



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, December 10, 2007 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

WILLIAM MAHAN, CHAIR
 PAUL ZINK, VICE-CHAIR
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 ERIN CARROLL
 GLEN DEISLER
 GARY MOSEL
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

GRANT HOUSE

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

Single Family Design Board Submittal Checklist		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p>Master Application & Submittal Fee</p> <p>Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also panoramic streetscape photos.</p> <p>Plans - floor, roof, etc. drawn to scale, three sets of <u>folded</u> plans, minimum size 18" x 24", required <u>at time of submittal & with each plan revision</u>.</p> <p>Vicinity Map and Project Statistics Forms/or Equivalent - (Include on first sheet). If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also street elevation outlines.</p> <p>Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p>Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable. .</p> <p>Story Pole Plan – if story poles are required for the project.</p> <p>Topographic Survey – professional survey for sites averaging 15% or more.</p> <p>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p>Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p>Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient project review.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p>Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p>Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for some single family projects, for example, where grading or new landscaped areas are proposed or for over 85% of max. FAR* projects. Proposed tree removal or planting and other proposed planting areas must be shown per SFDB Guidelines, Part 2: Landscape Design. At least 80% of landscaped areas must be allocated for water-wise plants. Paved areas must be shown and site statistics provided. Plans must include any street parkway strips.</p> <p>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p>Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p>Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p>Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p>Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories or noise generating equipment dBA CNEL levels at property line, where applicable.</p> <p>Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including additional planting specifications, erosion control measures and irrigation plan.</p> <p>Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. The meeting was called to order at 3:06 p.m. by Chair Mahan.
- B. Roll call.
Present: Bernstein, Carroll, Deisler, Mahan, Mosel, Zink
Absent: Woolery
Staff: Boughman, Limon (left at 3:31 p.m.), Shafer
- C. Public Comment:
A public comment letter from Paula Westbury concerning Item #1, Vinyl Window Discussion, was read into the record by Vice-Chair Zink.
- D. Approval of Minutes for November 26, 2007.
Approval of the Minutes were tabled to the next regular meeting.
- E. Consent Calendar:
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of December 3, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.
Action: Mosel/Deisler, 6/0/0. Motion carried.
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of December 10, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.
Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried.
- F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
1. Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:
a) There will be a recess for break from 5:40 to 6:00 p.m.
b) Denise Woolery will be absent.
c) A Special Meeting of the SFDB will take place on Tuesday, December 18, 2007 at 3:00 p.m.
d) Consent Calendar will meet at the regular time on Monday, December 17, 2007 at 11:00 a.m.
- G. Subcommittee Reports.
NPO Subcommittee: Chair Mahan announced that the NPO Update will be addressed by the Ordinance Committee on Tuesday, December 11, and at Planning Commission on Thursday, December 13, 2007.
- H. Possible Ordinance Violations.
No violations.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. Acceptability of vinyl windows.**

Member Deisler made the presentation providing vinyl window samples. Not all “vinyl” windows are vinyl, some are fiberglass and paintable, others have mullions outside double glazing.

Member Mosel expressed concern with projects using mullions built into the windows, manufactured windows lack window sills, lack of compatibility with older existing windows, and lack of art glass replacement.

Mr. Limon suggested developing guidelines addressing the desired characteristics and installation details rather than a list of manufacturer’s products that would be acceptable. The final effect is often determined by installation details rather than window selection.

Chair Mahan appointed a subcommittee of Mosel and Deisler to return with a list of the desired final aesthetic effects the Board would look for in installation of various window types.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**2. 1967 STANWOOD DR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 019-050-002

Application Number: MST2007-00081

Owner: Ronald B. Dinning

Applicant: Sophie Calvin

(Proposal for remodeling and a 990 square foot one story addition to an existing single family residence, a new 529 square foot detached garage with a 463 square foot second-floor accessory space, garden stairs, patio, trellises and exterior fireplace. The project is located on a 32,916 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 1,982 square feet is 41% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

(Second Concept Review. First review was at ABR.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(3:31)

Present: Sophie Calvin, Designer.

Staff comment: A Modification is no longer required.

Public comment opened at 3:40 p.m.

A public comment letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:40 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Study using colors that are compatible with colors found in Stanwood Canyon.
- 2) Raise the shed roof over the garage doors so that a three foot overhang is expressed.
- 3) Return with window details.

