



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, August 29, 2011 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT
 DENISE WOOLERY, VICE-CHAIR - PRESENT
 BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT
 BRIAN MILLER - ABSENT
 FRED SWEENEY - PRESENT
 JIM ZIMMERMAN - ABSENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: MICHAEL JORDAN - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Deisler, Woolery, Bernstein, and Sweeney.
Members absent: Miller and Zimmerman.

Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **August 15, 2011**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **August 15, 2011**, as amended.
Action: Bernstein/Sweeney, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Deisler abstained from Item #7 (2547 Medcliff Rd) on the revised agenda).

C. Consent Calendar.

Tony Fischer spoke as an interested party for Consent Item A, 860 Jimeno Road/1402 Grand Avenue, regarding the project description, Consent minutes.

Richelle Mailand rebutted the comments made by Tony Fischer, and stated that the Board had visited the site and were given full disclosure of the project details. She stated she felt due diligence had been satisfied on the proposed project and that it deserved to move forward through the design review process.

Chair Deisler and Board members Sweeney and Woolery stated individually and concurred that the applicant has satisfied the required criteria within the Board's purview, and that the project should move forward through the design review process. Board member Bernstein expressed concern regarding public comment.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **August 22, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Brian Miller**.

Action: Woolery/Sweeney, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained on Item A, 860 Jimeno Road/1402 Grand Avenue).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **August 29, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Brian Miller**.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 4/0/0. (Motion carried).

Motion: To reopen ratification of Consent Calendar for August 22, 2011, Item I, 2 Oliver Rd. only.

Action: Bernstein/Sweeney, 4/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Re-ratify the Consent Calendar for **August 22, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Brian Miller**.

Action: Woolery/Sweeney, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained on Item A, 860 Jimeno Road/1402 Grand Avenue).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1) Ms. Bedard announced that Board members Miller and Zimmerman would be absent from the meeting.
- 2) Board member Sweeney announced later that he would be absent from the September 26, 2011, meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**1. 1465 CRESTLINE DR****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-241-009
Application Number: MST2011-00175
Owner: Daksha Oza Family Living Trust
Designer: Punam Prajapti

(Proposal to construct a total of 349 square feet of new one-story additions, to include 204 square foot kitchen addition and a 145 square foot den addition, and a new 120 square foot second-floor deck to an existing 2,456 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached 500 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,805 square feet, on a 11,653 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District, is 71% of the floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Referred from Consent on August 22, 2011. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to granting Final Approval.)

(3:33)

Present: Punam Prajapti, Designer.

Board member Sweeney explained the reasons why the proposed project was referred to the Full Board.

Public comment opened at 3:36 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study column size, spacing, and bracing of the proposed second-floor deck. Indicate the proposed surface materials and edge details and provide a section through the deck.
- 2) Study use of bay window at the front elevation and study the proportions, slope of the roof element, and the base of the bay window.
- 3) Study both the existing and proposed intersection of the gable ends; resolve where the gable ends integrate in the roof plan, and how the support posts of the existing gable ends integrate with the addition.
- 4) Provide column, post and trellis element details (to be reflected in the elevations).

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Zimmerman absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**2. 917 PASEO FERRELO****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-261-006
 Application Number: MST2011-00049
 Owner: Neil Dipaola
 Architect: Dan Weber

(The project has been revised to eliminate the previously proposed new garage and retain the existing 650 square foot garage, thereby reducing the proposed FAR from 94% to 83%. The revised proposal involves alterations and additions to the existing 2,951 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, to include a total of 202 square feet of second-floor additions, comprised of a 157 square foot kitchen addition and a 45 square foot master bedroom addition, a second-story deck addition to the existing deck, and the removal and/or relocation of three existing trees. The proposed total of 3,153 square feet, on a 10,500 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 83% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio. The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval on May 18, 2011 (Resolution No. 020-11) for a zoning modification to allow alterations and additions to the residence within the required interior setback.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 020-11, and Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed by the SFDB on February 28, 2011.)

