MEETING DATE: April 15, 2020

TO: Historic Landmarks Commission

FROM: Nicole Hernandez, City Urban Historian

SUBJECT: Staff Evaluation of a project on a building that is eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit.

ADDRESS: 524 State Street

PROJECT: 3rd story addition and alterations to rear elevation.

The purpose of this staff evaluation is to evaluate the proposed project to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation when the Urban Historian has not required a Historic Structures/Sites Report.

Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.

   The Proposed project will return the building to its original use as a hotel. There will be minimal change to the distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships on the front elevation (which is the most visible to the public on State Street).
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The proposed project will retain and preserve the historic character of the property and the distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize the front elevation (which is most visible to the public on State Street).

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

The project does not propose adding conjectural features or elements that would create a false sense of historical development.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

There are no changes to the property that have acquired historical significance.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The original entry door, storefront windows and transoms will be preserved and restored using the National Park Service's Preservation Briefs for appropriate treatment to historic resources. The project proposes to replace the existing windows on the upper floor of the front elevation that characterize the property due to extreme deterioration to match the materials, size, profile, and configuration of the original windows and doors. The project proposes to preserve the other character-defining features, including the wrought-iron balconies, terracotta roof, and coping; dentil molding under the eave and texture of the stucco.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match
the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

The windows and doors on the second floor, State Street elevation, are severely deteriorated with wood splitting, as well as warping and water damage as evidenced from the drip lines coming down from the sill and black mildew. The project proposes to replace the windows and doors with wood windows to match the original in material, size, profile, and configuration. The original windows will be salvaged and used as the template for the original. The City’s Urban Historian will review window detail drawings and a sample of the new windows in comparison to the original before production of all windows to ensure the accurate match.

The windows on the side, more utilitarian that the front elevation, elevation of the building are also in deteriorated condition. Because this elevation is more utilitarian than the front elevation, the project proposes to replace the windows to match in size, profile, and configuration, however with aluminum clad rather than wood. The side elevation faces south and has direct sun that causes more maintenance and accelerated deterioration than the front elevation that warrant a material that will not require as much maintenance as wood and will not deteriorate as quickly on this exposed elevation. Due to the minimal visibility of this elevation, the change in material is appropriate.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

The restoration of the storefront doors, windows, transoms, and terracotta roof and coping will use the gentlest means possible and follow appropriate National Park Service’s Preservation Briefs when conducting all work. Work will be coordinated through the City’s Urban Historian to ensure the gentlest means are being executed.

8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

This is not applicable for this evaluation/ archeological work reviewed separately.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The new addition will not destroy any of the historical material on the front elevation. It will focus on adding a third story addition that steps back from the front elevation and alterations on the back of the building that faces the City parking lot. The third story addition will be differentiated from the original in its deep set back from the front elevation with a hipped roof and tower so that it is not confused with the original, two-story massing of the front of the building. The new work takes many of the original features as inspiration and echoes them in the new addition creating a compatible rhythm through the building. The rear of the building is currently a non-descript elevation as it was designed for “back of house” functions. The new
design for the rear elevation brings in elements from the front elevation to create consistency with the building while using belly bands to divide the floors and a flat roof and cornice to create differentiation from the original. The new work will be compatible with the following elements to protect the integrity of the property and its environment:

**Materials:** The smooth stucco walls and terra cotta roof tiles are compatible with the Mediterranean style building.

**Features:** The round-arched openings on the third floor set back from the original façade echoes the round openings of the original doors on the second floor, carrying the rhythm to the new addition. The project proposes to carry the scalloped corners around the original storefront windows into the openings on the third floor and alterations facing the rear elevation.

**Size, Scale and Proportion:** The scale of the addition, which extends the third floor forward, is slightly shorter in height than the original building with the highest portion being the tower. The project sets the addition extension back from the original elevation, so the character-defining features of the State Street elevation remain distinct, and the addition does not overwhelm the original elements of the façade. The new openings, hipped roof and tower features are in proportion to the original building and relate to the original building so that the addition remains subservient to the original front elevation.

**Massing:** The massing of the extended third floor is compatible with the original building and does not overwhelm the original structure nor compete with the original structure so that the original front elevation is the dominant feature on State Street.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

If the addition were removed, the essential form of the original building would remain.
**Conclusion:** The project meets all the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and thus will have a less-than-significant impact, Class III, on the historic resource.