- 4) The project is compatible in consistency and appearance; compatible in scale to the neighborhood; provides quality architecture and materials; provides protection of the oak tree with the cantilever.

Action: Zink/Deisler, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 421 DIBBLEE AVE

R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-112-001
 Application Number: MST2007-00524
 Owner: Timothy G. Milham
 Architect: Steve Hausz

(Proposal to demolish a 451 square-foot non-conforming detached two-car garage and replace it with a 471 square-foot two-car garage with a 319 square-foot second-story accessory space. The existing 1,548 square-foot two-story single-family residence on the 4,880 square-foot lot will remain. The total proposed square-footage of 2,338 is 97% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(3:51)

Present: Steve Hausz, Architect; Tim Milham, Owner/Contractor.

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m.

A public comment letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by Chair Mahan.

Public comment closed at 3:58 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Restudy the design giving consideration to how the masonry walls will be treated.
- 2) Bring the architecture into a more Edwardian style to be compatible with the neighborhood.
- 3) Study the cantilevers to make them more compatible with the design.
- 4) Note existing trees and landscape on the landscape plan.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 1642 CALLE CANON****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-140-008
 Application Number: MST99-00606
 Owner: Carolyn Maguire

Architect: Pete Ehlen
 Contractor: Russell Banko Design and Construction

(Proposal for a tentative subdivision of two existing lots into five new residential lots, with associated street improvements on Calle Canon. A new private access road, private driveways and Fire Department turnaround are anticipated to require approximately 3,600 cubic-yards of cut and 2200 cubic-yards fill grading, multiple retaining walls of varying heights are proposed. One oak tree is proposed to be removed.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVALS.)

(4:22)

Present: Pete Ehlen, Architect.

Staff Comments: Allison DeBusk, Case Planner stated staff's concerns with a) inconsistency with General Plan; b) residential density; c) environmental constraints; d) visual impacts.

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m.

- Ramona Marten, opposed: concerned with proximity to property line; visual impact; project height.
- Marcia Engleman, opposed: concerned with loss of views; integrity of hillside and neighborhood; removal of seven oak trees; traffic; density; negative impact to neighborhood.
- Bill Boyd, conditional support: concerned with maintenance of existing view easement.
- Stephen Zodos, spoke in support of the project.
- Richard Banta, conditional support: would like to work with developer to mitigate loss of views.
- Public comment letters from Paula Westbury, Otto Engleman, Pamela Haldeman, Bill Boyd, Gina-Vera Niblack, Terry Bugay, and Eva Turner were acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment was closed at 5:06 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:

- 1) Give consideration to single-story houses on building envelope numbers 4 and 5. Those building envelopes will be kept away from the upper property line as is reasonable to prevent the house from intruding on the neighbors above.
- 2) The tall curved retaining wall may deviate from the height and terracing guidelines if designed in an interesting way.
- 3) Preservation of oak trees is very important. Use caution with regard to the effects of grading on the oak trees.
- 4) The overarching architectural style should be rural and of appropriate size and color.
- 5) The Board appreciates the sidewalks as presented.

Action: Deisler/Bernstein, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Zink opposed, excessive grading. Carroll stepped down. Woolery absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 210 MEIGS RD****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-110-011
Application Number: MST2006-00476
Owner: Mary Stevens Trustee (For) Steven
Architect: Pete Ehlen

(Proposal for a five lot subdivision to include street improvements and grading. No structures are proposed at this time. The project requires a General Plan amendment, Local Coastal Plan amendment, zone change, and a lot line adjustment between three existing lots referred to as 216 and 290 Lighthouse Road and 210 Meigs Road.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVALS.)

(5:35)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:44 p.m.

Natasha Campbell: insert first comment; statements of hours, design components: walls, and landscaping.

Public comment letters submitted by Don Barthelmeß and Kallman, and Paula Westbury were acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment was closed at 5:54 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission with the following comments:

- 1) Restudy the tree removal giving consideration to retaining as many trees as possible, including the Eucalyptus.
- 2) The retaining walls should be faced in sandstone or a similar material.
- 3) Applicant to provide a landscape plan for the public areas.
- 4) Study articulating the wall along the street.
- 5) The five lot subdivision and grading are supportable as presented.

