



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, April 25, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

- GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT
- DENISE WOOLERY, VICE- CHAIR - PRESENT
- BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT
- ERIN CARROLL - PRESENT
- BRIAN MILLER - PRESENT
- JIM ZIMMERMAN - PRESENT
- PAUL ZINK - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: MICHAEL JORDAN - ABSENT

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
- MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
- KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for Project Design Approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes. , Present
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Single Family Design Board (SFDB) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the SFDB are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.69 and with adopted SFDB guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The SFDB may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for Project Design Approval or Final Approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Project Design Approval and Final SFDB approval.
- Conceptual comments are valid for one year. Project Design Approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. Final SFDB approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the SFDB may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/sfdb. Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the SFDB after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard at 805-564-5470 extension 4551, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Our office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Wednesday, April 20, 2011, at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/sfdb.
2. This regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Bernstein, Carroll, Deisler, Miller, Woolery, Zimmerman, and Zink
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:**A. Public Comment:**

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **April 11, 2011.**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **April 11, 2011**, as amended.
Action: Zink/Zimmerman, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **April 18, 2011, as amended.** The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **James Zimmerman** and **Denise Woolery**, (with the exceptions of Item E, 237 San Nicholas as reviewed by **Paul Zink** and **Denise Woolery**; and Item G, 260 Eucalyptus Hill Drive, as reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman, Denise Woolery** and **Paul Zink**).

Action: Woolery/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **April 25, 2011.** The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **James Zimmerman** and **Denise Woolery**.

Action: Zimmerman/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Chair Deisler announced he would be stepping down from Item #6, 2547 Medcliff Road with Board member Woolery stepping in to act as Chair.

E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**1. 1311 SAN MIGUEL AVE****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-143-004

Application Number: MST2011-00134

Owner: Wayne Cassriel

Architect: Workshop Architecture Group, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a 244 square foot first-floor addition and a new 244 square foot second-story roof deck above the proposed addition to an existing two-story, 1,771 square foot single-family residence with an attached 378 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,333 square feet, on a 6,814 square foot lot located in the non-appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 81% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Project was last reviewed on Consent on April 11, 2011, and referred to Full Board. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(3:10)

Present: Mark Weinke, Architect; and Wayne Cassriel, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Three letters of support submitted by the Applicant were acknowledged by the Board.

Straw vote: How many of the Board find the current design for the roof deck and its relation to the property line acceptable per the Single Family Design Guidelines? 2/5 (failed).

Straw vote: How many of the Board find the size of the roof deck compatible with the neighborhood if it were properly screened? 5/2 (passed).

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with the comment to provide additional information on screening and the landscaping proposed for the west side upper level deck.

Action: Zink/Carroll, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 1233 MISSION RIDGE RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-231-007
Application Number: MST2010-00186
Owner: Sanborn 1998 Trust
Architect: Lloyd Malar
Architect: Mark Shields

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish the existing residence, accessory building, and detached garage totaling 2,847 square feet and construct two new single-family residences on a 31,584 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes Unit 1 as a 3,796 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached 407 square foot two-car garage, 192 square foot workshop, 674 square foot covered patio, 50 square foot second-story deck, pool, spa, hardscape and retaining walls. Unit 2 is proposed as a 920 square foot one-story additional dwelling unit with a 459 square foot two-car garage and a 125 square foot storage area attached to the main house. The proposed total of 4,395 square feet for Unit 1 is 99.9% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. The proposed total of 1,504 square feet for Unit 2 is 34% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. A total of 308 cubic yards of on-site grading is proposed. The project received Planning Commission approval on 3/10/2011 (Resolution No. 005-11) for a Performance Standard Permit to allow an additional dwelling unit per SBMC 28.93.030.E.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 002-11 and Planning Commission Resolution No. 005-11. Project was last reviewed by SFDB on March 28, 2011.)

(3:32)

Present: Mark Shields, Architect; Tom Sanborn, Owner; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:50 p.m.

