



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
JANUARY 22, 2020

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine (absent 1:46-2:12 p.m.), Hausz, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, and Veyna (at 1:34 p.m., until 5:00 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: Ooley

Staff present: Hernandez (until 4:57 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **January 8, 2020**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 6/0/2. (Lenvik and Veyna abstained. Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 22, 2020**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Hausz/Nemec, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that City Council appointed Mayor Pro Tem Sneddon as the liaison to the Historic Landmarks Commission and Mayor Murillo as the alternate.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:
 - a. Staff has completed a working draft of the Historic Structures Ordinance with Assistant City Attorney Gregory L. Lusitana, Renee Brooke, City Planner, and Ariel Calonne, City Attorney, will review the Historic Structures Ordinance draft, after which the Historic Landmarks Commission will hold a public workshop presenting all changes to the Ordinance.
 - b. Ms. Hernandez provided a notice for the upcoming design review training and walking tour scheduled to take place on Friday, January 31, 2020 at 2:30 p.m. beginning at the Lobero Theatre.
3. Commissioner Drury requested that Commissioners adhere to the rule of asking the Chair for permission to speak.
4. Chair Grumbine announced he will step down from Item 1, 131-137 East De La Guerra Street, and Item 2, 814 Santa Barbara Street, as they are Santa Barbara Historic Trust properties.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Mahan reported on the Design Awards Subcommittee.

(1:50PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. **131-137 E DE LA GUERRA ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 131-011-008; 009; 010; 011
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2020-00018
Owner: State of California

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style commercial storefronts, designed in 1927 located at 131-137 East De La Guerra Street.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Chair Grumbine recused himself from hearing this item, due to his connection with the Santa Barbara Historic Trust.

Actual time: 1:46 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:50 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

- 1. Anne Petersen

Public comment closed at 1:51 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2020-1 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Spanish Colonial Revival style commercial storefronts designed in 1927 located at 131-137 East De La Guerra Street.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(1:55PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

- 2. **814 SANTA BARBARA ST**
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-018
 Zone: C-G
 Application Number: PLN2020-00018
 Owner: State of California

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Hoff General Hospital building constructed in 1941 located at 814 Santa Barbara Street.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Chair Grumbine recused himself from hearing this item, due to his connection with the Santa Barbara Historic Trust.

Actual time: 1:58 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:03 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

- 1. Anne Petersen

Public comment closed at 2:04 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2020-2 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Hoff General Hospital building constructed in 1941 located at 814 Santa Barbara Street, with the comment to remove the words “and architectural” from the resolution.

Action: Mahan/Edmunds, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(2:00PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**3. 2339 EDGEWATER WAY**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-350-003
 Zone: E-3/SD-3
 Application Number: PLN2020-00014
 Owner: Thurman, Barbara Jo Revocable Trust
 Barbara Jo Thurman, Trustee
 Applicant: Sarah Bronstad, Vanguard Planning LLC

(Proposal for a Coastal Development Permit to abate violations in ENF2018-00339 to remove as-built retaining wall and remove 50 cubic yards of grading located on the coastal bluff. The project includes a proposal for a two-story addition of 1,713 square feet, a new detached two car garage, and remodeling the existing 1,976 square foot two-story residence located outside the archaeological sensitive zone.)

Acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Brent Leftwich, is requested.

Actual time: 2:12 p.m.

Present: Brent Leftwich, Archaeologist; and Sarah Bronstad, Applicant, Vanguard Planning LLC

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. This project is not subject to the Historic Landmarks Commission.

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:05PM) STAFF HISTORIC EVALUATION REPORT**4. 1108 DE LA VINA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-222-016
 Zone: C-G
 Application Number: PLN2020-00019
 Owner: Tasca, Carmelo & Antonia Family Trust
 Carmelo & Antonia Tasca, Trustees
 Applicant: Ellen Bildsten, Architect AIA, LEED AP

(Applicant request for review of Staff Historic Evaluation Report, prepared by City Urban Historian, to establish historic significance prior to a project proposal.)

Review of a Staff Historic Evaluation Report. The report concluded that the house constructed in 1904-05 in the Queen Anne Free Classic style is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit.

Actual time: 2:16 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara; Ellen Bildsten, Applicant, Architect AIA, LEED AP; and Joey Tasca, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the report and its conclusions? 6/2 Passed

Motion: **Accept the report with the comment that the structure is not in El Pueblo Viejo.**

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 6/2/0. (Lenvik and Nemec opposed. Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments:

1. Commissioner Lenvik opposed because he does not feel that the structure meets Criterion D or G.
2. Commissioner Nemec opposed because he does not feel that the building on its own rises to the level of a Structure of Merit.