Action: Mosel/Deisler, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed. Woolery absent.)

***** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:17 UNTIL 7:42 P.M.*****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 1635 MIRA VISTA AVE****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-031
 Application Number: MST2006-00097
 Owner: Michael S. Millhollan
 Architect: Bill Wolf

(Proposal to reconfigure a driveway and attached 546 square foot two-car garage for entry facing the street. The project includes 99 cubic yards of grading and construction of a retaining wall up to 10 feet high. The existing 3,617 square-foot one-story single-family residence including garage is located on a 16,628 square-foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Staff Hearing officer approval is requested for a modification to allow a retaining wall to exceed 3.5 feet high in the front setback.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)

(7:42)

Present: Bill Wolf, Pacific Architects.

Public comment opened at 6:49 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment was closed at 6:50 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The modification poses no adverse impacts to the neighborhood.
- 2) The Board finds the project supportable.
- 3) The project is ready for Preliminary Approval on Consent Calendar.

Action: Zink/Deisler, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

***** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:55 UNTIL 7:03 P.M. *****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 492 LA CUMBRE RD****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-170-009
 Application Number: MST2007-00563
 Owner: Robert Hart
 Architect: David Lavendar

(Proposal for new two-story 2,611 square-foot single-family residence including attached 487 square-foot two-car garage. The project is located on a 7,501 net square foot vacant lot. The proposed total square-footage of 2,611 is 85% of the maximum FAR.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(7:03)

Present: Gunner Tautrim, Builder/Owner; Robert Hart, Owner.

Staff comments: the project does not require site concept review. The project is below 85%.

Public comment opened at 7:13 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment was closed at 7:14 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Restudy design alternatives for the stair tower element.
- 2) Restudy the chimney and verify that it will comply with Building Code. Study the appropriateness of the chimney size and consider stone material.
- 3) Study the roof plan to eliminate gables.
- 4) Study the cupola height.
- 5) Provide structural details for the balcony. Study its appropriateness for size and extent of cantilever.
- 6) Provide a preliminary landscape plan, including details of the arching porch wall.
- 7) Show a location for future photovoltaic installation.

Action: Zink/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

8. 1943 GRAND AVE

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-344-004

Application Number: MST2007-00015

Owner: Gerald Constantine and Janean Comati

Architect: Jeff Shelton

Contractor: Dan Upton Construction, Inc.

(Proposal for remodeling and additions to an existing 1,968 square-foot two-story single-family residence on a 7,018 square foot lot in the Mission Area Special Design District. The proposal would add 633 square feet of living area, two attached 242 square-foot one-car garages, and 284 square feet of roof decks. The proposed total square footage of 3,085 is 104% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(First review at SFDB, project was reviewed once at ABR.)

(7:40)

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:52 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 7:53 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code as a basis for working drawings and continued indefinitely to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The design as presented is acceptable to the Board.
- 2) Provide windows in both the garage and the garage doors.
- 3) Reduce the width of the driveway as allowed by Transportation Planning.
- 4) Add a tree between the garage doors.
- 5) The metal chimney and roof are acceptable as presented.
- 6) Provide a revised color and materials board.
- 7) The project is compatible in consistency and appearance, compatible in scale to the neighborhood; provides quality architecture and materials. The FAR over 100% is acceptable because the project is located in an R-2 Zone.

Action: Zink/Carroll, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained. Woolery absent.)

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

9. 730 COOK AVE

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-243-018

Application Number: MST2007-00447

Owner: Joseph C. and Genevieve H. Franco Trustees

Architect: Larry Graves, Alliance Design Group

(Proposal to construct a new 2,053 square foot two-story single family residence including attached 425 square-foot two-car garage on a vacant 5,135 square foot lot. The proposed total square footage of 2,053 is 83% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

Postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

10. 1141 HARBOR HILLS DR

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-314-004

Application Number: MST2007-00438

Owner: Joyce Holliday Fahlman, Trustee

Architect: Amy Taylor

Owner: Nancy Engstrom

(Proposal for an 808 square foot addition and remodel for an existing one-story 3,353 square-foot single-family residence on a 10,062 square-foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The project includes repair of the foundation and the addition of a lower level under the rear of the residence. The proposed total square-footage of 3,757 (counting 1/2 the basement) is 100% of the maximum FAR.)

