



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 15, 2007 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:
 WILLIAM MAHAN, CHAIR, Present
 PAUL ZINK, VICE-CHAIR, Present
 BERNIE BERNSTEIN, Present
 ERIN CARROLL, Present
 GLEN DEISLER, Absent
 GARY MOSEL, Present
 DENISE WOOLERY, Present

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: GRANT HOUSE, Absent
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON, Absent

STAFF:
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Absent
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician, Present
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary, Present

Single Family Design Board Submittal Checklist		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p>Master Application & Submittal Fee</p> <p>Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also panoramic streetscape photos.</p> <p>Plans - floor, roof, etc. drawn to scale, three sets of <u>folded</u> plans, minimum size 18" x 24", required <u>at time of submittal & with each plan revision</u>.</p> <p>Vicinity Map and Project Statistics Forms/or Equivalent - (Include on first sheet). If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also street elevation outlines.</p> <p>Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p>Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable. .</p> <p>Story Pole Plan - if story poles are required for the project.</p> <p>Topographic Survey - professional survey for sites averaging 15% or more.</p> <p>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p>Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p>Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient project review.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p>Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p>Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for some single family projects, for example, where grading or new landscaped areas are proposed or for over 85% of max. FAR* projects. Proposed tree removal or planting and other proposed planting areas must be shown per SFDB Guidelines, Part 2: Landscape Design. At least 80% of landscaped areas must be allocated for water-wise plants. Paved areas must be shown and site statistics provided. Plans must include any street parkway strips.</p> <p>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p>Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p>Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p>Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p>Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories or noise generating equipment dBA CNEL levels at property line, where applicable.</p> <p>Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including additional planting specifications, erosion control measures and irrigation plan.</p> <p>Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

Chair Mahan called to the meeting to order at 3:08 p.m.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of October 01, 2007, with corrections.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of October 8, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of October 15, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink with the exception of landscaping for Item B reviewed by Erin Carroll.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Boughman announced that Board member Deisler will be absent.

Mr. Boughman asked whether the Board would consider having longer meetings to help with the backlog of applications. Consensus of the Board was that they would prefer not to have longer meetings or longer agendas.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No reported violations.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 1141 HARBOR HILLS DR

E-1 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-314-004

Application Number: MST2007-00438

Owner: Nancy Engstrom

Architect: Amy Taylor

(Proposal for a 1,000 square foot addition and remodel for an existing one-story 3,353 square foot single-family residence on a 10,062 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The project includes repair of the foundation and the addition of a lower level below the rear of the residence. The proposed total square footage of 4,353 is 102.5 % of the maximum FAR. Planning Commission approval of a modification to exceed the maximum square footage is requested.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)

(3:20)

Present: Amy Taylor, Architect; Nancy Engrstrom, Trustee; Mark Saughter, General Contractor.

Public comment opened at 3:33 p.m.

Bruce Anderson: concerned about hillside stability, potential loss of trees; drainage question.

Public comment closed at 3:36 p.m.

Straw vote: How many can approve the project over 100% FAR? 3/3/0.

Straw vote: How many are in favor of revising the plans to have no side yard modifications 5/1/0.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Provide a report from a licensed geologist.
- 2) Provide a rear yard landscape plan. Provide a drainage plan.
- 3) Revise the plans to not require a side yard modification. Reduce the area to less than 100% FAR.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 4/2/0. (Mosel and Zink opposed, no need to reduce square footage. Deisler absent.)

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

2. 118 CALLE BELLO

A-2 Zone

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-340-007
Application Number: MST2007-00385
Owner: Paul and Marianne Gertman
Architect: Bildsten and Sherwin

(Proposal for 248 cubic yards of cut and fill grading and sitework for new landscaped terrace and pool, enclosed pool house, open pergola, new solar photovoltaic panels, and solar water heating panels on the southern, sloped portion of the 1.1 acre parcel in the Hillside Design District.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(4:11)

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Architect; Paul and Marianne Gertman, Owners.

