



City of Santa Barbara
PLANNING COMMISSION
MINUTES
JUNE 14, 2018

1:00 P.M.
 City Hall, Council Chambers
 735 Anacapa Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Lesley Wiscomb, *Chair*
 Sheila Lodge, *Vice Chair*
 John P. Campanella
 Jay D. Higgins
 Mike Jordan
 Deborah L. Schwartz
 Addison Thompson

STAFF:

N. Scott Vincent, Assistant City Attorney
 Beatriz Gularte, Senior Planner
 Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Wiscomb called the meeting to order at 1:02 p.m.

I. ROLL CALL

Chair Lesley Wiscomb, Vice Chair Sheila Lodge, Commissioners John P. Campanella, Jay D. Higgins (at 1:08 p.m.), Mike Jordan, and Deborah L. Schwartz

Absent: Commissioner Addison Thompson

STAFF PRESENT

N. Scott Vincent, Assistant City Attorney
 Beatriz Gularte, Senior Planner
 Allison De Busk, Project Planner
 Megan Arciniega, Associate Planner
 Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

II. PRELIMINARY MATTERS

A. Requests for continuances, withdrawals, postponements, or addition of ex-agenda items:

Ms. Gularte asked that Item III, 2111 Edgewater Way be continued to the July 19, 2018 agenda.

MOTION: Jordan/Lodge

Approve to postpone Item III, 2111 Edgewater Way, to the July 19, 2018 meeting and condition that it be agenzized as a regular item as opposed to a Consent Item.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 Noes: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 (Thompson and Higgins)

B. Announcements and appeals:

No announcements.

C. Comments from members of the public pertaining to items not on this agenda:

Annamarie Gott discussed the Canary Hotel covenant and brought forward concerns regarding enforcement on the conditions listed in the covenant. Ms. Gott also discussed the new AUD ordinance and illegal vacation rental. Bonnie Donovan ceded her time to Ms. Gott.

III. CONSENT ITEM

APPLICATION OF ROGER HOLCOMBE, PROPERTY OWNER, 2111 EDGEWATER WAY, APN 041-350-017, E-3/SD-3 ZONES, GENERAL PLAN AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM LAND USE DESIGNATION: LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL, 5 DU/AC (MST2017-00079)

The project consists of a remodel to an existing 2,734 square foot single residential unit with a 484 square foot attached two-car garage. The remodel consists of replacing the exterior doors and windows, repainting and a re-roof replacing the existing composition shingles with new charcoal gray composition shingles. Other site improvements include new landscaping and minor hardscape alterations. No new square footage is proposed to the existing residence. The project would abate violations identified in ENF2017-017417.

A Coastal Development Permit (CDP2018-00004) is required to allow the proposed development in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the City's Coastal Zone (SBMC §28.44.060).

The Environmental Analyst has determined that the project is exempt from further environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines Sections 15301, Existing Facilities and 15304, Minor Alterations to Land.

Item postponed to the July 19, 2018 Meeting.

IV. CONCEPT REVIEW

ACTUAL TIME: 1:09 P.M.

APPLICATION OF JARRETT GORIN, AGENT FOR LAGUNA HALEY STUDIOS LLC, 401-409 EAST HALEY STREET, APNS 031-212-017 AND -018, C-M COMMERCIAL MANUFACTURING ZONE, GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION: COMMERCIAL INDUSTRIAL/HIGH DENSITY RESIDENTIAL/PRIORITY HOUSING OVERLAY 37-63 DU/ACRE (MST2016-00508)

The scope of work previously reviewed by the Planning Commission for this project has been revised by the applicant to increase the commercial square footage and reduce the number of residential units. A Development Plan approved by the Architectural Review Board will be required for the new scope of work. The revised proposal is as follows.

The project is a proposal for a new mixed-use development using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program, in the M-C, Manufacturing Commercial zone. The project will include

a voluntary lot merger of Assessor's Parcels 031-212-017 and 031-212-018, which will result in one parcel of 22,500 square feet. Currently, there are two existing single-story commercial buildings and one residential duplex at 401 E. Haley Street, and one single-story, single-family residence (currently being used for commercial purposes), at 409 E. Haley. All existing residential and commercial structures totaling 5,828 square feet will be demolished. The proposal will include 5,462 square feet of commercial floor area, including 2,334 square feet of office/retail and four short term rental units (one proposed with a full kitchen), and 24 AUD rental units averaging 801 square feet. The project has 52 parking spaces; 10 parking spaces would be assigned to off-site uses per an existing off-site parking agreement with the Mill and Mill Annex.

This project requires Planning Commission Conceptual Review because the combined lot size is more than 15,000 square feet and the project is being proposed under the AUD Incentive Program Priority Housing Overlay. The purpose of this hearing is for Planning Commission and the public to review the proposed project design changes and provide the applicant, staff, and the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) with comments on the proposed revisions to the design, and General Plan consistency (SBMC §28.20.080).

