



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 24, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT
DENISE WOOLERY, VICE-CHAIR – PRESENT @ 3:05 P.M.
BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT
BRIAN MILLER - ABSENT
FRED SWEENEY - PRESENT
JIM ZIMMERMAN - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: MICHAEL JORDAN - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT UNTIL 3:11 P.M.
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Deisler, Woolery (present @ 3:05 p.m.), Bernstein, Sweeney, and Zimmerman.
Members absent: Miller.
Staff present: Bedard, Limón (present until 3:11 p.m.), and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **October 10, 2011.**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **October 10, 2011**, as amended.

Action: Zimmerman/Sweeney, 4/1/0. Deisler abstained from Consent item #C of October 10, 2011. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

The **October 17, 2011** meeting was cancelled.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **October 24, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Jim Zimmerman**.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Ms. Bedard requested Board representation at an upcoming City Council appeal hearing on November 1, 2011, regarding 1117 Las Alturas Road. Board member Fred Sweeney will represent the Board at that hearing.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**1. 2521 MEDCLIFF RD****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-330-034

Application Number: MST2011-00208

Owner: Thomas E. A. Caesar Family Trust

Designer: Marcia Vail

(Proposal to permit the "as-built" replacement of an existing 74 linear foot six-foot tall wood fence located within required front setback and the right-of-way along La Jolla Circle, and to relocate an "as-built" 64 linear foot 3.5-foot tall wood fence located in the right-of-way along Medcliff Road. The parcel is currently developed with an existing one-story single-family residence. The improvements will address the enforcement issues identified in ENF2011-00086. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow a portion of the existing "as-built" fence to exceed 3.5 feet in height within the required setback. This proposal also requires an encroachment permit from the Public Works Department to allow the construction of the fences to be located within the public right-of-way.)

(Second concept review. Project was last reviewed on Consent on July 18, 2011. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(3:11)

Present: Thomas E. A. Caesar, Property Owner; and Dan Gullett, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:20 p.m.

- 1) David Vanhoy (neighbor), opposition; expressed concerns regarding the fence height and locations and the loss of landscaping along La Jolla Circle.

Public comment closed at 3:24 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the fence location as presented in the current right-of-way? 3/0/2 (passed, Deisler and Bernstein abstained.).

A majority of the Board felt the height of the fence along La Jolla Dr should be restricted to a maximum of 6-feet tall.

Motion: Continued to the November 2, 2011 Staff Hearing Officer hearing to return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board finds acceptable the new 42-inch high fence located at the property line on Medcliff Road.
- 2) The existing 2' by 2' concrete pilasters may remain in the current existing location with the removal of the existing light fixtures; and if necessary, may be replaced with new down-casting light fixtures that do not impact the adjacent neighbors or the street.
- 3) The Board finds acceptable that the existing fence off La Jolla Drive can remain in the public right-of-way location; however, it shall be limited to a maximum of 72-inches in height.
- 4) Provide vine plantings along the amended 72-inch high fence line on La Jolla Circle.
- 5) Provide acceptable landscape plantings (such as suggested vine plantings) along the fence on Medcliff Road.
- 6) The proposed fence colors and materials are acceptable.
- 7) The Board is supportive of the installation of acceptable street trees in the parkway, as reviewed and approved by the Parks and Recreation Department, along La Jolla Drive.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Deisler abstained, Miller absent).

Staff commented that the Public Works Encroachment permit specifies a maximum 72-inch height for the fence in the public right-of-way along La Jolla Drive.

FINAL REVIEW

2. 1304 CRESTLINE DR

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-251-001
 Application Number: MST2008-00385
 Owner: Joe Weber and Jillian Reed
 Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for a 169 square foot first-floor addition, 248 square feet of second-floor additions, and a façade remodel including the replacement of the existing pitched roof with a flat roof on an existing 2,728 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached two-car garage. The proposal includes a 307 square foot roof deck above the first floor with exterior stairs, a 43 square foot second-story deck, a rear patio and swimming pool, and the demolition of a total of 239 square feet (including 151 square feet of permitted square footage and 88 square feet of "as-built" square footage). The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification. The proposed total of 2,994 square feet, on a 10,605 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 79% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on May 9, 2011. Project requires compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval.

(3:55)

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:04 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued one week to Consent with comments:

- 1) Provide an updated landscape plan.
- 2) Corrections to elevations on Plan Sheet A2.1, indicating verticals and detailing of the exposed staircase handrail system.
- 3) Provide on all elevations Plan Sheets A2.1, A2.2, and A3.1 indicate and document all color elements and details, including downspouts, trellis elements, stucco, window trim, gutters, door colors, and stone veneers, etc., on the elevations.
- 4) Provide on Plan Sheet A5.2 chimney cap details indicating the finishes that reflect the elevations.
- 5) Provide a color board, and color schedule on the plans.
- 6) Provide compliance with Tier 2 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) requirements prior to receiving Final Approval.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

3. 1708 CALLE BOCA DEL CANON

R-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-062-017

Application Number: MST2011-00376

Owner: Marlene Roberts, Revocable Trust

Designer: Mehdi Hadighi

(Proposal to construct a new 331 square foot second-story addition to an existing 1,391 square foot one-story, single-family residence with a basement and an attached 334 square foot one-car garage, resulting in a total development of 2,056 square feet on a 6,534 square foot lot. The 1,391 square foot existing residence includes a 368 square foot basement which is exempt from the floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) calculation. The proposal is 60% of the maximum required FAR.)

(Second concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. The project was last reviewed on October 10, 2011.)

(4:15)

Present: Mehdi Hadighi, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:18 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with positive comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, acceptable design, and good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 4:26 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:28 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**4. 912 MEDIO RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-262-002

Application Number: MST2011-00244

Architect: Bob Easton

Owner: David Edward Duron Trust

(Proposal to construct a new 285 square foot one-story master bedroom and kitchen addition, a new 457 square foot deck, and an interior remodel to an existing 985 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 212 square foot one-car garage. The proposal will result in a one-story 1,482 square foot single-family residence on a 13,334 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Third concept review; first Full Board review. The project was referred from the Consent Calendar on October 10, 2011. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval.)

(4:28)

Present: Agent for Bob Easton, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support option No. 4, with the option of an open rail system? 3/2 (passed).

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the proposed 4th option or scheme? 4/0/1 (passed).

Straw vote: How many Board members could support some form of a screening element? 5/0 (passed).

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with the following comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, and quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.
- 2) The Board favors deck option #4 as the preferred deck configuration.
- 3) Study providing a screening element, as suggested, for the portion of the proposed railing from the new addition extending to the corner, as shown on the plans.
- 4) Provide a partial landscaping solution along the south property line, as indicated on the plans (where stated as "new hedge") to enhance privacy screening
- 5) The Boards suggests the applicant notify the surrounding neighbors to satisfy neighborhood compatibility, especially the neighbor to the south, to satisfy good neighbor guidelines.
- 6) Provide architectural details, a color board, and any proposed exterior lighting details.
- 7) Provide compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) requirements prior to receiving Final Approval.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 652 RICARDO AVE****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-170-025
 Application Number: MST2011-00368
 Owner: Roy Calvin Petersen
 Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to construct a 931 square foot one-story addition to an existing 2,027 square foot one-story single-family residence, including an attached two-car garage, located on a 20,831 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. A portion of the existing residence will be demolished and reconstructed. The proposal includes a new courtyard area and a new covered porch. The total proposed development is 2,958 square feet and is 63% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline. This project addresses violations listed in ZIR2011-00176 to include the demolition of the accessory structure.)

(Second concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on October 10, 2011.)