(8:10)

Present: Amy Taylor, Architect.

Public comment opened at 8:18 p.m.

Anderson: concerned about drainage flow; concerned about integrity of hillside.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 8:20 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code as a basis for working drawings and continued indefinitely to Consent Calendar with the following comments

- 1) Applicant to verify with contractor, or other means, size, adequacy, and termination of the drainage system.
- 2) Provide working drawings.
- 3) The project is compatible in consistency and appearance, compatible in scale to the neighborhood; and provides quality architecture and materials.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

I. The Full Board meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

NEW ITEM

A. 255 SAN RAFAEL AVE E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-141-005

Application Number: MST2007-00564

Owner: Jeffrey M. and Jennifer A. Davis

Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for a 892 square feet of single-story additions, a 588 square foot roof deck, 2 rear decks (275 square feet and 350 square feet), and a 44 square foot addition to the existing front porch. The existing 1,194 square foot one-story single-family residence and attached 386 square foot attached two-car garage is located on a 7,520 square foot lot. The proposed total of 2,472 square feet is 80% of the maximum FAR.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued one week with the following comments: 1) Study moving the roof deck 15 feet away from the property line. 2) Verify open yard area is not reduced below requirements.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 626 E MICHELTORENA ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-033-006
Application Number: MST2007-00267
Owner: Roger and Debra Friedland
Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal for a 407 square foot one-story addition, reconstruction of the existing one-car garage, and 527 square feet of exterior first and second floor decking and stairs to an existing 2,587 square foot two-story single-family residence on a 12,430 square foot lot in the Lower Riviera Special Design District.)

(Review After Final to change wood shingle siding to vertical tongue-and-groove 1 x 6 siding, change stone veneer wainscoting to plaster finish, and change stone veneer retaining wall to native stone gravity wall.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final as noted on the plans.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 1606 HILLSIDE RD****R-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-092-053
Application Number: MST2007-00460
Owner: Christopher Kirkbride
Architect: James LeCron

(Proposal to demolish an existing 793 square foot one-story single-family residence and construct a 793 square foot one-story single-family residence and a 256 square foot two-car carport. The 8,580 square foot lot is currently developed with another single-family residence facing Clearview Rd.)

Final Approval of the Architecture with the following conditions: 1) Specify high quality Milgard vinyl windows. 2) Roof color to be Rocky Grey. 3) Building color to be Great Desert. Landscaping continued to Consent Calendar.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 3825 LA CUMBRE HILLS LN****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-170-042
Application Number: MST2007-00044
Owner: John and Marcia Briggs
Architect: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal for remodeling and additions to an existing 1,254 square foot single family residence with an attached 418 square foot garage on an 8,000 square foot lot. The proposal includes converting an existing 336 square foot second story deck to habitable space, a 192 square foot addition, a 45 square foot deck, and a 382 square foot workshop at the lower level. The 2,582 square foot proposed total has a FAR of 0.32 and is 81% of the maximum FAR.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 365 EL CIELITO RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-082-005
Application Number: MST2007-00216
Owner: Michael G. A. and Helen M. Chadwick
Architect: Vadim Hsu

(Proposal for remodeling and a 1,369 square foot two-story addition to an existing 4,370 square foot one-story single family residence. The addition would attach the existing detached two-story 1,722 square foot three-car garage/accessory space to the residence. The project is located on a 2.26 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal has a FAR of 0.08.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**F. 964 GARCIA RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-261-003
Application Number: MST2007-00434
Owner: Robert F. Lint
Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal for remodeling and an 851 square foot one-story addition for an existing 2,852 square foot one-story single-family residence on a 21,244 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The project includes replacement of the roof and all windows. The project will result in a one-story 3,667 square foot residence including the 450 square foot two-car garage which is 78% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

Final Approval with the following conditions: 1) Rear flood lights to be mounted high enough to be shielded by the roof overhang. 2) Path lights are to be removed from the proposal. 3) Substitute horizontal rail in lieu of vertical pickets.

All items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Glen Deisler. Consent Calendar ended at 12:40 p.m.