



**CITY OF SANTA BARBARA  
PARKS AND RECREATION DEPARTMENT**

**PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION  
REGULAR MONTHLY MEETING**

**Wednesday, September 25, 2013**

**MINUTES**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The meeting was called to order at 4:01 p.m. at City Council Chambers.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** Chair Wiscomb

**ROLL CALL:**

**Commissioners & Staff Present**

Commissioner Megan Alley  
Commissioner Chris Casebeer  
Commissioner Nicolas Ferrara  
Commissioner Beebe Longstreet  
Commissioner Lesley Wiscomb  
Parks & Recreation Director Nancy Rapp  
Asst. Parks & Recreation Director Jill Zachary  
Urban Forest Superintendent Timothy Downey  
Executive Assistant Karla Megill

**CHANGES TO THE AGENDA:**

Ms. Rapp suggested that the Commission address Item 3, Street Tree Advisory Committee Recommendations, following public comment.

**WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS:** None

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** No one wished to speak.

**COMMISSIONER COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENT REPORTS:**

Commissioner Alley reported that she was unable to attend the Neighborhood Advisory Council meeting. She reported on the 2013 Health Fair and Family Day.

Commissioner Longstreet reported the activities of the Neighborhood Advisory Council and the Parks and Recreation Community (PARC) Foundation. She also reported on the activities of the Urban Forest Management Plan Technical Advisory Committee.

Commissioner Ferrara reported that he was unable to attend the Integrated Pest Management Advisory Committee. He said the Creeks Advisory Committee was cancelled.

Commissioner Casebeer reported on the Arts and Crafts Show Advisory Committee. He further said he attended the Safe Passages gathering.

Chair Wiscomb reported on the activities of the Street Tree Advisory Committee, and said that she also attended the Urban Forest Management Plan Technical Advisory Committee and the PARC Foundation meetings.

**COMMISSION AND STAFF COMMUNICATIONS:** None

**CONSENT CALENDAR:**

1. Summary of Council Actions – For Information

The Commission received the Summary of Council Actions. They had no questions.

2. Approval of Minutes – For Action

Recommendation: That the Commission waive the reading and approve the minutes of the regular meeting of August 28, 2013.

**Commissioner Ferrara moved, seconded by Commissioner Alley, and passed 4/0 to waive the reading and approve the minutes of the regular meeting of August 28, 2013.**

**Commissioner Longstreet Abstained.**

**STREET TREE ADVISORY COMMITTEE ITEMS:**

Any action of the Parks and Recreation Commission made pursuant to Municipal Code Chapter 15.24, Preservation of Trees, may be appealed to the City Council within ten days.

3. Street Tree Advisory Committee Recommendation – For Action

Documents:

- Staff Report
- Staff PowerPoint

Speakers:

- Staff: Tim Downey, Urban Forest Superintendent

Recommendation: That the Commission

- A. Approve the following Street Tree removal request, with conditions.

1. 233 W. Carrillo St. – Archontophoenix cunninghamiana, King Palm – Marc Winnikoff

**Public Comment:** No one wished to speak.

**Commissioner Casebeer moved, seconded by Commissioner Longstreet, to concur with the Street Tree Advisory Committee and staff recommendation to approve the removal of the King Palm at 233 W. Carrillo Street, and replace it with a 15-gallon Queen Palm at the present location, plus a second Queen Palm.**

Commissioner Wiscomb asked Mr. Downey for clarification as to whether the Commission can ask the applicant to plant two trees. Mr. Downey said that the

recommendation of the Street Tree Advisory Committee was to condition the planting of one tree; they commented that they would like to see a second tree. He said if the Commission's motion is to concur with the Street Tree Advisory Committee, it would be to plant one Queen Palm. Chair Wiscomb commented that the record could also reflect that the Commission would like a second tree planted.

Commissioner Casebeer said Chair Wiscomb comment is very well stated and amended his motion. Commissioner Longstreet concurred with the amended motion.