The following public comment spoke in opposition of the proposed project:

- 1) Judy Denenholtz spoke with concerns regarding the FAR, high fire area, potential traffic issues, and density.
- 2) Keith Rivera, representing adjacent neighbors Dan and Diane Gainey, spoke with concerns regarding second floor privacy issues, and a request for landscape plan language for privacy screening.
- 3) Beverly Trial (submitted a prior email in opposition and photos of neighboring homes during meeting) spoke with concerns regarding the large size of the proposed project in comparison to neighboring homes.
- 4) Edward Easton (submitted letter at meeting) spoke with concerns regarding the large size of the proposed project, window locations, and the tower elements on the north and west side.
- 5) Marc Chytilo, (representing the Dave and Judy Denenholtz/submitted letter/photos at meeting) spoke with concerns regarding the large size, bulk and mass of the proposed project, neighborhood compatibility, and obstruction of public ocean views.

Emails of opposition were acknowledged from Beverly and Alain Trial.

An email of neither support nor opposition from James Knight of The Rivera Association was acknowledged by the Board.

Letters of support were acknowledged by the Board from: Sarah Stewart, Graham Phillips, Dorothy Padilla, Michael R. and Kathleen Cooper, Laurel Gilbert Phillips, Esq., Glendon Dyruff, and Mary Lou Fahy.

Public comment closed at 4:05 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board found the proposed project's current mass, bulk, and scale, compatibility with the Riviera neighborhood, and appreciates the reductions of the design by the applicant over the course of the previous five Design Review meetings.
- 2) The consistency of appearance, detailing of the design, and quality of the architecture and materials are acceptable.
- 3) The layout of the house on the site and landscaping are acceptable. The Board appreciates the sensitive design to maintain the existing oak trees.
- 4) The Board finds that the proposed project will not result in any negative impacts to public views.

Action: Zimmerman/Woolery, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

3. 1117 LAS ALTURAS RD

A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-113-022
 Application Number: MST2011-00142
 Owner: Barbara Fasken Trust
 Architect: Leonard Grant

(Proposal to replace a 3,520 square foot two-story single-family residence and garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. Project proposes construction consisting of a new 4,159 square foot two-story single-family residence and an attached 617 square foot two-car garage. Site improvements include a driveway, auto courts, fountain, and approximately 1,225 cubic yards of total site grading. The proposed total of 4,776 square feet on the 46,303 square foot lot, in the Hillside Design District, is 95% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Project was last reviewed at Consent on April 18, 2011, and referred to Full Board. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(4:13)

Present: Eddie Herrera and Brad Vernon, Architects.

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m.

The following public comment spoke either in support or in opposition of the proposed project:

- 1) Penny True, neighbor, expressed concerns regarding the FAR of the proposed project, the site layout, grade, solar access, and trees.
- 2) Don Vogt, neighbor, expressed concerns regarding the lack of break up on the façade, the straight roof line, and the proposed entry. He requested story poles be installed on the project site.

Public comment closed at 4:33 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study reducing the overall size and height of the proposed project; particularly the south elevation.
- 2) Provide site and building sections, and plate height details; reduce the plate heights; study the proportion of the front entry.
- 3) Provide additional information of the proposed pool including a section through the pool.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 1304 CRESTLINE DR****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-251-001

Application Number: MST2008-00385

Owner: Joe Weber and Jillian Reed

Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for a 169 square foot first-floor addition, 248 square feet of second-floor additions, and a façade remodel including the replacement of the existing pitched roof with a flat roof on an existing 2,790 square foot two-story single-family residence with an attached two-car garage. The proposal includes a 652 square foot roof deck above the first floor with exterior stairs, a 42 square foot second-story deck, a rear patio, and swimming pool. The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification for alterations in the required interior setback. The proposed total of 3,207 square feet, on a 10,605 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 84% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 071-09. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on August 17, 2009.)

(4:55)

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the proposed contemporary design for the project acceptable.
- 2) Provide articulation to soften the massing of the building from the street and from the rear elevation; in particular the deck over the garage door at the front and breaking up of the massing at the rear elevation.
- 3) Provide design details.
- 4) Provide photographs of neighboring contemporary houses of similar style.

Action: Zink/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 707 CHIQUITA RD****E-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-132-009
Application Number: MST2011-00139
Owner: Niki Gleason
Applicant: Sophie Calvin

(Proposal to construct a 361 square foot one-story addition and a 206 square foot two-story addition to an existing two-story, 2,714, square foot single-family residence with a 274 square foot basement and an attached 374 square foot two-car garage on a 13,073 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Approximately 20 cubic yards of grading is proposed. The proposed total of 3,929 square feet is 96% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(5:25)

Present: Sophie Calvin, Architect; and Mr. and Mrs. Gleason, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:30 p.m.

