



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, January 30, 2012

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

- GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT
- DENISE WOOLERY, VICE-CHAIR - ABSENT
- BERNI BERNSTEIN – PRESENT
- BRIAN MILLER - PRESENT
- FRED SWEENEY - PRESENT
- JIM ZIMMERMAN - PRESENT @ 4:13 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: MICHAEL JORDAN - ABSENT

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
- MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
- KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

ATTENDANCE:

- Members present: Deisler, Bernstein, Miller, Sweeney, and Zimmerman (present @ 4:13 p.m.).
- Members absent: Woolery.
- Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **January 17, 2012.**

- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **January 17, 2012**, as submitted.
- Action: Sweeney/Miller, 3/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained, Zimmerman/Woolery absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **January 23, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Brian Miller**.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 3/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained, Zimmerman/Woolery absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **January 30, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Brian Miller**.

Action: Miller/Sweeney, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman/Woolery absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- Ms. Bedard announced that Board member Zimmerman would arrive late, and Board member Woolery would be absent from today's meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**1. 1121 WALNUT AVE****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-202-006

Application Number: MST2011-00409

Owner: Alamar II, LLC

Architect: Murphy & Associates, Architects

Applicant: Dario Pini

(Proposal to demolish the existing 770 square foot one-story single-family residence and construct a new 1,885 square foot two-story single-family residence, including an attached 400 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes a new 5-foot tall wood fence in the front yard. The proposed total of 1,885 square feet on a 6,750 square foot lot is 66% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations in ENF 2011-00778.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment. The project was last reviewed on January 3, 2012.)

(3:09)

Present: Bryan Murphy, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to return to Consent with comments:

- The Board finds acceptable the 6-foot front entry wall due to the proximity to the railroad tracks and freeway.
- The Board appreciates the applicant proceeding with a proposed new two-car garage, as previously directed, with the style to match the proposed new residence, and finds the location to be acceptable.
- Provide a color board and include all exterior details and materials on the plans, including lighting fixtures, windows, decking, roof, and garage details.
- The Board appreciates the proposed inset windows, which provide added interest and articulation.
- The roof shall be a two-piece Mission tile roof.
- Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Miller/Sweeney, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman/Woolery absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**2. 1482 LOU DILLON****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-048
 Application Number: MST2012-00003
 Owner: Terence and Angela Becerra
 Architect: Eisenbeiz Design Studio

(Proposal to construct a new 2,483 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 599 square foot garage on a 2.26-acre lot located in the Hillside Design District. Site improvements include an entry gate, fountain, bio-swale, concrete swale, stone garden walls, flagstone patios, removal of two Eucalyptus trees, walkways and landscaping. The proposal includes 186 cubic yards of cut and fill grading. The proposal is 54% of the maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline. The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 056-03.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 056-03. The project was last reviewed on January 17, 2012.)

(3:28)

Present: John Eisenbeiz, Architect; and Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:40 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury which expressed concerns.

Motion: Continued four weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Reduce the overall scale by reducing the plate heights of the first and second floors.
- 2) Provide additional graphic support to ensure effective landscape screening solutions to minimize potential privacy impacts to the downhill neighbors.

Action: Bernstein/Sweeney, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman/Woolery absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 1790 SYCAMORE CANYON RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-163-018
 Application Number: MST2011-00454
 Owner: Sycamore Heights, LLC
 Designer: Rick Mendez Design C.D.S.

(Proposal involves fire damage repairs, remodel, the conversion of the existing attic to a new third story, a 165 square foot new addition (approximately 55 square feet on the first, second, and the new third story) to an existing single-family residence. Approximately 330 square feet of the existing 565 square foot attached garage will be converted to floor area. The parking will be provided by an attached one-car garage and one new uncovered parking space. The proposal will result in an approximately 3,185 square foot three-story single-family residence on a 34,308 square foot lot and is 66% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. The project will address violations identified within enforcement case ENF2010-00361.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(4:16)

Present: Rick Mendez, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m.

Roger Helkey requested story poles be placed on the site.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury which expressed concerns.