The opinions of the Planning Commission may change, or there may be ordinance or policy changes that could affect the project that would result in requests for project design changes. **No formal action on the development proposal will be taken at the concept review, nor will any determination be made regarding environmental review of the proposed project.**

Megan Arciniega, Associate Planner, gave the Staff presentation.

Jarrett Gorin, Agent, gave the Applicant presentation.

Public comment opened at 1:40 p.m.

The following people spoke in support:

1. Peter Jacobson
2. Madeline Jacobson

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. Annamarie Gott expressed that the application date for this project should be adjusted to today's date so that the community can benefit and collect inclusionary housing and impact fees. Ms. Gott explained that the City's residential living space is getting smaller while hotel living space is getting larger. Ms. Gott discussed a concern with parking and covenant enforcement and requested that the commission pass on voting on the project until there is an official ordinance on short-term vacation rentals and parking. Bonnie Donovan ceded her time to Ms. Gott.

Public comment closed at 1:50 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

Commissioner Jordan:

- Can support a motion that states the revised project is consistent with the General Plan policies and is appropriate for the location and neighborhood since it is essentially the same project.
- Expressed that the project is a benefit to the community and will provide housing for residents.
- Stated that the project is consistent with the developing corridor.
- Would like to see street tree grates on Haley Street.
- Expressed concern with the planters proposed on Laguna Street where it is intensely parked and many will step all over the planting while getting out of their vehicle. A revised planting plan should be considered to mitigate that concern.
- Commented that a commitment to provide short term vacation rental guests with bicycles would be appreciated because of the location of the property and how accessible the location is to surrounding places of interest.
- Appreciates that the project continues to be over parked.

Commissioner Lodge:

- Is disappointed with the direction of the project and understands that the project fits within City ordinance; however, the high priority and high density zone was intended to be used to create a workforce affordable housing.
- Stated that the dark gray color proposed is not a Santa Barbara Color and is grim. The brick red color is preferred.

Commissioner Schwartz:

- Agrees that the project remains consistent with the General Plan Policies.
- Likes the location of the proposed project which is very much in support of eco-tourism and an ideal area to support the revitalization of lower downtown area.
- Stated that the landscaping design has improved since the original proposal; however, further landscape development should be implemented on Haley Street and Laguna Street.
- Expressed that a more blended architectural design and color pallet, with the mill, would have been more appealing.
- Finds the project meets the density and parking requirements.
- Would appreciate separating the long term vacation rentals and the short term vacation rentals with a gated structure.
- Will be able to support, as part of a majority vote, to move the project back to ABR for design development and approval.

Commissioner Campanella:

- Finds the project consistent with the goals and policies of the City's General Plan.
- Believes the project will be a benefit to local economics by bringing in people, 7 days a week, into the neighborhood and local businesses.
- Supports the ability to provide more reasonable priced housing for visitors or those who have short term needs.
- Expressed that this project is a better use for a commercial space than building additional office space.

- Stated the cost of construction and interest rates have gone up, so the viability of the project is important to make sure it is successful and makes economic sense.
- Finds the project design favorable for the neighborhood.
- Stated that the project is acceptable and approvable because this development plan is not squeezing out established housing and is simply repurposing commercial property.

Commissioner Higgins:

- Expressed that the façade treatment is heading in a better direction.
- Stated that offsite parking is not a desirable direction and it would have been preferred to keep parking onsite and bring down the building height.
- Believes kitchens in hotel units are not offensive but more common as a marketable aspect of the project.
- Stated that the project is moving in the right direction aesthetically.

Chair Wiscomb:

- Agrees with commissioner Jordan and can support that the project is consistent with the City's General Plan.
- Understands that the short term vacation rentals are being implemented as an economic component of the viability of the project.
- Finds the project aesthetically appropriate and the colors favorable.
- Expressed that the landscape should be more developed and agrees that the trees should have tree grates.
- Agreed that the proposed planters should be reconsidered so that they don't get trampled.
- Stated that bicycle parking is encouraged and promotes sustainability.

MOTION: Jordan/Higgins

Support the project making the findings that the revised project is consistent with the General Plan policies as outlined in the Staff Report dated June 7, 2018.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 Noes: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 (Thompson)

MOTION: Jordan/Higgins

Support the project design making the findings that the revised project is appropriate for the location and neighborhood with the comments made from the.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 Noes: 1 (Lodge) Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 (Thompson)

MOTION: Jordan/Higgins

Commissioner comments are to be put together by staff, on paper, and forwarded to the Architectural Board of Review for its consideration.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 Noes: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 (Thompson)

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:41 TO 2:51 P.M. ***

V. DISCUSSION ITEM**ACTUAL TIME: 2:51 P.M.****APPLICATION OF SUZANNE ELLEDGE, AGENT FOR AMERICAN TRADITION, PROPERTY OWNER, 433 E. CABRILLO BLVD. & 103 S. CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ (“WATERFRONT HOTEL”), APN 017-680-009 & 017-113-020, HRC-2 / S-P-1 / S-D-3 (HOTEL AND RELATED COMMERCE II / PARK PLAZA SPECIFIC PLAN / COASTAL OVERLAY) & OM-1/S-D-3 (OCEAN ORIENTED LIGHT MANUFACTURING / COASTAL OVERLAY) ZONES, LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM LAND USE PLAN DESIGNATION: OPEN SPACE AND OCEAN ORIENTED INDUSTRIAL (MST2016-00284)**

