



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
JANUARY 20, 2021

1:30 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner
Heidi Reidel, Planning Technician I

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Ted Hamilton, Assistant Planner.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Doordan, Drury (until 6:00 p.m.), Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Manuel (until 3:54 p.m.), and Ooley

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Ostrenger; Unzueta; Hernandez; Plummer; Timmy Bolton, Associate Planner; Tony Ruggieri, City TV Production Supervisor; Ted Hamilton, Assistant Planner; and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. 2021 Election of Chair and Vice Chair.

Nominations for Chair: Grumbine. Hausz/Ooley. 8/0/1 (Grumbine)

A vote was taken, and Commissioner Grumbine was elected as Chair.

Nominations for Vice Chair: Hausz. Drury/Ooley. 8/0/1 (Hausz)

A vote was taken, and Commissioner Hausz was elected as Vice Chair.

B. 2021 Appointment of Consent Review Representatives and Subcommittees.

Appointments were made to the following committees:

	<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Alternate</u>
Consent Calendar		
Architecture	Mahan	Grumbine
Landscape	Manuel	Edmunds
Sign Committee	Drury	Hausz
Street Tree Advisory Committee	Manuel	Edmunds
Arts Advisory Committee	Drury	Hausz
Subcommittees		
Design Awards	Drury, Mahan, Doordan	Lenvik
Designations	Doordan, Ooley, Lenvik, Manuel	Drury
Ad hoc Subcommittees		
Architectural Detail	Grumbine, Ooley, Mahan, Doordan	
Objective Design Standards	Grumbine, Lenvik, Ooley	
Guidelines Committee	Hausz, Ooley, Doordan	
FAR Committee	Lenvik, Ooley	
State Street Design	Grumbine, Hausz	Drury
Plaza De La Guerra Design	Drury, Hausz	
Highway 101 HOV Project	Ooley, Manuel	

Motion: Accept the amended subcommittee list for 2021.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt, Richard Closson, and Lanny Ebenstein was acknowledged.

D. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **December 9, 2020**, as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 6/0/3. (Edmunds, Manuel, and Doordan abstained.) Motion carried.

E. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 20, 2021**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Manuel (Items B and E).

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/1. (Manuel abstained.) Motion carried.

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Hernandez announced that the Ordinance Committee will review the Historic Resources Ordinance on February 23, 2021. Chair Grumbine offered to attend the meeting to represent the HLC.
2. Chair Grumbine announced the following:
 - a. Kellam de Forest is ill and the Commission extends its thoughts and sympathies. Commissioner Ooley requested that staff send a card on behalf of the HLC.
 - b. The AIA will present on the 2020 Design Charrette at the City Council Meeting on Thursday, January 21, 2021.

G. Subcommittee Reports:

1. Commissioner Hausz reported on the Plaza De La Guerra Subcommittee.
2. Commissioner Lenvik reported on the Designation Subcommittee.

(1:55PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. HISTORIC PRESERVATION PROGRAM AND THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT

Reference Number: PLN2021-00038
 Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
 Julia Pujo, Environmental Analyst

(Review the process for identifying historic resources and evaluating impacts to historic resources as required by the California Environmental Quality Act and outlined in the City of Santa Barbara [Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines](#).)

Actual time: 2:20 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara; and Julia Pujo, Environmental Analyst, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:45 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Discussion held.

(2:30PM) RESOLUTION OF INTENTION FOR STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

- 2. [130 CANYON ACRES DR](#)**
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-015
 Reference Number: PLN2021-00039
 Owner: Jo Lynn Hardimann

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on February 3, 2021 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Mediterranean style residence designed by Russell Ray, AIA, in 1915.)

Actual time: 3:02 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2021-2 to hold a Public Hearing on February 3, 2021 to consider Structure of Merit designation a Mediterranean style residence located at 130 Canyon Acres Drive.

Action: Ooley/Lenvik, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:35PM) RESOLUTION OF INTENTION FOR STRUCTURES OF MERIT DESIGNATIONS

3. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES PER ATTACHED EXHIBIT A

Reference Number: PLN2021-00039

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on April 14, 2021 to consider designating the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A as Structures of Merit.)

Actual time: 3:05 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:09 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2021-1 to hold a Public Hearing on April 14, 2021 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:40PM) RESOLUTION OF INTENTION FOR STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATIONS

4. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES LISTED BELOW

Reference Number: PLN2021-00039

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Pursuant to Municipal Code Section 22.22.035.(d)(2), the permit request of a possibly historic structure shall be scheduled at the Historic Landmarks Commission for a hearing on the application concurrently with a duly noticed hearing to allow the Commission to decide among the following options: 1) Listing on the Potential Historic Resources List, 2) Structure of Merit designation, or 3) City Landmark designation. The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on April 14, 2021 to consider Structure of Merit designation of 530 State Street, and 1806 El Encanto Road.)

A. 530 State Street

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-026

Owner: Patricia Thompson Perry and McColm Family Trust

(Spanish Colonial Revival style building, designed in 1929, and remodeled in 1951.)

B. 1806 El Encanto Road

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-002

Owner: Michael Duca & Shawn Seibert

(Spanish Colonial Revival style building designed in 1930.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2021-3 to hold a Public Hearing on April 14, 2021 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style buildings located at 530 State Street and 1806 El Encanto Road.**Action:** Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Manuel absent). Motion carried.**(2:45PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT****5. 1911 DE LA VINA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-362-009

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2020-00425

Owner: Sam Tyler

Applicant: Wade Mously, DMHA Architects

(Proposal for a mixed-use remodel. Project entails remodeling multiple facades of an existing 5,535 square foot, one-story non-residential structure. Also proposed is the internal reconfiguration of the structure from office and laundromat space to an art studio and laundromat. Project proposes site improvements and a parking lot and vehicular circulation improvements. An Accessory Dwelling Unit will be permitted under a separate permit above a new six-vehicle tandem carport. Scope of work also entails landscaping improvements. No change to the existing single-unit residence is proposed.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report, prepared by David Stone, Wood Environmental and Infrastructure Solutions, Inc.