(3:54)

Present: Dan Weber, Architect; and Neil Dipaola, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:05 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.
- 2) The proposed project does not include the removal of nor does it significantly impact the specimen tree in the front yard.
- 3) Continue to work with planning staff to delineate the rear yard area and satisfy the zoning requirements.
- 4) Provide detailed sections of the front walkway to review any tree impacts.
- 5) Provide landscape plan details for the front and rear areas to be reflected on the plans. Specify all existing landscaping to remain, existing to be removed, and all new landscaping.

Action: Woolery/Sweeney, 3/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed for compatibility, Miller/Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**3. 104 W JORGENSEN LN****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-110-038
Application Number: MST2011-00104
Owner: Jason Rick
Architect: Jeff Shelton

(Proposal to construct a new two-story, 2,596 square foot single-family residence, a 248 square foot basement, and an attached 506 square foot two-car garage on an existing 3.85 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal also includes a 419 square foot detached pool cabana, a new pool and spa, new pool fencing, 335 square foot loggia, 1,814 square feet of uncovered decks, 600 cubic yards of grading to be balanced onsite, and the removal of two existing oak trees. The proposed total of 3,521 square feet includes a 248 square foot basement calculation discount, and is 53% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 014-07 and City Council Resolution No. 07-086.)

(Second concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on April 11, 2011.)

(4:31)

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect; and Jason Rick, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Include the floor-to-lot area ratio and grading calculations on the plans.
- 2) Return with details for chimney and architectural features, windows, paving, cabana, and garage doors; provide tile and material samples.
- 3) Provide a color board.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan. Provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP).

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**4. 108 ONTARE HILLS LN**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-160-056
 Application Number: MST2011-00267
 Owner: Casey Sulak
 Owner: Security F.S.E. One-Hundred And Forty-Seven, Inc.
 Designer: Woodall Design Group

(Proposal to construct a new two-story 3,921 square foot single-family residence and a 677 square foot detached three-car garage located on an existing vacant 40,946 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a total of 1,350 square feet of covered porches and 488 cubic yards of grading under the main building footprint (244 cubic yards of cut and 244 cubic yards of fill) to be balanced onsite. The proposed total of 4,598 square feet is 93% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 032-05.)

(Third concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on August 15, 2011.)

(4:56)

Present: Ben Woodall, Designer; and Pat Brodie, Landscape Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:09 p.m.

- 1) Theodore Smyth Jr., (adjacent adobe home owner/submitted photos), expressed concerns regarding mass, scale, setbacks, neighborhood compatibility, and privacy screening.
- 2) Steve Frenkel (submitted email), opposition; with concerns regarding views, landscaping, style, building materials, and neighborhood compatibility.

Public comment closed at 5:15 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the proposed general architectural design style, as presented? 4/0 (unanimous).

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the proposed FAR, as presented? 3/1 (passed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Return with a full set of garage elevations and exterior elevation materials.
- 2) Indicate the main material use and the roof materials.
- 3) Provide site sections through the house, from property to property line, including landscaping.
- 4) Provide base elements of the house to incorporate the native Santa Barbara sandstone.
- 5) Provide elevations of the front gate.
- 6) Provide a minimum landscape tree box size.
- 7) The applicant is encouraged to make an effort to meet with neighbors.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Zimmerman absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**5. 1117 LAS ALTURAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-113-022
 Application Number: MST2011-00142
 Owner: Barbara Fasken Trust
 Architect: Leonard Grant

(Proposal to construct a new 4,478 square foot two-story single-family residence and an attached two-car garage. The previous residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. Site improvements include a driveway, auto courts, fountain, and approximately 1,270 cubic yards of total site grading, which includes 610 cubic yards of grading underneath the building footprint and 660 cubic yards of grading elsewhere on the site. A total of 623 square feet of decks are proposed, which includes 340 square feet of covered decks and 283 square feet of uncovered decks. The proposed total of 4,478 square feet, located on a 46,303 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 89% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Fourth concept review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) prior to Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on August 1, 2011.)

(5:56)

Present: Edward Herrera, Designer/Project Manager; Brad Vernon, Contractor/Agent for Owner; and Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:21 p.m.