**Commissioner Casebeer moved, seconded by Commissioner Longstreet, and passed 5/0 to concur with the Street Tree Advisory Committee and staff recommendation to approve the removal of the King Palm at 233 W. Carrillo Street, and replace it with a 15-gallon Queen Palm at the present location, and asked the property owner to add a second Queen Palm.**

2. 530 Alan Rd. – Liquidambar styraciflua American Sweetgum – Daniel and Sarah McCarter

Mr. Downey highlighted this removal request. He said that City staff has been working with Mr. McCarter since July to come to some resolutions to his sewer lateral issues. Mr. Downey stated that the sewer line exists directly underneath the Liquidambar tree. He said the Street Tree Advisory Committee reviewed the removal application and materials and determined that the two other trees on the property were more than sufficient to fill the space, based on the density of trees in the area, and the benefits to the adjacent trees, they recommend the removal be approved.

Commissioner Ferrara asked who would bear the cost of the removal of the tree. Mr. Downey indicated that if the Mr. McCarter chooses to follow with other options to repair their sewer line, and the tree would be destabilized by that work, the City would remove the tree. He said the application process states that if the tree is found to be in good condition, and the tree removal request is granted solely for the convenience of the applicant, the full cost of the removal shall be borne by the applicant. Mr. Downey stated that if the Commission approves the application removal through the application process, and the tree is removed for the reasons indicated, the cost would be to the applicants.

Commissioner Casebeer asked what the approximate cost is to remove the tree. Mr. Downey said he estimates it would cost a minimum of a couple of thousand dollars to remove the tree.

Chair Wiscomb commented that the Commission is deciding on the removal request only, not who pays for the removal. She said the cost of the removal is not within the purview of the Commission; that will be resolved at a later date with the Department and Risk Management, if necessary.

Commissioner Alley commented that the root cause of the problem is that the Liquidambar tree sits on the sewer line, is that the case, or is it that the roots are finding their way to the sewer line because the sewer line is leaking, which is the initiation of the problem. Mr. Downey said that to date, staff has not received any

documentation as to the actual cause of the sewer line defect. He stated that it has been suggested that the tree is the cause, but staff has not received any evidence substantiating that.

**Public Comment:** Speaker: Daniel McCarter

Chair Wiscomb asked Mr. McCarter whether now that he is aware that the Commission does not have purview over who pays for the removal of the tree, would he like the Commission to proceed with action on the removal request. Mr. McCarter said that if it is still open-ended as to who pays for it, he said yes, he said yes, he does want the Commission to proceed to take action on his removal request.

Mr. Downey clarified that if the Commission concurs with the Street Tree Advisory Committee and approves the removal request, it does not mandate that the McCarter's remove the tree. He said they can choose to remove it at that point, or not; it simply allows that process to move forward.

Commissioner Alley asked Mr. McCarter what he means by the tree sits on the sewer line; is there any gap between the tree roots and the sewer line, and what is the difference in length? Mr. McCarter said that when the trees are planted on the sewer lines, the tree roots are attracted to water; the sewer lines are not leaking at the time, but water condenses on the outside of pipes as cool water goes through them. He said that the roots are attracted to the pipe because it is a water source; over the years, the roots have grabbed a hold of the sewer line and grow around it and have caused the pipe to break in three spots, causing the water to back up causing a sewage issue.

Commissioner Ferrara commented that it was mentioned that a number of these trees have been removed over the years; he asked why the City removed these trees in the same general area. Mr. Downey said in 2006, four Liquidambar trees were removed; only one of those was by application to the Commission, which indicates the other three were removed by the City because the trees became hazardous. He said the reason stated on the application for the fourth tree was damage to the sidewalk, driveway and other hardscapes; it did not involve sewer lateral issues.

**Commissioner Longstreet moved, seconded by Commissioner Casebeer, and passed 5/0 to concur with the Street Tree Advisory Committee recommendation for the removal of the Liquidambar styraciflua, American Sweetgum, at 530 Alan Road.**

#### **ADMINISTRATIVE AND STAFF REPORT – None**

#### **OLD BUSINESS – None**

#### **NEW BUSINESS**

4. Historic Franceschi Flame Tree – For Information

Documents:

- Staff Background Paper

- Staff PowerPoint

Speakers:

- Staff: Jill E. Zachary, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director

Recommendation: That the Commission receive a report on the treatment and propagation plan for the Historic Franceschi Flame Tree located in Parking Lot 12.

The Commission received the report and their questions were answered.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

At 4:40 p.m., with no further business to be addressed by the Commission, the meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Nancy L. Rapp  
Parks & Recreation Director