project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit and requested zoning modifications.)

(Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 002-12. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on April 11, 2011.)

(4:27)

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; Russ Shappel, Owner; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner.

Ms. Brodison clarified for the Board that the requested modification was reviewed by the Planning Commission on February 1, 2012; approving the modification to rebuild the first floor within the existing legally non-conforming footprint, and subject to conditions in Planning Commission Resolution No. 002-12.

Public comment opened at 4:41 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Ms. Bedard advised the applicant that the use of compacted sand base is not a permeable solution (remove the sand base) and replace with possibly a rock aggregate base; a sand material is acceptable only on the very bottom layer; provide section details (Sheet A-1.4) of all proposed permeable designs for verification of the base materials to ensure a true permeable design.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and with conditions:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency, character, and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.
- 2) Raise the bottom of the bay window (of the second-floor master bath) up by approximately 12-inches.
- 3) The Board is supportive of the option to use of a standing seam roof with the requirement that the seams shall not be more than 18-inches apart.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed, Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 732 BOND AVE****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-232-007
Application Number: MST2012-00104
Owner: Allen and Jeanette Arnold

(Proposal for "as-built" removal of a two-car garage, replacement of the garage with two uncovered parking spaces, addition of a 50 square foot utility room and exterior alterations to an existing 543 square foot residence. The proposal will result in a 593 square foot residence located on a 5,250 square foot lot and is 24% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations identified within enforcement case ENF2011-00637.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(4:57)

Present: Allen and Jeanette Arnold, Owners; Earl Arnold; and Heather Baker, Project Planner.

Staff clarified that, although action may be taken on the proposed project, a few plan check corrections are still outstanding that will be conditioned upon prior to the issuance and granting of a building permit.

Staff clarified the enforcement case and permeable paving requirements of the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 5:12 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury with expressed concerns was acknowledged.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with conditions:

- 1) Use permeable paving or inter-locking pavers for the driveway and parking spaces.
- 2) The new storage structure shall comply with the required 6-foot rear and interior setbacks, and will match the color and materials (siding, roofing, etc.) of the existing house.
- 3) The new rear utility room is to match the color and materials (siding, roofing, etc.) of the existing house.
- 4) The existing front yard hedges shall be maintained to provide screening of the uncovered parking spaces.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**4. 3439 CAMPANIL DR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-101-011
Application Number: MST2011-00416
Owner: Klinkon Family Trust
Architect: Dennis Thompson

(Proposal to construct a 310 square foot one-story addition to an existing 5,873 square foot, two-story single-family residence located on a 44,431 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The existing residence includes a 1,896 square foot basement, third-story loft, and an attached 582 square foot garage. The project includes a net 99 square foot addition to an existing 415 square foot deck. A 371 square foot accessory structure exists on site and is proposed to remain. The revised proposal results in a total of 6,554 square feet and is 131% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on February 27, 2012.)

(5:31)

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:35 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Final Approval with the condition that the color board reflects the clear finish on the handrails.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 218 SAN CLEMENTE****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-152-018
Application Number: MST2012-00038
Owner: Lennart and Barbara Colombana, Trustees
Designer: Carlos Grano

(Proposal for demolition of an existing one-story, 1,013 square foot single-family residence, including an attached 231 square foot one-car garage, and construction of a new two-story 1,817 square foot, single-family residence constructed within the footprint of the existing residence. The proposal includes construction of a new 424 square foot detached two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,241 square feet, located on a 6,000 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 83% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on February 27, 2012.)

(5:41)

Present: David Colombana, Owner/Trustee.