- 1) Gil Garcia, (also for Edward Gastaldo) opposition; expressed concerns regarding building mass, incompatible design, story poles, and roof form; made architectural suggestions.
- 2) Everett Woody, (submitted documentation) opposition; expressed concerns regarding accuracy of on-site story poles, building height, location, cross slope, and size.
- 3) Penny True, (submitted photographs) opposition; expressed concerns regarding private view impacts.
- 4) Don Vogt, (submitted documentation) opposition; expressed concerns regarding accuracy of story poles on site and scale of project.
- 5) Carolyn Vogt, opposition; expressed concerns regarding scale on a narrow sloping site, FAR percentage, and neighborhood compatibility.

Public comment closed at 6:31 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide an accurate and surveyed story pole plan and install new story poles onsite prior to returning to the Board.
- 2) Reduce the square footage to achieve a maximum 85% floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).
- 3) Study the proposed window orientations of the proposed residence in relation to the westerly neighbor, in regards of privacy concerns.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Zimmerman absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 7:03 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 7:08 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 222 LA MARINA DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-221-013
Application Number: MST2011-00333
Owner: Thomas Smead
Agent: Jerry Rocci
Architect: J. Michael Holliday

(Proposal to construct a new 2,154 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached 446 square foot two-car garage located on a 6,050 square foot lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The existing 1,408 square foot one-story single-family residence will be demolished. The proposed 2,600 square foot residence is 96% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval.)

(7:08)

Present: J. Michael Holliday, Architect; and Jerry Rocci, Agent.

Public comment opened at 7:19 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board found the architectural style appropriate to the neighborhood.
- 2) Reduce the square footage to achieve a maximum 85% floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).
- 3) Reduce the width of the roof deck dimensions to be a minimum 15 feet from the interior property line.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Zimmerman absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 3750 MERU LN****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-262-011
Application Number: MST2011-00090
Owner: Susan J. Quinlan
Architect: Edwards-Pitman Architects

(Proposal to construct a new 2,989 square foot, two-story, single-family residence and an attached 468 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes the demolition of the existing single-family residence and attached two-car garage and 25 cubic yards of grading beneath the building footprint. The proposed total of 3,457 square feet, on a 15,537 square foot lot, is 79% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio guideline.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. The project was last reviewed on August 15, 2011.)

(7:35)

Present: Richard Redmond, Edwards-Pitman Architects; David Niles, Landscape Architect; and Terry Quinlan, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:45 p.m.

- 1) Mari Simpson, opposition; expressed concerns regarding scale, bulk, size, style and neighborhood compatibility.
- 2) Judy Ritchie, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed size, scale, privacy impacts, and neighborhood compatibility; requested dialogue with the property owners.
- 3) Jamie Kaner, opposition; expressed concerns regarding size, scale, privacy, and neighborhood compatibility; proposed a reduction in scale.
- 4) Frank Crowley, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed design, style, and compatibility with the neighborhood.
- 5) Eleanor York, opposition; expressed concerns regarding view from street, non-cohesive design with nearby creek, FAR calculations, window locations and privacy concerns.
- 6) Gerrie Fausett, opposition; expressed concerns regarding second floor massing, location of lot in small cul-de-sac, and large massing into a small lot.
- 7) Gloria Easter (submitted documents), opposition; expressed concerns regarding window locations and privacy concerns; requested a redesign of second floor.
- 8) Carl Easter, opposition; expressed concerns regarding second floor massing, and privacy concerns.

A letter expressing concerns from Larry Fausett was acknowledged.

Terry Quinlan, property owner, stated that no interested parties have made recent efforts to contact him with their concerns.

Public comment closed at 7:56 p.m.

Staff stated that the floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) is a guideline for this parcel, which is greater than 15,000 square feet in size; a 20 closest lots FAR analysis was not submitted. If necessary, the Board may request an FAR analysis be submitted by the applicant.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Reduce the proposed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR); and provide a 20 closest lots FAR analysis study of the neighborhood.
- 2) Provide more detailed clarification on the corner window location, and provide proposed plant screening (i.e. trees) to address adjacent neighborhood privacy concerns.
- 3) Revise the proposed design style to be more compatible with the neighborhood and meet SFDB neighborhood compatibility guidelines.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Zimmerman absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:30 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 3501 SEA LEDGE LN****A-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-082-004
Application Number: MST2004-00141
Owner: David Neubauer
Designer: Bree Medley Designs

(The project consists of demolishing an accessory structure, storage building, workshop, and two-car garage and constructing a new 494 square foot two-car garage with a 176 square foot workshop. Attached and above to the proposed garage is a new 450 square foot cabana with an approximate 504 square foot deck. A lap pool, spa and sun deck is proposed between the house and accessory structure. The proposal also includes adding new drought tolerant vegetation and palm trees to the site with drip irrigation and the addition of a new security gate. The project will result in a 3,468 square foot single-family residence with a detached 720 square foot three-car garage on a 1.03 acre lot.)