Terry Gray, neighbor, expressed concerns of the proposed project, potential view impacts, and requested story poles be placed on the project site.

Public comment closed at 5:31 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met regarding the project's acceptable design, bulk, and scale, consistency of appearance, quality of architecture and materials, and compatibility with the neighborhood as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with the comment for the applicant to return with a color board.

Action: Zink/Carroll, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 2547 MEDCLIFF RD****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-362-016
Application Number: MST2011-00151
Owner: 2547 Medcliff, LLC
Architect: Harrison Design
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting

(Proposal to construct a 1,285 square foot addition, including a 264 square foot loft and an attached 65 square foot pool equipment storage area, to an existing 2,645 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached two-car garage. The residence is located on a 1.11 acre lot located in the Hillside Design District and in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes the removal of 11 existing trees, the demolition of a 91 square foot storage structure and a detached 65 square foot pool equipment shed. Other site alterations include the filling of an existing pool and construction of a new pool and spa, solar panels, new site stone and permeable patio areas, a new 436 square foot cantilevered wood deck, new site walls, fences, and landscaping, including a new six foot tall stucco wall and entry gate. A total of 335 cubic yards of grading is proposed. The proposed total of 3,930 square feet on the 1.11 acre lot is 78% of the floor-to-lot area guideline. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(5:44)

Present: Tony Spann, Architect; Steve Welton, Agent; and Courtney Miller for Katie O'Reilly Rogers.

Public comment opened at 6:05 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Letters of support from Felicia Kashevaroff and Andy Erickson, and Junie Webb were acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board feels the proposed project is appropriate and compatible with the neighborhood.
- 2) The proposed project's overall style, size, bulk, and scale are acceptable.
- 3) The project's consistency of appearance and quality of proposed architecture and materials are acceptable.
- 4) The Board recommends the addition of a new street tree in the parkway; provide native plants along the bluff top.
- 5) A majority of the Board finds the proposed metal roof is acceptable.
- 6) The majority of the Board found the rear deck to be acceptable as it is a maximum of 18 inches above grade, and therefore not truly cantilevered.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler stepped down).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:22 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR:**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 1109 LUNETTA PZ****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-222-035
 Application Number: MST2008-00452
 Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal for additions and remodeling for an existing 3,762 square foot two-story single-family residence, including a 384 square foot attached two-car garage, located on a 13,824 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The project would demolish 515 square feet and add 411 square feet to the first and second floors and construct a 260 square foot covered porch at the lower level and a 239 square foot covered porch at the second-floor level. The project will abate violations in ENF2007-01283. The proposed total of 3,595 square feet is 85% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio. The parcel is located in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The project received Planning Commission approval for a Coastal Development Permit on April 16, 2009 (Resolution No. 014-09).)

(Comments only; project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination. Review After Final for a proposed change of architectural style and related exterior door and window alterations. The footprint and square footage remains the same as originally approved.)

Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) Positive comments regarding proposed changes to architectural style.
- 2) Provide complete architectural drawings including site plan, floor plans, and elevations, and details.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**B. 1436 MANITOU RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-222-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00126
 Architect: Lori Kari
 Owner: Yukari Okamoto

(Proposal to construct a 294 square foot second-floor addition and a 42 square foot first-floor addition to an existing 1,570 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 478 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,384 square feet, on a 10,875 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 62% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio. The proposal will address the violations listed under ZIR2010-00515.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM – PUBLIC HEARING**C. 1547 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-041
Application Number: MST2009-00234
Owner: DC Duncan, Susan Duncan Trustees
Agent: Mark Morando
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal to remove a portion of an existing patio that has been undermined by erosion on the coastal bluff on a 20,300 square foot lot located in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and developed with an existing 4,835 square foot single-family residence. The proposal includes the "as-built" removal of one eucalyptus tree from the coastal bluff area and a proposed new site landscape plan. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit. The project will address the violations listed in ENF2008-00430 and ENF2010-00829.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

Positive comments from the Board, and continued indefinitely to Planning Commission.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman** and **Denise Woolery**.