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The project is ready for Preliminary Approval pending environmental review.
- 2) Eliminate the stairs at the interim equipment room landing; provide steps and landscaping in that area.
- 3) Integrate boulders to soften the retaining walls.
- 4) Provide information about landscaping to screen retaining walls.
- 5) Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings can be made on Consent Calendar.

Action: Zink/Woolery, 6/0/0. (Deisler absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 3035 HERMOSA RD****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-192-002
 Application Number: MST2007-00432
 Owner: Jessica L. Kolbe
 Designer: Clay Tedeschi

(Proposal to remodel and add an 828 square foot second-story addition to an existing 2,007 square foot single-family residence, including 460 square foot two-car garage on a 8,712 square foot lot. The proposal includes demolition of 115 square feet on the first floor, an addition of 94 square feet to an existing first-floor deck, and a new 80 square foot deck on the second floor. The project will result in a 2,720 square foot two-story residence which is 80.5% of the maximum FAR.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(4:37)

Present: Clay Tedeschi, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:00 p.m.

Martin Scharlemann, requested that no windows face his property which can not be screened.

Donald LaFler: question about heights.

Public comment closed at 4:45 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the project as the basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code. Return to Full Board for in-progress review with the following comments:

- 1) Revise the roof and rear chimney to integrate into the architecture.
- 2) Provide high quality details and materials to emulate the neighborhood.
- 3) Provide a front yard landscaping plan.
- 4) The project provides consistency and appearance; is compatible with the neighborhood; provides quality architecture and materials; and preserves trees.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 1057 ARBOLADO RD****E-1 Zone**

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-241-013
 Application Number: MST2007-00462
 Owner: Ann S. De Bruyn Kops
 Applicant: Mike Gones

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing one-story 2,024 square foot single-family residence located on a 13,504 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Proposed are first-floor additions of 516 square feet, a new 893 square foot second-story, replace all roofing, complete exterior remodel, and repaving the driveway, and 50 cubic yards of fill grading. The project will result in a 3,433 square foot structure which is 82% of the maximum allowable FAR. Staff Hearing officer approval of a modification to encroach into the front yard setback is requested.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)

(5:01)

Present: Mike Gones, Applicant; Paul and Ann De Bruyn Kops, Owners.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m. The following individuals expressed concern:

1. Derek Westen, Attorney representing neighbors; project is not designed sensitively.
2. Brad Simon, resident: opposed to project height.
3. Gaile Baratto, resident: loss of views.
4. Nick Svensson, resident: loss of views.
5. Jacqueline Page, resident: loss of views.
6. Nancy Kaplan, visitor: loss of views.
7. Doug McElwain, resident: mass, and change of views.
8. Elaine Daugherty, visitor: size impacts.
9. Cliff Hickman, Designer: view impacts.
10. Chris Kamen, resident: loss of backyard privacy.
11. Dory Turk-Kamen: sensitivity for privacy.
12. Joyce Searles, resident: project sets a precedent for the area.
13. Bruce Morrow, resident: loss of views; encouraged a Board site visit.
14. Marge Graves, resident: privacy and views of the neighborhood.
15. Justina Evans, resident: concerned about loss of views.
16. Jeff Evans, resident: proposal does not blend into the neighborhood.
17. Jack Hewitt, resident: view protection needed, per SFDB Guidelines.
18. Diane Hall, resident: loss of views.
19. Steve Buchanan, resident: requested that applicant meet with neighbors.

Public comment closed at 5:44 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Restudy the design to reduce the size, bulk, and scale, particularly the tower and stair area.
- 2) Provide dimensions from the property line to any proposed decks.
- 3) If the applicant retains the two-story concept, the Board will require story poles.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler absent.)

*****THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:13 P.M. UNTIL 6:37 P.M.*****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 2109 MOUNT CALVARY RD****A-1 Zone**

(5:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-073-017
Application Number: MST2007-00454
Owner: Kurt H. and Carole Kinzel
Architect: James LeCron

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,556 square foot house and 400 square foot attached garage and construct a new three-story single-family residence on the 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed 6,209 square foot residence includes an attached 732 square foot three-car garage, 92 square foot workshop, and 985 square foot unfinished basement. The proposal is 113% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

(Site Concept Review will precede review of architecture.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(6:37)

Present: James LeCron; Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:49 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: To accept the site plan concept and proceed to a review of the architecture.