(Review After Final for revised column locations, revised spa shape, change to the roof shape, simplify the patio & deck, removal of planters, and change to the siding and railing.)

Postponed two weeks to be continued to the Full Board hearing on September 12, 2011.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 444 CONEJO RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-061-029
Application Number: MST2011-00309
Designer: Behzad Masooman
Architect: Borzou Rahmi
Owner: Salmaun Masooman

(Proposal to replace the original 1,116 square foot single-family residence and attached 289 square foot one-car garage that was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes construction of 498 square feet of additions to include a new 171 square foot one-story and a new 327 square foot two-story addition. The footprint of the original residence was non-conforming to the location within the required front and interior setbacks. The proposed 542 square foot addition is proposed to comply with the required setbacks. Parking will be maintained with the non-conforming 289 square foot one-car garage. The proposed total of 1,903 square feet, on a 6,804 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District, is 66% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on August 22, 2011.)

Final Approval with comments:

- 1) The Board suggests that the support columns to be more substantial.
- 2) The applicant presented two railing options with the preference for the metal ballasters. The Board found either option as acceptable.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 555 LA MARINA DR****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-211-008
Application Number: MST2011-00326
Owner: Stephen and Joan Price
Applicant: Eric Swenumson
Engineer: Ashley & Vance Engineering, Inc.

(Proposal to demolish the "as-built" 182 square foot sunroom and construct a new one-story 239 square foot sunroom and dining room addition to an existing 1,891 square foot one-story single-family residence including an attached 498 square foot two-car garage. The proposed 2,130 square foot total, on a 14,820 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District, is 49% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio. The proposal will address all zoning violations listed in ENF2011-00105 and ZIR2011-00032, including reducing over-height hedges to the maximum 3.5 foot height and removing the unpermitted deck and all storage items in the interior setbacks.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program prior to granting Final Approval.)

Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued two weeks to Consent with conditions:

- 1) Provide color materials.
- 2) Provide window and door details.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**D. 317 NORTHRIDGE RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-131-009
Application Number: MST2011-00291
Owner: Victoria J. Trevillian
Designer: J. Grant Design Studio
Landscape Architect: Charles McClure

(Proposal to permit 550 linear feet of "as-built" stone retaining walls, 350 linear feet of new site and retaining walls, replace the existing retaining wall along the driveway with a new 106 linear foot retaining wall, and replacement of the existing 1,140 square foot driveway with new permeable paving. The site and retaining walls will vary in height from a minimum of two feet to a maximum of eight feet tall. The project involves 822 cubic yards of grading, consisting of 195 cubic yards of excavation and 627 cubic yards of fill. All existing trees are proposed to remain. No changes are proposed to the existing one-story single-family residence. This proposal will address the violations listed in enforcement case ENF2010-01069.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on August 1, 2011. Compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program is required prior to granting Final Approval.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A-3 that the color of the wall is to be a tan Santa Barbara sandstone.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 1750 SYCAMORE CANYON RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-163-016
Application Number: MST2010-00089
Owner: Otto and Ingrid Schenck, Trustees
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
Engineer: David Schrier, P.E.
Contractor: Schipper Construction
Applicant: Landscape Repair Foundation

(This project is for Phases IV and V of the Sycamore Canyon Emergency Landslide Repair Project. Proposal to construct a modular block retaining wall and other repair and drainage structures which cross the City/County boundary. Approximately 105 linear feet of the retaining wall is located within the City, along with 8,600 cubic yards of cut and 6,600 cubic yards of fill grading. Maximum height of the wall is approximately 7 feet. The area of the repair will be revegetated.)

(Final Approval of landscaping and irrigation is requested.)

Final Approval of landscaping as submitted.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Fred Sweeney** and **Denise Woolery**.