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Wood Environmental and Infrastructure Solutions, Inc.; Scott Sunell, Wood Environmental and Infrastructure Solutions, Inc.

Staff comments: Mr. Hamilton stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 3:38 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Edmunds, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:42 TO 3:49 P.M. ***

(2:50PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

6. WESTSIDE PASEOS PROJECT

Assessor's Parcel Number: Multiple Right-Of-Way Parcels

Application Number: PLN2020-00339

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Jessica Grant, Public Works Department

(The Westside Community Paseos will establish safe and efficient connections within and from the Westside to Downtown and the Eastside. With a focus on low vehicular-volume streets (Gillespie, San Pascual, Mission, Micheltorena, Sola, Panchita Place, Victoria, Alta Vista, Anapamu and Nopal) the improvements will also provide a safe route to four local schools, encouraging students to bike or walk. Exterior improvements within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) include traffic signals, traffic diverter medians, access ramps, landscaping, brick pavers, relocated street lights, high visibility bike lanes at the Sola and Santa Barbara Street intersection and improved crossing with two curb extensions, brick pavers, landscaping, relocated street lights, all way stop signs, and green backed bike roadway stencils at the intersection of Sola and Garden Streets. All roadway improvements follow City, State and/or Federal Standards.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project requires consistency with the Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria and El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 3:49 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Public Works Department, City of Santa Barbara; Derrick Bailey, Transportation Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; Alex Flores, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; and Chelsey Swanson, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:07 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposal has a profound adverse impact on the streetscapes of Santa Barbara and does not rise to the aesthetic level of Santa Barbara.
2. Provide views and additional context for the Commission to evaluate the brick pavers.
3. The plantings as submitted are not appropriate for the visual blocking of the road from views of the mountains and down the street.
4. In general, the plantings need to be redesigned, as the lack of other planting is not acceptable.
5. The mulch is not appropriate for the current location, nor is it a desirable material.
6. Minimize the visual impact of the medians.
7. The use of the word "paseo" is inappropriate for this project.
8. The aesthetic impact of the project blocks the view corridor created by the historic grid.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Manuel absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:21 TO 5:28 P.M. ***

Motion: Reconsider the previous motion.

Action: Lenvik/Grumbine, 4/4/0. (Manuel absent.) Motion failed.

(3:30PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**7. 410 STATE ST, 27 E. GUTIERREZ ST, 409 ANACAPA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-022, 037-212-035, 037-212-030
 Zone: M-C
 Application Number: PLN2020-00220
 Owner: Series C of Old Town Properties SB, LLC
 Applicant: The Cearnal Collective LLP (Architect)

(Proposal to merge three parcels located at 410 State Street, 27 E. Gutierrez Street, and 409 Anacapa Street, to create a 59,010 square foot lot. The proposed development involves construction of 78 rental units (42 studios, 18 one-bedrooms, and 18 two-bedrooms) averaging approximately 670 square feet per unit, in a new four-story building on the existing parking lot located at 27 E. Gutierrez Street, using the City's Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The building would be approximately 90,000 square feet, including an approximately 25,000 square foot ground floor consisting of a parking garage, commercial space, residential lobby, trash enclosure, and bicycle parking. The proposal includes 89 parking spaces in a combination of surface parking spaces and parking lifts. Planning Commission granted the Community Benefit Project exceptions to height limitations.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archeological Resources Report and Addendum, prepared by Heather Macfarlane and Michael H. Imwalle, Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.

Actual time: 5:33 p.m.

Present: Michael H. Imwalle, Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants

Staff comments: Mr. Hamilton stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 5:35 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Manuel absent.) Motion carried.

(3:35PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

8. 410 STATE ST, 27 E. GUTIERREZ ST, 409 ANACAPA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-022, 037-212-035, 037-212-030

Zone: M-C

Application Number: PLN2020-00220

Owner: Series C of Old Town Properties SB, LLC

Applicant: The Cearnal Collective, LLP (Architect)

(Proposal to merge three parcels located at 410 State Street, 27 E. Gutierrez Street, and 409 Anacapa Street, to create a 59,010 square foot lot. The proposed development involves construction of 78 rental units (42 studios, 18 one-bedrooms, and 18 two-bedrooms) averaging approximately 670 square feet per unit, in a new four-story building on the existing parking lot located at 27 E. Gutierrez Street, using the City's Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The building would be approximately 90,000 square feet, including an approximately 25,000 square foot ground floor consisting of a parking garage, commercial space, residential lobby, trash enclosure, and bicycle parking. The proposal includes 89 parking spaces in a combination of surface parking spaces and parking lifts. Planning Commission granted the Community Benefit Project exceptions to height limitations.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires consistency with the Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria and El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed September 16, 2020.

Actual time: 5:45 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Applicant, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; Martha Degasis, Arcadia Studio Landscape Architecture; Bob Cunningham, Arcadia Studio Landscape Architecture; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Mr. Hamilton stated that Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, is available to answer questions.

Public comment opened at 6:02 p.m.

Written correspondence from Patricia Saley was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:03 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the following findings and the comment that the Commission believes the project will be successful and a beautiful addition to the street.

1. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project, as there are a number of buildings close by that are of a similar scale.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood, as downtown Santa Barbara has a number of tall buildings so the project is compatible with existing buildings.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping. The paseo provides an appropriate amount of open space and the Commission is happy about the commercial use.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Drury and Manuel absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:24 P.M. ***