The purpose of this discussion item is to inform the Planning Commission of proposed changes to the Waterfront Hotel Project which was approved by the City Council on August 15, 1995, within the context of a request to the City for a Substantial Conformance Determination (SCD). The Waterfront Hotel Project involves the development of two parcels totaling 5.42 acres with a luxury hotel and related development at 433 E. Cabrillo Blvd. and 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez. The discretionary applications approved for the Project include a Development Agreement, a Coastal Development Permit, a Development Plan, a Parking Modification and a Conditional Use Permit.

Key proposed changes include:

- Change from 150 hotel rooms to 52-60 hotel rooms.
- Moving back-of-house operations from the hotel building at 433 E. Cabrillo to a new three-story building totaling 10,416 net square feet located at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez, which was previously approved as the Project's 111-space surface parking lot. This eliminates the need for a basement at 433 E. Cabrillo Blvd.
- Reconfiguration of the building and site planning at 433 E. Cabrillo Blvd., including relocating the pool from the corner of E. Cabrillo Blvd./S. Calle Cesar Chavez to the building's rooftop.
- Increase in the amount of public commercial square footage at 433 E. Cabrillo Blvd. from 10,741 net square feet to 11,785 net square feet.
- Total project square footage reduced from 142,647 gross square feet to 107,797 gross square feet.

The purpose of the discussion is to allow the Planning Commission an opportunity to review the proposed changes to the Project and provide input to the Community Development Department with regard to the SCD request. The Community Development Director will ultimately make a determination as to whether the proposed changes are in substantial conformance with the Approved Project.

Environmental review was conducted for the project in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). A Final Environmental Impact Report (EIR) was previously certified for the Waterfront Park and Hotel and Youth Hostel Project. The current revised project remains within the scope of the certified EIR analysis; all previously identified mitigation measures would continue to apply to the project; and various environmental impacts would be the same or reduced. No new or greater significant impacts than identified in the EIR would result from the current project changes, and pursuant to CEQA Guidelines §15162, no further environmental review document is required. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines §15164, an Addendum to the certified EIR has been prepared to document minor changes to the EIR analysis for the current project.

Allison DeBusk, Project Planner, gave the Staff presentation.

Suzanne Elledge, Agent, gave the Applicant presentation, and was joined by Puck Ericson, Arcadia Studio, Landscape Architect; Bob Lasier, Design Architect; Michael A. Caccese, Civil Engineer, MAC Design Associates; Scott Schell, Associated Transportation Engineers; Jessica Peak, Biologist; and Eli Parker and Ashely Parker Schneider, owners.

Public comment opened at 3:42 p.m.

Annamarie Gott spoke with concerns due to parking, explained concerns with regard to charging for parking, and explained that people will park elsewhere to avoid that cost.

Public comment closed at 3:49 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

Commissioner Jordan:

- Agrees that the project meets the substantial conformance requirements.
- Stated that the Calle Cesar Chavez pedestrian experience needs to be fully developed at its best with landscaping, wide sidewalks, and tree grates.
- Expressed that the revised project is a substantial improvement from what was originally presented.

Commissioner Campanella:

- Agrees that the project meets the substantial conformance requirements criteria as indicated in the staff presentation.
- Appreciates staff's addendum and review of the project.
- Appreciates the re-design of the project and the improvements made for visitors and locals.

Commissioner Higgins:

- Agrees with all commissioner comments and agrees that the project meets the substantial conformance requirements criteria.
- Stated that the design change and risks associated with opening up the back door is appreciated.

Commissioner Schwartz:

- Finds the revised project in substantial conformance.
- Expressed that being a luxury hotel, valet parking is key and needs to work well.
- Stated that the banquet room, theater, and bar, need to be balanced with the amount of parking. Sufficient parking must be provided and it should be monitored to make sure parking needs for guest and locals is provided.
- Encourages the narrowing of the street.
- Finds the architecture is beautiful and the best of Santa Barbara.

Chair Wiscomb:

- Commends staff on their thorough presentation.
- Stated that the revised project is a substantial improvement.
- Commends the design team for all their work and is looking forward to the new development.

MOTION: Lodge/Schwartz

The Planning Commission finds that the proposed project meets the criteria for a substantial conformance determination and forwards their comments and approval to the Community Development Director to approve the project.

This motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 Noes: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 (Thompson)

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA

ACTUAL TIME: 4:53 P.M.

A. Committee and Liaison Reports:

1. Staff Hearing Officer Liaison Report

No report.

2. Other Committee and Liaison Reports

a. Commissioner Campanella requested that the final guidance on automated parking guidelines be brought to all design review boards.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Wiscomb adjourned the meeting at 4:55 p.m.

Submitted by,

Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary