City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
MAY 27, 2020
1:30 P.M.
This Meeting was Conducted Electronically
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:
Anthony Grumbine, Chair
Steve Hausz, Vice Chair
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:
Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER
The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE
Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Drury (until 6:00 p.m.), Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Ooley, and Veyna
Commissioners absent: None
Staff present: Ostrenger (until 5:22 p.m.); Unzueta; Ellen Kokinda, Administrative Analyst; Timmy Bolton, Associate Planner; Tony Ruggieri, City TV Production Supervisor; Hernandez; Plummer; William Russell, Planning Technician; and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS
A. Public Comment:
Written correspondence from Linda Mathews was read into the record.

B. Approval of Minutes:
Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 13, 2020, as amended.
Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/1. (Mahan abstained from Item 3, 433 E Cabrillo Blvd.) Motion carried.
C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of May 27, 2020, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Hausz.

Action: Lenvik/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Commissioner Veyna announced that he is concerned about landscaping changes and over-pruning of the ficus tree at the parking lot area of the Amazon building located at 1001 State Street. Staff stated that they will review the plans and provide a status update at an upcoming hearing.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(1:50PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE HISTORIC RESOURCES ORDINANCE

Reference Number: PLN2020-00068
Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

(The Historic Landmarks Commission will receive public comment and recommend revisions to the draft of the Historic Resources Ordinance (Santa Barbara Municipal Code Chapter 30.157). The Historic Landmarks Commission’s recommendations will be incorporated into a revised draft of the ordinance that will return to HLC for acceptance at a future hearing.)

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara; and Greg Lusitana, Assistant City Attorney, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:02 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Richard Closson
2. Steven Dowty
3. Linda Dye
4. Fred Sweeney
5. Mary Louise Days
6. Pat Saley
7. Dee Duncan

Written correspondence from Susan Chamberlin, Patricia Saley, Richard Closson, Robert Ooley, Fermina Murray, Allied Neighborhoods Association, Francesca Galt, Paulina Conn, Fred Sweeney,
Dennis Doordan, Kathleen Weinheimer, Pearl Chase Society, Ed Lenvik, Michael Imwalle, Mary Louise Days, Linda Dye, and Donald Sharpe was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:21 p.m.

Discussion held.

Commission comments:

In general, the Commission suggests that staff incorporate the ideas offered in various public comment letters, particularly regarding neighborhood definitions, historic districts, and cultural landscapes. The Commission supports the requirement of 80 percent of contributing resources and 51 percent of property owners participating for a historic district. The Commission also suggests restructuring the document to have broader definitions of historic resources and cultural landscapes, as there are some repeating elements. The Commission would like staff to return with different options for a buffer zone that might help it relate to the size of the resource and be compatible with the resource. In general, the Commission is comfortable with the appeal hearing process as presented.

* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:00 TO 4:12 P.M. *

(3:20PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 700 - 1400 BLOCKS OF DE LA VINA ST
    300 W – 300 E BLOCKS OF SOLA ST
    400 – 500 BLOCKS OF ANACAPA ST
    GARDEN ST / FIGUEROA ST INTERSECTION
    Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-164; -231; -304; -392; -456; -526; -532; -592;
    -659; -725; -845; -899; -933; -986
    Application Number: PLN2019-00493
    Owner: City of Santa Barbara
    Applicant: Behdad Gharagozli, Public Works

(The Downtown Perimeter Lighting Project was identified as part of the City’s annual collision analysis and is primarily located along the De La Vina Street (Vision Zero Priority corridor) and Sola Street. A review of the collisions within the Project area revealed that there is a high frequency of injury related crashes occurring at night and the City proposes to install several countermeasures. The Project includes additional street lighting along 700-1400 blocks of De La Vina Street between Micheltorena and Ortega Streets, 300W – 300E blocks of Sola Street between Bath and Garden Streets, 400 – 500 blocks Anacapa Street between Haley to Gutierrez Streets, and the Garden and Figueroa Intersection. Eleven existing non-compliant sidewalk access ramps along Sola Street will be replaced with ADA compliant City standard sidewalk access ramps. High visibility crosswalk markings and additional signage will be installed along four uncontrolled intersections along De La Vina Street and at the intersection of Figueroa and Garden Street. White edge lines along De La Vina Street, between Constance Avenue and Haley Street, and Chapala Street, between Constance Avenue and Victoria Street, will be painted to better define the vehicle travel way and reduce single vehicle collisions.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Investigation, prepared by David Stone, Wood Environment & Infrastructure, Inc.

Actual time: 4:12 p.m.
Present: David Stone, Archaeologist, Wood Environment & Infrastructure, Inc.; and Behdad Gharagozli, Applicant, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report’s conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 4:19 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Richard Closson

Public comment closed at 4:21 p.m.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.
Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

(3:35PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

3. 2190 ALSTON RD
Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-174-019
Zone: RS-25
Application Number: PLN2019-00176
Owner: Ok Wave, LLC
Applicant: Jessica Hall, Shubin Donaldson

(The Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, Graholm Estate, constructed in 1920-1924 by Roland Sauter, is eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places, the California Register of Historical Resources, and is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal for a new 1,908 square foot detached garage for the existing 19,611 square foot residence. Project includes 4,822 square feet of driveway extension with 6,435 square feet of resurfaced permeable pavement at the lower motor court, removal and replacement of 5,220 square feet of existing sandstone pavers at the motor court, improvements to the drive, and repainting of the historic residence.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on August 21, 2019.

Actual time: 4:24 p.m.

Present: Jessica Hall, Applicant, Shubin Donaldson; Greg Griffin, Studio Director, Shubin Donaldson; and Robin Donaldson, Shubin Donaldson

* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:32 TO 4:37 P.M. *

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the purpose of the review is for the Commission to review the garage in more detail so that the applicant can complete the Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report.

Public comment opened at 5:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.
Motion:  Continue indefinitely with comments:
1. The Commission feels that the design of the garage is a great improvement.
2. The windows on the garage seem proportionally too large.
3. The garage doors on the south elevation are not resolved in the operability of their openings or the amount of plaster and wall surface above.
4. Study the rafter tails as they seem to be too small.
5. Study the roof pitch as a break pitch; the Commission is split on the roof pitch as proposed.
6. The River of Life motif should be used on either the arches or the man door.
7. The auto court design, specifically the lozenge-shaped grasscrete area is not acceptable as submitted; the Commission requires a new design.
8. The plaster and steel windows are acceptable.
9. Study an asymmetrical window composition on the east elevation.
10. The Commission feels the project is ready for Project Design Approval and the applicant may move forward with preparing the Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

(4:25PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

4. 410 STATE ST, 27 E. GUTIERREZ ST, 409 ANACAPA ST
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-022, 037-212-035, 037-212-030
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2020-00220
Owner: Series A, B, & C of Old Town Properties SB, LLC
Applicant: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal to merge three parcels located at 410 State Street, 27 E. Gutierrez Street, and 409 Anacapa Street, to create a 59,010 square foot lot. The proposed development involves construction of 84 rental units (21 studios, 51 one-bedrooms, 11 two-bedrooms, and 1 three-bedroom) averaging 646 square feet per unit, in a new four-story building on the existing parking lot located at 27 E. Gutierrez Street, using the City's Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The building would be approximately 90,179 square feet, including a 24,658 square foot ground floor consisting of a parking garage, residential lobby, trash enclosure, transformer, and bicycle parking. The proposal includes 99 parking spaces in a combination of surface parking spaces and parking lifts. Planning Commission review is required for Community Benefit Project exceptions to height limitations, a Parking Modification, and Open Yard Modification. City Council review and approval is required for a Variance of the Gutierrez Street Setback.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 5:44 p.m.

Present: Christine Pierron, Architect, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; Brian Cernal, Architect, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she did a staff evaluation of the infill guidelines and if the Commission would like to see the guidelines in any other format they should let her know.
Public comment opened at 6:08 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Richard Closson

Written correspondence from Patricia Saley, Paulina Conn, and Robin Donaldson was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:11 p.m.

**Motion:** Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The view from across Gutierrez Street is the most successful and in general the other elevations need to be adjusted to be more poetic and in keeping with the Gutierrez Street elevation.
2. The overall massing is too large; the Commission suggests reducing by bringing the floor to floor height down and removing portions of the massing at the fourth story.
3. The lower level openings and podium level seem too large, especially the delivery entries.
4. The elevations from View 2 from State and Gutierrez Streets and View 3 from Haley Street need more irregularity and articulation.
5. Show how the delivery and design amenities and mechanical equipment will be resolved.
6. Story poles, or some alternative, may be needed after more 3D imagery and video is provided.
7. The animation video is appreciated; The Commission would like an aerial birds-eye view to understand the site.
8. The Commission would like to see additional views.

**Action:** Mahan/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:10 P.M. *