Public comment opened at 5:53 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury with expressed concerns was acknowledged.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and general landscaping.
- 2) Provide additional detail and clarification on the retaining wall height, front sidewalk area, and garden wall (incl. heights and materials).
- 3) Provide paving details.
- 4) Provide a color and materials board and reproduce on the plans, including exterior light fixtures, gutters/downspouts, and paving materials.
- 5) Provide details and clarifications on the second-floor (north and south elevations) windows and corbels.
- 6) Provide details of the trellis design and hand rails.
- 7) Provide details of the head, jam, and sill of the window and door frames.
- 8) Provide details of the roof element covering the bay windows, and of the corbels supporting the bay windows.
- 9) Provide details of the corner post at the entry porch.
- 10) Provide clarification and details on the long narrow windows on the north and south elevations; and slightly raise the two second-floor west elevation windows.
- 11) Reduce the lawn area to no more than 20% of the overall landscape area and provide a more definitive (detailed) landscape plan.
- 12) Provide additional information regarding the details of the pathway lighting fixtures, including the layout and wattage, and verify compliance with the Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:15 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 1656 LAS CANOAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-072-010
Application Number: MST2012-00015
Owner: Jeffrey Frank
Architect: Robert Pester

(Proposal to demolish existing second floor, 12 square foot wrought iron balcony and replace with a new 199 square foot heavy timber wood frame balcony, and construct a new detached 103 square foot pool equipment shed. The existing two-story 3,693 square foot residence with a 726 square foot detached garage is located on a one acre lot located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Review After Final for revisions to the exterior uncovered staircase design.)

Approval as noted of Review After Final.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 1947 EUCALYPTUS HILL RD****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-040-027
Application Number: MST2012-00113
Owner: Ingham Family Trust
Architect: Douglas Gheza

(Proposal for alterations to an existing 2,414 square foot, split-level residence with an attached two-car garage on an 18,081 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The exterior alterations include replacing the south elevation windows and door, replacing one west elevation window and replacing the wood deck guardrail with a glass guardrail.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on April 2, 2012.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 1634 MIRA VISTA AVE****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-014
 Application Number: MST2012-00047
 Architect: Steve Hausz, Architect
 Owner: Harry Herbert

(Proposal for minor site and façade alterations on a 17,672 square foot parcel currently developed with an existing two-story 3,290 square foot single-family residence, including an attached 436 square foot two-car garage located in the Hillside Design District. Alterations to the residence involve replacement of windows and doors, the addition of new windows, alterations to an existing balcony and reconfiguration of the existing patio stairs. Site alterations include replacing the existing concrete driveway with new concrete interlocking pavers, a reduction of driveway surface and increase of planted surface area, remodel and approximately 200 square foot expansion to the existing patio, the replacement of an existing spa in the same location, new site fencing, walls, and driveway pillars. The 3,290 square foot residence is 80% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on February 13, 2012. Compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required.)

Final Approval as noted.

CONTINUED ITEM**D. 326 N ONTARE RD****E-2/SD-1/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-151-008
 Application Number: MST2012-00126
 Owner: Ronald Morris Living Trust
 Architect: Robert Pester

(Proposal for the removal of an existing 261 square foot, second-story deck on the north elevation and construction of a new 426 square foot, second-story deck on the east elevation for an existing 1,753 square foot, two-story residence with a 465 square foot attached garage. The project is located on an 8,495 square foot lot and is 64% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued two weeks to Consent with conditions:

- 1) Show the structural connection from the post to the beam and include base detail with the base cap to include a concrete base.
- 2) Provide a color and materials board and reproduce on the plans.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 501 CONEJO RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-062-011
Application Number: MST2009-00269
Owner: Michael and Kathleen Szymanski
Designer: Ubaldo Diaz
Landscape Architect: Charles McClure

(The original project description follows: Proposal to replace a one-story 1,174 square foot house and detached 323 square foot garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. Proposed is a 1,823 square foot two-story single-family residence and attached 510 square foot two-car garage. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification is requested to allow altering and relocating the garage and altering the house in the front setback. The proposed total of 2,333 square feet on the 11,190 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 60% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Review After Final for revisions to the landscape plan.)

Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) Restudy landscape design; too many agave plants.
- 2) Add ground cover on the slope at the rear.
- 3) Change the proposed ground cover plantings.
- 4) Study using citrus or vegetable plantings for the area at the rear retaining wall.
- 5) Citrus trees shall be placed in planters located at the base of the slope in the back yard.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman** and **Denise Woolery** (for Item E only).