Action: Mosel/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler absent.)

Public comment reopened at 6:57 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Study lowering the chimneys.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan.
- 3) Show a location for future solar installation.
- 4) Lower the living room ceiling height.
- 5) Study lowering the arched window heights.
- 6) Restudy and reduce the tower composition.
- 7) Study a terraced retaining wall.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 1568 LAS CANOAS RD****A-1 Zone**

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-082-032
Application Number: MST2007-00474
Owner: Robert E. and Alyce E. Parsons
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for a new 4,468 square foot two-story single-family residence including 730 square foot three-car garage on a 63,581 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The existing house and garage are to be demolished. The proposal is 85% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

(Site Concept Review will precede review of architecture.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(7:19)

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect; Robert and Alyce Parsons, Owners.

Public comment opened at 7:46 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: To accept the site plan concept with the following comments and proceed to a review of the architecture: 1) Grading is not proposed under the oak trees and no oak trees will be removed. 2) Cut and fill grading will be balanced, without excessive retaining walls. 4/0/0. (Mahan and Carroll stepped down; Deisler absent.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Provide additional design drawings.
- 2) Provide a massing model.
- 3) Provide a landscaping plan addressing solar and other green components.
- 4) Provide a site plan showing footprints of neighboring homes.

Action: Mosel/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Mahan and Carroll stepped down; Deisler absent.)

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

7. 835 W VALERIO ST

R-2 Zone

(7:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-211-001
 Application Number: MST2007-00282
 Owner: Manuel Castro
 Applicant: Ubaldo Diaz
 Architect: Gil Garcia

(Proposal for a 2,309 square foot two-story single-family residence, with an attached 478 square foot two-car garage on a 5,250 square foot lot. The existing one-story 728 square foot residence and attached 271 square foot garage will be demolished. The proposal has a FAR of 0.44.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(7:57)

Present: Gil Garcia, Architect; Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect; Ubaldo Diaz, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 8:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: **Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments and conditions:**

- 1) Redesign the garage door to move the lintel to the plaster surface, and to modify the carriage door design.
- 2) Provide a trellis with planting over the garage door.
- 3) At the side elevation facing the open yard, replace the double doors with a single 3' 0" door.
- 4) Show a wall and trellis above on the front elevation, as viewed from Gillespie Street per Landscape Drawings.
- 5) Modify the cantilevered bathroom element to comply with Planning Department requirements.
- 6) Indicate on the plans that all new site walls will be plastered on both sides.
- 7) Provide information about the chimney top.
- 8) The three arches on the front elevation shall be identical.
- 9) The lawn area shall comply with the City's water conservation requirements.
- 10) The proposal provides consistency in appearance, is compatible with the neighborhood, and provides quality architecture and materials.

Action: Mosel/Woolery, 3/1/0. (Bernstein: opposed, prefers Full Board review. Mahan and Carroll stepped down. Deisler absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 964 GARCIA RD

E-1 Zone

(7:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-261-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00434
 Owner: Robert F. Lint
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal for remodeling and an 851 square foot one-story addition for an existing 2,852 square foot one-story single-family residence on a 21,244 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The project includes replacement of the roof and all windows. The project will result in a one-story 3,667 square foot residence including the 450 square foot two-car garage which is 78% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(8:30)

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; Becky Lint, Owner's Agent.

Public comment opened at 8:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar.

- 1) Provide permeable paving in the motor-court and adjacent to the garage.
- 2) Paint the lower retaining walls a dark adobe earth tone color.
- 3) Provide a 300 square foot area without vents for future solar installation.

Action: Mosel/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink stepped down. Deisler absent.)

**** FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:57 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.)

NEW ITEM

A. 1566 W VALERIO ST

R-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-032-030
 Application Number: MST2007-00499
 Owner: Casey Hartwell
 Designer: Jason Grant

(Proposal for a 98 square foot front porch and stair, demolition of 206 square foot front deck, a 6 square foot addition, interior remodel, replacement of all windows and doors, and replacement of siding.)

Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final approval with the following conditions: 1) the corbels supporting 6x6 balcony posts shall be 6x8 minimum (or per structural); 2) trim around windows shall be 1x3 minimum.

NEW ITEM

B. 840 CIMA LINDA LN

A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-162-019
 Application Number: MST2007-00500
 Owner: Chuck and Lisa Mounts
 Architect: Kent Mixon

(Proposed 96 square foot addition to an existing 6,063 square foot, two-story residence with an attached three-car garage. The improvements include a new detached 721 square foot, covered terrace and a new swimming pool and spa.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) the project is ready for Preliminary Approval pending environmental assessment; 2) the addition has no effect on the project's size, bulk, and scale; 3) the pool equipment's location should be finalized, if a new enclosure is proposed it shall be plastered CMU; 4) show driplines of oak trees and provide oak tree protection measures on plans; 5) bring cut sheet of proposed exterior light fixtures, must comply with City outdoor lighting ordinance; 6) raise the grade at the SE corner of motor court retaining wall to eliminate requirement for guardrail. 7) provide a low water compliance statement on the plans; 8) this review does not include the entry gate.

NEW ITEM**D. 1318 KENWOOD RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-133-017
Application Number: MST2005-00404
Owner: Enrique Chavez
Architect: Amy Taylor

(Proposal to replace the existing asphalt shingles with new shingles and new rafter tails, remove as-built portable spa and concrete pad, minimal grading along front for installation of new boulders at tow of slope, grading in side yard to create level yard area behind existing garage and an "as-built" replacement of a portion of a 6' high redwood fence on a property that contains an existing single family residence in the Hillside Design District. A greenhouse structure was previously removed without a permit.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued one week with the following comments: 1) repair the wood fence as needed and provide planting between fence and driveway; 2) call out proposed roof material on cover sheet; 3) alternative wall 2 is preferred, indicate height of wall for alternative 2 to be 64 inches, cover the footing with 4 inches minimum if paved, 6 inch minimum if landscaped; 4) alternative 1 allenblock walls shall not exceed 30 inches so no guardrail would be required; 5) bring tile color sample.

NEW ITEM**E. 1724 VILLA AVE****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-182-016
Application Number: MST2007-00286
Owner: Guajardo David
Agent: Catherine Dunbar

(Proposal to abate enforcement case [ENF2007-00184] and permit an as-built 291 square foot accessory structure. Proposal involves attaching the accessory unit to the existing house and relocating the existing as-built walls on the north and east elevations to meet the required interior yard setbacks and. A modification was approved to provide less than the required open yard area.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued one week with the following comments: 1) print the Staff Hearing Officer resolution on the plans; 2) show solar access on plans; 3) provide a deck plan showing deck to be no closer than 10 feet from property lines, show deck walls to be 6 feet minimum in height.

NEW ITEM

F. 3515 CHUPAROSA DR

E-3/SD-1/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-233-005
Application Number: MST2007-00468
Owner: Abshere Family Trust
Architect: Gary Jensen

(Proposed 296 square foot. addition and minor alterations to an existing two-story single-family residence. The proposed project includes adding a new 21 square foot. window seat in the master bedroom, demolishing an existing previously un-permitted room at the southwest corner of the structure and constructing a new room in the same location, and adding a new, partially covered patio. Also proposed is the replacement of existing stairs to a room over the garage. The project will result in a FAR of .26, which is 68% of the maximum.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval with the following conditions: 1) the master bedroom window to be divided into 2 double-hung windows; 2) the window sills at the balcony shall be at the same level as the balcony railing; 3) bring color board.

Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink, with the exception of landscaping for Item B reviewed by Erin Carroll.

Consent Calendar meeting ended at 12:50 p.m.