(2:20PM) FINAL APPROVAL

5. 40 E ANAPAMU ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2019-00243
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Brad Klinzing, Public Works
Landscape Architect: Laurie Romano, Arcadia Studios

(This site contains designated City Landmarks: Central Library, constructed in 1916 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style, Faulkner Galley, constructed in 1930 in the Art Deco style, and five Corymbia Trees. Proposal for a renovation and upgrade of the landscape and hardscape area of the library property. Improvements include approximately 5,980 square feet of additional hardscape, 500 cubic yards of imported fill, a reduction in turf area and in total trees from 95 to 66, new planters, art work, lighting, and approximately 9,800 square feet of activity space. The project includes a new lower plaza for the south entrance to the Library to increase accessibility and address connections to La Arcada, the Museum north entrance, Library Avenue and the upper plaza. No improvements are proposed to the historic buildings or landmark trees.)

Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed and received Project Design Approval on November 27, 2019.

Actual time: 2:46 p.m.

Present: Brad Klinzing, Supervising Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; Laurie Romano, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studios; Kalie Grubb, Project Manager, Arcadia Studios; and Ryan Smith, Principal Engineer, Smith Engineering

Public comment opened at 2:54 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners cannot support lights in the eucalyptus trees? 4/1 Passed

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

1. The Commission greatly appreciates the design and attention to detail, and feels the project will be successful.
2. The lighting shall have a maximum color temperature of 3000k, though 2700k is preferred.
3. Lighting attached to the historic eucalyptus trees as presented is not acceptable. The applicant may return as a Review After Final for an alternative proposal.
4. The mosaic pattern as shown on sheet LC.1 is acceptable.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 5/0/3. (Drury, Nemece, and Veyna abstained. Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:19 TO 3:28 P.M. ***

(3:05PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

- 6. 113-115 & 117 W DE LA GUERRA ST**
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-027, 037-082-003
 Zone: C-G
 Application Number: PLN2015-00626
 Owner: John R Dewilde
 Architect: Ed De Vicente, DMHA Architecture

(The W.D. Smith Building, constructed in 1928 and located at 113 W. De La Guerra Street is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, as it is eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit. Proposal for a 23-unit mixed-use project to be developed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program on two parcels known as 113-115 W. De La Guerra Street (APN 037-082-027) and 117 W. De La Guerra Street (APN 037-082-003). The project proposes the demolition of two existing 1,113 and 923 square foot commercial buildings, two outdoor patios, 15 surface parking spaces, and the near complete demolition of a 4,455 square foot commercial building, of which the historic façade and tile roof will be preserved. The project proposes to construct a 28,946 square foot, three- and four-story mixed-use building that includes 16,851 square feet of residential area, 1,139 square feet of commercial area, and 10,957 square feet of parking garage. Twenty-six parking spaces will be provided in the at-grade parking garage. The residential component comprises 23 residential units with an average unit size of 693 square feet and a unit mix of studios, one-bedroom, and two-bedroom units. The two parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential/Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). The proposed density on the lots totaling 16,273 net square feet will be 62 units per acre. One existing Queen Palm in the right of way is proposed to be relocated.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on August 7, 2019.

Actual time: 3:28 p.m.

Present: Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Ryan Mills, Architect, DMHA Architecture; and Ed Di Vicente, Architect, DMHA Architecture

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that since its last review, the project was deemed complete and is now subject to the Permit Streamlining Act. The time limit for approval or disapproval of the project is February 17, 2020 and Project Design Approval review is scheduled for February 5, 2020. The project will include a Minor Zoning Exception Request at the next review for a visibility triangle at the driveway.

Public comment opened at 4:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support Option 2 as a solution for the door and window arrangements? 5/1 Passed

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission feels that the project continues to be acceptable overall.
2. The Commission finds the solution to the project's adjacency to neighboring balconies to be acceptable and thanks the applicant for the 3-D model.
3. The Commission generally finds the solution to the elevator tower to be acceptable.
4. The Commission finds the resolution of the brick arch into the wall to be acceptable.
5. The Commission finds the mass, bulk, and scale to be acceptable as presented in the 3-D model.
6. The Commission is generally in support of Option 2 as a solution to the door and window arrangements at the historic storefront.
7. Thicken the wall on the opening into the garage to a minimum of twenty inches.
8. Provide two sections showing the rooftop equipment and how it will be screened from view, taking care not to increase mass, bulk, and scale.
9. The Commission suggests another non-white material for the south wall, preferably brick.
10. Show the existing landscape of the adjacent property.
11. Balconies, particularly the Monterey, still need additional design work.
12. The plaster wall above the garage entry on elevation A202 is too stark and needs to be further articulated.
13. Confirm that the landscaping adjacent to the driveway complies with the Municipal Code.
14. Staff should forward the completeness review to the Commission.
15. Show thick walls with windows inset a minimum of two and a half inches.
16. The elliptical arch and corbeled opening on the podium level, and other similar openings on sheet A302, should have a minimum wall depth of twelve inches.
17. The planter on the podium level of the back courtyard is to be square, larger in size, and with a phoenix reclinata multi-stem palm.
18. Shield lighting in the parking garage from public view

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Veyna and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:20 P.M. ***