Public comment closed at 4:28 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the one-covered and one-uncovered parking solution for the property? 0/5 (failed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board could not support the one-covered and one-uncovered parking solution as presented. Provide or maintain a minimum two-car garage solution. Study the garage doors for consistency with architecture; provide details.
- 2) Reduce or eliminate the pop-out balconies on the upper floor of the north elevation.
- 3) Study the materials and design of balconies for consistency with architectural style, consider the use of corbels, top-railing or heavy timber elements.
- 4) Study the approach to the dormers on the south elevation; provide details and sections (and possibly a 3-D image) to clearly illustrate how the dormers integrate into the roof.
- 5) Provide articulation to the existing stair case on the south elevation; the board could be supportive of altering the landing element out from the alignment with the wall to assist in further articulation.
- 6) Study utilizing vertical casements for all windows; with the possible exception that the kitchen window may be a horizontal window; provide details.
- 7) Study the divided lights of the two small arch windows at the second story (south elevation).
- 8) Study and simplify the design of the entry addition. The round element could be acceptable with further refinement and simplification of the design, number and locations of doors and windows. It was suggested to use one larger door rather than two doors. Study the covered trellis element and provide sections and details. It was also suggested to reduce the mass of the entry addition and limit to a two-story addition and incorporate dormers or utilize other methods to provide a solution that is more compatible to the existing architectural style.
- 9) Reconsider the use of vertical panel and stucco element on the west elevation to match architectural style.
- 10) Provide further study of the French doors and divided lights; provide additional details and a manufacturer brochure. Provide additional clarification of window J (Is it a window or a skylight?) Provide details and manufacturer brochure.
- 11) Provide additional study and clarification of the roof rafters and fascia boards, specifically how it works; provide details.
- 12) Provide revised drawings to clearly and accurately represent the proposal.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 940 ALSTON RD****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-173-028
 Application Number: MST2012-00007
 Owner: American Riviera Bank
 Designer: Nils Holroyd

(Proposal to construct a new two-story 4,370 square foot single-family residence and an attached 750 square foot three-car garage located on a vacant 1.38 net acre lot in the Hillside Design District. A total of 1,220 cubic yards of grading is proposed. Other site improvements include a new swimming pool, a new detached pool equipment/accessory structure, new site landscaping, including the removal of six existing oak trees and one palm tree, approximately 600 linear feet of a new, 6-foot tall, chain-link perimeter fencing, new site retaining walls, driveway entry gates, and a new driveway. The proposed total of 5,120 square feet is 99% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-85.)

(Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-85.)

(4:59)

Present: Nils Holroyd, Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m.

- 1) Marsha Byers, (adjacent neighbor) opposition; expressed concerns regarding potential privacy impacts.
- 2) Geonine Moriarty (for Kerry Moriarty), (submitted letter) opposition; expressed concerns regarding proposed bulk, building envelope, potential privacy impacts, and the driveway gate.
- 3) Sophie Calvin (agent for Moriarty) expressed concerns regarding the common narrow driveway, proposed design, location of pool, and screening elements.

Letters of expressed concern were acknowledged from Judith Mouderras, Karen Hostettler Trogan, Paula Westbury, and Cathy Carpenter.

Public comment closed at 5:24 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board found the proposed design to be too aggressive for the site.
- 2) Study relocation of the house footprint to the north (bottom) of the canyon and that adhere to the site contours.
- 3) Study an alternative style that better acknowledges the rural setting with a combination of a more appropriate one- and two-story design solution to be compatible with the surrounding neighborhood, rather than an affixed two-story Mediterranean style.
- 4) Study methods to reduce the overall floor-to-area ratio (FAR) to be closer to the 85% guideline.
- 5) It is recommended for the applicant to meet with Staff and obtain the Substantial Conformance Determination prior to returning for a continued concept review by the Board.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 958 ARBOLADO RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-232-010
Application Number: MST2012-00020
Owner: Daniel Greiwe and Phyllis Myers
Designer: Chris Cottell

(Proposal to construct 437 square feet of new additions, to include 255 square feet on the ground floor and 182 square feet on the second floor, and exterior and interior remodel to an existing 3,434 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, including an attached 451 square foot two-car garage and 170 square foot storage area. The proposal also includes 797 square feet of new second-story decks, new ground level decks and patios, a new pool, new site retaining walls and landscaping, and approximately 120 cubic yards of grading. The proposed total of 3,871 square feet, located on a 29,858 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 81% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(5:45)

Present: Chris Cottell, Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:56 p.m.

Barbara Bonadeo (neighbor), opposition; expressed concerns regarding screening of the pool and the connecting building.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury.