(5:07)

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members could be supportive of a zoning modification for the one-story solution as presented? 3/2 (passed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the project's bulk, mass, and scale, FAR, and square footage are acceptable and compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.
- 2) Return with a solution to resolve the setback issues along La Vista Del Oceano.
- 3) Return with more definition and details for the existing railroad tie and proposed soldier pile system on the site plan.
- 4) Provide a preliminary landscape plan, and specify a solution in regards to the existing ice plant.
- 5) Specify any proposed fencing details around the property, especially on the La Vista Del Oceano side of the property.
- 6) Reduce the size of the courtyard facing Ricardo Avenue.
- 7) The Board could generally support the direction of the proposed 'Spanish hacienda' architectural style.
- 8) Consider a reconfiguration of the front porch given the location of the front door and windows at the kitchen. Consider utilizing a post and beam style in lieu of the proposed arch style.
- 9) Simplify the garage door element to reflect the language of a posted beam rancho style.
- 10) Consider redesigning the gable end of the mechanical room and gate area on the north elevation facing Ricardo Avenue.
- 11) A majority of the Board generally found the south elevation overhangs acceptable.
- 12) Provide more consistency of the door and window heights along the south elevation.
- 13) Eliminate or show the elimination of the outbuilding on the plans.
- 14) Provide compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) requirements prior to receiving Final Approval.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:46 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 2010 EMERSON AVE

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-401-002
 Application Number: MST2009-00294
 Owner: C. Bradford and Cathy A. Simon
 Designer: Mark Morando

(Proposal to address violations in ENF2009-00219 by permitting as-built alterations to the second floor of the existing 1,981 square foot single-family residence. The project includes replacement of the American four square gable dormer with a full front gable with French Doors and roof deck, addition of two side-facing gable dormers totaling 71 square feet, replacement of the widow's walk, replacement of the rear kitchen window and rear door, and removal of paving in the front yard. The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval on 7/28/10 (Resolution No. 039-10) for three modifications: to allow a small portion of the roof of the front gable to increase in height within the interior setback; for the north side dormer to exceed the solar access limit; and for parking within the required fifteen foot front setback. The proposed total of 2,052 square feet on the 8,739 square foot lot in the Mission Area Special Design District is 83% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Continuation of the Review After Final last reviewed on August 22, 2011, for alterations to the paving configuration and landscaping.)

Continued two weeks to Consent with the comment to provide landscape screening (shrubs & groundcover) of parked vehicles from public view from the street.

NEW ITEM

B. 206 LOS ALAMOS AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-196-007
 Application Number: MST2007-00347
 Owner: James Candy
 Designer: Joaquin Ornelas

(Proposal for a 635 square foot second-story addition and 146 square foot one-story addition for an existing 1,729 square foot one-story single-family residence located on a 7,097 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. Parking is provided by an existing 380 square foot carport to remain unaltered. The proposal includes two new decks totaling 338 square feet and the replacement of all existing windows. The proposed total 2,890 square feet is 98% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(A new Project Design Approval and Final Approval is requested. No changes have been made to the project as originally approved on October 29, 2007. The project is subject to expire on October 29, 2011.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the condition to either extend the privacy screening the full extent of the proposed deck or to eliminate the deck overhang.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**C. 422 SAMARKAND DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-112-016
Application Number: MST2011-00323
Architect: Doug Reeves
Owner: Douglas and Nina Katsev, Revocable Trust

(Proposal to permit the construction of an "as-built" 218 square foot storage room, adjacent to the garage, and an "as-built" 509 square foot second-story deck located above the addition and cantilevered above the existing two-car garage and storage structure, on an existing two-story 2,714 square foot single-family residence. The proposed total of 2,932 square feet, on an 11,248 square foot lot, is 76% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. The proposal will address the violations listed within the enforcement case ENF2011-00196.)

(Project Design & Final Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 041-11.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with conditions:

- 1) Planning staff to verify that the location of the deck railing satisfies the modification conditions stated in Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 041-11.
- 2) Applicant to remove driveway paving as shown on the plans.

NEW ITEM**D. 1723 GRAND AVE****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-141-014
Application Number: MST2011-00393
Owner: Rembert and Yvonne Brown, Family Trust
Contractor: Action Roofing

(Proposal to replace the existing wood shingle roof on the front portion of the residence with Landmark TL fiberglass shingles, Shenandoah color. The existing composition shingle roof on the rear portion of the residence is proposed to remain.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman** and **Denise Woolery**.