Public comment closed at 5:58 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Explore increasing the redwood siding.
- 3) Provide screening methods and/or a reduction in the size of the second level deck (east side).
- 4) Provide quarter-inch elevation color renderings.
- 5) Provide details and material samples of the proposed metal roof design.
- 6) Provide a landscape plan; specifically include selection of proposed landscaping around the pool, and screening of the decks.
- 7) Provide details of the wall and surface materials.
- 8) Provide a color and materials board and include all details on the plans.

Action: Miller/Sweeney, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**6. 1117 LAS ALTURAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-113-022
Application Number: MST2011-00142
Owner: Barbara Fasken Trust
Architect: Leonard Grant
Contractor: Vernon Construction

(Proposal to construct a new 4,216 square foot two-story single-family residence, including an attached 455 square foot two-car garage. The previous residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. Site improvements include a new driveway, site retaining walls, and approximately 1,263 cubic yards of total site grading, which includes 525 cubic yards of grading underneath the building footprint and 738 cubic yards of grading elsewhere on the site. A total of 743 square feet of decks are proposed, which includes 335 square feet of upper floor decks and 408 square feet of first floor decks. The proposed total of 4,216 square feet, located on a 46,303 square foot lot, located in the Hillside Design District, is 84% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on September 12, 2011. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) prior to Final Approval.)

(6:17)

Present: Edward Herrera, Project Manager; Brad Vernon, Developer; and Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 6:33 p.m.

Carolyn Vogt (neighbor) asked for and received clarification that the overall height of the home has not increased and that the proposal does not include any additional tall trees within their view corridor from the previous review.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury.

Public comment closed at 6:35 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with the condition to provide an electrical plan and coordinated elevations to indicate location of all exterior light fixtures and reproduce the light fixture details on the plans.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Comments for the record: 1) Remove the fountain feature from within the front setback; replace with a landscaped solution. 2) Review plans with Transportation staff to find a solution that limits paving in the setbacks to provide the minimum necessary for a safe turn around.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:51 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):**PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW****A. 1131 LOS PUEBLOS RD****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-071-028
Application Number: MST2011-00352
Owner: Scheeff, Richard W & Vera J Family
Architect: Murphy & Associates Architects

(Proposal for an exterior facade remodel and interior remodel to an existing 3,110 square foot, two-story, single-family residence on a 15,921 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes the demolition of the existing non-conforming one-car carport, an interior remodel and conversion of existing habitable floor area to replace the existing one-car garage and construct a new two-car garage, which also creates 267 square feet of crawl space. The proposal will result in a 1,240 square foot net reduction of paved surfaces and a total of 5 cubic yards of site grading. The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval for a zoning modification. The proposed total 3,377 square foot is 77% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Revised project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 034-10, received under MST2010-00079. Project was last reviewed on September 26, 2011.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and the Hillside Design District Findings have been met as stated in subsection 22.69.050.B of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

NEW ITEM**B. 1656 LAS CANOAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-072-010
Application Number: MST2012-00015
Owner: Jeffrey Frank
Architect: Robert Pester

(Proposal to demolish existing second floor, 157 square foot wrought iron balcony and replace with a 157 square foot heavy timber wood frame balcony; construct a new detached 103 square foot pool equipment shed. The existing two-story 3,693 square foot residence with a 726 square foot detached garage is located on a one acre lot located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued two weeks to Consent with comments:

- 1) Provide deck details, and colors and materials board.
- 2) The pool equipment storage structure shall include the Santa Barbara sandstone material on all four elevations.
- 3) Provide adjacent parcel building footprints on the site plan.
- 4) Show compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

Note: Applicant was advised that the pool equipment storage structure may need to be slightly relocated to comply with the remaining front yard setback requirement; advised to verify with Zoning staff.

NEW ITEM**C. 1447 CRESTLINE DR****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-241-006
Application Number: MST2012-00014
Owner: Lawton Christensen Living Trust
Architect: Robert Pester

(Proposal for a 428 square foot one-story addition and interior remodel to an existing 2,531 square foot, one-story single-family residence, including an existing attached two-car garage, located on a 16,182 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 2,959 square feet is 68% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and the Hillside Design District and Sloped Lot Findings have been met as stated in subsection 22.69.050.B of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to Consent, with conditions:

- 1) Provide roof, door, and window details.
- 2) Provide a colors and materials board.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Brian Miller**.